

CLASSICAL TRIPOS Part II
Group B Philosophy

Monday 5 June 2000 9 to 12

Paper B 1

PLATO

Answer **three** questions: at least **one** from Section **A** and at least **one** from Section **B**.

You are not required to translate into English any of the passages quoted in the questions that you attempt, although you may if you wish make use of them when giving your answers.

It is important to write good English.

Irrelevance will be penalised.

SECTION A

1 Is the *Phaedo* in any sense a Pythagorean work?

2 Πόθεν λαβόντες αὐτοῦ τὴν ἐπιστήμην; ἄρ' οὐκ ἐξ ὧν νυνδὴ ἐλέγομεν, ἢ ξύλα ἢ λίθους ἢ ἄλλα ἅττα ἰδόντες ἴσα, ἐκ τούτων ἐκείνο ἐνενοήσαμεν, ἕτερον ὃν τούτων; ἢ οὐχ ἕτερόν σοι φαίνεται; σκόπει δὲ καὶ τῆδε. ἄρ' οὐ λίθοι μὲν ἴσοι καὶ ξύλα ἐνίοτε ταῦτ' ὄντα τῷ μὲν ἴσα φαίνεται, τῷ δ' οὐ;
Πάνυ μὲν οὖν.
Τί δέ; αὐτὰ τὰ ἴσα ἔστιν ὅτε ἄνισά σοι ἐφάνη, ἢ ἡ ἰσότης ἀνισότης;
Οὐδεπώποτε γε, ὦ Σώκρατες.

Phaedo 74 b 4–c 3

Analyse and criticise Socrates' argument about equal sticks and stones. What is its function within the overall argument for Recollection?

3 Ἐπὶ δὲ θαυμαστῆς ἐλπίδος, ὦ ἑταῖρε, ὡχόμεν φερόμενος, ἐπειδὴ προῖων καὶ ἀναγιγνώσκων ὁρῶ ἄνδρα τῷ μὲν νῶ οὐδὲν χρώμενον οὐδέ τινας αἰτίας ἐπαιτιώμενον εἰς τὸ διακοσμεῖν τὰ πράγματα, ἀέρας δὲ καὶ αἰθέρας καὶ ὕδατα αἰτιώμενον καὶ ἄλλα πολλὰ καὶ ἄτοπα.

Phaedo 98 b 7–c 2

Why was Socrates disappointed with Anaxagoras?

4 ἀλλ' οὖν δὴ ταύτη γε ὤρμησα, καὶ ὑποθέμενος ἐκάστοτε λόγον ὃν ἂν κρίνω ἐρρωμενέστατον εἶναι, ἃ μὲν ἂν μοι δοκῇ τούτῳ συμφωνεῖν τίθημι ὡς ἀληθῆ ὄντα, καὶ περὶ αἰτίας καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἀπάντων [όντων], ἃ δ' ἂν μὴ, ὡς οὐκ ἀληθῆ.

Phaedo 100 a 3–7

What role does Socrates in the *Phaedo* assign to the use of hypotheses in philosophical inquiry?

[TURN OVER

5 ἔμοι γὰρ φαίνεται οὐ μόνον αὐτὸ τὸ μέγεθος οὐδέποτε ἔθελειν ἄμα μέγα καὶ μικρὸν εἶναι, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὸ ἐν ἡμῖν μέγεθος οὐδέποτε προσδέχεσθαι τὸ μικρὸν οὐδ' ἔθελειν ὑπερέχεσθαι, ἀλλὰ δυοῖν τὸ ἕτερον, ἢ φεύγειν καὶ ὑπεκχωρεῖν ὅταν αὐτῷ προσίῃ τὸ ἐναντίον, τὸ μικρὸν, ἢ προσελθόντος ἐκείνου ἀπολωλέναι· ὑπομένον δὲ καὶ δεξάμενον τὴν μικρότητα οὐκ ἔθελειν εἶναι ἕτερον ἢ ὅπερ ἦν.

Phaedo 102 d 6 e 3

How should we understand Socrates' talk of 'the largeness in us', and of its 'fleeing' and 'perishing', and what materials for the final proof of the soul's immortality are provided by his discussion of them?

SECTION B

6 Should the notion that Forms are 'separate' from particulars be judged to survive the critique offered in the *Parmenides*?

7 **Either** (a) In what ways does the first half of the *Theaetetus* in your view advance our understanding of perception, whether negatively or positively?

Or (b) Does *Theaetetus* 187–200 succeed in showing us why we should be, and should remain, puzzled about false belief?

8 To what extent, and on what grounds, does Plato see good government as dependent on moral knowledge? [*Discuss with reference to at least two dialogues.*]

9 In what ways, if any, is the *Timaeus* account of creation a myth?

10 Discuss critically Plato's use of collection and division as a dialectical method.

11 What are Plato's best arguments for the thesis that not all pleasures are good?

12 Discuss Plato's views on the ideal human relationship to god.

13 Is the main aim of the *Cratylus* to adjudicate the dispute between naturalism and conventionalism, or to move beyond it?

14 How, and how effectively, do the five 'greatest kinds' (μέγιστα γένη) in the *Sophist* contribute to Plato's solution to the problem of false statement?

15 How helpful are developmental approaches to Plato for the interpretation of his individual dialogues?