



CLASSICAL TRIPOS Part II
Group A Literature

Thursday 1 June 2006 1.30 to 4.30

Paper A4

**GREEK AND LATIN TEXTUAL CRITICISM AND
TRANSMISSION OF TEXTS**

Answer three questions: one from each Section.

You need not write out the passages in full unless asked to do so.

**Candidates who do not write legibly may find themselves at a grave
disadvantage.**

Irrelevance will be penalised.

STATIONERY REQUIREMENTS
20 Page Booklet x 1
Rough Work Pad x 1

SPECIAL REQUIREMENTS
None

**You may not start to read the questions
printed on the subsequent pages of this
question paper until instructed that you
may do so by the Invigilator**

SECTION A

1 Answer both (a) and (b).

(a) Explain why you would accept or reject the variants and conjectures given below one of the following passages.

- (i) Αν. οὐ γὰρ τάφου νῷν τῷ κασιγνήτῳ Κρέων
 τὸν μὲν προτίσας, τὸν δ' ἀτιμάσας ἔχει;
 Ἐτεοκλέα μέν, ως λέγουσι, σὺν δίκῃ
 χρησθεὶς δικαίᾳ καὶ νόμῳ κατὰ χθονὸς
 ἔκρυψε τοῖς ἐνερθεν ἐντιμον νεκροῖς. 25
 τὸν δ' ἀθλίως θανόντα Πολυνείκους νέκυν
 ἀστοῖσι φασιν ἐκκεκτρύχθαι τὸ μὴ
 τάφῳ καλύψαι μηδὲ κωκῦσαι τινα,
 ἐάν δ' ἄκλαυστον, ἄταφον, οἰωνοῖς γλυκὺν
 θησαυρὸν εἰσορῶσι πρὸς χάριν βορᾶς. 30
 τοιαῦτά φασι τὸν ἀγαθὸν Κρέοντα σοὶ
 κάμοι, λέγω γὰρ κάμε, κτρύξαντ' ἔχειν,
 καὶ δεῦρο νεῖσθαι ταῦτα τοῖς μὴ εἰδόσιν
 σαφῇ προκτρύξαντα, καὶ τὸ πρᾶγμ' ἄγειν
 οὐχ ως παρ' οὐδέν, ἀλλ' ὃς ἂν τούτων τι δρᾷ 35
 φόνον προκεῖσθαι δημόλευστον ἐν πόλει.
 οὕτως ἔχει σοι ταῦτα, καὶ δείξεις τάχα
 εἴτ' εὐγενῆς πέφυκας εἴτ' ἐσθλῶν κακή.
 Ισ. τί δ', ὦ ταλαῖφρον, εἰ τάδ' ἐν τούτοις, ἐγὼ
 λύουσ' ἂν ἡ θάπτουσα προσθείμην πλέον; 40

SOPHOCLES *Antigone* 21-40

21 τάφῳ K ^{ac} V ^{sl} , coni. Kousis	23-4 σὺν δίκῃσ / χρήσει Müller, σὺν δίκησ / κρίσει
Nauck post 23 lac. indic. Kern	24 del. Wunder χρήσθαι δικαιῶν τῷ νόμῳ
Schütz 28 φησιν L ^{ac} RZc	29 ἄκλαυτον L ^{ac} KR ἄταφον ἄκλ- LZcZf
29-30 γλυκὺν ... χάριν del. Löschhorn	30 del. Wunder θησαυρὸν] ἔρμαιον ε Σ
Heimreich εἰσορμῶσι anon.	χαρὰν Blaydes βοράν Löschhorn 33 τοῖσι

Livingius 34 προκηρύξαντα] -ύξοντα UYT^s: -ύσσοντα L^{ac}RV ἄγειν] ἔχειν
 ZoT 40 ḥ] εὶ Λ ḥ φάπτουσα Σ^{γρ}, Brunck, εἴθ' ἀπτουσα Porson
 κλάουσ' ἄν ḥ θάπτουσα Pantsch

(ii) Xo. πολλὰ τὰ δεινὰ κούδεν ἄν- στρ. α'
 θρώπου δεινότερον πέλει·
 τοῦτο καὶ πολιοῦ πέραν
 πόντου χειμερίψ νότῳ 335
 χωρεῖ, περιβρυχίοισιν
 περῶν ὑπ' οἰδμασιν, θεῶν
 τε τὰν ὑπερτάταν, Γᾶν
 ἄφθιτον, ἀκαμάταν, ἀποτρύεται,
 ἵλλομένων ἀρότρων ἔτος εἰς ἔτος, 340
 ἵππείψ γένει πολεῦον.

κουφονόων τε φῦλον ὄρ- ἀντ. α'
 νίθων ἀμφιβαλῶν ἄγει,
 καὶ θηρῶν ἀγρίων ἔθνη
 πόντου τ' ἐναλίαν φύσιν 345
 σπείραισι δικτυοκλώστοις
 περιφραδής ἀνήρ· κρατεῖ
 δὲ μηχαναῖς ἀγραύλου
 θηρὸς ὄρεσιβάτα, λασιαύχεινά θ' 350
 ἵππον ἄξεται ἀμφίλοφον ζυγὸν
 οὐρειόν τ' ἀδμῆτα ταῦρον.

SOPHOCLES *Antigone* 332-52

334 πέρα SZf	337 ἐπ' Zf, coni. Blaydes	341 πολεύων AUY, lemma ΣL
343 ἄγει] ἀγρεύει interpretatur Σ: ἄγρεῖ Nauck	345 εἰναλίαν T	348 ἀριφραδής
ἀνήρ e Soph. citat Eustathius	350 ὄρεσιβάτα KAUYT	351 ἄξεται]
ἄξεται L: ἔξετ' SV: ἄξετ' ZfZh: ἐλῶν ἄγετ' T: ὄχμάζεται Schöne, ὑπάξεται Brunck		
ἀμφὶ λόφον ζυγῷ Schöne et Franz, ἀμφιλόφῳ ζυγῷ Kayser		352 ἀκμῆτα LZc

(b) Explain why you would accept or reject the variants and conjectures given below one of the following passages.

- (i) Passer, deliciae meae puellae,
 quicum ludere, quem in sinu tenere,
 qui primum digitum dare at petenti
 ea acris solet incitare morsus,
 cum desiderio meo nitenti 5
 karum nescio quid libet iocari,
 et solaciolum sui doloris,
 credo, ut cum grauis acquiescat ardor:
 tecum ludere sicut ipsa possem
 et tristis animi leuare curas. 10
 tam gratum est mihi quam ferunt puellae
 pernici aureolum fuisse malum,
 quod zonam soluit diu negatam.

CATULLUS II

3 qui V: al. cui *O¹* at petenti V: appetenti γ: al. patenti *G¹R²* 4 ea V: et *R²*: aut
uel atque *Heyworth* 5 mei *Heyworth* 6 karum V: carum *m*: gratum *Heyworth*,
erae Harrison libet V: al. iubet *O¹* 7 et V: in *Itali*: ut *Guarinus*, ad *Ramler*, es
nescioquis sui] simul *Garrod* 8 uersum del. *Heyworth* ut cum ...
 acquiescat] ut tum ... acquiescat *Guarinus*, [ut] tum ... acquiescat *Baehrens*, [ut] cum ...
 acquiescit *Nisbet* (acquiescit *Ellis*) 8-7 credo ut cum grauis acquiescat ardor / sit
 solaciolum *Munro* 9 al. secum *O¹* luderem *OG¹* posse *Voss*, passer
Housman 11-13 *tamquam alterius carminis fragmentum sunt qui a praecedentibus*
seiungant 13 negatam V: ligatam *Priscianus*, *R²* (erat negatam *R²* in marg.)

- (ii) ut flos in saeptis secretus nascitur hortis,
 ignotus pecori, nullo conuulsus aratro, 40
 quem mulcent aurae, firmat sol, educat imber,
 multi illum pueri, multae optauere puellae:

idem cum tenui carptus defloruit ungui,
 nulli illum pueri, nullae optauere puellae:
 sic uirgo, dum intacta manet, tum cara suis est; 45
 cum castum amisit polluto corpore florem,
 nec pueris iucunda manet, nec cara puellis.
 Hymen o Hymenae, Hymen ades o Hymenae!
 ut uidua in nudo uitis quae nascitur aruo
 numquam se extollit, numquam mitem educat uuam, 50
 sed tenerum prono deflectens pondere corpus
 iam iam contingit summum radice flagellum;
 hanc nulli agricolae, multi acoluere iuuenci:
 at si forte eadem est ulmo coniuncta marita,
 multi illam agricolae, multi acoluere iuuenci: 55
 sic uirgo dum intacta manet, tum inculta senescit;
 cum par conubium maturo tempore adepta est,
 cara uiro magis et minus est inuisa parenti.
 <Hymen o Hymenae Hymen ades o Hymenae!> 58b
 et tua nec pugna cum tali coniuge, uirgo.
 non aequum est pugnare, pater cui tradidit ipse,
 ipse pater cum matre, quibus parere necesse est.
 uirginitas non tota tua est, ex parte parentum est,
 tertia patris, pars est data tertia matri,
 tertia sola tua est: noli pugnare duobus,
 qui genero sua iura simul cum dote dederunt. 65
 Hymen o Hymenae, Hymen ades o Hymenae!

CATULLUS LXII 39-66

39 <qui> in *Spengel* post 41 lacunam indicavit *Spengel*, <iam iam se expandit
 suavesque exspirat odores> *suppl. Goold* 45 tum *TOGR*²: cum R: dum *Quint.* 9.3.16
 53 multi acoluere *T*: nulli col(l)uere *V* 54 marita *T*: marito *V*: maritae *Heinsius* 55
 acoluere *T*: accolere *V*: coluere (γ) 56 intacta *TV*: innupta *Weber* tum *T*: dum *V*
 ante 59 add. <iam satis; at uiuas tali cum uirgine coniunx> *Meerwaldt* 59 et] at recc.
 tua *T*: tu *V* nec *TV*: ne *Guarinus* 62 om. *T* 63 patris *T*: pars patri *V*: pars patris
 est *Parrhasius*, pars patri *Avantius*, pars patrist *Haupt* pars est *T*: est *O*: data pars *GR*

SECTION B

2 Discuss the text of **three** of the following passages:

(a) *A messenger reports to servants on the shore that Hippolytus has been banished. Hippolytus arrives with a large crowd.*

ἡμεῖς μὲν ἀκτῆς κυμοδέγμονος πέλας
ψήκτραισιν ἵππων ἐκτενίζομεν τρίχας
κλαίοντες· ἥλθε γάρ τις ἄγγελος λέγων 1175
ώς οὐκέτ' ἐν γῇ τῇδ' ἀναστρέψοι πόδα
Ἴππολυτος, ἐκ σοῦ τλήμονας φυγὰς ἔχων.
οἱ δ' ἥλθε ταύτον δακρύων ἔχων μέλος
ἡμῖν ἐπ' ἀκταῖς, μυρία δ' ὀποσθόπους
φίλων ἄμ' ἔστειχ' ἡλίκων ὄμηγυρις. 1180

EURIPIDES *Hippolytus* 1173-80

1176 ἀναστρέψοι ΒΔΡ: -ψει L: -φοι ΠΜΟΑΒ

1179 ἀκτάς Kirchhoff

1180 ἡλίκων <θ> Markland

There are two main groups of manuscripts: Ω = MBOA (s. xi-xiii), Λ = H (s. x-xi) + DELP (s. xiv). The group Λ divides into two sub-groups Δ (HDE) and LP. V (c. 1250-80) belongs to no group. Π is a papyrus of the 3rd century B.C.

(b) *The Birds claim that Eros is the parent of all things*

πρότερον δ' οὐκ ἦν γένος ἀθανάτων, πρὶν "Ερως συνέμειξεν ἅπαντα." 700
συμμειγνυμένων δ' ἐτέρων ἐτέροις γένετ' Οὐρανὸς Ὁκεανός τε
καὶ Γῆ πάντων τε θεῶν μακάρων γένος ἄφθιτον. ὥδε μέν ἐσμεν
πολὺ πρεσβύτατοι πάντων μακάρων ἡμεῖς. ώς δ' ἐσμὲν "Ερωτος
πολλοῖς δῆλον· πετόμεσθά τε γὰρ καὶ τοῖσιν ἐρώσι σύνεσμεν.

ARISTOPHANES *Aves* 700-704

701 δ' om. pars codd. γένετ' Triclinius: ἐγένετο δ' Μ: ἐγένετ' codd. plerique, Suda

703 ἡμεῖς. ώς δ' Dobree: ἡμεῖς δ' ώς codd. 704 τε γὰρ Daubuz: γὰρ codd.:

γ' ἀεὶ Bentley (cl. lemmate in Suda ἀεὶ τοῖς ἐρώσιν σύνεσμεν)

(c) *Gorgias will refute the poets who have slandered Helen, and expose the folly of those who listen to them.*

τοῦ δ' αὐτοῦ ἀνδρὸς λέξαι τε τὸ δέον ὄρθως καὶ ἐλέγξαι τοὺς μεμφομένους Ἐλένην, γυναικα περὶ ᾧς ὁμόφωνος καὶ ὁμόψυχος γέγονεν ἢ τε τῶν ποιητῶν ἀκουσάντων πίστις ἢ τε τοῦ ὄνόματος φήμη, ὁ τῶν συμφορῶν μνήμη γέγονεν. ἐγὼ δὲ βούλομαι λογισμόν τινα τῷ λόγῳ δοὺς τὴν μὲν κακῶς ἀκούουσαν παῦσαι τῆς αἰτίας, τοὺς δὲ μεμφομένους ψευδομένους ἐπιδεῖξαι καὶ δεῖξαι τάληθὲς ἢ παῦσαι τῆς ἀμαθίας.

GORGIAS *Heleneae Encomium* 2

2 ἀκουσάντων] πάντων Sauppe, ὁμοῦ πάντων Diels, ἀκμασάντων Radermacher ποιητῶν <πύστις ἢ τε τῶν> ἀκουσάντων Immisch 5 ἐπιδείξας καὶ δείξας τάληθὲς [ἢ] παῦσαι Blass, ἐπιδεῖξαι καὶ δεῖξαι <τε> τάληθὲς καὶ παῦσαι MacDowell

(d) *Horace will achieve world-wide fame: he pictures himself as a swan flying to the ends of the earth.*

iam Daedaleo notior Icaro	
uisam gementis litora Bosphori	
Syrtisque Gaetulas canorus	15
ales Hyperboreosque campos.	

HORACE *Carm. II 20* 13-16

13 notior *pars codd.*: ocior *pars codd.*: tutior Bentley, fortior Deltz, cautior Withof, audacior Peerlkamp

[TURN OVER

(e) *Ovid begs that the elements will speed Corinna back to him.*

uade memor nostri uento reditura secundo;
 impleat illa tuos fortior aura sinus.
 tum mare in haec magnus proclinet litora Nereus,
 huc uenti spectent, huc agat eurus aquas. 40

OVID *Amores* II. 11. 37-40

40 huc *PYS²ω*: haec *S*: hac *DF* uenti (-is *PW*) spectent *PS*: uentis *Y*: uventus spectet
ySS: uenti spirent *Dousa*, uenti properent *Watt* eurus] aestus *ω*

P (s. ix-x), *Y* and *S* (s. xi) are the oldest manuscripts (*y* and *S²* are later hands). *ω* = the majority of the later manuscripts (mainly s. xiii), *S* = a minority of them.

(f) *Is life worth living?*

nihil est tam fallax quam uita humana, nihil tam insidio: non mehercules quisquam illam accepisset, nisi daretur intibus. itaque si felicissimum est non nasci, proxime, puto, breuitate defunctos cito in integrum restitui.

SENECA *Consolatio ad Marciam* 22. 3

1 insidio *A*: insidiosum *RV* 2 intibus *A*: insciis *RV*: inuitis *Abel*, ignorantibus
Reynolds proxime *A*: proximum *RV*: proximum est *Gertz* 3 breuitate]
 breui aetate *Hertz*

The tradition divides into two branches: *A* (s. xi) and *RV* (s. xiv). The text above is printed from *A*. The editor of the OCT argues that most of the good readings of *RV* are conjectural.

3 This poem is preserved in manuscripts M (s. xi-xii) and A (s. xiv) of the anthologist Stobaeus (s. v). Lines 1-2 are also quoted by Plutarch (s. i-ii). The text below is printed from M. Establish your own text, and evaluate the variants and conjectures.

Gather ye rosebuds while ye may.

τίς δὲ βίος, τί δὲ τερπνὸν ἄτερ χρυσῆς Ἀφροδίτης;
 τεθναίην ὅτε μοι μηκέτι ταῦτα μέλοι,
 κρυπταδίη φιλότης καὶ μειλίχια δῶρα καὶ εύνή,
 οἱ ἥβης ἄνθεα γίνεται ἀρπαλέα
 ἀνδράσιν ἡδὲ γυναιξίν· ἐπεὶ τ' ὁδυνηρὸν ἐπέλθοι 5
 γῆρας, ὃ τ' αἰσχρὸν ὄμως καὶ καλὸν ἄνδρα τιθεῖ,
 ἀεὶ μὲν φρένας ἀμφὶ κακαὶ τείνουσι μέριμναι,
 οὐδ' αὐγὰς προσορῶν τέρπεται ἡελίου,
 ἀλλ' ἔχθρὸς μὲν παισίν, ἀτίμαστος δὲ γυναιξίν· 10
 οὕτως ἀργαλέον γῆρας ἔθηκε θεός.

MIMNERMUS 1

1 βίος Stob.: χάρις Plut.	ἄτερ Stob.: ἄνευ Plut.	3 μείλιχα A ²
δῶρα Διώνης Hecker, δῶρ' Ἀφροδίτης Hartung		4 οἱ M: εἱ A: οἱ'
Ahrens, οἱ' Bergk	ἄνθεα τῆς (ταῦθ' Hermann, τέρπν' Hartung) ἥβης Grotius	
γίγνεται A	5 ἐπήν Brunck	ἐπέλθοι M: -θη A
6 ὄμως Doederlein	κακὸν Hermann	7 ἀεὶ M: αἰεὶ A μὲν MA: μιν
Bergk	τείνουσι M: τείρουσι A	8 προσορᾶν Grotius
West		9 γυναικί

[TURN OVER]

4 The older manuscripts (s. xi-xii) divide into two groups: MNSU and BFLP. S designates a reading found in one or more later manuscripts. The latest editor (R.J. Tarrant) observes: 'liqueat lectiones quae ex codicibus antiquioribus plane exciderint in codicibus recentioribus conseruari posse'. The text printed below follows the older manuscripts. Constitute your own text of the passage (you need not copy it out in full).

Erysichthon (son of Triopas) cuts down a huge sacred oak, and in doing so kills the tree-nymph. The Dryads beg Ceres to avenge their sister.

saepe sub hac Dryades festas duxere choreas,
saepe etiam manibus nexit ex ordine truncum
circuiere modum, mensuraque roboris ulnas
quinque ter implebat, nec non et cetera tanto
silua sub hac omnis quanto fuit herba sub omni. 750

non tamen idcirco ferrum Triopeius illa
abstinuit famulosque iubet succidere sacrum
robur et, ut iussos cunctari uidit, ab uno
edidit haec rapta sceleratus uerba securi:
"non dilecta deae solum, sed et ipsa licebit 755
sit dea, iam tanget frondente cacumine terram."
dixit, et obliquos dum telum librat in ictus,
contremuit gemitumque dedit Deoia quercus,
et pariter frondes, pariter pallescere glandes
coepere ac longi pallorem ducere rami.
cuius ut in trunco fecit manus impia uulnus, 760
haud aliter fluxit discusso sanguine cortex
quam solet, ante aras ingens ubi uictima taurus
concidit, abrupta crux e ceruice profundi.
obstipuere omnes aliquisque ex omnibus audet
deterrere nefas saeuamque inhibere bipennem;
aspicit hunc "mentis"que "piae cape praemia" dixit
Thessalus inque uirum conuertit ab arbore ferrum
detruncatque caput repetitaque robora caedit.
editus e medio sonus est de robore talis: 770
"nympha sub hoc ego sum Cereri gratissima ligno,
quae tibi factorum poenas instare tuorum

uaticinor moriens, nostri solacia leti."
 persequitur scelus ille suum, labefactaque tandem
 ictibus innumeris adductaque funibus arbor
 corruit et multa, prostravit pondere siluam.
 attonitae Dryades damno nemorumque suoque
 omnes germanae Cererem cum uestibus atris
 maerentes adeunt poenamque Erysichonis orant.

775

OVID *Metamorphoses* VIII 746-79

749-50 tanto ... quanto <i>MNSBFL</i> : tantum ... quantum <i>M²N^cUP</i>	<i>Heinsius</i>	fuit] iacet <i>S</i> (<i>probat Heinsius</i>)	750 omnis] silua
			omni] illa <i>N^cB³</i>
757 telum dum <i>UFP</i>		760 pallorem ducere} sudore madescere <i>S</i> : sudorem	
ducere <i>S</i> : lurorem ducere <i>Kenney</i>		762 discusso sanguine cortex} discusso cortice	
sanguis <i>U³S</i> : discussus sanguine cortex <i>S</i>		770 editus} redditus <i>M</i>	e] et <i>MS</i>
de <i>MNSBFL</i> : cum <i>UP</i> : tum <i>S</i> : hic <i>B²</i>		774 ille} ipse <i>S</i>	775 abductaque <i>P</i>
nubibus <i>M^a</i>		777 suoque <i>M^cN^cSUBP</i> : suorum <i>MNFL</i> : suaequae <i>eodem anno</i> (1972)	
<i>Diggle, Anderson</i>		778 omnes] et nece <i>S</i>	'locus fortasse interpolatus
et sic uel simili modo restituendus: [omnes germanae]		maerentes adeunt Cererem [cum	
uestibus atris] poenamque <precantur> [Erysichonis orant]' <i>Tarrant</i>			

[TURN OVER

SECTION C

5 'Nobis et ratio et res ipsa centum codicibus potiores sunt' (BENTLEY). Discuss.

6 'Textual criticism is a glorified form of proof-reading' (G. HIGHET). Discuss.

7 Describe the main stages in the transmission of the text of either *Antigone* or Catullus.

8 How useful is the concept of an 'archetype' in the transmission of Sophocles or Catullus or both?

9 Transcribe the text of *Antigone* (including scholia and glosses) from the photograph provided. Identify the manuscript and comment briefly on its relationship to the other manuscripts and on any features of palaeographical interest.

10 Transcribe the text of Catullus (including headings and variants) from the photograph provided. Identify the manuscript and comment briefly on its relationship to the other manuscripts and on any features of palaeographical interest.

END OF PAPER