

SQ14/H/01

# English Reading for Understanding, Analysis and Evaluation

Date — Not applicable

Duration — 1 hour 30 minutes

#### Total marks — 30

Attempt ALL questions.

Write your answers clearly in the answer booklet provided. In the answer booklet you must clearly identify the question number you are attempting.

Use blue or black ink.

Before leaving the examination room you must give your answer booklet to the Invigilator; if you do not, you may lose all the marks for this paper.





The following two passages focus on the importance of trees.

#### Passage 1

In the first passage Janice Turner, writing in The Times newspaper, considers the value of trees.

Read the passage below and attempt the questions which follow.

Watching the tree surgeon from the window, I felt I was witnessing a crime. One I'd authorised, like a Mafia hit. The holm oak - a dense, virulent, evergreen ball - loomed over the garden like a storm cloud. It had to be cut back. But as the chainsaw whined and branches tumbled, I wondered if I really had the right.

- 5 I'm a resolute city-dweller, but trees seem ever more precious these days, a rebuke to built-in obsolescence, a steady point in a churning world. My pear and apple trees are remnants from when South London orchards ran all the way down to meet the sea. The walnut reaches out a mammoth limb from my neighbour's garden to mine like God's arm on the ceiling of the Sistine Chapel in Rome.
- 10 They are our living past, clocking up the years, ring by ring. Trees are calming like cathedrals, reassuring us that they will endure even though we will not. No wonder the ancients believed they were gods; there are worse things to worship than a tree.
- And this week, reading how some protesters had been arrested trying to prevent ancient woodland being destroyed to make way for a three-mile link road to Hastings, I thought: yes, I'd go to prison for a tree. Indeed, the protesters who are digging tunnels in the mud and standing before the diggers are not "eco-warriors" or "hippies". Among them are young families, retired folk and ordinary dog-walkers. "Local grandmothers", it was reported, came to swing in giant hammocks strung between the 400-year-old oaks.
- But this is their last stand. They can only slow the developers. By March the trees will be felled. Local people have fought for 20 years to save them, but they are on the wrong side of what the government is determined to market as progress, however short-term and dubious the economic benefits. The Chancellor of the Exchequer gave £56.8 million of government money for this very road, which will fill up with extra traffic, as new roads do, and lead in time to a spanking new industrial estate, although Hastings town already has plenty of boarded-up premises from which to trade.
- Development versus the trees. The government tells us that those who want to protect open countryside and woodland from being turned into endless Lego-brick estates are not conservationists, they are selfish, privileged people who, sitting comfortably in their own cheaply bought piles, have no care for struggling young couples who can't afford a family home.

  30 Anyway, what's a bunch of trees?
- But people with no respect for trees show a special kind of arrogance: they think they're bigger than history. I'd argue that cutting down an ancient oak is worse than killing most types of animal. Certainly the more numerous species such as dogs, cows, monkeys or cats. A chainsaw slicing into a 300-year-old trunk is more brutal and grotesque than hunting 100 foxes. Chopping down a fine old tree is more like shooting an elephant or harpooning a whale: the aching poignancy of an enormous creature whose size and strength nonetheless cannot save it. Except even the mightiest mammal can be bred to maturity in a few years. Not so a tree.
- Yet it is astonishing, given how much people love them planting them to mark special moments or honour dead loved ones, measuring their lives by their seasonal changes that officialdom loathes trees. Insurance companies fretting about subsidence would rather you took them all down just in case. Councils detest them, employing municipal butchers to hack away at whole groves. Embarrassed stumps with a couple of twigs are all that remain.

- It's a wonder any tree survives a health and safety audit. One City Council tried to remove a whole row of horsechestnuts because conkers fell on cars and children might slip on leaves. Our local primary school cut down a fine tree beneath which generations of children had played, because the new head deemed its twigs and leaves too messy. A posh gardener once suggested we cut down most of our trees and start again with fresh, more groovy varieties. This misunderstood the very point: trees are the antithesis of fickle fashion. But some crass homeowners can't bear the fluff-balls from plane trees messing up their hall carpet or the lime sap puking down on their shiny car bonnets. Neater to reach for the axe. Maybe garden centres should start selling plastic ones: say goodbye to autumnal hell.
  - Visiting Burma, I learnt that its teak forests were flogged off to China by the generals, who were desperate for quick cash, like a beautiful girl being forced to sell her hair. Iceland is barren because Vikings cut them all down in a year and Peru is logging away its resources.
- Our country's trees will tumble to make way for the machines of progress. But for how much economic growth is it worth mowing down a wood? Trees are beyond priceless: they are our history inscribed in the natural world. Which rich men, planting beautiful orchards to their own glorious memory, have always known.

Adapted from an article in The Times newspaper, January 2013.

### Passage 2

In the second passage below, the science writer Colin Tudge gives his own views on trees.

Read the passage and attempt the question which follows. While reading, you may wish to make notes on the main ideas and/or highlight key points in the passage.

In New Zealand a few years ago I experienced more powerfully than ever the sheer gravitas of trees: in the presence of the world's largest kauri. Kauris are conifers, the biggest of their family. The great trunk of the kauri rises like a lighthouse out of the gloom: fifteen metres in circumference — it would touch all four walls in an average living room — and straight up, leafless, for twenty metres or so. And then on its great horizontal boughs rests a virtual park, a floating island with an entire ecosystem of ferns and flowers. Kauris are about 2000 years old. For the first 1400 years of the kauri's life, moas strutted their stuff around its base. Moas included the world's tallest-ever birds, like giant emus, which were preyed upon by commensurately huge but short-winged eagles. The moas and their attendant eagles are now long gone. The kauri lives on.

The remaining kauri forest has been horribly reduced these past two hundred years, but the way modern New Zealanders look after the trees that are left to them is a model for all the world. Rare trees are no longer felled but existing planks are prized and meticulously re-cycled. Meanwhile, you can follow slatted wooden paths among the vast conifers. That's conservation; that's intelligent ecotourism.

Similarly, if new farming economies are to come about, then trees must be at the centre of them. Yet, tree-based farming systems have to fight for survival against the massed ranks of the powers-that-be. How ludicrous. The world's most powerful governments have made themselves answerable to the big companies — and they take pride in this. They call it "realism".

- 20 So although the things that need doing seem obvious, governments and the big corporations whose interests they serve have a quite different agenda. If we want life to be agreeable or indeed to continue at all we just have to ignore the pressures from our ostensible leaders, and do things the way they should be done: building new ways of life, whatever the pressures from on high. Again, trees show the way.
- Outstanding among the world's many popular initiatives is the Greenbelt Movement, a campaign among Kenyan women to re-plant trees in places they used to grow. Now they have planted 30 million. They have transformed landscapes and changed entire economies and the whole tenor of life. This kind of thing, very simple, and achieved in the teeth of the modern economy (for who makes money out of it?), contributes far more to human wellbeing than, say, cheap white goods from China, on which the economy of the modern world, egged on by our world leaders, is being built.

The broadest issue of all is the western conceit that we can "conquer" nature, or indeed control it. This idea truly took off in the 19th century, and yet is taken still as a mark of modernity. In 1879 the poet Gerard Manley Hopkins lamented the felling of poplars: "O if we but knew what we do/When we delve or hew — Hack and rack the growing green!" We still don't know what we are doing but the hacking and racking continue more vigorously than ever. The only halfway sane approach if we want this world to remain habitable, is to approach it humbly. Trees teach humility. We need to take the world far more seriously. It would be a good idea to begin with trees.

Adapted from an article published on Colin Tudge's website in 2005.

5

#### Question

7. Both writers express their views about the importance of trees. Identify key areas on which they agree. In your answer, you should refer in detail to both passages.

You may answer this question in continuous prose or in a series of developed bullet points.

[END OF SPECIMEN QUESTION PAPER]

[BLANK PAGE]

### Acknowledgement of Copyright

- Passage 1 Article is adapted from "Cutting down a tree is worse than fox hunting" by Janice Turner, taken from The Times, 12 January 2013. © The Times, 01 2013.
- Passage 2 Article is adapted from "Trees, me, and all of us" by Colin Tudge. Reproduced by kind permission of Colin Tudge.



SQ14/H/01

# English Reading for Understanding, Analysis and Evaluation

# Marking Instructions

These Marking Instructions have been provided to show how SQA would mark this Specimen Question Paper.

The information in this publication may be reproduced to support SQA qualifications only on a non-commercial basis. If it is to be used for any other purpose, written permission must be obtained from SQA's Marketing team on permissions@sqa.org.uk.

Where the publication includes materials from sources other than SQA (ie secondary copyright), this material should only be reproduced for the purposes of examination or assessment. If it needs to be reproduced for any other purpose it is the user's responsibility to obtain the necessary copyright clearance.



# General Marking Principles for Higher English: Reading for Understanding, Analysis and Evaluation

This information is provided to help you understand the general principles you must apply when marking candidate responses to questions in this Paper. These principles must be read in conjunction with the detailed marking instructions, which identify the key features required in candidate responses.

- (a) Marks for each candidate response must <u>always</u> be assigned in line with these General Marking Principles and the Detailed Marking Instructions for this assessment.
- (b) Marking should always be positive. This means that, for each candidate response, marks are accumulated for the demonstration of relevant skills, knowledge and understanding: they are not deducted from a maximum on the basis of errors or omissions.
- (c) Candidates should gain credit for their understanding of the ideas of the passage, and their analysis and evaluation of the writer's use of language.
- (d) Candidates should use their own words as far as possible, unless the candidate is discussing or analysing a quotation.
- (e) Other answers can be accepted than those in the Marking Instructions as long as they are relevant and appropriate. We use the term "or any other acceptable answer" to allow for the possible variation in candidate responses. Credit should be given according to the accuracy and relevance of the candidate's answers.
- (f) In the final question on both passages, candidates should be rewarded for their ability to infer and summarise the ideas of both passages.
- (g) i) For questions that ask candidates to "Identify...", candidates must present in brief form/name.
  - ii) For questions that ask candidates to "Explain..." or ask "in what way...", candidates must relate cause and effect and/or make relationships between things clear.
  - iii) For questions that ask candidates to "Analyse", candidates must identify features of language and discuss their relationship with the ideas of the passage as a whole. Features of language might include word choice, imagery, tone, sentence structure, punctuation, sound techniques, and so on.
  - iv) For questions that ask candidates to "Evaluate", candidates must make a judgement on the effect of the language and/or ideas of the passage(s).

The following notes are offered to support markers in making judgements on candidates' evidence.

### Marking Instructions for each question

### Passage 1

Q	Question		Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
1	a		Candidates should identify two of the writer's feelings in the first paragraph.  Candidates must use their own words. No marks are awarded for verbatim quotations from the passage.  1 mark for each point from the "Additional Guidance" column.	2	Possible answers include:  • she felt troubled, as though watching an illegal/senseless act • she felt responsible/guilty for a terrible act • she felt morally uncertain; questioned whether or not she was justified in doing this or any other acceptable answer
1	b		Candidates should analyse how the language emphasises the importance of trees.  Marks will depend on the quality of comment on appropriate language feature(s).  2 marks may be awarded for reference plus detailed/insightful comment; 1 mark for reference plus more basic comment; 0 marks for reference alone.  Possible answers shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.	4	Possible answers include:  Word choice  "ever more (precious)" suggests trees' increasing value  "precious" suggests trees are valuable, to be cherished  "a rebuke to built-in obsolescence": trees effectively criticise/stand in opposition to a world where products are designed to have only a limited life  "remnants" suggests precious remains from the past  "mammoth (limb)" suggests something on a massively impressive scale  "reassuring" suggests they offer comfort  "they will endure" suggests permanence, continuity, resilience  "the ancients" suggests trees have been considered valuable throughout the ages  "gods" suggests their almost religious significance  "ring by ring" suggests trees' natural, organic, unhurried growth  "worship" suggests our attitude should be respectful, reverent, devotional  "worseworship": candidates might argue that the use of

Q	uestio	Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
				alliteration adds to the impact of the concluding statement • use in general of "religious" language ("God's arm", "cathedrals", "gods", "worship") heightens trees' spiritual significance • "our living past": trees connect us to our heritage  Imagery • "a steady point in a churning world": trees offer steadfast permanence in a fast-changing, impermanent, turbulent world • (personification of) "reaches out", "mammoth limb" suggests a majestic living creature • "like God's armRome": simile suggests majesty, beauty, spiritual significance, awesome impact • "calming like cathedrals": simile suggests their scale, majesty, spiritual quality, that they should be treated with reverence, that they are good for our inner well-being
				<ul> <li>Punctuation/sentence structure</li> <li>structure of opening sentence "I'mworld": the two phrases at the end of the sentence (heightened by the parallel structure) serve as a powerful development of the "precious" idea</li> <li>balanced nature of final sentence: the artful juxtaposition of the near-reverent tone of the first part of the sentence, followed by the more matter-of-fact, modern tone of the second half brings the paragraph to a quietly effective conclusion</li> <li>or any other acceptable answer</li> </ul>
2		Candidates should demonstrate understanding of how the protesters differ from what might have been expected.  Candidates must use their own words. No marks are	2	Possible answers include:  • we might have expected the protesters to be (over)zealous environmental activists/(ultra)dedicated conservationists (explanation of "eco-warriors")/people who have rejected the

Qı	uestio	n Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
3		awarded for verbatim quotations from the passage.  1 mark for each point from the "Additional Guidance" column.  Candidates should analyse how the writer's use of	3	conventional values of society (explanation of "hippies") • instead they are just normal people/a typical cross-section of the community/ people of all ages and from all walks of life or any other acceptable answer  Possible answers include:
3		language conveys her feelings of unhappiness.  Marks will depend on the quality of comment. For full marks there must be comment on at least two features. 2 marks may be awarded for reference plus detailed/insightful comment; 1 mark for reference plus more basic comment; 0 marks for reference alone.  Possible answers shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.	3	Sentence structure  • series of three short, simple, matter-of-fact sentences at start of paragraph suggest the inevitable fate that awaits the trees and the irresistible march of the developers  • positioning of "By March" at start of sentence suggests fixed, immovable timeline to destruction  • structure of fourth sentence ("Localbenefits."): initial praise for efforts of local community is offset immediately by pessimistic recognition of government power; the sentence then reaches a climax with her attack on government policy  • use of parenthesis "as new roads do" to emphasise the inevitable futility of government transport policy  Word choice:  • "last stand" (could be dealt with as imagery) suggests a defensive position facing inevitable defeat against insuperable odds  • "only" suggests defeat itself is inevitable  • "determined" suggests inflexible, unyielding nature of government policy  • "market" suggests her scepticism about government policy: they are "selling" it as progress but "market" suggests this is more image than reality; suggests government is being unscrupulous, deceitful, conniving  • "short-term" suggests transient, limited nature (of benefits)

Q	uesti	on	Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
					<ul> <li>"dubious" suggests deep uncertainty, unreliability (of benefits)</li> <li>"fill up" suggests saturation, full to overflowing</li> <li>"spanking new": hyperbole of her apparent enthusiasm could be argued to betoken her fundamental antipathy</li> <li>"boarded-up" suggests the development will be to the continued detriment of an already rundown Hastings; suggests that Hastings itself needs attention</li> </ul>
					Contrast • "spanking new" versus "boarded-up" emphasises the pointlessness of building new premises when existing ones lie empty and abandoned
					<ul> <li>Tone</li> <li>some candidates may recognise and discuss the changing tone of this paragraph, in particular the somewhat defeated, hopeless tone of the first three sentences which changes to an angry, scathing, sceptical tone in the rest of the paragraph.</li> </ul>
					or any other acceptable answer
4	a		Candidates should identify two claims the government makes about the protesters.  For full marks there must be understanding demonstrated of two claims.  Any two points from the "Additional Guidance" column for 1 mark each.	2	Possible answers include:  the government claims the protesters:     are not interested in protecting the environment     are only interested in looking after their own (advantaged) interests     have no interest in the fate of people less well-off/less fortunate than themselves
					or any other acceptable answer

Q	Question		Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
4	b		Candidates should analyse how at least two features of language convey the strength of the writer's belief in tree conservation.  Marks will depend on the quality of understanding shown of key ideas and the quality of comment on appropriate language features. 2 marks may be awarded for detailed/insightful comments; one mark for more basic comments; 0 marks for reference alone.  Possible answers shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.	4	Word choice  "special kind" suggests people who don't care about trees are particularly awful  "arrogance" suggests the insufferable conceit of those who don't care about trees  "bigger than history" suggests arrogance on a grand scale  (repeated) use of violent language when describing trees — felling (ie "cutting down" suggests something akin to an act of murder; "slicing into" suggests a savage, violent attack; "brutal" suggests a ruthless, crude, cruel, vicious attack; "grotesque" suggests a strange, distorted, unnatural, outrageous act; "chopping down" suggests a categorical, definitive act).  "fine" suggests the majesty, worthiness of the tree  "aching (poignancy)" suggests how deeply hurt she is when trees are cut down  writer's use of "shock tactics" in making a developed, quite visceral comparison between killing living creatures and cutting down trees: some candidates may recognise that the writer shows the strength of her feeling by developing an argument that many readers will find shocking or extreme
					<ul> <li>Imagery</li> <li>by comparing (in a very visual way) the fate of trees to the fate of whales and elephants ("mightiest mammal") the writer is associating trees with elevated concepts such as the awesome wonder of the natural world, beauty, majesty, conservation</li> <li>"enormous creature" suggests epic scale of what is being destroyed</li> </ul>

Q	Question		Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
5	a		Candidates should identify any four reasons given for cutting down trees.  Candidates should use their own words as far as possible. No marks are awarded for verbatim quotations from the passage.  Any four points from the "Additional Guidance" column for 1 mark each.	4	<ul> <li>Punctuation/sentence structure</li> <li>use of colon (line 31) introduces explanation of what this "special kind of arrogance" involves</li> <li>punchy conclusion to paragraph ("Not so a tree") emphasises just how different the trees' situation is to even the most impressive or endangered of our natural creatures</li> <li>or any other acceptable answer</li> <li>Possible answers include:</li> <li>they may contribute to land sinking (which would affect buildings on that land)</li> <li>they are regarded as potentially damaging to vehicles</li> <li>they are regarded as potentially a danger to young people</li> <li>they shed (twigs and leaves) and that leaves things (public spaces, houses or vehicles) looking dirty and untidy</li> <li>some trees are considered unfashionable (and people want to replace them with something more popular)</li> <li>selling trees makes money, can boost a country's economy</li> <li>they are converted into timber for commercial purposes</li> </ul>
5	b		Candidates should analyse how their chosen image emphasises the writer's opposition to cutting down trees.  Marks will depend on the quality of comment. A detailed/insightful comment will be worth 2 marks; a more basic comment will be worth 1 mark. Mere identification of an image will be 0 marks.	2	or any other acceptable answer  Possible answers include:  • "butchers": just as a butcher is involved in carving up animals into large-scale pieces, so the writer is suggesting that municipal workers are cutting back the trees to a significant degree. It also suggests that the nature of the work performed is rather brutal and indiscriminate  • "embarrassed stumps": just as an embarrassed person feels self-

Question	Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
	When dealing with imagery, answers must show recognition of the literal root of the image and then explore how the writer is extending it figuratively.  Possible answers shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.		conscious and exposed, so the writer is suggesting that trees look vulnerable after the work has been carried out on them  • "autumnal hell": just as hell is seen as a place of eternal damnation, so the writer is using this hyperbolic term to ridicule the wild over-reaction of those who find trees a problem at particular times of the year  • "like a beautiful girl being forced to sell her hair": just as the girl exchanges a personal asset, an attractive feature for financial gain, so the writer suggests Burma gave away part of the country's natural beauty for money  or any other acceptable answer
6	Candidates should evaluate the final paragraph's effectiveness as a conclusion to the passage as a whole.  Marks will depend on the quality of comment. For full marks there must be appropriate attention to the idea of a conclusion. A more basic comment may be awarded 1 mark.  Possible answers shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.	2	<ul> <li>• the writer concedes that inevitably trees will be cut down to make way for developments, a point she has already made in relation to the Hastings development and government policy in general</li> <li>• the writer returns to an argument which she has discussed throughout the passage: economic growth versus the innate value of trees. The Hastings development is an example of economic growth (very short-term in the writer's opinion), while the writer stresses at several points the value of preserving trees (for example, establishing the majesty and wonder of trees in the opening paragraphs; showing how much they mean to ordinary people protesting against the Hasting development; suggesting they are more important than creatures great and small)</li> <li>• the writer concludes by re-asserting how important a part of our heritage trees are: they are a link to our past ("they are our history inscribed in the natural world") and a means by which people leave their mark on society ("which rich men, planting beautiful orchards to their own glorious memory"). The link to</li> </ul>

Q	uesti	on	Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
					the past idea has already been developed, for example in lines 10-11, while the idea of planting trees for posterity is explicitly discussed in lines 38-39 ("plantingloved ones").  • some candidates will recognise the elevated quality of the writing in the final paragraph (quite different in tone to some of the almost brutally graphic sections of the passage) and link it to the persuasively idealistic message the writer has been trying to convey in much of the passage  or any other acceptable answer

### Passage 2

Q	uestion	Expected Response	Max mark	Additional Guidance
7		Candidates should identify key areas of agreement in the two passages by referring in detail to both passages.  There may be some overlap among the areas of agreement. Markers will have to judge the extent to which a candidate has covered two points or one.  Candidates can use bullet points in this final question, or write a number of linked statements.  Evidence from the passage may include quotations, but these should be supported by explanations.  Approach to marking shown in the "Additional Guidance" column.  Key areas of agreement shown in grid below. Other answers are possible.	5	The mark for this question should reflect the quality of response in two areas:  • identification of the key areas of agreement in attitude/ideas • level of detail given in support  The following guidelines should be used:  Five marks — comprehensive identification of three or more key areas of agreement with full use of supporting evidence Four marks — clear identification of three or more key areas of agreement with relevant use of supporting evidence Three marks — identification of three or more key areas of agreement with supporting evidence Two marks — identification of two key areas of agreement with supporting evidence One mark — identification of one key area of agreement with supporting evidence Zero marks — failure to identify any key area of agreement and/or total misunderstanding of task

	Area of Agreement	Janice Turner	Colin Tudge
1	awe/wonder/majesty	spiritual, almost religious significance; comparison to whales, elephants	magnificence of the kauri
2	heritage/permanence	link to previous centuries; certain feature in an uncertain world; will outlive us all	have outlasted the moa; now treated with reverence in New Zealand
3	trees as teachers	we should question our assumption of superiority	we can learn from trees
4	ordinary people see trees' importance	Hastings protesters; gift to posterity	New Zealand conservationists; Kenyan women (impact on quality of life)
5	government and businesses' misguided economic priorities	government short-termism (Britain, Burma, Iceland, etc); trees considered expendable in the interests of "progress"	opposition to tree-based farming; profit-driven outlook of big businesses
6	lack of respect	councils, officialdom, some homeowners	historical clearing; governments; companies; western desire to control nature
7	brutality	trees are cut down or cut back quite brutally	hacking and racking continues

## [END OF SPECIMEN MARKING INSTRUCTIONS]