

X013/701

NATIONAL
QUALIFICATIONS
2007

MONDAY, 28 MAY
1.00 PM – 4.00 PM

CLASSICAL
STUDIES
ADVANCED HIGHER

Answer **Part 1** and **Part 2**.

200 marks are allocated to this paper.



Part 1

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 1–4. (Note: there are two options in Question 4.)

Passage 1

Men kept crowding round them and congratulating them on their strength, and women kept telling the mother how lucky she was to have such sons, when, in sheer pleasure at the public recognition of her sons' act, she prayed to the goddess Hera, before whose shrine she stood, to grant Cleobis and Biton, who had brought her such honour, the greatest blessing that can fall to mortal men.

(Herodotus, 1.31)

Passage 2

My body only has been violated. My heart is innocent, and death will be my witness. Give me your solemn promise that the adulterer shall be punished. He is Sextus Tarquinius. He it is who last night came as my enemy disguised as my guest, and took his pleasure of me. That pleasure will be my death—and his too, if you are men.

(Livy, 1.58)

Passage 3

The accuracy of these details concerning Hannibal's war establishment need not surprise the reader . . . At the same time I need not be condemned as if I were imitating those historians who try to make their inaccuracies convincing. The fact is that I discovered on Lake Lacinium a bronze tablet which Hannibal himself had had inscribed with these details while he was in Italy.

(Polybius, 3.33)

Passage 4

And with regard to my factual reporting of the events of the war, I have made it a principle not to write down the first story that came my way, and not even to be guided by my own general impressions; either I was present myself at the events which I have described or else I heard of them from eye-witnesses, whose reports I have checked with as much thoroughness as possible.

(Thucydides, 1.22)

Questions

Marks

1. Read **Passage 1**. Why does Herodotus tell this story at this point in his narrative? **10**
2. Read **Passage 2**. How does this story fit Livy's declared aim, to describe Rome's rise to greatness? **10**
3. Read **Passage 3**. What do you learn about Polybius' approach to writing history from this extract and from your wider reading? **10**
4. **Either**
 - (a) Read **Passages 1–4**. From these passages and your wider reading, compare and assess each writer for his commitment to objectivity in writing history. **20**

or

 - (b) Read **Passages 1–4**. Discuss each of the above writers' attitudes to bold narrative in his history writing. **20**

(50)
(scaled to 100)

[Turn over

SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 5–8. (Note: there are two options in Question 8.)

Passage 1

But if children play on the right lines from the beginning and learn orderly habits from their education, these produce quite the opposite results, following and fostering their growth and correcting any previous flaws there may have been in society.

For example . . . the young should observe a proper silence in the presence of their elders, give up their seats to them and stand, and look after their parents; besides the whole business of one's dress and bearing, keeping one's hair and clothes and shoes tidy, and so on. Do you agree?

(Plato, *Republic* 4.424e–425b)

Passage 2

On the contrary, if we are to persuade them that no citizen has ever quarrelled with any other because it is sinful, our old men and women must tell children stories with this end in view from the first and we must compel our poets to tell them similar stories when they grow up. But we can admit to our state no stories about Hera being tied up by her son, or Hephaestus being flung out of Heaven by his father for trying to help his mother when she was getting a beating, nor any of Homer's Battles of the Gods, whether the intention is allegorical or not.

(Plato, *Republic* 2.378c–d)

Passage 3

The legislator ought to banish utterly from the state, as he would any other evil, all unseemly talk; for the unseemly remark lightly dropped results in conduct of a like kind. Especially, therefore, must it be kept away from youth; let them not hear or see anything of that kind. If anyone is found doing or saying any of the forbidden things, he shall, if he is of free birth but not yet entitled to recline at the common tables, be punished by measures of dishonour and a whipping.

(Aristotle, *Politics* 7.1336b)

Passage 4

Others again who say that regard should be had for the rights of fellow-citizens, but not of foreigners, would destroy the universal brotherhood of mankind; and, when this is annihilated, kindness, generosity, goodness and justice must perish utterly; and those who work all this destruction must be considered as wickedly rebelling against the immortal gods.

(Cicero, *On Duties* 3.28)

Questions

Marks

5. Read **Passage 1**. How true is it to say that Plato's only interest in the young is that they should be educated to fit in best to the society he advocates? **10**
6. Read **Passages 2 and 3**. Do Plato and Aristotle always agree on the role of censorship in their ideal states? **10**
7. Read **Passage 4**. From this passage and your wider reading, do you feel that Cicero is really a liberal at heart, or is he just showing common sense? **10**
8. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passages 1, 2 and 3**. "It is easy to see why thinking like this appealed to communist and fascist regimes in the 1930s." Is this being unfair to Plato and Aristotle? **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passages 1–4**. Which aspects of the state systems advocated by the authors whose works you have read seem to you to be most liable to be challenged by modern human rights legislation? **20**
- (50)**
- (scaled to 100)**

[Turn over

SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 9–12. (Note: there are two options in Question 12.)

Passage 1

So I ask you all to have the same opinion of me as of my forefathers, so that I may be enabled to follow their lead. Recall that they have resembled the city's greatest and most extensive benefactors for numerous reasons, but principally out of good will towards you, and the desire that, should they or any of their descendants be in danger or trouble, they might be preserved by the fellow-feeling you would have for them.

(Andocides, *On the Mysteries*, 141)

Passage 2

Do you need to go round and ask each other whether there is any startling news? What could be more startling than a Macedonian fighting a successful war against Athens and dictating the affairs of Greece? “Philip is dead”, comes one report. “No, he is only ill”, from another. What difference does it make? Should anything happen to Philip, Athens, in her present frame of mind, will soon create another Philip.

(Demosthenes, *Philippics*, 1, 10)

Passage 3

If a young man should happen to be found in the company of such a woman, then surely, Lucius Herennius, you would agree that this was not so much adultery as just plain sex—not an outrage to chastity, but mere satisfaction of appetite.

(Cicero, *In Defence of Caelius*, 49)

Passage 4

You have to know virtue, vice and all the rest in between. You need to know how to rouse anger and pity. So, whether you have to deal with hostile, prejudiced, envious, morose or frightened men, you will be able to feel your hearers' pulse, and proceed to adapt your speech as your characters require.

(Tacitus, *Dialogus*, 31)

Questions

Marks

9. Read **Passage 1**. From this and your wider reading, describe how Andocides tries to enlist his audience's support by using arguments that would be considered irrelevant in a modern court. **10**
10. Read **Passage 2**. Explain the force and effectiveness of this argument for action and compare it to other effective passages in which Demosthenes tries to rouse the Athenians to action. **10**
11. Read **Passage 3**. From this and your wider reading, explain what methods Cicero uses to destroy the reputation of Clodia. **10**
12. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passages 1–4**. Explain how each orator excites his audience's emotions. **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passages 1–4**. To what extent does prejudice work as a weapon in the armoury of each of these orators? **20**
- (50)**
(scaled to 100)

[Turn over

SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 13–16. (Note: there are two options in Question 16.)

Passage 1

- Strepsiades: Tell me the truth: do you love your father?
Pheidippides: I do, I swear it, by Poseidon the god of horses.
Strepsiades: Please, not by the god of horses! He's the one that's brought all this trouble on me. Well dear, if you really do love me from your heart—will you do something for me?
Pheidippides: What?
Strepsiades: I want you to reform—to change your ways—and go and learn what I'm going to ask you to.

(Aristophanes, *Clouds*, 80–87)

Passage 2

- Thepeople: Why, what was I like before? What did I use to do?
Sausage-seller: Well, for one thing, whenever anyone in the Assembly talked like this, yer know, “Thepeople, I love you, I cherish you, I care for you, I am your only protector”, the sorter standard opening, you know, well, you flapped yer wings and bellowed “Ear, ear” like a bloody bull.

(Aristophanes, *Knights*, 1350–1357)

Passage 3

It is worth your while to give ear, ye who wish ill success
to adulterous men, how on all sides they are beset by troubles,
how their pleasure is spoiled by many a pain, is won but rarely,
and then, as it often chances, amidst atrocious perils.
One has jumped from a roof, another has been flogged to death;
one while running away has blundered into a gang
of violent thugs; another has paid cash for his life;
another has been repeatedly raped by louts.

(Horace, *Satires* 1.2.37–44)

Passage 4

Well then, now that I've left town for my castle in the hills
what thing can I better praise in the satires of my lowland muse?
I'm spared the accursed struggle for status, and the leaden sirocco,
which in the tainted autumn enriches Our Lady of Funerals.

(Horace, *Satires* 2.6.16–19)

Passage 5

A word with himself now—if he will deign to listen.
Nowadays no one expects such generous presents
as the old Republican gentry once used to lavish
on their humbler friends. In those times such largesse
brought more honour than title or office. All we're asking
is—dine with us like an equal.

(Juvenal, *Satires* 5.107–112)

Questions

Marks

13. Read **Passage 1**. Is Aristophanes making a serious point about relationships between generations in this passage or is he milking the situation for laughs? **10**
14. Read **Passage 2**. Can we say with any certainty that the Sausage-seller's criticisms of 'Thepeople reflect Aristophanes' own views on the ways in which the Assembly was manipulated by Cleon? **10**
15. Read **Passage 3**. Is this passage typical of Horace's attitude to sexual behaviour? **10**
16. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passage 4**. "Horace attacks selfishness in his *Satires*, but is in fact guilty of the vice he condemns." Is this true? **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passage 5**. Is this the only occasion where Juvenal looks at the Republican past uncritically? Why does he glorify such a self-destructive period of Roman history? **20**
- (50)**
(scaled to 100)

[Turn over

PART 2

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

Answer TWO questions from your chosen section.

Each question is allocated 50 marks.

SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

1. What are the strengths and weaknesses of the insertion of speeches into Thucydides' narrative?
2. Do any of the classical historians you have read conform to modern ideas of what makes a good historian? In what respects do they conform?
3. Compare Polybius and Livy in respect of their treatment of the causes of the second Carthaginian War. Which writer do you find to be more analytical, and how effective is this analysis?
4. "Tacitus was a dramatist, not a historian." Discuss.

SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

5. How true is it to suggest that the rights of the individual are better protected in Aristotle's model constitution than in the sort of society which Plato advocates?
6. What elements of Plato's ideal state, as set out in the *Republic*, do you think would be unacceptable in a modern democracy?
7. "Cicero's views on political life are not only limited by his experiences of the society in which he lived, but have little application to any society other than that." Is this a fair assessment?
8. Mrs Thatcher once memorably said that there is no such thing as society. Do you think any of the writers whose works you have studied would agree with her?

SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

9. Discuss the effectiveness of Cicero's attack on Catiline with reference to his use of oratorical techniques.
10. From your study of classical orators, what do you think makes a great orator? Which of the orators studied is the greatest, in your opinion? Give reasons for your answer.
11. Explain the effectiveness of humour as a weapon in Cicero's *In Defence of Caelius*.
12. Compare and contrast Cicero in *de Oratore* and Plato in *Gorgias* with reference to their views on the respectability of oratory.

SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

13. Can you identify any consistent political or social message in Aristophanes' plays?
14. "Horace is a better satirist than Juvenal because his gentler and more subtle approach is more effective."

Do you agree with this statement? Give reasons for your answer.

15. "Satire, at least, is wholly Roman." (Quintilian)

What particular elements of their society did Roman satirists attack?

16. "A misogynist through and through."

Is this a fair assessment of Juvenal's attitude to women in his *Satires*?

[END OF QUESTION PAPER]

[BLANK PAGE]