

# X013/701

---

NATIONAL  
QUALIFICATIONS  
2008

MONDAY, 2 JUNE  
1.00 PM – 4.00 PM

CLASSICAL  
STUDIES  
ADVANCED HIGHER

Answer **Part 1** and **Part 2**.

200 marks are allocated to this paper.



## Part 1

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

### SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 1–4. (Note: there are two options in Question 4.)

#### Passage 1

In the course of that fight Leonidas fell, having fought like a man indeed. Many distinguished Spartans were killed at his side—their names, like the names of all the three hundred, I have made myself acquainted with, because they deserve to be remembered. Amongst the Persian dead, too, were many men of high distinction—for instance, two brothers of Xerxes, Habrocomes and Hyperanthes, both of them sons of Darius by Artanes' daughter Phratagune.

(Herodotus, 7.224)

#### Passage 2

By that time people felt their own private sufferings rather less acutely and, so far as the general needs of the state were concerned, they regarded Pericles as the best man they had. Indeed, during the whole period of peace-time when Pericles was at the head of affairs the state was wisely led and firmly guarded, and it was under him that Athens was at her greatest. And when the war broke out, here, too, he appears to have accurately estimated what the power of Athens was.

(Thucydides, 2.65.5)

#### Passage 3

Germanicus shared in the general grief, and laid the first turf of the funeral-mound as a heartfelt tribute to the dead. Thereby he earned Tiberius' disapproval. Perhaps this was because the emperor interpreted every action of Germanicus unfavourably. Or he may have felt that the sight of the unburied dead would make the army too respectful of its enemies.

(Tacitus, *Annals* 1.62)

#### Passage 4

These events carry in them many lessons for those who can read them rightly and wish to be guided in the conduct of their lives. The disaster which befell Regulus offers us the clearest possible illustration of the principle that we should not only rely upon the favours of Fortune, above all when we are enjoying success. Here we see the very man, who only a little while before had refused any pity or mercy to the vanquished, himself led captive and pleading before his victims for his own life.

(Polybius, 1.35)

## Questions

*Marks*

1. Read **Passage 1**. Is Herodotus objective in his treatment of the relative merits of the Greeks and the Persians in this war? **10**
  2. Read **Passage 2**. In what ways did Pericles represent the best qualities of Athens for Thucydides? **10**
  3. Read **Passage 3**. What do we learn about Tacitus' values from his account of Germanicus' career? **10**
  4. **Either**
    - (a) Read **Passages 3 and 4**. Do Polybius and Tacitus give similar importance to the character of individuals? **20**

**or**

    - (b) Read **Passages 1, 2, 3 and 4**. Are all four writers similar in their ability to create vivid personalities for their historical characters? **20**
- (50)**  
**(scaled to 100)**

**[Turn over**

## SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 5–8. (Note: there are two options in Question 8.)

### Passage 1

“As far as the gods are concerned, then, we have now outlined the sort of stories which men ought and ought not to hear from their earliest childhood, if they are to honour the gods and their parents, and know how important it is to love one another.”

“And I think we are quite right,” he said.

“But what if they are to be brave? Must we not extend our range to include something that will give them the least possible fear of death? Or will anyone who in his heart fears death ever be brave?”

(Plato, *Republic* 3.386a–b)

### Passage 2

“Look at it again this way. I assume that you will make it the duty of our rulers to administer justice?”

“Of course.”

“And won’t they try to follow the principle that men should not take other people’s belongings or be deprived of their own?”

“Yes.”

“Their reason presumably being that it is *just*.”

“Yes.”

“So we reach again by another route the conclusion that justice is keeping what is properly one’s own and doing one’s own job.”

(Plato, *Republic* 4.433e)

### Passage 3

Still, oligarchy and tyranny are shorter-lived than any other constitution. The longest tyranny was the Sicyonian, that of Orthagoras and his sons: it lasted a hundred years. That was because they treated their subjects with moderation and in many matters subjected themselves to the rule of law: and Cleisthenes was a war-like person and therefore not one to be easily despised. In general, they maintained themselves as the people’s leaders by repeated acts of care for them.

(Aristotle, *Politics* 5.12)

### Passage 4

Furthermore, all politicians who harbour such intentions are aiming a fatal blow at the whole principle of justice: for once rights of property are infringed, the principle is totally undermined. It is, I repeat, the special function of every state and every city to guarantee that each of its citizens shall be allowed the free enjoyment of his own property.

(Cicero, *On Duties* 2.78)

## Questions

*Marks*

5. Read **Passage 1**. How true is it to claim that the type of education proposed by Plato is distinguished by what he chooses to omit as much as by what he chooses to include? **10**
6. Read **Passage 2**. How important in the administration of justice are the rights of the individual in the *Republic*? **10**
7. Read **Passage 3**. Do you think that Aristotle shows any sympathy for oligarchy and tyranny? **10**
8. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passage 4**. Does Cicero's attitude to property rights reflect his wider commitment to a very conservative and unchanging society? **20**
- or**
- (b) Classical philosophers frequently refer to the importance of property rights. To what extent did they recognise that classical societies were controlled by wealth based on property? **20**
- (50)**
- (scaled to 100)**

**[Turn over**

## SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 9–12. (Note: there are two options in Question 12.)

### Passage 1

Socrates: I am content with that answer. Granted that there are two kinds of political oratory, one of them is pandering and utter rubbish; only the other is good, which aims at the edification of the souls of the citizens and is always striving to say what is best, whether it be welcome or unwelcome to the ears of the audience. But I don't believe that you have ever experienced the second type; if you can point to any orator who conforms to it, lose no time in letting me into the secret of his identity.

(Plato, *Gorgias*, 503)

### Passage 2

The Senate once ordained that Lucius Opimius, who was at that time consul, should “take measures to protect the state from harm”. Thereafter, not one single night was allowed to elapse. Because of a mere suspicion of treason, Gaius Gracchus, the son, grandson and descendant of highly distinguished men, was put to death.

(Cicero, *Catiline*, 1.2.3)

### Passage 3

The great and famous eloquence I speak of is a foster child of licence, which fools call liberty, and the companion of revolution. In well-organised states it does not exist.

(Tacitus, *Dialogus*, 40)

### Passage 4

To this there should be added a certain humour, flashes of wit, the culture befitting a gentleman, and readiness and terseness alike in repelling and in delivering the attack, the whole being combined with a delicate charm and urbanity.

(Cicero, *De Oratore*, 1.17)

## Questions

*Marks*

9. Read **Passage 1**. What are the arguments Socrates uses to prove that most political oratory is “rubbish”? **10**
10. Read **Passage 2**. In what ways does Cicero use his skills to emphasise the threat that Catiline poses? **10**
11. Read **Passage 3**. For what reasons could the speaker think that great oratory was a “companion of revolution” and that it could not exist in well-organised states? **10**
12. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passages 1, 2 and 4**. How far do Plato and Cicero provide good examples of the qualities described in Passage 4? **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passages 1, 2, 3 and 4**. Do Plato, Cicero and Tacitus share the same attitudes to the respectability of oratory? **20**
- (50)**
- (scaled to 100)**

**[Turn over**

## SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 13–16. (Note: there are two options in Question 16.)

### Passage 1

Praxagora: And what I'm going to say is that everyone is to have an equal share in everything and live on that: we won't have one man rich while another lives in penury, one man farming hundreds of acres while another hasn't enough land to get buried in: one man with dozens of slaves and another with none at all. There will be one common stock of necessities for everybody, and these will be shared equally.

(Aristophanes, *Assembly Women*, 589–594)

### Passage 2

Trygaeus: Let us now to heaven pray  
To bless us this and every day,  
To give us lots of bread to eat  
And wine to drink, and figs so sweet,  
To give all Greece abundant wealth,  
Our wives fertility and health,  
Restore us all the joys of yore,  
And make at last an end to war  
For ever and ever, Amen!

(Aristophanes, *Peace*, 1320–1328)

### Passage 3

Now I come to the great benefits which accrue from simple living. First, you have decent health. Think of the harm that a conglomeration of stuff does to a man. Remember the plain food that once agreed with you so well. But as soon as you mix boiled with roast, and oysters with thrushes, the sweet juices will turn to acid, and sticky phlegm will raise a revolt in the interior.

(Horace, *Satires* 2.2.70–76)

### Passage 4

Time was when this would have seemed a luxurious banquet to our senators. Curius used to raise his own spring greens on a little allotment, and cook them over his modest hearth. But today the scruffiest chain-gang ditcher disdains such fare, remembers the smell of tripe in some stifling cook-shop. Once, as a feast-day treat, it used to be the custom— or if it happened to be a relative's birthday— to unrack a side of salt pork or a flitch of bacon, with maybe a little fresh meat if they'd run to a sacrifice.

(Juvenal, *Satires* 11.77–85)



### Passage 5

Observe the size of that crayfish: it marks out a platter reserved for my lord. Please note the asparagus garnish heaped high around it, the peacocking tail that looks down on the guests as it's brought in, borne aloft by some tall waiter! But you get half an egg that's stuffed with a single prawn, and served in a little saucer, like some funeral offering.

(Juvenal, *Satires* 5.80–85)

### Questions

*Marks*

13. Read **Passage 1**. From this passage and your wider reading, do you believe that Aristophanes is seriously suggesting the idea of a society where everything is shared equally? **10**
14. Read **Passage 2**. From your study of this play, do you think that Aristophanes is sincere in his concern for the welfare of the ordinary citizens of Greece? **10**
15. Read **Passages 3 and 4**. In what ways do Horace and Juvenal use food to illustrate vices in the societies in which they lived? **10**
16. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passage 5**. From this passage and your wider reading, is it fair to say that satirists show no real awareness of the changing nature of society? **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passages 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5**. Is it reasonable to claim that while satirists recognise the social divisions of their societies, they offer no practical solutions? **20**
- (50)**

**(scaled to 100)**

**[Turn over**

## PART 2

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

Answer TWO questions from your chosen section.

Each question is allocated 50 marks.

### SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

1. Herodotus has been called “the father of history”. Discuss his right to this title.
2. Thucydides and Polybius both try to analyse the causes of events. Compare the two writers for the success of their analyses.
3. How does Livy’s treatment of Hannibal’s career bring out the writer’s strengths and weaknesses as a historian?
4. “I will write without indignation or bias.” Does Tacitus manage to do this in the works you have read?

### SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

5. “The state envisaged in Plato’s *Republic* can hardly be considered a Utopia since it lacks so many freedoms and choices.”

Is this a fair comment on the ideal state Plato proposes?

6. “The triumph of logic over experience.”

How true is it to claim that Aristotle’s constitution in his *Politics* is an unworkable creation constructed largely round failed political theories?

7. Is it fair to suggest that Cicero’s views of political life are fundamentally different from those of Plato and Aristotle? What factors might account for such differences?

8. “Today’s society is organised and controlled to an extent which would have been unimaginable in the classical world.”

Are the views of classical authors on the organisation of society really so far distant from views which are held today?

### SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

9. Is there more to Demosthenes' *Philippics* than a personal attack on Philip of Macedon?
10. Cicero in *De Oratore* describes the skills and qualities which an orator must possess. Does he give a convincing analysis?
11. Compare Andocides' *On the Mysteries* with Cicero's *In Defence of Caelius* with regard to the effectiveness of their techniques of persuasion.
12. How far is oratory a matter of natural ability and practice, rather than a science to be learned? Use evidence from the ancient orators in your answer.

### SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

13. "Aristophanes shows little sympathy for the democratic institutions of Athens. Indeed, he consistently displays anti-democratic tendencies."

Is this a fair assessment of Aristophanes' attitude in the plays you have studied?

14. "Horace's philosophy of life consists of little more than self-indulgence."

On the basis of your reading of Horace's *Satires*, do you agree with this point of view?

15. How true is it to argue that Juvenal gives us very little insight in his *Satires* into the political and social issues of the age in which he lived?
16. "It is wrong, and wrong again, to use Greek comedy and Roman satire as reliable sources of political and social information. Neither was written for such a limited purpose."

From your study of the works of Aristophanes and **either** Horace **or** Juvenal, does the statement above seem to you to be reasonable?

[END OF QUESTION PAPER]

**[BLANK PAGE]**