## X013/701

NATIONAL
QUALIFICATIONS 2011

FRIDAY, 3 JUNE
$1.00 \mathrm{PM}-4.00 \mathrm{PM}$

# CLASSICAL STUDIES <br> ADVANCED HIGHER 

## Answer Part 1 and Part 2.

200 marks are allocated to this paper.


## Part 1

## Choose ONE section-A or B or C or D.

## SECTION A-HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

# If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 1-4. (Note: there are two options in Question 4.) 

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

## 100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

## Passage 1

"Gyges," she said, as soon as he presented himself, "there are two courses open to you, and you may take your choice between them. Kill Candaules and seize the throne, with me as your wife; or die yourself on the spot, so that never again may your blind obedience to the king tempt you to see what you have no right to see. One of you must die: either my husband, the author of this wicked plot; or you, who have outraged propriety by seeing me naked."
(Herodotus, 1.11.5-14)

## Passage 2

"Your assembly is not a court of law, competent to listen to pleas either from them or from us. Our aim is to prevent you from coming to the wrong decision on a matter of great importance through paying too much attention to the views of your allies. At the same time we should like to examine the general principles of the argument used against us and to make you see that our gains have been reasonable enough and that our city deserves a certain consideration."
(Thucydides, 1,73,1)

## Passage 3

Germanicus stood among them, still smarting with grief and anger. "My wife and son", he told them, "are not more dear to me than my father and my country. But my father has his august dignity to protect him, and the Roman empire has its other armies. I would willingly see my wife and children die for your greater glory. Now, however, I am taking them out of your demented reach. Whatever atrocities are impending, my life alone must atone for them. Do not make your guilt worse by murdering the great-grandson of Augustus, and the daughter-in-law of Tiberius!"
(Tacitus, Annals, 1, 41-42)

## Passage 4

Hannibal responded as might be expected of one who was young, full of martial spirit, confident in the success of his enterprises and spurred by his long-standing hatred of Rome. In replying to the delegates he claimed to be protecting the interests of the Saguntines. Not long before, party strife had broken out in Saguntum and the Romans had been called in to arbitrate, and Hannibal now accused them of having caused some of the leading citizens to be unjustly put to death. The Carthaginians, he warned them, would not overlook this treacherous act of seizure, for it was an ancestral tradition of theirs always to take up the cause of the victims of injustice.
(Polybius 3, 15, 6-8)

## Passage 5

"The Romans are a proud and merciless people; they claim to make the world their own and subject to their will. They demand the right to dictate to us who our friends should be and who our enemies. They circumscribe our liberties, barring us in behind barriers of rivers or mountains beyond which we may not pass-but they do not themselves observe the limits they have set. "Do not cross the Ebro," they say; "keep your hands off Saguntum." "But is Saguntum on the Ebro?" you say. "Then don't go anywhere-stay where you are!"
(Livy, 21.44. 5-6)

## Questions

1. Read Passage 1. What is the appeal of this story and how does it fit into the structure of Herodotus' Histories?
2. Read Passage 2. What does this Athenian speaker mean by "the general principles of the argument" used against Athens at this time? What was Athens' defence?
3. Read Passage 3. What is Tacitus telling us about Germanicus' character from the description of his dealings with the rebel army?

## 4. Either

(a) Read Passages 4 and 5. Compare Polybius and Livy for their treatment of the affair of Saguntum. Which writer's treatment do you prefer and why?
or
(b) Read Passages 2, 3 and 5. In your opinion, which of the three writers, Thucydides, Tacitus or Livy, uses speeches to best effect and why?

## SECTION B-INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 5-8. (Note: there are two options in Question 8.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

## Passage 1

"To go back to what I was saying, then," I continued, "we must look for the Guardians who will stick most firmly to the principle that they must always do what they think best for the community. We must watch them closely from their earliest years and set them tasks in doing which they are most likely to forget or be led astray from this principle; and we must choose only those who don't forget and are not easily misled. Do you agree?"
(Plato, Republic $3.412 \mathrm{c}-\mathrm{d}$ )

## Passage 2

"Our rulers possess lands and build themselves fine large houses and furnish them magnificently; they offer their own private sacrifices to the gods, they entertain visitors, and acquire the gold and silver you were just talking about, and everything else that is commonly thought to make a man happy. But one might almost describe your Guardians as a set of hired mercenaries in the city with nothing to do but perpetual guard-duty."
(Plato, Republic 4.419)

## Passage 3

An individual ruler, if he has been well educated by law, gives good decisions; but he has only one pair of eyes and ears, one pair of hands and feet, and it would be a paradox if he had better vision in judgement and action than many men with many pairs.
(Aristotle, Politics 3.1287b)

## Passage 4

For example, the attempt by Lucius Philippus to pass a bill providing for redistribution of land was outrageous. It is true that when the measure was rejected he took the rebuff calmly enough and to that extent he deserves credit for moderation. But while, previously, he had been agitating for popular support, he offered malicious comment that the entire total of property-owners in the whole country did not add up to make them two thousand.
(Cicero, On Duties 2.21.73)

## Questions

5. Read Passage 1. What are the main flaws a Guardian should avoid? What are
the virtues he or she must possess?
6. Read Passage 2. Is it reasonable to describe the Guardians as "a set of hired mercenaries"?
7. Read Passage 3. Explain why the concept of a leader being "well educated by law" is so important to Aristotle.10
8. Either
(a) Read Passages 1-3. Which of these philosophers, Plato or Aristotle, seems to you to provide modern politicians with the better model?20
or
(b) Read Passage 4. Was Cicero's view of the best structure for society too conservative for an age which may have required radical change?

## SECTION C-HEROES AND HEROISM

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 9-12. (Note: there are two options in Question 12.)

## In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your

 study of your chosen area throughout the course.100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

## Passage 1

Priam had set Achilles thinking of his own father and brought him to the verge of tears. Taking the old man's hand, he gently put him from him; and overcome by their memories they both broke down. Priam, crouching at Achilles' feet, wept bitterly for man-slaying Hector, and Achilles wept for his father, and then again for Patroclus. The house was filled with the sounds of their lamentation. But presently, when he had had enough of tears and recovered his composure, the excellent Achilles leapt from his chair, and in compassion for the old man's grey head and grey beard, took him by the arm and raised him.
(Homer, Iliad, 24.507-517)

## Passage 2

Then resourceful Odysseus spoke in turn and answered her:
"Goddess and queen, do not be angry with me. I myself know
That all you say is true, and that circumspect Penelope
Can never match the impression you make for beauty and stature.
She is mortal after all, and you are immortal and ageless.
But even so, what I want and all my days I pine for Is to go back to my house and see my day of homecoming."
(Homer, Odyssey, 5.214-220)

## Passage 3

Hecuba: But, my dear daughter, cease mourning for Hector; all your tears cannot help him. And honour your new master; win his love as a husband by your own goodness and sweetness. In this way you will not only make your own life happier, but you may even bring up my little grandson, to be-who can tell?-the saviour of Troy! Sons of yours may yet one day found a new Ilium, and our city live again.
(Euripides, Trojan Women, 697-705)

## Passage 4

But beyond all the rest the unhappy Phoenician Dido, condemned now to sure destruction, could not satisfy her longing. She gazed, and the fire in her grew; she was affected equally by the boy and by the beautiful gifts. Cupid had been clinging to Aeneas and embracing him with his arms around his neck, expressing great love for his supposed father. Then he crossed to the queen. Dido's eyes and her whole mind were fixed on him, and at times she would fondle him and hold him close to her, for she could not know, poor Dido, how mighty a god was entering her.
(Virgil, Aeneid 1. 710-719)

## Passage 5

This castaway I sheltered when he came, And made him king before I knew his name! I wish I'd given you no more than thisI'd silence all reports of our first kiss. The day a sudden storm forced us to flee To that deep cave brought ruin down on me. I heard a voice and thought the nymphs were crying, And then the Furies marked me out for dying. Punish me, tarnished honour, and abused Sychaeus, whom I face with shame confused.
(Ovid, Heroides 7. 89-98)

## Questions

9. Read Passage 1. Why is this scene so effective in demanding an emotional response from the reader?
10. Read Passage 2. Is Odysseus fair to Calypso?
11. Read Passage 3. Why is this passage so moving, considering the history and the destiny of Hector and his family?10
12. Either
(a) Read Passages 2, 3, 4 and 5. Compare the writers in the way they depict the love between men and women.
or
(b) Read Passages 1, 3, 4 and 5. From these passages and your wider knowledge, compare the writers for the power of their descriptions of reversals of fortune.

## SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 13-16. (Note: there are two options in Question 16.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

## Passage 1

Ambassador: And to follow-this is the absolute truth: they served us up an enormous fowl, several times the size of-of-of-of Cleonymus. They called it a bezzle.

Dikaiopolis (aside): So that's what taught you to embezzle all those drachs you've been drawing for the past eleven years!
(Aristophanes, Acharnians 88-90)

## Passage 2

Demosthenes: He shall hold power until another man appears who is even more loathsome than he is, and then he shall fall. For on his heels will appear a leather-seller, our Paphlagonian, a robber and a shrieker, with a voice like an overloaded sewer.
(Aristophanes, Knights, 134-137)

## Passage 3

A light lunch-enough to save me from having to go
Through the day on an empty stomach; then I laze about at home.
That's what life is like when you're free from the cruel compulsion
To get to the top. I console myself that I'll live more happily
Like this than if my grandfather, father and uncle had all been Quaestors.
(Horace, Satires 1.6.127-131)

## Passage 4

No visitation of crime or lust has been spared us since
Roman poverty perished. From then our Seven Hills
Have been flooded out by Sybaris, Rhodes, Miletus
And unruly Tarentum, wine-flown and garlanded.
(Juvenal, Satires 6.294-298)

## Passage 5

You can hedge if you like, discount all the rest, but don't you
think it worth something, Virro, that if I hadn't displayed
true dedication to duty, your wife would be virgin still?
(Juvenal, Satires 9.70-72)

## Questions

## 13. Read Passage 1. How successfully does Dikaiopolis expose the corruption of Athenian political life in the Acharnians?

14. Read Passage 2. Explain the context of this passage. What facet of religion in Athens during the war is being criticised here? Does Aristophanes make similar criticism in any of his other works?

## 15. Read Passage 3. How successful is Horace in convincing us that he is free from the "cruel compulsion" of ambition? <br> 10

## 16. Either

(a) Read Passages 1, 2 and 3. Is it possible to argue from your study of classical comedy and satire, that, for those involved in political life, some level of corruption is inevitable? Is this true today?
or
(b) Read Passages 4 and 5. What point is Juvenal trying to make in each of these extracts? Is there any inconsistency here?

## PART 2

## Choose ONE section-A or B or C or D. <br> Answer TWO questions from your chosen section. <br> Each question is allocated 50 marks. <br> SECTION A-HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

1. "Herodotus has sometimes been represented as a profound thinker about human destiny."
How important is this emphasis on destiny in Herodotus' Histories?
2. Which of the two, Polybius or Thucydides, do you believe has more to say to us today about basic human motivation?
3. "Livy keeps description to a minimum and recreates the spirit of Rome by entering into the emotions of the people of the time."
Discuss Livy's ability to evoke feelings and emotions in the reader.
4. "It is easier to say what Tacitus was against than what he was for."

Do you agree?

## SECTION B-INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

5. "Plato's disdain for ordinary citizens fundamentally undermines his attempts to define the society he advocates in the Republic."

Does this seem to you to be a reasonable view?
6. "What is praiseworthy about Aristotle is his desire to include and involve all the citizens of his state in the organising and running of the state."
Is Aristotle really as inclusive as this statement suggests?
7. "Politically, it is wholly simplistic. Morally, however, he hits the mark and no mistake." Is this a fair assessment of Cicero's views in On Duties?
8. "Despite the disdain of liberals for the attempts of classical philosophers to organise their societies, our own society today is more organised than these philosophers could have imagined."

Is this a reasonable view of how the organisation of society has developed between the classical period and modern societies?

## SECTION C-HEROES AND HEROISM

9. Why is "the anger of Achilles" such a good theme to hold the Iliad together?
10. From the books of the Odyssey you have read, what would you say about the morality of Odysseus' actions?
11. If the characters are merely playthings of the gods in the epics of Homer and Virgil you have read, why does the reader feel so involved with them?
12. Do you find any reasons to be sympathetic to the plight of Dido and Turnus in the Aeneid? For which of the two do you feel more pity and why?

## SECTION D-COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

13. "Aristophanes makes a passionate case for ending the Peloponnesian War, but ignores the political consequences of such an outcome on Athens and on its democratic society." Discuss this with reference to the texts you have studied.
14. "The real Horace remains hidden from us. All we can see of him are those images he wants us to see."

Is this a fair assessment of the persona of Horace in the Satires?
15. "Juvenal's anger only serves to make us less sympathetic to the case he is trying to make against the moral corruption of the age in which he lived."
To what extent do you agree with this statement?
16. "The classical writers of comedy and satire were limited in their ability to change the character of their societies."

Discuss with reference to the works you have studied.
[END OF QUESTION PAPER]

