

X013/701

NATIONAL
QUALIFICATIONS
2009

THURSDAY, 4 JUNE
1.00 PM – 4.00 PM

CLASSICAL
STUDIES
ADVANCED HIGHER

Answer **Part 1** and **Part 2**.

200 marks are allocated to this paper.



Part 1

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 1–4. (Note: there are two options in Question 4.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

Passage 1

The following night Xerxes dreamed that the same figure as before stood by his bed and spoke to him. “Son of Darius,” it said, “so you have openly, in the presence of your subjects, renounced the campaign and made light of what I said to you, as if it had never been said at all. Now let me tell you what the result will be, if you do not at once undertake this war: just as in a moment you rose to greatness and power, so in a moment you will be brought low again.”

(Herodotus, 7.14)

Passage 2

Just as Fortune has steered almost all the affairs of the world in one direction and forced them to converge on one and the same goal, so it is the task of the historian to present to his readers under one view the process by which she has accomplished this general design.

(Polybius, 1.4)

Passage 3

In the course of that winter many strange things happened in Rome and the country round it—or at least they were said to have happened, and believed, on small evidence, to have happened, as is the way when men’s minds are shaken by superstitious fears. A six-months-old baby, of good family, had shouted “Victory!” in the vegetable market; in the cattle market an ox had walked up three pairs of stairs, and then when the lodgers screamed, was so frightened that he leapt out of the window.

(Livy, 21.62)

Passage 4

Many prodigies occurred. A woman gave birth to a snake. Another woman was killed in her husband’s arms by a thunderbolt. The sun suddenly went dark. All fourteen city-districts were struck by lightning. But these portents meant nothing. So little were they due to the gods that Nero continued his reign and his crimes for years to come.

(Tacitus, *Annals*, 14.12)

Questions

Marks

1. Read **Passage 1**. From this episode and your other reading of Herodotus, comment on the writer's purpose in using dreams in his narrative. **10**
2. Read **Passage 2**. What examples does Polybius offer in his *History* of the way Fortune influences events? **10**
3. Read **Passage 3**. What are the strengths and weaknesses of Livy's insertion of such omens in his narrative? **10**
4. **Either**
 - (a) Read **Passages 1 and 4**. Using these and your wider reading, compare Herodotus and Tacitus for the relative weight they both give to superstition and reason in their writing. **20**

or

 - (b) Read **Passages 1 – 4**. Compare the four writers for their power to appeal to a present-day reader. **20**

(50)
(scaled to 100)

[Turn over

SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 5–8. (Note: there are two options in Question 8.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

Passage 1

“They should all share duties, though we should treat the females as the weaker, the males as the stronger.”

“And can you use any animal for the same purpose as another,” I asked, “unless you bring it up and train it in the same way?”

“No.”

“So if we are going to use men and women for the same purposes, we must teach them the same things.”

“Yes.”

“We educated the men both physically and mentally.”

“Yes.”

“We shall have to train the women also, then, in both kinds of skill, and train them for war as well, and treat them in the same way as the men.”

“It seems to follow from what you said,” he agreed.

(Plato, *Republic* 5.451e–452a)

Passage 2

“‘You may be right,’ said I; we must now press on with our inquiry. So let us first consider how our citizens, so equipped, will live. They will produce corn, wine, clothes, and shoes, and will build themselves houses. In the summer they will for the most part work unclothed and unshod, in the winter they will be clothed and shod suitably. For food they will prepare wheat-meal or barley-meal for baking or kneading. They will serve splendid cakes and loaves on rushes or fresh leaves, and will sit down to feast with their children on couches of myrtle and bryony; and they will have wine to drink too, and pray to the gods with garlands on their heads, and enjoy each other’s company. And fear of poverty and war will make them keep the numbers of their families within their means.”

(Plato, *Republic* 2.372a–c)

Passage 3

Again, community of wives and children is prescribed for the Guardian class. It would seem to be far more useful if it applied to the agricultural class. For where wives and children are held in common there is less affection, and a lack of strong affection among the ruled is necessary in the interests of obedience and absence of revolt.

(Aristotle, *Politics* 2.4)

Passage 4

We begin by asking whether it is more expedient to be ruled by the best man or by the best laws. Those who believe that to be ruled by a king is expedient think that the laws enunciate only general principles and do not give day-to-day instructions on matters as they arise; and so, they argue, in any skill it is foolish to be guided always by written rules.

(Aristotle, *Politics* 3.15)

Passage 5

But to return to my subject. The reason why these disasters have descended upon us is because we chose to make ourselves feared rather than liked and loved. And if this could happen to the entire Roman community, because of its unjust imperialism, what lesson should individuals draw for themselves?

(Cicero, *On Duties* 2.30)

Questions

- | | <i>Marks</i> |
|--|--------------|
| 5. Read Passage 1 . How accurately does this passage reflect Plato's views of the role of women in the society he is advocating? | 10 |
| 6. Read Passage 2 . Is the idealised "Utopian" lifestyle described attainable in any sort of society? What pitfalls does Plato fail to see? | 10 |
| 7. Read Passage 3 . Aristotle is criticising Plato in the passage. In what ways is his own vision also flawed with regard to the role of wives and children in society? | 10 |
| 8. Either | |
| (a) Read Passage 4 . What is the nature of the relationship being suggested between laws and political leaders? Is this possible or desirable in today's society? | 20 |
| or | |
| (b) Read Passage 5 . Is it reasonable to argue that Cicero is a politician and therefore keen to find a populist solution to society's problems, while real leadership requires the resolve to take unpopular decisions? Discuss this view from your wider reading. | 20 |
| | (50) |

(scaled to 100)

[Turn over

SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 9–12. (Note: there are two options in Question 12.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

Passage 1

They also accused me in connection with my sea-going commercial undertakings, as if the reason why the gods saved me from danger was, apparently, to come here and be done to death by Cephisius. But I don't believe the gods could hold such a view as not to punish me when they had me in such terrible danger, if they thought I had done them wrong. What greater danger could a man undergo than going on voyages in the winter?

(Andocides, *On the Mysteries*, 137)

Passage 2

Nature herself demonstrates that it is right that the better man should prevail over the worse and the stronger over the weaker. The truth of this can be seen in a variety of examples, drawn from both the animal world and from the complex communities and races of human beings; right consists in the superior ruling over the inferior and having the upper hand.

(Plato, *Gorgias*, 483)

Passage 3

There is also a second class of witnesses we should call. Who are these? The party who after the Peace and my return from the second delegation sent to ratify it, when I realised how Athens had been misled and was loud in denunciation of the betrayal of Thermopylae and Phocis, then declared that I was a man who drank water instead of wine, bound to be awkward and difficult whereas Philip, once past Thermopylae, would do everything we wanted.

(Demosthenes, *Philippics*, 2,28)

Passage 4

And yet there are some men here in this Senate, who either genuinely fail to see, or make a pretence of not seeing, the disasters by which we are menaced. Their mildness has fostered Catilina's hopes, and their refusal to believe in his growing conspiracy has given it strength.

(Cicero, *Catiline*, 1,12)

Questions

Marks

9. Read **Passage 1**. What importance does religion play in this speech and how does Andocides attempt to manipulate religious beliefs to help his case? **10**
10. Read **Passage 2**. Is Socrates successful in challenging the above argument of Callicles? Discuss. **10**
11. Read **Passage 3**. In what ways and to what effect does Demosthenes build his case against the appeasers of Philip? **10**
12. **Either**
- (a) Read **Passages 3 and 4**. From these extracts and elsewhere in the two speeches, compare Demosthenes and Cicero for the effectiveness of their techniques to shame appeasers of tyrants. **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passages 1, 3 and 4**. Compare these three writers for their ability to construct a good case against opponents. **20**
- (50)**
- (scaled to 100)**

[Turn over

SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

If you choose this section, read the following passages carefully, and answer Questions 13–16. (Note: there are two options in Question 16.)

In your answers, you will be expected to draw on what you have learned in your study of your chosen area throughout the course.

100 marks are allocated to this part of the paper.

Passage 1

This tanner-fellow soon got to know master's ways, and then he fell at his feet, licked his boots, wheedled, flattered, sucked up, everything to take him in, with all the trimmings—in real leather. “Thepeople,” he'd say, “why don't you try just one case today and then have a good bath and get stuck into a slap-up supper on your three obols? Shall I serve the first course now?” Whereupon he grabs something one of us has been cooking, this Paphlagonian does, and gives it to master so master will think *he* cooked it and love him even more. Why, only the other day I'd baked a lovely Spartan cake down in Pylos and round he sneaks and grabs it, serves up *my* cake as if it was his own work!

(Aristophanes, *Knights*, 43–57)

Passage 2

Gentlemen, my interest in the welfare of this state is no less than yours; but I deeply deplore the way its affairs are being handled. The task of speaking for the people is invariably entrusted to crooks and rascals. For every one day they spend doing good they spend another ten doing irreparable harm. If you try somebody new, he turns out to be even worse than the last one. It's difficult to give advice to men so hard to please as yourselves; you're frightened of the people who really want to serve you, and you throw yourselves at the feet of those who don't and won't.

(Aristophanes, *Assembly Women*, 173–182)

Passage 3

I revert now to myself—only a freedman's son,
run down by everyone as only a freedman's son,
now because I'm a friend of yours, Maecenas, before
because as a military tribune I commanded a Roman legion.
The two factors are different; a person might have reason
to grudge me that rank, but he shouldn't grudge me your friendship too,
especially as you are so careful to choose suitable people,
and to hold aloof from twisters on the make. I could never say
I was lucky in the sense that I *just happened* to win your friendship.
It wasn't just chance that brought you into my life.

(Horace, *Satires* 1.6.45–54)

Passage 4

There's a story that Servius Oppidius, a rich man by the standards of an earlier day, made over his two farms at Canusium to his two sons. When dying, he called the lads to his bedside: "Ever since I saw you, Aulus, carrying your dice and marbles in an unsafe pocket, giving and gambling them away, and you, Tiberius, counting them sternly and hiding them in crannies, I have worried that you might develop opposite forms of obsession, you imitating Nomentanus and you Hemlock. And so, here in our home, I appeal to you both: *you* mustn't reduce and *you* mustn't increase what your father considers enough and what falls within nature's limits. Moreover, in case you are excited by the charms of public life, I shall have you swear an oath: if either becomes an Aedile or Praetor he shall forfeit his legal powers and be cursed of heaven."

(Horace, *Satires* 2.3.168–181)

Passage 5

And what about the flower of our youth who died in battle, our slaughtered legionaries, those myriad shades of war? If only they commanded sulphur and torches in Hades, and a few damp laurel-twigs, they'd insist on being purified. Yes: even among the dead we're paraded to public scorn. Though our armies have advanced to Ireland, though the Orkneys are ours, and northern Britain making do with the shortest nights, these conquered tribes abhor the vices that flourish throughout their conquerors' capital.

(Juvenal, *Satires* 2.154–162)

[Turn over

Questions

Marks

- 13.** Read **Passage 1**. What criticisms of Cleon is Aristophanes indirectly making in this extract? Are they justified? **10**
- 14.** Read **Passages 1 and 2**. How fair do you think Aristophanes' presentation of the Athenian Assembly is in these passages? **10**
- 15.** Read **Passage 3**. What points is Horace making about his father and Maecenas in this passage? How well does this passage reflect the main theme of the satire of which it is part? **10**
- 16. Either**
- (a) Read **Passages 3 and 4**. Is Horace consistent in his depiction of different lifestyles? **20**
- or**
- (b) Read **Passage 5**. What point is Juvenal making in this passage? What do you feel he is trying to express about the society in which he lived? **20**
- (50)**
(scaled to 100)

PART 2

Choose ONE section—A or B or C or D.

Answer TWO questions from your chosen section.

Each question is allocated 50 marks.

SECTION A—HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

1. What do you regard as the main strengths and weaknesses of Thucydides as a historian?
2. In what ways, and how effectively, does Livy relate myth and legend to history?
3. For what reasons did Herodotus and Tacitus insert speeches into their historical narrative? Compare the two writers for their success in doing this.
4. Is there a difference between history viewed as a well-ordered collection of sources and history viewed as a work of literature? Choose one of your prescribed writers and discuss.

SECTION B—INDIVIDUAL AND COMMUNITY

5. “There is nothing of Plato’s views on education as advocated in the *Republic* which would be acceptable to modern educationalists.”

Does this seem to you to be a reasonable view?

6. “Aristotle’s concept of citizenship seems to focus more on responsibilities than on rights – which is no bad thing!”

Do you agree with this view of the sort of citizenship Aristotle advocates in *Politics*?

7. Politicians have spoken of contemporary society in our country as “fractured”. Are there any lessons we can learn from the classical philosophers whose works you have studied which might help society today to become more cohesive?
8. “Cicero has little to say in *On Duties* about the alleviation of poverty or the elimination of disadvantage as desirable policies for a state.”

Is this a fair assessment of Cicero’s position or are we guilty of applying present-day values to a very different political era?

[Turn over

SECTION C—ORATOR AND AUDIENCE

9. Compare the ways in which Andocides and Demosthenes use love of their country in the speeches you have read.
10. “Although some of the charges may well have had more substance than Cicero admits, his brilliant and amusing advocacy got Caelius off.”

Describe and analyse the humour which Cicero uses so effectively in his speech *In Defence of Caelius*.

11. What are the important lessons an orator could learn from reading Tacitus’ *Dialogus*?
12. Select one of the orators you have read. Discuss the methods he uses to attack his opponent’s reputation and comment on their effectiveness.

SECTION D—COMEDY, SATIRE AND SOCIETY

13. “Aristophanes is much more interested in making his audience laugh than in raising their awareness of important political and social issues.”

From the plays you have studied and from your wider reading, does this seem to you to be a fair assessment?

14. “Horace has views and opinions on a wide range of subjects, but one searches in vain to find any evidence that he has principles.”

Do you agree with this statement? Give reasons for your answer.

15. “Satire must surely be more than a rancid concoction of prejudice and bombast.”

Is it reasonable to argue that Juvenal’s effectiveness as a satirist is lessened by the bitterness of his language and his bigoted attitudes?

16. “The effectiveness of Aristophanes’ satire is weakened by the conventions of Old Comedy in a way which the satire of Horace and Juvenal is not.”

Does the fact that Aristophanes was delivering his satire as part of a play and in a competition make it less effective than the work of the Roman satirists which was written to be read?

[END OF QUESTION PAPER]