

TROTSKY AND STALIN COURSEWORK ASSIGNMENTS

SOURCE A: From Lenin's Political Testament written on 25 December 1922

Comrade Stalin, having become General Secretary, has concentrated enormous power in his hands, and I am not sure that he always knows how to use that power with sufficient caution.

Trotsky is the most able man for the party. His defect is an excess of self-confidence. He is attracted too much by the purely administrative aspect of affairs.

The qualities of Trotsky and Stalin, the two most able leaders of the present Central Committee might quite innocently lead to a split. If our party does not take steps to prevent it, a split might arise quite unexpectedly.

SOURCE B: From a postscript to Lenin's Political Testament, written on 5 January 1923

Stalin is too rude, and this fault, which is completely acceptable amongst us communists, is not acceptable in the office of General Secretary. Therefore, I propose to the comrades that they find a way to remove Stalin from that position and appoint it to another man who in all respects differs from Stalin; he should be more patient, more loyal, more polite and more attentive to colleagues.

SOURCE C: Part of a recorded private conversation between Bukharin and Kamenev in 1928

Stalin is an unprincipled intriguer. He is only interested in increasing his own power. He changes theories according to whom he needs to get rid of. Our potential forces of the Right opposition are vast, but middle-ranking members of the Party do not understand the issues involved. There is a terrible fear of a split in the party. Stalin has made it difficult for us to attack him. He is a monster who will kill us all.

SOURCE D: A cartoon published in the Soviet Union in 1927. A Soviet cartoon showing the 'Left Opposition': Trotsky (organist), Zinoviev (singer) and Kamenev (parrot).



SOURCE E: A photograph taken at Lenin's funeral in January 1924. It shows Stalin (front right) carrying Lenin's body.



SOURCE F: From the funeral oration made by Stalin at Lenin's funeral in January 1924

In leaving us, Comrade Lenin commanded us to hold high and pure the great calling of party members. We swear to you, Comrade Lenin, to honour your command. Before he left us, Comrade Lenin commanded us to keep the unity of our party above all else. We swear to you, Comrade Lenin, to honour your command.

SOURCE G: From a book written by Trotsky in the 1920s

Without the direct support of the European working-class we cannot remain in power and turn our temporary victory into lasting socialism.

SOURCE H: Part of a speech made by Stalin in the 1920s

Socialism in one country means the working class taking power and using that power to build a completely socialist society in our country. We do not need the victory of working-class revolution in other countries.

SOURCE I: From George Orwell's novel 'Animal Farm' written in 1945. In this novel Orwell represents the power struggle between Stalin and Trotsky as a conflict between two farm animals called Napoleon [Stalin] and Snowball [Trotsky].

At the Meetings, Snowball often won over the majority by his brilliant speeches, but Napoleon was better at getting support from the other animals for himself in between times. Of all the arguments, none was so bitter as the one that took place over the windmill*.

Apart from the disputes over the windmill, they disagreed over the defence of the farm. According to Napoleon, what the animals must do was to get firearms and train themselves in the use of them. According to Snowball, they must send out more and more pigeons and stir up rebellions amongst the animals on the other farms.

These arguments were finally settled at a Meeting. As usual, Snowball made a brilliant speech but then Napoleon stood up and uttered a high-pitched whimper of a kind none of the animals ever heard before. Then there was a terrible baying and nine enormous dogs wearing brass-studded collars came bounding into the barn. They dashed straight for Snowball, who only sprang from his place just in time to escape their snapping jaws. He put on an extra spurt and, with few inches to spare, slipped through a hole in the hedge and was seen no more.

The animals were amazed at the expulsion of Snowball, but there was another surprise in store for them.

On the third Sunday after Snowball's expulsion, the animals were somewhat surprised to hear Napoleon announce that the windmill was to be built after all.

*the windmill represents policies for industrialisation.

Where a question does not mention a particular source, candidates may refer to any of the sources which they consider to be appropriate, or use their own knowledge.

Assignment 1: Assessment Objective 1

1. Describe the career of Stalin to 1922. (12)
2. Why did Stalin become the leader of the Soviet Union by 1928? (18)

Assignment 2: Assessment Objectives 2 and 3

1. What can you learn from Source A about Lenin's ideas for a successor to himself? (3)
2. Use Sources E and F and your own knowledge to help you describe how Stalin took advantage of Lenin's funeral. (6)
3. Use Sources G and H and your own knowledge to explain why Stalin wanted to force Trotsky out of the Soviet Communist Party (9)
4. Source C suggests that Stalin was only interested in power. Do you agree that this was the case? (12)

Markscheme

Assignment 1: Assessment Objective 1

1. Target: Recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements supported by some knowledge, e.g. Pravda, Nationalities, General Secretary etc.

(1-4)

Level 2: Developed statements supported by relevant knowledge, e.g. details of the above etc.

(5-8)

Level 3: Developed exposition supported by selected knowledge showing understanding of a range of aspects, e.g. used Nationalities to build up support in regions, used G-S to build up support in Party, control, decisions, make appointments etc.

2. Target: Causation/Recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements supported by some knowledge, e.g. he got rid of the others, forced Trotsky out etc.

(1-5)

Level 2: Developed statements supported by relevant knowledge, e.g. details of Stalin's intrigues against other leaders and his disagreements with Trotsky etc.

(6-10)

Level 3: Developed explanation supported by selected knowledge showing understanding of interrelationship of factors and making links between them, e.g. links power base to ability to force others out of power, need to create a strong Soviet Union rather than permanent revolution, references to Five Year Plans etc.

(11-15)

Level 4: Sustained argument supported by precisely selected knowledge assessing importance of factors, e.g. other leaders underestimated Stalin, did not want Trotsky as a leader and therefore decided not to publish the Political Testament, that gave Stalin the opportunity to make use of his support within the Party etc.

(16-18)

Assignment 2: Assessment Objectives 2 and 3

1. Target: Comprehension of a source

Level 1: Points taken at face value from the source, e.g. he wanted Trotsky and did not like Stalin etc.
(1-2)

Level 2: Inferences made, e.g. he had seen through Stalin's attempts to gain power, Trotsky was the natural leader and had organised the Bolshevik seizure of power and the winning of the Civil War etc.
(3)

2. Target: Comprehension of source/recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements using the sources at face value supported by some own knowledge, e.g. he organised it and made the oration, gave Trotsky the wrong date etc.
(1-2)

Level 2: Developed statements making inferences from the source supported by relevant knowledge, e.g. details of the above etc.
(3-4)

Level 3: Developed explanation supported by selected knowledge, e.g. by organising the funeral he was able to push himself into the limelight and gain popular attention for the first time, he began to create Leninism and had Lenin buried in the mausoleum against his wishes etc.
(5-6)

3. Target: Comprehension of sources/recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements taking the sources at face value supported by some own knowledge, e.g. they disagreed on policy, Stalin was jealous, Trotsky was rude and outspoken etc.
(1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements making inferences from the sources supported by relevant knowledge, e.g. details of Socialism in one Country and Permanent Revolution, differences between Stalin and Trotsky etc.
(4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation making inferences from the sources supported by selected own knowledge, e.g. shows understanding of the range of differences, Stalin believed that the Soviet Union was threatened by the West, reference to Five Year Plans, wanted to protect communism by making Soviet Union secure, Trotsky had been chosen by Lenin and could not be allowed to succeed etc.
(7-9)

4. Target: Evaluation of an interpretation/recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements using the sources at face value, supported by some own knowledge, e.g. yes/no he was power crazy, he wanted to make the Soviet Union secure etc.

(1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements making inferences from the sources supported by relevant own knowledge, e.g. in C, D, E and I Stalin wanted to oust Trotsky and seize power, in F and H he wants to make the Soviet Union secure etc.

(4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation making inferences from the sources supported by selected own knowledge, e.g. can make a judgement, Stalin was a megalomaniac, but also believed that the Soviet Union and communism was in danger of attack, he wanted to protect it at all costs etc.

(7-9)

Level 4: Sustained argument using the sources supported by precisely selected knowledge, e.g. reaches a balanced judgement etc. Yes because he had built up power in the party since 1917 and had changed policy to eliminate rivals, he pursued Trotsky from 1924; no because he was really concerned with protecting the only communist country and was afraid that the West would intervene as it had in the Civil War.

(10-12)