

# **MARKSCHEME**

**May 2001**

**HISTORY**

**Higher Level and Standard Level**

**Paper 1**

**SECTION A**

**Prescribed Subject 1      The Russian Revolutions and the New Soviet State 1917-1929**

**1. (a) What can be inferred from Document D about the following?**

**(i) Why the soldiers wanted to go home. [2 marks]**

Document D states that the soldiers wanted land and freedom. They wanted to go home to obtain their share of land which the peasants at home were taking from the landlords. They were afraid that they would fail to get any if they were away from their villages. Award [1 mark] for a sentence on land. Freedom could be inferred to mean freedom from the landlord's authority or being out of the army. Award [1 mark] for either, but note that Document D does not mention the horrors of war.

**(ii) Why the soldiers now supported the Bolsheviks. [1 mark]**

The inference here is that the Bolsheviks supported both ending the war and land redistribution. Award [1 mark] for either of these or the implicit inference that the Social Revolutionaries did not support them.

**(b) What propaganda/political message is intended by Document E? [1 mark]**

The message is continue fighting the war. Award [1 mark] for this or something similar (e.g. to encourage women to replace male deserters).

**N.B.** Do not enter half marks or + and - but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of [4 marks].

**2. In what ways do Documents A, B and C support the assertion made in Document C that "Lenin wanted power, Lenin's rivals did not want it"? [5 marks]**

For "Lenin wanted power" candidates could use the opposition of Lenin to the Provisional Government, their policies and lack of revolutionary spirit stated in Document A. As well as his incitement to soldiers, workers and peasants to opposition, and by implication, to support him. Lenin's ambition is spelt out clearly in Document C with his conduct at the All Russian Conference of Soviets, when he shouts that one party was willing to "assume responsibility for governing," implying that the Bolsheviks wanted power, and he their leader wanted it.

For "Lenin's rivals did not want it", candidates could quote "revolutionary defensism" from Document A and the ambiguity and caution of Document B to support the Provisional Government without assuming responsibility *etc.*; candidates could, however, also contradict this in B with "gradually gaining political control". Document C contains a definite statement from a leading Menshevik that no party wanted to shoulder full responsibility.

Probably marks should be split 3/2 either way for each statement, or for those who tackle each document separately 2+2+1 in the most appropriate order. Specific references to the documents must be given for full marks but do not demand all the above material.

- 3. With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Documents A and B for historians studying the period between the *two* 1917 Russian Revolutions. [5 marks]**

Document A, part of Lenin's April Theses was issued by him the leader of the Bolsheviks the day after his return from exile in Switzerland. Its purpose was to set out Bolshevik and Lenin's aims and policies. Lenin wanted to undermine the Provisional Government and replace it with a more revolutionary government, therefore he aimed to appeal to soldiers, workers and peasants by telling them that they would gain more from a more radical revolution. Its value is that it is reliable as presenting Lenin's views or at least what he wanted to be understood by his audience. Its limitations are that Lenin had been out of Russia for some time and was out of touch with the situation in Russia and even with the local Bolsheviks, who had not yet been consulted, and there was not general Socialist agreement.

Document B is a resolution passed at the All Russian Conference of Soviets, thus it expressed the views of the delegates and its purpose was to record these views. It was an internal official document. Its value is as an expression of the conference at this time, when the Soviets were emerging as a powerful body. Its limitations could be that it is not known how many delegates were present, how they had been selected, if there was dissent *etc.* The tone of the resolution is ambiguous.

For maximum [5 marks] ensure that candidates use both documents and assess both value and limitations. If only one document is addressed award up to [3 marks].

- 4. Using the documents and your own knowledge analyse the contributions of both continued participation in the First World War and widespread unrest and disorder within Russia, in causing the downfall of the Provisional Government. [6 marks]**

Documentary material for the war could be:

Document A, the war was regarded as an imperialist war and Lenin was determined to oppose it and thus make it even more unpopular.

Document D, indicates the unpopularity of the war, the general's fear of meeting a large number of troops, their wish to go home *etc.*

Document E, reports the number of desertions and the desperate formation of a women's battalion.

Own knowledge could include defeats, low morale, shortages at the front, and at home.

Documentary material for disorder is in Document D with the taking of land by peasants, the loss of authority of the squires *etc.*

Own knowledge could include strikes, lockouts, general anarchy, workers' organisations, formation of the Red Guards, the Kornilov affair, inflation *etc.*

Demand balanced and evidenced answers. If only documentary material or own knowledge is used, [4 marks] is the maximum. If only the war or only disorder is addressed, then mark out of [4 marks]. Do not expect all the documents to be used, use of a range of them is sufficient on this demanding question.

**SECTION B**

**Prescribed Subject 2                      Origins of the Second World War in Asia 1931-1941**

5. (a) **What does Document D suggest Japan should do as a result of the Emperor's decision to attack Pearl Harbor?** **[2 marks]**

This document suggests that the people must support the Emperor, be united as a nation, and win the war. It also maintains that the Japanese Military and its government will be closer together. Credit valid assertions and relevant quotations. Award **[1 mark]** for two valid assertions; **[2 marks]** for three assertions.

- (b) **What political message is intended by Document B?** **[2 marks]**

Tojo (Japan) is complaining about the US, represented by Hull, and Welles (and Roosevelt - although not identified), encircling Japan while, at the same time, Japan is portrayed as encircling the US. The three Americans are represented as being dizzy indicating that they are confused by Japanese actions. Candidates might make reference to the US's Allies (China, Britain, and the Netherlands) threatening the autonomy of Japan in the Pacific although this is not required for them to receive full marks.

**N.B.** *Do not enter half marks or + and - but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of [4 marks].*

6. **How consistent are Documents A, C and E in their portrayal of the relationship which existed between Japan and the US in November and December 1941?** **[5 marks]**

Document A clearly identifies Japanese aims to be to “strike a heavy blow at America's source of strategic materials” and to “defeat America”. It is evidently hostile to the US. Document C indicates that the US is attempting to put pressure on Japan with its “humiliating proposal” and that the US has been “unbending”, making it difficult for Japan to negotiate. Document C also clearly instructs Nomura and Kurusu to pretend to continue negotiating with the US and indicates that Japan desires peace in the Pacific. Document E accuses Japan of deliberately deceiving the US which believed that it was negotiating conditions which would maintain peace. Document E also protests against the Japanese action of attacking Pearl Harbour. Document A shows that Japan expects war to come soon and is consistent with Document C in that Document C expects diplomatic relations to be broken off and a split to occur between the two countries, but it is inconsistent in that it does not specifically mention war. Document E is inconsistent with the others as it claims that the US had no knowledge of either the impending breakdown of negotiations or the attack on Pearl Harbour.

All documents should be included in the answer. If only two are mentioned award no more than **[3 marks]**. Balanced responses which refer to the documents specifically and show the degree of consistency which they contain should receive full marks.

7. **With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Documents B and E for historians studying the attack on Pearl Harbor in 1941.** **[5 marks]**

Document B is a political cartoon in a British newspaper. Britain is at war with Germany and Japan is a member of the Tripartite Pact. British sources at this time are likely to be hostile to Japan which it shows running rings around the Americans (Roosevelt is the man in the middle - although candidates are not expected to know this fact). The cartoon therefore has propaganda value and also indicates the British point of view. Its limitations are that it could be seen as propaganda and is therefore subjective.

Document E is a speech asking Congress to declare war on Japan. It is valuable as it portrays the United States' position on the Pearl Harbour attack, but is limited as it seeks to give the impression that the US knew nothing about Japan's aggressive intentions. The choice of words and its tone show its subjectivity as it is trying to gain sympathy for the American point of view.

For maximum **[5 marks]** ensure that candidates use both documents and assess both value and limitations. If only one document is addressed award up to **[3 marks]**.

8. **Using the documents and your own knowledge assess the state of diplomatic relations between Japan and the US in 1941.** **[6 marks]**

The documents give conflicting opinions. Document E is asking Congress to declare war and argues that the relationship has been amicable. Candidates may question the truth of this latter statement. Document B indicates that Japan is trying to deceive the US and this is supported by Document C suggesting that Japan has aggressive intentions. Document A clearly shows the intent of Japanese policy and Document D shows that an attack is planned.

1941 had been an uneven year between the two countries. The first six months showed vigorous private and official transpacific efforts to avoid war. Nomura became ambassador on the condition that peace took precedence over war, agreed to by Konoye and Matsuoka. Private citizens also contributed (the "John Doe Associates" among others) and called for meetings between the two nations. In July 1941 the US froze all Japanese funds in the US and cut off oil. This was to last until Japan agreed with Hull's four principles. In August the Atlantic Charter was signed. The negotiations of November and December 1941 were tortuous and there was uncertainty whether Japan would attack Russia or not after its moves towards southeast Asia. The US certainly expected Japan to expand, but thought that moves would be made towards Indonesia rather than Hawaii.

Candidates are not expected to include all of this detail but ensure that a coherent argument is made utilising both documents and the candidate's own knowledge. If only the documents **or** own knowledge is used award a maximum of **[4 marks]**.

**SECTION C**

**Prescribed Subject 3      The Cold War 1945-1964**

9. (a) **What criticisms of ‘The Cold War’ television series can be found in Document E?** **[2 marks]**

Criticisms include: it neglects to criticise USSR behaviour; too little time/attention is given to the important issue of the ideological origins of the Cold War; it is not balanced in its criticisms of the Marshall Plan. There are various acceptable answers. Allow actual criticisms within the document too, for example the depiction of Marshall as lacking experience and understanding.

*[1 mark]* for indicating any one criticism made in the Document; *[2 marks]* for indicating clearly any two criticisms, or for brief reference to 3 or more criticisms.

- (b) **What political message is intended by Document C?** **[2 marks]**

The cartoon refers to the Berlin airlift that followed the imposition of the Berlin blockade (1948) and a dilemma that then faced Stalin. The birds (storks), shown carrying coal and food, represent the Allied airlift of supplies to their sectors in Berlin. Stalin’s power to shoot the birds/planes down is indicated by his gun and proximity to the birds. Use of this power would stop the flow of supplies, but would arouse much criticism and possibly retaliation.

*[1 mark]* for indicating awareness that the cartoon refers to the Berlin airlift; *[2 marks]* for answers providing further explanation, for instance what is implied by Stalin’s position or the significance of the birds.

**N.B.** *Do not enter half marks or + and - but compensate between (a) and (b) if necessary for a final mark out of [4 marks].*

- 10. Explain the different interpretations of the Marshall Plan to be found in Documents B, D and E. [5 marks]**

Document B is totally hostile to the Marshall Plan, asserting that it was part of a general plan of world expansion by the US (“a plan for the economic and political enslavement of Europe by American imperialism”). The emphasis in Document D is on the positive economic benefits of the Plan (“The Marshall Plan kick-started the west European economies”; “an extraordinary growth of the region got under way”; “West Germany retooled its industries”). Document E presents two views. The first is similar to that presented in Document D in that it stresses that the Marshall Plan helped lay the foundations of post-war European recovery, but adds that this “played a part in halting the spread of communism in Europe”. The other interpretation mentioned in Document E echoes part of the interpretation in Document B, emphasising economic dependence when it states “Marshall Aid created a consumer society and linked Europe to American trade and capital”, and it also makes the further assertion that this “forced the Soviet Union to build a rival bloc”.

Reward comment and quotation that shows understanding of the different interpretations. Maximum of **[3 marks]** for comment on any one document. Reserve **[1 mark]** for comment on each of the other two documents. Do not expect explanation of why the interpretations are different but credit such a response.

- 11. With reference to their origin and purpose assess the value and limitations, for historians studying the Cold War, of Documents A and D. [5 marks]**

Document A is an extract from a personal letter written by President Truman on 5 January 1946 to his Secretary of State. Truman’s purpose is to inform and influence his Secretary of State by indicating clearly to Brynes his own views about Russian intentions and what the US government should do. Assuming that it is authentic, the letter provides valuable evidence of the new President’s views on Soviet intentions and appropriate US policies, but it is only one perspective.

Document D is an extract from a book by a British historian whose intention is to inform, clarify and explain. There is no indication that he witnessed the events mentioned and his views are likely to have been shaped by the society in which he has lived and worked. On the other hand he does have the benefit of hindsight and of access to Soviet archives opened in 1991. His account, open to public examination, provides a further record of these events. He offers his account of the events plus some indication of what the newly opened Soviet archives reveal about Stalin and the Berlin blockade.

For maximum **[5 marks]** ensure that candidates use both documents and assess both value and limitations. If only one document is addressed award up to **[3 marks]**.

- 12. Using the documents and your own knowledge, explain why there was continuing tension between the US and the Soviet Union in the period 1945 to 1950.**

**[6 marks]**

Candidates may use the documents as evidence of some of the following:

**Document A** Truman's belief that Russia intended to expand to the Mediterranean and should be faced with strong language and an iron fist

**Document B** the Soviet leaders' belief that the US had a world expansionist policy;

**Document C** the Western Allies and the USSR in dispute over Berlin;

**Document D** the Berlin blockade increasing insecurity and making east-west relations adversarial;

**Document E** the ideological foundations of the Cold War and consequences of the Marshall Plan and aid package.

Own knowledge could include some of the following: disputes arising at the end of World War Two (*e.g.* reparations, Poland); the imperative of security felt by the Superpowers; the US' nuclear capability; the 'Sovietisation' of eastern and central Europe (Bulgaria, Rumania, Poland, Hungary); the Communist take-over in Czechoslovakia (February 1948); creation of the Federal Republic of Germany (August 1949) and German Democratic Republic (October 1949); the Soviet Union successfully testing their first atomic bomb in 1949; and the worsening situation in Korea leading to the outbreak of war in 1950.

Do not demand all the above for **[6 marks]**. The maximum if only documentary material **or** own knowledge is used is **[4 marks]**.

---