

MARKSCHEME

May 2002

HISTORY

Higher and Standard Level

Paper 1

SECTION A

PRESCRIBED SUBJECT 1 The Russian Revolutions and the New Soviet State 1917 to 1929

- 1. (a) According to Document D why did Nicholas II abdicate? [2 marks]**

Award *[1 mark]* for each of the following to a maximum of *[2 marks]*; the dangerous situation “at home”; to obtain co-operation from the people to win the war; to follow the dictates of his conscience and/or fulfil his duty; to obey the wishes of the Duma.

- (b) What message is portrayed by Document E? [2 mark]**

The message is anger against the Russian Imperial family the Romanovs, and a wish to destroy/overthrow it. Award *[1 mark]* for a simple statement to this effect, and the second for some elaboration.

N.B. *Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate where necessary between (a) and (b) for a final mark out of [4 marks].*

- 2. In what ways do Documents C and E support the views expressed in Document A? [5 marks]**

The views expressed in A are of a dangerous situation on 26 February with mob violence, and a mutiny of soldiers largely caused by recently conscripted peasants, who wanted “land and freedom” and who opposed the Tsar, and their officers. On 27 February the situation deteriorated with the breakdown of law and order, shortage of fuel and food and the failure of the government to alleviate it.

C supports A in reporting the troop mutiny, raging mobs which the government failed to control and therefore it wished to resign.

E supports A in picturing mob violence and a threat to overthrow the Tsar, on 26 February 1917.

A probable breakdown of marks would be *[2 marks]* for A, *[2 marks]* for C and *[1 mark]* for E.

- 3. With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Documents B and D for historians studying the 1917 February/March Russian Revolution. [5 marks]**

B is an official contemporary document issued by the Central Committee of the Social Democratic party. Its purpose is to set out party policy. It is valuable as showing the party's aims and policies and revealing support for the people, the setting up of a provisional government and opposition to the Tsar. Its limitations are that it is a manifesto seeking support so its policies and support for the achievements of the people, "huge efforts" "cost of blood and lives" may be exaggerated in order to win support.

D is also a contemporary document written by the Tsar to explain why he was abdicating. Written at the height of the revolution its value is that it reveals his fears, his feelings for Russia and the Russian people and his concept of his duty. Its limitations are that in many ways it is both an apology and a justification, seeking to put his actions in the best possible light.

Assign [2 to 3 marks] either way for each document. Candidates must refer to origin and purpose to obtain [5 marks].

- 4. Using these documents and your own knowledge, explain why the 1917 February/March Russian Revolution was successful. [6 marks]**

There are many reasons contained in the documents that candidates could use to show why the revolution was successful, for example:

A the strength of the peasants' demands and opposition to the Tsar and the Romanov dynasty, the quick break down of law order and government control and hatred of officers.

B also reveals the strength of the revolutionary outbreak and the popular demands.

C shows the weakness and indecision of the Tsar, a main cause of revolutionary success.

D also portrays the weakness of the Tsar and his government.

E pictures hatred of the Romanov dynasty.

Own knowledge could include war conditions at home and in the war zone, for which the Tsar, in command, was blamed; Alexandra and Rasputin; failure since 1905 to reform, for example failure and criticism of the duma, economic problems.

Do not expect all the above, but for full marks candidates must explain clearly why the first 1917 Revolution was successful by referring to long term and immediate causes of increasing disaffection as well as the actual events in February/March 1917. If only own knowledge or documentary material is used [4 marks] is the maximum that can be obtained.

SECTION B

PRESCRIBED SUBJECT 2 Origins of the Second World War in Asia 1931–1941

5. (a) According to Document C, what does Jiang Jieshi (Chiang Kai-shek) regard as Japan’s aim and what does he believe will prevent it being fulfilled? *[2 marks]*

Jiang Jieshi (Chiang Kai-shek) believes that Japan intends to make China her colony and to make herself the mistress of Asia. In order to do this, he claims, Japan must first conquer the world. He believes that this will be prevented because the “world powers” (*i.e.* the western powers), which have together made China a semi-colony, will resist Japan and defeat her. Award *[1 mark]* for a valid answer to each part of the question.

- (b) What does Document B reveal about the attitude of the West towards Japan at the time? *[2 marks]*

Document B reveals mixed western feelings of fear, distaste and racial contempt. The Japanese figure is a distorted caricature in military uniform, its large hands clasping the world and its prominent teeth biting down on China. The caption expresses western apprehension as to Japan’s ultimate intentions. Award *[1 mark]* for awareness of the Western attitude, *[2 marks]* if the candidate explains how the cartoon conveys this message.

N.B. Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate where necessary between (a) and (b) for a final mark out of *[4 marks]*.

6. How consistent are Documents A, C and D in their view of Japanese intentions in East Asia? *[5 marks]*

Document A is from August 1940 and clearly states that Japan aims at a new order in East Asia based on the relationship between Japan, Manchoukuo and China. It takes as its first priority the settlement of the conflict in China and makes an oblique reference to the international situation, meaning the outbreak of the war in Europe, the defeat of France by Germany and the expected invasion of Britain. Document C gives Jiang Jieshi’s (Chiang Kai-shek’s) view in 1934. Japan’s policy of the Greater East Asian Prosperity Sphere had not yet evolved, but Document C states that Japan’s intention is the conquest of China and that this will lead to conflict with the world powers who would defend their interests. Document D reflects American suspicion after the conquest of Manchuria, that Japan may increase its influence over China, perhaps by agreement with the Chinese Government. If only two documents are included, or if all three are included without any analysis, award up to *[3 marks]*. For an answer which evaluates the consistency of all three documents award up to *[5 marks]*.

7. **With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Documents A and C for historians studying Sino-Japanese relations in the period 1932 to 1940.** *[5 marks]*

Document A is an official Japanese document issued after the outbreak of war in Europe, the defeat of France by Germany and the isolation of Britain. It may be regarded as a statement of policy. It clearly states the Government's desire to end the conflict in China and to establish the Greater East Asia Prosperity Sphere under Japanese domination. It does not say how this will be done, but historians would note the reference to the international situation and realise that the Japanese Government might seek to turn the defeat of the European colonial powers to its advantage, especially as the document stresses strengthening and arming the nation.

Its limitations are that it is a Government statement for public consumption. Historians, however, may see in its vagueness evidence of Japanese Government indecision and hesitation at that particular time, and suspect that it reflects a compromise between different views and factions. They would wish to study documents reflecting those views and the opinions of sections of Japanese society.

Document C gives the views of the leader of Republican China. As he is talking in secret to his military officers, it may be taken as an accurate description of his views, providing the source is correctly attributed. Historians would find the document a valuable insight into Jiang's (Chiang's) analysis of China's situation and the importance he attached to the international dimension. They would also note his reference to the "complicated" domestic situation, meaning the conflict with the Communists. The document could be seen as partly an attempt to convince his officers that the threat from Japan was not as dangerous as it appeared in that Japan would first have to defeat the western powers.

Its limitations are that it tells us what Jiang (Chiang) wanted his officers to hear, not whether he really believed what he said. Historians would want to view other documents to ascertain fully Jiang's (Chiang's) views at that time.

Maximum of *[3 marks]* if only one document is addressed. For maximum *[5 marks]* candidates must refer to both origin and purpose in their assessment.

- 8. Using these documents and your own knowledge, assess the role of the western powers, in particular the United States and Great Britain, in the conflict between Japan and China in the period 1932 to 1940. [6 marks]**

Documents A and C show that the Japanese and the Chinese were aware of the potential importance of the western powers, and Document D is evidence of US disquiet at Japanese actions in Manchuria and the threat posed to US commercial interests in China. Document B indicates that at least some western opinion saw Japan as an aggressor and opposed its policies and thus supports Document C's contention that Japan would have to face the West before it could conquer China. Document E, while confirming Western interests in China, reveals that the British and the Americans were not prepared to resist Japan in 1937. Storry provides reasons for this, which candidates may place in the context of the worsening situation in Europe, the strength of isolationism in the United States, the relative unpreparedness for war of Britain and the United States and lingering antagonism to the Nationalist regime. At this stage the full extent of Japanese atrocities in China had not been revealed and national opinion in the United States and Britain, as Storry points out, may not have supported intervention. Nevertheless, Storry sees this as a last chance for successful intervention, when the western powers were not involved in war in Europe and Japan's accession to the anti-Comintern Pact (in 1936) had not greatly decreased its diplomatic isolation. Better students may note that Jiang's (Chiang's) forces still employed German military advisers.

Candidates are not expected to include all of this detail, but ensure that a coherent argument is made utilising both documents and the candidate's own knowledge. If only documenting material or own knowledge is used, award a maximum of **[4 marks]**.

SECTION C

PRESCRIBED SUBJECT 3 The Cold War 1945-1964

9. (a) **What does Document A reveal about the US naval response proposed by Acheson immediately following North Korea’s invasion of South Korea? [2 marks]**

According to Document A, Acheson recommended that the US navy give all-out support to the (South) Korean forces, that for the time being their efforts should be confined to the south of the 38th parallel, and that the Seventh Fleet should be ordered to prevent an attack on Formosa (Taiwan).

[2 marks] for responses indicating these three parts of his recommendations; *[1 mark]* for reference to any two parts. Credit also other valid comments on Acheson’s recommendations regarding the US naval response.

- (b) **What message is portrayed by Document B? [2 marks]**

The cartoon shows two figures representing President Truman and an armed United Nations, dashing into action. The implication is that the armed UN and USA are rushing to take an active part in the war in Korea. This action is portrayed as contrasting with the earlier inactivity of the League of Nations. The message on the tombstone is that the League died from lack of exercise facing wanton aggression. The figure representing the deceased League of Nations shows horror at the UN’s hasty armed activity.

Candidates should identify two main points for *[2 marks]*.

- N.B.** *Do not enter half marks or + and – but compensate when necessary between (a) and (b) for a final mark out of [4 marks].*

- 10. Compare and contrast the accounts of the invasion of South Korea given in Documents C and D. [5 marks]**

Candidates are likely to focus on similarities and differences in specific content, but credit all relevant comment. Stalin has a prominent role in both accounts (authorizing the invasion in Document C, decision-maker in D). US intervention is discussed in both, but seen as inevitable in C and avoidable by a swift victory in D. Mao and the Chinese communists are given relatively low status in both accounts (C states the Chinese communists were seen as mere tools of the Kremlin and D simply that Mao's opinion was sought). Kim Il-sung is portrayed as the initiator of the invasion in D but not mentioned in C. Other contrasts could include: the invasion is said to be a deliberate test of Western wills in C whereas D states that the North Koreans wanted to help their brethren in South Korea; C refers to the consequences for the security of Japan and beyond if Stalin was allowed to succeed whereas the war is seen as an internal matter in D; the account in C is from a Western perspective and seeks to recapture how people felt in the late 1940s whereas the extract from Khrushchev's memoirs (D) offers a Soviet perspective.

Do not expect all the above. This question can be answered in various ways; reward all comment and analysis that shows understanding of similarities and differences. Maximum of **[3 marks]** for answers that only compare or contrast. For maximum **[5 marks]** candidates must offer well-argued running contrasts and comparisons.

- 11. With reference to their origin and purpose, assess the value and limitations of Documents A and C, for historians studying the outbreak of the Korean War. [5 marks]**

Document A is an extract from Dean Acheson's memoirs, listing some of his policy suggestions to the President immediately following North Korea's invasion of South Korea. As Secretary of State he has a key responsibility for advising the President. The purpose of the recommendations was to give the President his best possible advice after North Korea's invasion. However, these recommendations are reported 19 years later in his memoirs, when his purpose may include portraying himself in the best possible light. Given their origin and purpose, the extract seems likely to be a valuable source of evidence on government policy recommendations; but, particularly because it was published in memoirs, there is a need to seek corroboration.

Document D is an extract from a book by a British historian. As an historian, his role is to explain the events he writes about, with proper attention to the evidence available. His views are likely to have been shaped in some ways by the society in which he has lived and worked, but as an historian he must base his account and claims on evidence, not personal feelings. He is seeking to recapture the thinking of the time he is writing about, and as an historian he has the benefit of hindsight and whatever sources were available to him. The date of publication means that he did not have access to the Soviet archives opened in 1991 with their evidence on Stalin's role.

Reward relevant comment, but up to a maximum of **[3 marks]** if only one document is addressed. For maximum **[5 marks]** candidates must refer to both origin and purpose in their assessment.

- 12. Using these documents and your own knowledge, how far do you agree with the judgment, “The Korean War transformed the Cold War”?** **[6 marks]**

Evidence that could be used in support of the claim includes: from the documents, extension of Cold War military deployment to include Indo-China and Formosa (Documents A and E) and the US using the UN in a military role (B), and from own knowledge, armies of two superpowers (US and China) met on the battlefield, further details of the global spread of superpower confrontation, and reference to the arms race stimulated by the war. The best candidates might explain how the Korean War fuelled anti-communism in America, making it impossible to propose a balanced policy towards Communist states.

Candidates may find it more difficult to construct arguments against the claim. Be receptive to relevant, substantiated argument. It can be argued that other factors have a claim to transforming the Cold War, including the Communist victory in China and Soviet development of an atomic bomb. Document E suggests that the death of Stalin signalled a phase of negotiation and the ending of Cold War One, and that availability of atomic weapons to both sides brought a new attitude to war. Able candidates may argue that although the conflict was restricted to Europe initially and then moved to East Asia, various characteristics remained constant, *e.g.* Europe as an area of concern (C), the division of Europe, the East-West ideological divide, and the succession of tensions between East and West.

The question asks candidates to assess. Maximum of **[4 marks]** for narrative answers where assessment is implicit rather than explicit, and for answers that use only the documents or own knowledge.
