



GCSE MARKING SCHEME

SUMMER 2012

HISTORY - STUDY IN DEPTH

**WESTWARD MIGRATION: THE AMERICAN WEST,
1840-1895**

4281/01

INTRODUCTION

The marking schemes which follow were those used by WJEC for the Summer 2012 examination in GCSE HISTORY. They were finalised after detailed discussion at examiners' conferences by all the examiners involved in the assessment. The conferences were held shortly after the papers were taken so that reference could be made to the full range of candidates' responses, with photocopied scripts forming the basis of discussion. The aim of the conferences was to ensure that the marking schemes were interpreted and applied in the same way by all examiners.

It is hoped that this information will be of assistance to centres but it is recognised at the same time that, without the benefit of participation in the examiners' conferences, teachers may have different views on certain matters of detail or interpretation.

WJEC regrets that it cannot enter into any discussion or correspondence about these marking schemes.

NOTE ON THE QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

Examiners are required to credit the quality of written communication for each candidate's performance on particular questions. These are question 1(e) and either 2(d) or 3(d). There are no additional marks for the Quality of Written Communication, but examiners are expected to consider the following descriptions of performance when awarding levels to the work of candidates:

Level 1	the text is generally legible; aspects of spelling, punctuation and grammar are clear; some information is presented in a suitable manner
Level 2	most of the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are used to make the meaning clear; information is presented in a suitable format.
Level 3	the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently accurate to make meaning clear; relevant information is presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses some specialist vocabulary
Level 4	the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are consistently accurate to make meaning clear; information is always presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses specialist vocabulary accurately

PAPER 4281/01 WESTWARD MIGRATION: THE AMERICAN WEST, 1840-1895

MARKING SCHEME

SECTION A

Question 1 (a)

Target:	Understanding of source material		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
2			2

Question: **What does Source A show you about the life of a homesteader family?** [2]

Use 0 for incorrect or inaccurate answers.

Award one mark for one relevant selection from the source.
Award two marks for two relevant selections from the source.

The following can be credited:

They had a hard life;

Their house was made of sods with a turf roof;

Lifestyle was quite primitive, environment looks quite harsh;

Quite a large family, look well dressed despite dirty conditions.

Question 1 (b)

Target:	Understanding of source material; recall and deployment of knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	2		2

Question: **Use the information in Source B and your own knowledge to explain why people settled on the Plains.**[4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; uses content of source only. [1/2]

Eg: they settled on the Plains because of the Homestead Act; it gave each family 160 acres of land if they settled and farmed it for five years.

LEVEL 2 Development of the content with an attempt to provide some explanation. Needs explanation and background knowledge/context for highest mark. [3/4]

Eg: government legislation was an important reason; the Homestead Act 1862 gave away 160 acres of land to those who settled and farmed the land for 5 years; this was an important incentive, as were other acts such as the Timber and Culture Act 1873 and Desert Land Act 1877; railway companies also granted land to settlers; improved communications encouraged settlers; over-crowding on east coast; desire for a new lifestyle; impact of the Civil War; a variety of 'push and pull' factors encouraged settlement of the Plains.

Question 1 (c)

Target:	Analysis and evaluation of source material; reaching supported judgements		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
5		1	4

Question: **How far does Source C support the view that lawlessness and violence were common in the West? [5]**

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; weak reference to content of source only. [1/2]

Eg: it does support it because it shows a bank robbery taking place; people are shooting each other; people and horses are lying dead on the floor.

LEVEL 2 Discusses content of source with an attempt at a judgement on the extent of support for the view. [3/4]

Eg: the source shows a bank robbery taking place in the town of Northfield Minnesota in 1876; the James-younger gang are carrying out an armed robbery; the drawing shows violence; the robbers are on horseback shooting into the crowd; some of the crowd are shooting back; people and horses are lying dead on the street; it gives the impression of lawlessness and therefore supports the view; it is an artist's impression.

LEVEL 3 Answer uses the source and its authorship or contextual knowledge to offer a reasoned judgement on the extent of support for the view. [5]

Eg: Source C strongly supports the view that lawlessness and violence were common in the West, but it is only an artist's impression and we do not know how accurate the scene is; it does show an armed robbery taking place; a bank is being robbed using armed force; people are using guns, people and horses have been killed; the scene shows a major shoot-out but it provides no information on how common such events were.

Question 1 (d)

Target:	Critical analysis and evaluation of source material; deployment of knowledge		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
6	2	1	3

Question: **How useful is Source D to an historian studying the life of a cowboy?** [6]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 **Generalised answer; paraphrases content of source.** [1-2]

Eg: is useful because it says cowboys had to ride their horses for 12-24 hours a day; they had to guard the cattle at all hours; life was very hard for cowboys.

LEVEL 2 **Considers usefulness of the source in terms of its content only**
OR
Deals with some aspects of content; refers to authorship [3]

Eg: is useful because it comments on how difficult life was for a cowboy; they had to work very long hours; anything from 12 to 24 hours a day; they had to look after the cattle at all times; they had to travel over vast distances; life was lonely travelling over the empty Plains.

Deals with content of source well and begins to consider origin or purpose of source. [4]

Eg: as above but also notes that it was said by Mike Hinkle who had been a cowboy in the 1870s.

LEVEL 3 **Gives an evaluation with some imbalance, considering utility in terms of issues such as content, origin and purpose of source.** [5]

Gives a reasoned and balanced evaluation, considering utility in terms of issues such as content, origin and purpose of source. [6]

Eg: Source D is useful because it is the observation of a man who was a cowboy in the 1870s; he talks about the extreme hardship and loneliness of working as a cowboy on the Plains; reference is made to working very long hours, the constant watching of the cattle, the long distances travelled; he says that only a man who has worked on those early ranches can really comment upon the harsh working conditions; Matt Hinkle made these observations in a book which was published in the 1890s; it says they were his memories so the accuracy of the comments can be questioned as they were made 20 years afterwards; possibly Hinkle was exaggerating the hardship to make the story more dramatic for the book 'Cowboys of the Old West'; they were comments made to entertain the reader.

Question 1 (e)

Target:	Recognition and explanation of different historical interpretations; deployment of knowledge;		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
8	2	2	4

Question: **Why do Source E and F have different views about lawbreakers in the West?** [8]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 **Generalised answer; paraphrases the sources; may contain irrelevancy.** [1/2]

The Level 1 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: Source E says that Billy the Kid was not a blood-thirsty hard violent lawbreaker who killed many men; Source F says that he was a mass killer who had killed 21 people by the time of his 21st birthday.

LEVEL 2 **Starts to explain the different views in terms of either their content or their authorship; limited development is seen.** [3/4]

The Level 2 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: Source E says that the image of Billy the Kid as a violent lawbreaker who killed many people is untrue; he did not kill for money, money did not interest him; it says his lifestyle was good as he never drank or smoked; Source F paints a very different picture of Billy the Kid; it says he was a mass murderer who had killed at least 21 people by the time of his 21st birthday, having made his first killing before the age of 12; it says he killed for money as he was a hired gunman in the Lincoln County War; he was imprisoned for killing the law officer Sheriff Brady.

LEVEL 3 **Explains the difference in the views with clear reference to both content and authorship.** [5-6]

The Level 3 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: Sources E and F have contrasting views of lawbreakers in the West; Source E is trying to defend the reputation of Billy the Kid against stories that he was a violent and blood-thirsty killer; it says that the stories about how many men he killed exaggerated and he was not someone who killed for money; he was a clean living man who neither drank or smoked; these comments are made by Frank Coe who knew Billy; he had been a member of his gang and so his works are likely to be supportive and therefore biased; Source F, in contrast, is very negative in its reporting of Billy; it accuses him of having killed at least 21 people, of having served as a hired gunman in the Lincoln County War and therefore accepted money for killing people; it suggests he had no scruples and even killed a law officer Sheriff Brady; these comments are made in a GCSE textbook written by the historian Mike Mellor; he would have researched this information and would have had time to reflect upon the evidence now available upon Billy's life.

LEVEL 4 **Developed explanation with good support from the sources and own knowledge; detailed consideration of the authorship of each source; some routine elements still seen.** [7]

Balanced and developed explanation with good support from the sources and own knowledge; detailed consideration of the authorship of each source; answer is sophisticated and integrated. [8]

The Level 4 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: Sources E and F differ sharply in their views of Billy the Kid, a famous lawbreaker in the American West; Source E is the view of Frank Coe who gave a newspaper interview immediately after Billy had been shot dead by Sheriff Pat Garret in 1881; Frank Coe would have been upset by Billy's killing and would want to portray his former friend in a positive light, saying that stories about how many men he killed were totally exaggerated; he says that Billy was a decent chap who did not kill for money and was clean living, refusing alcohol and tobacco; this is a very biased view as Coe had been a member of Billy's gang and obviously wanted to support his former friend; Source F, in contrast, is the view of a modern historian, Mike Mellor, who was writing with the benefit of hindsight in 1998; he would have been able to study a range of evidence and would have reflected; Mellor believes that Billy was a mass murderer who killed at least 21 people; he was prepared to kill for money and served as a hired hand in the Lincoln County War; he had no respect for law and order and even killed Sheriff Brady; Mellor is writing in a GCSE textbook and as it is being used for educational purposes it is likely to be accurate; therefore the circumstances under which both sources were written explain why they differ so much in their comments about lawbreakers in the West.

SECTION B

Question 2(a)

Target:	Understanding of source material		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
2			2

Question: **What does this picture show you about the lifestyle of the Plains Indians?** [2]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

Award one mark for one relevant selection from source

Award two marks for two relevant selections from source

The following can be credited:

They lived in teepees;

The teepees were made out of buffalo skins;

They used horses for transport and hunting;

They lived in groups - the picture shows a collection of teepees;

They were nomadic.

Question 2(b)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; understanding of key historical features		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
5	3	2	

Question: **Describe the role of traders and trappers in opening up the West.** [5]

LEVEL 1 **Generalised answer with a weak or implied point made.** [1-2]

Eg: they hunted animals and traded their furs; they were the first white Americans to travel westwards.

LEVEL 2 **A more detailed description with up to two accurate points made.** [3-4]

Eg: they opened up new routes west across the Rocky Mountains; they trapped beavers to sell their furs; they traded their furs with merchants; trading companies became established, building forts to act as trading posts; mountain men were important in exploring new routes and were later used to guide wagon trains west through the Rocky Mountains.

LEVEL 3 **A fully developed description with three or more accurate points made.** [5]

Eg: they were pioneer travellers who explored and opened up new routes across the Rocky Mountains; the fur trappers were the first non-Indians to cross the Plains; they roamed the Rocky Mountains trapping beavers and hunting other animals for their fur; once a year trappers/mountain men gathered at a rendezvous to trade their catch; this led to establishment of trading companies and forts along the trade routes; by the 1840s the beaver trade had declined and mountain men earned a living by guiding wagon trains through the mountains; their knowledge of the west was unrivalled.

Question 2(c) (i)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; explanation of key historical features and characteristics		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	2	2	

Question: **Explain why the discovery of gold in California was important in westward migration.** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; only one reason given OR description only. [1/2]

Eg: it caused lots of people to rush west in search of gold; many thousands of miners hoped to get rich quick and made the journey to California.

LEVEL 2 More detailed and accurate explanation which discusses at least two reasons. [3/4]

Eg: it caused the trickle of settlers moving westwards to suddenly turn into a flood; January 1848 James Marshall discovered gold as Sutter's Mill, California; in March the newspaper 'The California' published an article about the find; May 1848 gold found at other sites; stampede of speculators; 19 August 1848 'New York Herald' announced news to the world; by 1851 40,000 people had descended upon California; cities such as Virginia City and Sacramento grew rapidly.

Question 2(c) (ii)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; explanation of key historical features and characteristics		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	2	2	

Question: **Explain why the Mormons migrated west.** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; only one reason given OR description only. [1/2]

Eg: to get a better life; to stop being attacked; so that they could worship freely; to find a new homeland.

LEVEL 2 More detailed and accurate explanation which discusses at least two reasons. [3/4]

Eg: their religious views, particularly polygamy, were unacceptable to many Americans; they found it difficult to settle and experienced persecution; they were frequently attacked and hounded out of an area; their leader Brigham Young decided to move to a remote site outside of the control of the government; he chose Great Salt Lake.

Question 2(d)

<i>Target:</i>	<i>Recall and deployment of knowledge; analysis of key concepts; quality of written communication</i>		
<i>Mark allocation:</i>	AO1	AO2	AO3
10	4	6	

Question: **Was the hunt for the buffalo the most important feature in the lifestyle of the Plains Indians?** [10]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; simple response which offers little support. [1/2]

The Level 1 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: yes it was, it provided the Indians with food; warriors hunted them; they followed the herds.

LEVEL 2 To distinguish between 3 and 5 marks apply the following framework: [3/5]

For 3-4 marks: A basic one-sided answer with some contextual support **OR** a very weak two-sided answer with limited contextual support.

For 5 marks: A reasoned one-sided answer with contextual support **OR** a weak two-sided answer with some contextual support.

The Level 2 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: yes the hunt for the buffalo was very important; the buffalo was the main source of food; the Indians used every part of the animal and they followed the herds round, it was the reason for their nomadic lifestyle; but other factors were important in their lifestyles such as religion and family life.

LEVEL 3 To distinguish between 6 and 8 marks apply the following framework: [6/8]

For 6-7 marks: A developed one-sided answer with good contextual support **OR** an unbalanced two-sided answer with contextual support.

For 8 marks: A two-sided answer with good contextual support but lacking some detail or balance.

The Level 3 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: the hunt for the buffalo was very important and was the key factor in determining the movement of the tribes; the Plains Indians were very respectful of the buffalo and they only hunted for what they needed; they used every part of the animal - meat, skins for teepees and clothes, bones for weapons, during for fuel; but this needs to be balanced against other key features in their lifestyles such as the importance of religion, the role of the medicine man, family life; the importance of the band/tribe.

LEVEL 4 **To distinguish between 9 and 10 marks apply the following framework:**
[9/10]

For 9 marks: A reasoned and supported two-sided answer with balance, using mostly accurate and relevant historical detail.

For 10 marks: A reasoned and supported two-sided answer with good balance, using fully accurate and relevant historical detail and with a clear judgement.

The Level 4 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: the answer discusses in some detail the importance of the buffalo in the lifestyle of the Plains Indians, spelling out how the following of the herds dictated their nomadic existence; the buffalo was worshipped by the Indians and they held ceremonies/dances before a hunt took place; they utilized every part of the animal - meat, bones, skin, dung etc; but the importance of the buffalo should be evaluated against other important features in the lifestyle of the Plains Indians; expect religion to be discussed in some detail - religious ceremony, beliefs, ritual, the spirit world, the role of the medicine man; the importance of the family unit and other features such as warrior culture and the use of the horse may also be considered.

Question 3(a)

Target:	Understanding of source material		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
2			2

Question: **What does this painting show you about the Plains Wars?** [2]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

Award one mark for one relevant selection from the source
Award two marks for two relevant selections from the source

The following can be credited:

It was a war between the Plains Indians and the US Army;
The army were seen attacking an Indian village;
The fighting involved the use of horses - US cavalry V. Indian warriors;
Weapons used included guns & bow and arrows;
The painting shows a massacre of Indian people by the US Army at Sand Creek in 1864.

Question 3(b)

Target:	Recall and selection of knowledge; understanding of key historical features		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
5	3	2	

Question: **Describe the Ghost Dance Movement.** [5]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer with a weak or implied point made. [1/2]

Eg: it was when the Indians performed a dance; they called it a Ghost Dance; they believed it would make things better.

LEVEL 2 A more detailed description with up to two accurate points made. [3/4]

Eg: a holy man had a vision which predicted better times ahead - the return of the buffalo, the disappearance of the whites and the return of dead Indians; he called upon the Indians to dance the Ghost Dance; the Indian authorities tried to stop it but failed.

LEVEL 3 A fully developed description with three or more accurate points made. [5]

Eg: on New Year's Day 1889 a Paiute holy man called Wovoka received a vision - if the Indians remained peaceful and danced the Ghost Dance then all the whites would disappear, the buffalo would return and all the dead Indians would come back to life; the Ghost Dance religion spread rapidly across the reservations; the authorities called upon the army to stamp out the movement; Sitting Bull was shot dead whilst being arrested; the army arrested Big Foot and his band and took them to a camp at Wounded Knee; as they attempted to disarm the Sioux the soldiers opened fire; 146 Indians and 25 soldiers were killed; the massacre marked the end of the Plains Wars.

Question 3(c) (i)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; explanation of key historical features and characteristics		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	2	2	

Question: **Explain why the Black Hills of Dakota were important in the Plains Wars.** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; only one reason given OR description only. [1/2]

Eg: it was important land which had belonged to their ancestors; the whites wanted it because gold had been discovered there.

LEVEL 2 More detailed and accurate explanation which discusses at least two reasons. [3/4]

Eg: in 1874 gold was discovered in the Black Hills of Dakota and hundreds of miners flooded into the area; this was sacred Indian territory protected by the Fort Laramie Treaty of 1868; the government tried to deal with the Indians in 1875 offering \$6 million but this failed; the government then demanded that all Indians go to the reservations and in summer of 1876 the US Army launched a campaign against the Indians; it resulted in the Battle of Little Big Horn 25 June 1876.

Question 3(c) (ii)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; explanation of key historical features and characteristics		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
4	2	2	

Question: **Explain why the US Government encouraged the destruction of the buffalo herds.** [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; only one reason given OR description only. [1/2]

Eg: they wanted to kill off all the buffalo; they wanted to destroy the food used by the Plains Indians; white settlers wanted the land.

LEVEL 2 More detailed and accurate explanation which discusses at least two reasons. [3/4]

Eg: they wanted to destroy the way of life of the Plains Indians; to take away their main source of food; they wanted the land to enable whites to set up ranches for cattle; it was part of a strategy to help defeat the Indians during the Plains Wars by taking away their livelihood; white hunters were encouraged to kill vast numbers.

Question 3(d)

Target:	Recall and deployment of knowledge; analysis of key concepts; quality of written communication		
Mark allocation:	AO1	AO2	AO3
10	4	6	

Question: **Was the lack of unity among the Plains Indians the most important reason for their defeat in the battle for the Great Plains?** [10]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer, simple explanation which offers little support. [1/2]

The Level 1 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: yes because they did not join together and fight as one big force; the US army was stronger and had better weapons.

LEVEL 2 To distinguish between 3 and 5 marks apply the following framework: [3/5]

For 3-4 marks: A basic one-sided answer with some contextual support **OR** a very weak two-sided answer with limited contextual support.

For 5 marks: A reasoned one-sided answer with contextual support **OR** a weak two-sided answer with some contextual support.

The Level 2 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: the Indians were weak because they fought as separate nations and did not unite and work together; the US army was able to pick off each nation one by one; the Indians could not fight long campaigns and had to stop fighting during the winter months; the US army had better weapons and more supplies; they were a professional army and they had good generals.

LEVEL 3 To distinguish between 6 and 8 marks apply the following framework: [6/8]

For 6-7 marks: A developed one-sided answer with good contextual support **OR** an unbalanced two-sided answer with contextual support.

For 8 marks: A two-sided answer with good contextual support but lacking some detail or balance.

The Level 3 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: the lack of unity among the Plains Indians is important in understanding the reasons for their defeat in the Plains Wars; their failure to join together meant they were weaker; the US army could pay off one nation against another and pick them off one by one; but they faced a stronger enemy; the US army had better tactics and better weapons; the general showed good leadership; Generals Sheridan and Sherman carried out the policy of Total War and Winter campaigns; they used forts; they attempted to kill off the buffalo herds to starve the Indians.

LEVEL 4 **To distinguish between 9 and 10 marks apply the following framework:**
[9/10]

For 9 marks: A reasoned and supported two-sided answer with balance, using mostly accurate and relevant historical detail.

For 10 marks: A reasoned and supported two-sided answer with good balance, using fully accurate and relevant historical detail and with a clear judgement.

The Level 4 descriptor for quality of written communication may be considered here.

Eg: the division between the Indian nations and their inability to unite against the US army was an important factor in their ultimate defeat; they were less well armed than the US army; they were not as efficient/experienced on the battlefield in using modern weapons; they were worn down by having to fight long campaigns; their lifestyle was threatened by the destruction of the buffalo herds, by continual white settlement on the Plains and the spread of the railway which took away land from the Indians; but other factors also need to be considered such as the good leadership of the US generals such as William Sherman and Philip Sheridan; they introduced new strategies such as Indian nations when they were most vulnerable; they attempted to destroy the landscape/food supplies upon which the Indians relied for their lifestyle; the ending of the Civil War allowed the US government to concentrate upon the West; the Plains Indians lost the battle for the Great Plains for a variety of reasons, among which their failure to unite and work together was a very important factor.