

TROTSKY AND
STALIN
COURSEWORK
ASSIGNMENTS

GCSE HISTORY COURSEWORK ASSIGNMENTS

Teacher Information

Introduction:

These assignments comprise sources, questions and mark schemes which will enable your pupils to fulfil the coursework requirements in history for Edexcel Foundation specifications for first examination in summer 2003. You may use these assignments as they stand. They have been designed to assess the full range of grades targeted by the syllabus (Grades G-A*). Assistance may be given in class to aid the comprehension of the sources.

You may also adapt these assignments if wished by:

- providing additional or replacement sources
- providing additional or replacement questions.

However, if you wish to make changes you should submit these to the Edexcel Foundation for approval to ensure that revised sources or questions give candidates appropriate opportunity to meet the targets specified at the appropriate level.

Management of the assignment:

The assignment has been designed to accommodate some flexibility of classroom practice. The following points should be borne in mind:

- Although all the questions *may* be tackled as part of a single task, this is not necessary. The timing of individual questions within an assignment may be staggered over a period of time and integrated into the programme of study.
- Candidates may use the sources provided in the pack as part of their preparation for Assignment 1 but this is not a requirement.
- Your candidates should draw upon their contextual knowledge when using the sources for Assignment 2. The historical content listed below should be familiar to candidates before they attempt to answer the questions.

Trotsky and Stalin

This assignment should arise from a teaching programme designed to occupy approximately half a term. Before candidates begin this assignment they should have knowledge of:

- Bolshevik rule and its impact, 1918-1924
- Trotsky's ideas about 'permanent revolution' and Stalin's ideas about 'revolution in one country'
- Stalin's attacks on Trotsky and the 'left opposition', and his attack on the 'right opposition'
- Trotsky in exile.

Introduction

When Lenin died in January 1924, the two most important figures in the Bolshevik Central Committee were Leon Trotsky and Joseph Stalin. Within four years, Joseph Stalin had not only forced Trotsky out of the party, but had also removed all of the other leading Bolsheviks from posts of responsibility. How was a poorly educated son of an ordinary family from Georgia able to outwit and outmanoeuvre so many highly educated figures in the Bolshevik party? Why did the Bolsheviks not follow Lenin's advice and appoint Trotsky as their leader and dismiss Stalin from his post of General Secretary?

SOURCE A: From Lenin's Political Testament written on 25 December 1922

Comrade Stalin, having become General Secretary, has concentrated enormous power in his hands, and I am not sure that he always knows how to use that power with sufficient caution.

Trotsky is the most able man for the party. His defect is an excess of self-confidence. He is attracted too much by the purely administrative aspect of affairs.

The qualities of Trotsky and Stalin, the two most able leaders of the present Central Committee might quite innocently lead to a split. If our party does not take steps to prevent it, a split might arise quite unexpectedly.

SOURCE B: From a postscript to Lenin's Political Testament, written on 5 January 1923

Stalin is too rude, and this fault, which is completely acceptable amongst us communists, is not acceptable in the office of General Secretary. Therefore, I propose to the comrades that they find a way to remove Stalin from that position and appoint it to another man who in all respects differs from Stalin; he should be more patient, more loyal, more polite and more attentive to colleagues.

SOURCE C: Part of a recorded private conversation between Bukharin and Kamenev in 1928

Stalin is an unprincipled intriguer. He is only interested in increasing his own power. He changes theories according to whom he needs to get rid of. Our potential forces of the Right opposition are vast, but middle-ranking members of the Party do not understand the issues involved. There is a terrible fear of a split in the party. Stalin has made it difficult for us to attack him. He is a monster who will kill us all.

SOURCE D: A cartoon published in the Soviet Union in 1927. A Soviet cartoon showing the 'Left Opposition': Trotsky (organist), Zinoviev (singer) and Kamenev (parrot).



SOURCE E: A photograph taken at Lenin's funeral in January 1924. It shows Stalin (front right) carrying Lenin's body.



SOURCE F: From the funeral oration made by Stalin at Lenin's funeral in January 1924

In leaving us, Comrade Lenin commanded us to hold high and pure the great calling of party members. We swear to you, Comrade Lenin, to honour your command. Before he left us, Comrade Lenin commanded us to keep the unity of our party above all else. We swear to you, Comrade Lenin, to honour your command.

SOURCE G: From a book written by Trotsky in the 1920's

Without the direct support of the European working-class we cannot remain in power and turn our temporary victory into lasting socialism.

SOURCE H: Part of a speech made by Stalin in the 1920's

Socialism in one country means the working class taking power and using that power to build a completely socialist society in our country. We do not need the victory of working-class revolution in other countries.

SOURCE I: From George Orwell's novel 'Animal Farm' written in 1945. In this novel Orwell represents the power struggle between Stalin and Trotsky as a conflict between two farm animals called Napoleon [Stalin] and Snowball [Trotsky].

At the Meetings, Snowball often won over the majority by his brilliant speeches, but Napoleon was better at getting support from the other animals for himself in between times. Of all the arguments, none was so bitter as the one that took place over the windmill*.

Apart from the disputes over the windmill, they disagreed over the defence of the farm. According to Napoleon, what the animals must do was to get firearms and train themselves in the use of them. According to Snowball, they must send out more and more pigeons and stir up rebellions amongst the animals on the other farms.

These arguments were finally settled at a Meeting. As usual, Snowball made a brilliant speech but then Napoleon stood up and uttered a high-pitched whimper of a kind none of the animals ever heard before. Then there was a terrible baying and nine enormous dogs wearing brass-studded collars came bounding into the barn. They dashed straight for Snowball, who only sprang from his place just in time to escape their snapping jaws. He put on an extra spurt and, with few inches to spare, slipped through a hole in the hedge and was seen no more.

The animals were amazed at the expulsion of Snowball, but there was another surprise in store for them.

On the third Sunday after Snowball's expulsion, the animals were somewhat surprised to hear Napoleon announce that the windmill was to be built after all.

*the windmill represents policies for industrialisation.

Assignment One: Objective 1

1. In what ways did the careers of Stalin and Trotsky differ in the years 1917 to 1924? **(15)**
2. Why was Stalin's position in the Bolshevik Party much stronger than Trotsky's in 1924? **(15)**
3. In what ways was Stalin able to eliminate his rivals in the party in the years from 1924 to 1930? **(20)**

(Total: 50 marks)

Assignment Two: Objectives 2 and 3

1. Study Source A.

What can you learn from Source A about Lenin's opinion of Trotsky and Stalin? **(6)**

2. Study Sources A and B.

Source B was written less than two weeks after Source A. Use Source A, and your own knowledge, to suggest reasons why Lenin wrote Source B. **(12)**

3. Study Sources C, D, E and F.

Does the evidence of Sources C, D and E support Stalin's promise (Source F) 'to keep the unity of our party'? **(8)**

4. Study Sources G, H and I

How useful are Sources G, H and I as evidence for the disagreements between Stalin and Trotsky? **(10)**

5. Study all the sources.

'Stalin won the power struggle with Trotsky because his ideas were more practical'. Use the sources, and your own knowledge, to explain whether you agree or disagree with this interpretation. **(14)**

(Total: 50 marks)

Coursework Assignments Mark Scheme

Trotsky and Stalin

Assignment One

1. *In what ways did the careers of Stalin and Trotsky differ in the years 1917 to 1924?* (15)

Target: Difference/Key features/recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements offering some details of the careers supported by some knowledge, eg the posts held by Stalin and Trotsky etc. (1-5)

Level 2: Developed statements giving differences supported by relevant knowledge, eg chronological lists of the main events in the careers. (6-10)

Level 3: Assesses the differences between the careers, e.g. the importance of the roles, the influence of the two etc. (11-15)

2. *Why was Stalin's position in the Bolshevik Party much stronger than Trotsky's in 1924?* (15)

Target: Causation/recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements giving reasons supported by some knowledge, eg he controlled the organisation, Trotsky was unpopular etc. (1-5)

Level 2: Developed statements giving reasons supported by relevant knowledge, eg the role of Stalin as General Secretary, the nature of Trotsky's personality and his political ideas etc. (6-10)

Level 3: Developed explanation supported by appropriately selected knowledge showing understanding of the sequence of events in the years from 1918 to 1924 and the links between them, e.g. The ways that Stalin exploited his position in the Party and the effects that these had upon the position of Trotsky and others, the impact of Trotsky's personality and his ideas. (11-15)

3. *In what ways was Stalin able to eliminate his rivals in the party in the years from 1924 to 1930?* (20)

Target: Analysis of key features /recall of knowledge

Level 1: Simple statements supported by some knowledge eg he isolated the Left by supporting the Right etc. Having got rid of the Left, he changed sides and then got rid of the Right etc. (1-5)

Level 2: Developed statements supported by relevant knowledge eg he sided with the right-wingers and supported NEP etc. He then changed his mind and attacked NEP and began to argue that industry should be expanded very quickly and then disposed of the Right who by now had no support in the Party. (6-10)

Level 3: Developed explanation supported by appropriately selected knowledge showing understanding of the sequence of events in 1924 to 1928 e.g. Stalin opposed the Left's plans to modernise industry and appeared to support the NEP, he then used the support of the Right to win a large majority at the December 1925 Party Congress etc. Stalin used the majority to turn on the Right and drive them out of power in order to pursue his plans for modernisation, they were unable to resist him as they had no power base in the party etc. (11-15)

Level 4: Sustained argument supported by precisely selected knowledge showing clear understanding of the nature of Stalin's aims and the links between them and the sequence of this actions e.g. Stalin wanted to achieve total power within the Soviet Union and had to eliminate Trotsky first. He therefore sided with the Right in support of the NEP and used the majority gained at the 1925 Congress to elect loyal supporters to the Politburo, this allowed him to dismiss Zinoviev, Trotsky and Kamenev from the Politburo in 1926. Stalin then dealt with the less experienced and politically less dangerous Right, who had little support in the party machinery, Bukharin, Rykov and Tomsky were all dismissed from office by 1930. (16-20)

Coursework Assignments Mark Scheme

Trotsky and Stalin

Assignment Two

Assessment Objectives 2 and 3

1. *Study Source A. What can you learn from Source A about Lenin's opinion of Trotsky and Stalin* (6)

Target: Comprehension of and inference from a source

Level 1: Information taken from source at face value, e.g. he did not like Stalin, he approved of Trotsky, details of their characters etc. (1-3)

Level 2: Inferences from the source, e.g. he was aware that they both had serious faults that could lead to discord etc. (4-6)

2. *Study Sources A and B. Source B was written less than two weeks after Source A. Use Source A, and your own knowledge, to suggest reasons why Lenin wrote Source B.* (12)

Target: Analysis of sources/recall of knowledge to explain change

Level 1: Simple statements of difference using the sources as information at face value and/or some contextual knowledge e.g. he had changed his mind, he wanted to make sure that Trotsky succeeded him, this was a personal document etc. (1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements using the sources and relevant own knowledge, e.g. Lenin realised that a successor was needed and had to be set out to review the main figures in the Bolshevik Party, he was trying to make sure that everyone understood his opinion of Stalin, this was a document which would only be read after Lenin died etc. (4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation using the sources as evidence and selected knowledge, e.g. shows that Lenin understood the relative positions of Stalin and Trotsky in the party and Lenin's feeling towards them, this document was an attempt to prevent trouble in the party after Lenin's death, after writing the first document Lenin had quarrelled with Stalin after the latter had insulted the former's wife etc. (7-10)

Level 4: Sustained argument using the sources as evidence and precisely selected knowledge, e.g. sets documents in the context of Russia in 1922-3, Bolsheviks were only just in control, Lenin understood the need for unity, references to Stalin's and Trotsky's roles in the Civil War etc. (11-12)

3. *Study Sources C, D, E and F. Does the evidence of Sources C, D and E support Stalin's promise (Source F) 'to keep the unity of our party'?* (8)

Target: Analysis and cross referencing of sources

Level 1: Simple statements matching details of content taken at face value from the Sources, eg no he tried to get rid of other members of the party, yes he got rid of opponents etc. (1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements making inferences from the sources eg Sources C and D suggest that Stalin was going out of his way to attack and ridicule his opponents, E and F suggest that Stalin placed loyalty to Lenin very highly etc. (4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation using the nature, origin and purpose of the sources, eg refers to the speaker in Source C and the significance of the cartoon in Source D, eg this suggests that Stalin's attacks reached a wide audience in the USSR. (7-8)

4. *Study Sources G, H and I. How useful are sources G, H and I as evidence for the disagreements between Stalin and Trotsky?* (10)

Target: Evaluation of sources for reaching a judgement on utility

Level 1: Simple statements using the sources as information, e.g. shows understanding that the sources refer to the conflict between Trotsky and Stalin. (1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements making inferences from the sources, e.g. explains the different ideologies and quotes from Source I in support eg references to pigeons, animals training themselves, attempt to attack Trotsky etc. (4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation using the sources as evidence e.g. refers to 'European working class', 'socialist society' and relates these to details from Source I, specific references to the significance of the windmill. (7-10)

5. *'Stalin won the power struggle with Trotsky because his ideas were more practical'. Use the sources, and your own knowledge, to explain whether you agree or disagree with this interpretation.* (14)

Target: Analysis of sources and recall of knowledge to make a judgement about an historical interpretation

Level 1: Simple statements offering points in support OR against using sources at face value OR own knowledge, e.g. yes, most people wanted the USSR to be strong, Trotsky's ideas were too risky, OR no it was terror that won etc. (1-3)

Level 2: Developed statements offering points in support of choice making inferences from sources AND supported by relevant knowledge, specific instances quoted from sources e.g. Source C suggests that Stalin had the backing of his party because they did not understand what was going on and wanted unity, as Stalin had promised in F etc. (4-6)

Level 3: Developed explanation giving a judgement about difficulty making use of sources as evidence and supported by selected knowledge, e.g. yes Stalin won because his ideas appealed more to ordinary party members. Trotsky was unpopular because he was not prepared to compromise and tried to lecture his opponents as is shown in Source I, OR Stalin used terror as is shown in Sources C and I and out-maneuvred his opponents by gaining control of the party machine etc.

(7-11)

Level 4: Sustained argument using the sources as evidence and supported by precisely selected knowledge, which critically evaluates the interpretation eg understands that most of the sources offer one-sided views of Stalin and uses these to offer an explanation of his success, which was brought about by a mixture of various factors, terror, manipulation and an appeal to party members based on Stalin's apparent closeness to Lenin etc.

(12-14)