

# Examiners' Report

## June 2015

### GCSE History 5HB02 2B

## Edexcel and BTEC Qualifications

Edexcel and BTEC qualifications come from Pearson, the UK's largest awarding body. We provide a wide range of qualifications including academic, vocational, occupational and specific programmes for employers. For further information visit our qualifications websites at [www.edexcel.com](http://www.edexcel.com) or [www.btec.co.uk](http://www.btec.co.uk).

Alternatively, you can get in touch with us using the details on our contact us page at [www.edexcel.com/contactus](http://www.edexcel.com/contactus).

## ResultsPlus

### Giving you insight to inform next steps

ResultsPlus is Pearson's free online service giving instant and detailed analysis of your students' exam results.

- See students' scores for every exam question.
- Understand how your students' performance compares with class and national averages.
- Identify potential topics, skills and types of question where students may need to develop their learning further.

For more information on ResultsPlus, or to log in, visit [www.edexcel.com/resultsplus](http://www.edexcel.com/resultsplus). Your exams officer will be able to set up your ResultsPlus account in minutes via Edexcel Online.

### Pearson: helping people progress, everywhere

Pearson aspires to be the world's leading learning company. Our aim is to help everyone progress in their lives through education. We believe in every kind of learning, for all kinds of people, wherever they are in the world. We've been involved in education for over 150 years, and by working across 70 countries, in 100 languages, we have built an international reputation for our commitment to high standards and raising achievement through innovation in education. Find out more about how we can help you and your students at: [www.pearson.com/uk](http://www.pearson.com/uk).

June 2015

Publications Code UG041831

All the material in this publication is copyright  
© Pearson Education Ltd 2015

## Introduction

In nearly all of the examination scripts candidates had completed the required number of questions and question 2 was the only area where there were a noticeable number of entirely blank pages. There were almost no rubric offences such as answering both questions 3 and 4 or combining a) and b) sections from both questions 5 and 6. There was a wide variation in the numbers choosing the optional questions; approximately two-thirds of candidates choose question 3 rather than question 4 and around 90% of the entry chose question 6 in preference to question 5. Although the numbers choosing the optional element of Question 2 are not available as data gathered from scanned answer booklets it was clear that the vast majority of students chose Custer rather Red Cloud.

This was the first examination of the revised 'strengthened' specification. The main change for this Depth Study Unit was the altered nature of the stimulus material in questions 3, 4, 5b and 6b to two short bullet points and the mark scheme requirement for candidates to use information beyond the stimulus material to reach the higher marks within Levels 2 and 3 for questions 3, 4, 5b, 6b. In 5b and 6b information beyond the stimulus is needed to enter Level 4. What was clearly noticeable is that some candidates were clearly answering a previously set question. This meant that their response might have had sufficient and accurate details but did not show an understanding of the focus of the set question and consequently was awarded very low Level 3 or high level 2.

## Question 1

Many of these responses began with 'the source shows', 'from this source I can infer/learn that' followed by an inference that explicitly supported by the source. The most frequent valid inferences made were about the Plains Indians' nomadic lifestyle by using evidence from the source such as the use of the horses and the tipi.

Where candidates did not reach level 2 it was invariably comments about what could be seen in the source. There were a few that wrote lengthy descriptions of the culture of the Plains Indians but without reference to the source at all. Such responses cannot be rewarded as this question has to be assessed with Assessment Objective 3 - comprehension and source inference.

1 What can you learn from Source A about the lives of Plains Indians?

(4)

From this painting I can learn that the lives of the plains indians was very difficult. living on the plains in the boiling sun and sand storms in the harsh ground. Also I can learn they were very communal as they are all sat around their tipis together. I can also learn that it was very barren with not much water and hardly any grass for their horses to eat. I can learn that horses had a very big impact on their life as there are many horses walking around the dry barren land.



**ResultsPlus**

**Examiner Comments**

The candidate has made a valid inference about communal living and this is clearly supported by reference to the source. It is therefore Level 2 and full marks.

## Question 2

Most students selected Custer. At level 3 students explained his role in the wider conflict between settlers and Plains Indians and were not entirely focused on the Battle of Little Big Horn. These responses included Custer's role in the discovery of gold in the Black Hills, the implications this had for settlers and the reasons for changes in US government policy towards the Indians. Level 2 answers were typically predominantly narrative accounts of Custer which invariably focused on the Battle of Little Big Horn. These responses often had an impressive knowledge of Custer's army. In some instances these responses could be seen as addressing a relatively recently set question on mistakes made by Custer. Level 1 comments were normally statements such as 'he led the US army at the Battle of Little Big Horn.'

Responses on Red Cloud at Level 3 explained his role in certain battles and his reaction to the signing of treaties. Many of these responses included Fetterman's trap and the attacks which took place on the Bozeman trail, as well as Red Cloud's ability to bring the tribes together. Level 2 responses were narrative or descriptive accounts of Red Cloud from the discovery of gold in Montana to the Fort Laramie Treaty. At Level 1 most responses were comments that could apply to any General or Indian Chief such as 'he led the US army' and 'he led the Indians.' There were also examples of confusion between Red Cloud and other Indian Chiefs such as Black Kettle, Sitting Bull and Crazy Horse.

2 The boxes below show two individuals.

Choose **one** and explain his role in the conflict between settlers and Plains Indians.

(9)

Red Cloud

Custer ✓

General Custer was part of the 7<sup>th</sup> cavalry. He was well known for his battles against the Plain Indians and his success against them. <sup>Custer's</sup> ~~the~~ main conflict against the plain Indians was in 1876 in the Battle of Little Big Horn. ~~As he was in charge of the army he refused~~ Custer made many mistakes during this battle due to him failing to take orders. He attacked the Sioux nation, splitting his cavalry into 3 as he would afraid the Indians would leave. Custer and his men were heavily outnumbered by the 2,000 Sioux warriors in the camp.

His army was ~~the~~ tired and he failed to provide enough weapons for his men. He began fighting on foot. Custer and his men were slaughtered by the Indians. However this act turned many people from negotiators into exterminators due to Custer's popularity.

In conclusion, Custer's role in conflict between the Plain Indians was to ~~protect~~<sup>keep</sup> the Indians on reservation however his hatred towards the Indians cost him his life but ultimately led to the end of the Plain Indian way of life.



**ResultsPlus**  
**Examiner Comments**

This response is low Level 3. Most of the response is at Level 2 as it is a description and narrative account of Custer and the Battle of Little Big Horn. However there is a comment at the end of the first page which summarises Custer's actions as changing the policy towards the Plains Indians from negotiation to extermination. This comment makes the response low Level 3.

### **Question 3**

Nearly all of the responses at Levels 2 and 3 included varying degrees of accurate and relevant details on the railroads changing the lives of homesteaders with the coming of machinery and less isolation. The range of factors changing the lives of homesteaders in addition to those prompted by the stimulus material included developments in education, law enforcement, opportunities for employment and the increase in consumer goods. Some candidates also mentioned that the coming of the railroads led to the decline of some settlements. Level 3 answers were focused on a range of ways in which the coming of the railroads changed the lives of homesteaders with accurate and relevant details such as the changes brought by sod busters, wind pumps, barbed wire and threshers. Some candidates explained the change from subsistence farming to homesteaders making a profit. In terms of Isolation, candidates explained the growth of communities with the provision of schools, doctors, and law enforcement.

At level 2 the responses were more descriptive and with more generalisations about railroads usually making things faster and easier to keep in touch with family and friends. There were some examples of candidates describing the effects of the construction of railroads on the cattle industry or the lives of the Plains Indians. These responses were clearly addressing previous examination questions. Comments in level 1 were invariably so general that they could apply to a new transport system reaching a community at any point in history such as 'they could buy and sell easier' or 'they could travel more.'

Indicate which question you are answering by marking a cross . If you change your mind, put a line through the box  and then indicate your new question with a cross .

Chosen Question Number: Question 3  Question 4

The transcontinental railroad was completed in 1869 and it dramatically improved the lives of homesteaders who had started to settle and farm on the great plains.

First of all the lives of the homesteaders changed because heavy machinery could be brought over from the east. Such as the sod buster to plow the very hard land and the wind pump to collect water from deep under ground. These two pieces of machinery alone really helped to improve the success of farming on the great plains. Before the railroad it would have been difficult to transport this machinery such a large distance because they were so heavy. The coming of the railroads meant that the machinery could easily be brought to the great plains to the homesteaders so their lives could improve.

Another thing that the coming of the railroads did to change the lives of the homesteaders was bringing the USA army to defend people against the native American Indians. Before the railroads the USA army would have to

travel long distances in a long time to try and push the Native Americans into reservations. This meant that Native Americans often attacked the early homesteaders because of their different views on land. However with the introduction of the railroad it meant the USA army could travel long distances much faster. This was a very bad thing for the Native Americans, due to the fact they were more forcefully pushed onto reservations and a lot of Buffalo were killed. ~~to~~ On the other hand it was very good for the lives of homesteaders because it reduced the fear of hostile Indian attacks.

The railroads also helped to kill lots of the buffalo because more people were coming over and eating them and the tracks were often along buffalo migration paths, so buffalo were often shot if they were in the way. Along with barbed wire which was ~~the~~ invented by Joseph Glidden in 1874, they prevented both the buffalo and cattle (from cowboys and the cattle industry) from trampling over their crops and drinking their water. As a result the homesteaders' lives improved due to more

Successful harvests leading to more food.

So overall the coming of the railroads played a huge role in the improvement of the homesteaders' lives on the great plains. This is because it helped to end the problem of isolation. The great plains were known as the great American desert because they were just so difficult to live on. However the coming of the railroads helped to end all this because now journeys were much shorter and safer. So more people ~~to~~ could move over. Vital machinery could be brought in and the USA army could much easier come over and defend the white settlers. This all meant a improvement in the homesteaders' lives.



**ResultsPlus**

**Examiner Comments**

This is a high level 3 response. The candidate clearly focuses on the set question and uses a range of examples to show how the coming of the railroads changed the lives of the homesteaders. The reasons identified are supported with accurate and relevant details.

## **Question 4**

Nearly all of the responses at Levels 2 and 3 included varying degrees of accurate and relevant details on the ways in which cow towns and John Iliff contributed to the growth of the cattle industry after 1865. The range of factors contributing to the growth of the cattle industry after 1865 in addition to those prompted by the stimulus material included Joseph McCoy, the Goodnight-Loving trail, railroads, refrigerated wagons and the opening up of new markets in the East. Level 3 responses showed a range of factors that were supported with accurate details and showed particularly how the industry developed at different times. Occasional answers explained other the transition from trails to cow towns to open range ranching. Level 2 answers often included lengthy descriptions of cow towns. There were some candidates who confused Illiff with Goodnight with McCoy, as well as a few that were under the impression that refrigerated railroad wagons meant that cows could be transported across the USA without getting too hot.

Indicate which question you are answering by marking a cross in the box ☒. If you change your mind, put a line through the box ☒ and then indicate your new question with a cross ☒.

Chosen Question Number: Question 3 ☒

Question 4 ☒

One reason was Joseph McCoy's cowtowns. After he set up the first cowtown more were made, this helped dramatically as it gave cattlemen a place to rest and feed their cattle after a long cattle drive, because they could feed them this made them healthier which in turn would sell for more money. The cowtowns eventually became a half way point to meet potential buyers, as the cattle didn't have to travel as far they ~~became~~ arrived more healthy which again sold for more money. They were also built along the railroad which decreased the time and work the cattle had to do which made them healthier.

Another was the railroad. Before the railroad the cattle were driven which made healthy cattle into worn out skinned cattle which didn't sell very well. The railroad provide ~~a~~ transport for the cattle so they would be just as healthy as when they left. The introduction of refrigerated carts also helped it meant ranchers could kill and prepare the ~~best~~ meat

before leaving which made it fresh and healthy and sold for more.

Finally there was ranching. John Illif came up with ranching which gave them the opportunity to get the cattle as healthy as possible for as much money as possible before killing them and then using refrigerated cattle. John Illif also set up a contract with the Indians on reservations to sell his meats.



**ResultsPlus**

**Examiner Comments**

This response is low Level 3. There is focus on the set question with support but more accurate and relevant details are needed for a high Level 3 mark.

## **Question 5**

### **Question 5a**

Level 3 responses identified problems specific to the Donner Party's migration West with almost all including the weather, the wagon train having a higher than average ratio of women and children, splitting up of the group and cannibalism. Many candidates also made reference to setting off late and the problems it caused, knew about Lansford Hastings and the cut off, crossing the salt plains and losing all their oxen. Some mentioned the Forlorn Hope and the various rescue missions. Level 2 responses were either descriptive or narrative accounts of the Donner Party's journey but without a focus on the problems faced or were an account of more general problems that would have been common to all wagon trains migrating West such as the length of the journey, lack of food, and bad weather. There were very few level 1 responses to this question.

### **Question 5b**

Most candidates used the stimulus on cattle rustling but the bullet point on the Wyoming Stock Growers association was frequently ignored suggesting that it was not familiar to most candidates. The most common own knowledge was the lynching of Averill and Watson and candidates were secure in their understanding. Most candidates understood the focus of the question in attributing blame for the Johnson County War. Level 4 answers were aware of the context of the outbreak of the war as well as the war itself and there was clear weighing up of the argument as to the extent to which each side was responsible for the conflict. At level 3 candidates were able to describe the problems between homesteaders and cattlemen and develop an explanation on who was to blame. At level 2 most responses described the Johnson County War and often gave narrative accounts of the Watson and Averill case.

## **Question6**

### **Question 6a**

Level 3 answers had a sense of contextualising the almost non-existent framework for law and order based up the geographical size and large distances, the very rapid development of mining and cow towns and the problems of preventing conflict between various group in US society. The responses which achieved full marks were the responses which went on to discuss the geographical difficulties of law and order and the difficulties of receiving support from the east.

Most students focused on mining towns and claim jumping but some brought in the Johnson County War. There were some excellent accounts of miners courts focused around the gold rush. A significant number of students were able to reach the lower end of level 3 by showing an understanding of the wider law enforcement issues present during the period.

Many made reference to the absence of sheriffs in the West and a significant number referred to the problem of Sheriffs being corrupt.

Level 2 answers tended to focus around the types of crime that vigilantes attempted to tackle such as claim jumping, fights and general crimes. There were very few level 1 responses to this question.

## Question 6b

The range of factors contributing to migration West in the 1840s in addition to those prompted by the stimulus material often included the economic depression in the East and to a lesser extent Manifest Destiny. Unfortunately a significant number of students used material which was outside of the time frame of the question such as homesteading, government legislation, resettlement after the Civil War, the rise of the cattle industry and the construction of railroads. There were some excellent Level 4 answers which identified wealth in its widest form; not just gold but land and commercial prosperity as well as the economic hardships in the East and weighed up the extent to which this explains migration West in the 1840s against other relevant factors such as the persecution of the Mormons and the widespread belief in Manifest Destiny. There were also a few candidates who mentioned the farming crisis in the mid-West. At level 3 most candidates explained the Mormons and the Californian Gold Rush as examples to both refute and support the statement. Most candidates then explained depression in the East as a factor but were less likely to relate this to wealth. At level 2 many candidates gave descriptive answers of the Mormons migrating West and the Gold Rush but often this knowledge was not used to answer the set question. There were very few responses at Level 1 for this question.

Indicate which question you are answering by marking a cross in the box . If you change your mind, put a line through the box  and then indicate your new question with a cross .

Chosen Question Number: Question 5  Question 6

a) In the West there was no law and order so people would do all sorts of things. They would steal peoples land, gamble, drink and even kill one another. One specific group called the vigilantes used it as an opportunity to take the law into their own hands.

The main thing the vigilantes did was lynch criminals. If they found anyone committing a crime they would immediately lynch them. This was good as well as bad. It was good because it provided people with a sense of security as the Sheriffs were good for nothing but it was also bad because they would sometimes lynch the wrong person so innocent people would often get punished.

Vigilantes were also normal people so as part of their human nature even they would have wanted to use the fact that they were powerful for their own desired reasons. They would use their power to commit their own crimes such as stealing land. If they ever got into trouble with the court, they would bribe them and the case would be dropped.

b) I disagree, the search for wealth was one of the many reasons why people migrated West but it wasn't the main.

After the discovery of gold in the West, a large number of men called the '49ers' decided to migrate to the West in hope of becoming rich. These men were greedy for wealth and went to ~~any~~<sup>every</sup> extent to get a piece of gold. They would steal ~~the~~ each others land, steal each others money, fight and even kill one another. This was all down to wealth so it was one of the reasons why people migrated West.

Another reason why people migrated West was to escape racial and religious persecution. An example of this was the Mormons. After founding the religion of Mormon, Joseph Smith and his followers were disunited and attacked by the people in ~~the~~<sup>Europe</sup> East. Many of his followers were

included this way so the only solution which was left for them was to move to the West. This proved to be successful for them as they got along with the Plains Indians and were able to escape persecution. This was another reason why people migrated ~~to~~ west.

Furthermore, Europe was going through a major economic crisis. Many people became unemployed and even lost their cattle and farms due to not being able to afford it. In the West, there were a large number of jobs to offer and land was also cheap and fertile so people could easily escape poverty and start their life from scratch again. This was another reason behind the migration of people to the West.

Also, people were encouraged to move to the West in many ways. Posters and advertisements would advertise the benefits of moving to the West

Such as the land. Family members would also send letters home which described what life was like there, persuading people to move.

Also, the government made many acts which encouraged people to move such as the homestead act which said that if you farm for 5 years on their land you will get a further 160 acres of land for very cheap. This persuaded people <sup>more to</sup>

hugely and they couldn't wait to <sup>move to</sup> the West.

The government made these acts for a specific reason which was to fulfill manifest destiny. They believed it was their god-given right to move to the West as they would bring light into it and it was inevitable. This is why they would persuade people to move, to get as many people fulfilling the manifest destiny. This was another reason why people moved to the West.

Lastly, Brigham Young set up the Perpetual Emigrating fund which enabled 15000 mormons ~~to migrate~~ and 80000 converts to migrate to the West. After reaching there, they would then repay him. This persuaded people to move because previously people found it difficult to take the journey across but now they would be able to receive help. This was another reason why people migrated to the West.

Overall, I think the main reason behind the migration to the West was the fact that people were going through a financial crisis. If the economic crisis did not take place, people would have most likely stayed where they were and not moved as they

would not have been persuaded by the promise of cheap land or free jobs. They would not have required it.



## ResultsPlus

### Examiner Comments

6a) This response is mid Level 2. It is a description of vigilantes with relevant support but is not a clear focus on their role in dealing with law and order. The response would also need more accurate detail for Level 3.

6b) This response is low Level 4. It has a sustained focus on the question and analyses the role of searching for wealth to explain migration West in the 1840s. The answer also attempts to assess the extent to which search for wealth was the main cause for the Mormons migrating west. The comments on the collapse of the bank are just sufficient as an aspect in addition to those provided by the stimulus material. More precisely-selected material would have secured a mark higher within Level 4.

## Paper Summary

On the basis of this year's paper candidates are offered the following advice to improve their performance in future tests:

- Focus on the set question rather than using a pre-prepared response to a previously set question.
- If there is a date range in the set question try to ensure that the response covers the full date range but does not give details outside of the given time frame.
- For questions 3 and 4, 5b and 6b include at least three factors or aspects in the response. This can be the two stimulus points and the candidates' own, one of the stimulus points and two of the candidates' own or three entirely of the candidates' own choices. Three factors or aspects are necessary for high Level 2 and 3 to be awarded in questions 3,4,5b and 6b and for Level 4 in questions 5b and 6b.

## **Grade Boundaries**

Grade boundaries for this, and all other papers, can be found on the website on this link:

<http://www.edexcel.com/iwantto/Pages/grade-boundaries.aspx>



Ofqual



Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru  
Welsh Assembly Government



Pearson Education Limited. Registered company number 872828  
with its registered office at 80 Strand, London WC2R 0RL.