

---

**THINKING SKILLS**

**9694/23**

Paper 2 Critical Thinking

**October/November 2018**

**1 hour 45 minutes**

No Additional Materials are required.

---

**READ THESE INSTRUCTIONS FIRST**

An answer booklet is provided inside this question paper. You should follow the instructions on the front cover of the answer booklet. If you need additional answer paper ask the invigilator for a continuation booklet.

Answer **all** the questions.

The number of marks is given in brackets [ ] at the end of each question.



---

This document consists of **6** printed pages, **2** blank pages and **1** Insert.

- 1 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.

### Source A

#### Extract from *Politics Yearbook*

Bangistan is an uneasy union of two provinces, Eastland and Westland. The two provinces are ethnically and religiously different from one another. The national capital, Easttown, is situated in Eastland, and Westish people have a longstanding grievance that they are the victims of discrimination. The current President of Bangistan is General Marcel Jalin, who took office after a military coup.

### Source B

#### News report from *Bangistan TV*

April 2016

Violent protestors today attacked the government buildings in Easttown. Soldiers had to fire in self-defence after they were attacked with rocks and petrol bombs. Three of the rioters have died. A spokesman for the President, General Jalin, has repeated the President's pledge to hold democratic elections to appoint a civilian president as soon as it is safe to do so.

### Source C

#### Report from international radio news

September 2016

A new political party has been launched in Bangistan. The name of the party is the 'Bangistan Unity Party', and its leader is Mr Leon Horak, the Mayor of Westtown. He hopes to be a candidate in the forthcoming presidential elections. It is widely believed that Mr Horak is a leading member of the outlawed Westish Liberation Movement, but he denies this. Mr Horak pledged that, if elected, he would work for national unity, ensuring that all positions of power would be shared between representatives of both provinces. The current President, General Jalin, has said he will resign from the army in order to stand for election on behalf of the Eastish Loyalist Party. One Eastish Member of Congress said he would support the Bangistan Unity Party, because it offered the only hope for an end to the hostility between the two provinces.

### Source D

#### Report from international radio news

May 2017

Following his narrow electoral victory, President Leon Horak has announced the names of his senior ministers; they are all from Westland. A spokesman has reported that all Eastish senior army officers will be retiring with immediate effect, and that the Head of the Supreme Court has been replaced by a Westish district judge. The President has also announced a large-scale programme of economic investment in Westland, in order to rectify what he described as decades of neglect.

**Source E****Report from international radio news**

September 2017

The former President of Bangistan, Mr Marcel Jalin, and several of his aides, have been arrested and charged with multiple counts of murder. It is understood that these charges relate to the deaths of protestors in the months leading up to the elections held earlier this year.

- (a) *Bangistan TV* is controlled by the government.

Explain how this affects the reliability of the report on the actions of the soldiers, given in Source B. [3]

- (b) Explain the significance of the statement from the Eastish Member of Congress, reported in Source C. [3]

- (c) The main place of worship in Easttown has been demolished by order of the government; a spokesman said that building inspectors had found it to be unsafe.

Explain the significance of this additional information in relation to Mr Horak's presidency and the allegations against Mr Jalin. [3]

- (d) How likely is it that Marcel Jalin is guilty of murder?

Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, with critical reference to the evidence provided and considering a plausible alternative conclusion. [6]

**2 Study the evidence and answer the questions that follow.****Source A****Research report**

The Christmas holiday season is hazardous to your health. Researchers analysed data for 53 million deaths in the USA over a 26-year period, excluding suicides, homicides, and accidents. "We found that there is a general tendency for deaths to peak during the winter, but above and beyond this seasonal increase, there are additional increases around Christmas and New Year," said lead researcher David Phillips, Professor of Sociology at the University of California at San Diego. The holiday death rate spikes were most noticeable among people who died at home, were dead on arrival at hospital, or died in the emergency department. There was no increase over the holiday period in the death rate of patients who survived long enough to be admitted to the hospital.

**Source B****Letter to newspaper**

As an experienced hospital nurse, I was not surprised to read your report that death rates rise over the Christmas holidays. Patients who are well enough to go home for the holidays are discharged, leaving only the most serious cases in the hospital. Most senior staff take annual leave over Christmas and New Year, and those doctors and nurses who do have to work share time off between themselves, resulting in a lack of continuity of care. Laboratories and diagnostic imaging departments are closed for all except emergency services, and the few technicians available may be over-worked. Medical staff and their families are people, too, and they have their needs.

**Source C****Research report**

When researchers recorded daily rates of death from heart disease in Los Angeles County (an area noted for mild winters), they noticed an increase in deaths starting around Thanksgiving (fourth Thursday in November), climbing through Christmas, peaking on New Year's Day, and then falling. This increase in the death rate was unlikely to be related to colder weather, since temperatures remained relatively constant during December and January.

The researchers have suggested several possible causes:

- changes in diet and alcohol consumption over the holiday period
- stress from spending time with relatives, facing unusual financial pressures and travelling
- people with Alzheimer's disease may be forced into a more unfamiliar environment or become stressed by the increased commotion or interaction with visitors during the holiday period
- delays in seeking medical care over the holiday period.

**Source D****Extract from speech by Health Minister**

An analysis of daily death rates in our country during December and January has revealed that, every year, deaths begin to rise on December 21, peak over the New Year and only begin to drop again in the middle of January. Heart attacks, respiratory conditions and cancer are the primary causes of death in that time. This unacceptable spike in deaths cannot be allowed to happen again.

- (a) How reliable is the evidence in Source A? Explain your answer. [3]
- (b) How well does Source B explain the evidence in Source A? [4]
- (c) Identify an unstated assumption being made by the Health Minister in Source D. [2]
- (d) 'Hospitals should increase the numbers of senior staff on duty over the Christmas and New Year period, in order to prevent the spike in deaths at that time.'

To what extent do you agree with this claim? Write a short, reasoned argument to support your conclusion, using and evaluating the information provided in Sources A–D. [6]

3 *Read the passage and answer the questions below.*

- 1 Ask anyone from the Anglo-American cultural tradition to explain why a particular course of action would be the right one to choose, and they will almost certainly justify it by reference to its probable benefits for the largest number of people. But aiming to achieve “the greatest good for the greatest number” is not the best basis for making moral choices. It is natural for everyone to act for their own benefit, and so you cannot expect anyone not to give preference to their own interests when deciding what to do. Life would hardly be worth living if we could never please ourselves without having to feel guilty about it.
- 2 Everyone should also give priority to the needs of their own family. Stable communities rely on strong family units. If some misguided parents gave their money to charity instead of using it to feed and clothe their own children, their actions would do far more harm than good.
- 3 It is senseless to base moral judgments on consequences, because you will not know the consequences of your choice until after you have made it. It is also unfair to criticise someone because what looked like the right choice happened, through bad luck, to produce worse consequences than they had anticipated.
- 4 Life is too short to weigh up all the consequences of all the options every time you have to make a decision, no matter how trivial. You would end up never doing anything. Obeying a simple set of rules is a more realistic way of making moral choices.
- 5 Evil people sometimes dishonestly try to defend their immoral actions on the grounds that they were done from good motives. However, some actions are simply wrong, and no good results can excuse them. It is therefore impossible to justify such actions on the basis of their consequences.

(a) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify the main conclusion. [2]

(b) Using the exact words from the passage as far as possible, identify **three** intermediate conclusions. [3]

(c) Evaluate the strength of the reasoning in the argument. In your answer you should consider any flaws, unstated assumptions and other weaknesses. [5]

(d) ‘Everyone should do their best to benefit other people.’

Write your own short argument to support **or** challenge this claim. The conclusion of your argument must be stated. Credit will not be given for repeating ideas from the passage. [5]



**BLANK PAGE**

---

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (UCLES) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest possible opportunity.

To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced online in the Cambridge International Examinations Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download at [www.cie.org.uk](http://www.cie.org.uk) after the live examination series.

Cambridge International Examinations is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.