

ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY (AS) General Certificate of Education January 2014

## **Religious Studies**

Assessment Unit AS 6

assessing

Religious Ethics: Foundations, Principles and Practice

[AR161]

MONDAY 27 JANUARY, MORNING

# MARK SCHEME

#### Part 1: Levels of Response

The specification requires that candidates demonstrate the following assessment objectives in the context of the learning outcomes and skills set out in the specification.

- Select and demonstrate clearly relevant knowledge and understanding through the use of evidence, examples and correct language and terminology appropriate to the course of study.
- Critically evaluate and justify a point of view through the use of evidence and reasoned argument.

Each of the two assessment objectives has been categorised into five levels of performance relating to the respective abilities of the candidates. Having identified, for each assessment objective listed opposite, the band in which the candidate has performed, the examiner should then decide on the appropriate mark within the range for the band.

#### (AO1) Knowledge and Understanding

#### Band 5 ([29]-[35])

- a full response to the task.
- · demonstrates a high level of accurate knowledge and comprehensive understanding
- uses a very good range of relevant evidence and examples
- a mature style of writing demonstrating a clear and coherent structure
- almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- makes use of a wide range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 4 ([22]-[28])

- a reasonably full response to the task
- demonstrates a very good level of accurate knowledge and understanding
- uses a good range of relevant evidence and examples
- a reasonably mature style of writing demonstrating a clear and coherent structure
- mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- makes use of a wide range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 3 ([15]-[21])

- a good response to the task.
- · demonstrates a good level of accurate knowledge and understanding
- uses a range of relevant evidence and examples
- an appropriate and reasonably coherent style of writing
- · reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- makes use of a range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 2 ([8]-[14])

- a limited response to the task
- demonstrates little accurate knowledge and understanding
- uses a limited range of evidence and examples
- style of writing is just appropriate to the task and may lack coherence in places
- limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- evidence of some technical language and terminology.

#### Band 1 ([0]-[7])

- a very basic response to the task
- demonstrates minimal knowledge and understanding
- very little use of evidence or examples
- style of writing is such that there is very little coherence or structure
- · very poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- little or no use of technical language and terminology.

### (AO2) Critical Line of Argument

#### Band 5 ([13]-[15])

- a full and coherent response.
- demonstrating a very good attempt at critical analysis.
- very good reference to other points of view.
- highly accurate and fluent.
- very good evidence of sustained and informed argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience.
- almost totally faultless use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.
- makes use of a very wide range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 4 ([10]–[12])

- a reasonably full response.
- demonstrating a good attempt at critical analysis.
- good reference to other points of view.
- accurate and fluent.
- good evidence of sustained and reasoned argument which is set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience.
- mainly accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.
- makes use of a wide range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 3 ([7]-[9])

- a reasonable response.
- demonstrating some attempt at critical analysis.
- some reference to other points of view.
- reasonably accurate and fluent.
- some evidence of sustained argument, which is set, where necessary, in the context of other aspects of human experience.
- reasonably accurate use of spelling, punctuation and grammar.
- makes use of a range of technical language and terminology.

#### Band 2 ([4]-[6])

- a limited response.
- demonstrating a modest attempt at critical analysis, although references to other points of view are limited.
- some inaccuracy in places.
- a limited argument which struggles to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience.
- limited command of spelling, punctuation and grammar.
- evidence of some technical language and terminology.

#### Band 1 ([0]-[3])

- a simplistic response.
- demonstrating little attempt at critical analysis.
- practically no reference to other points of view.
- minimal argument which fails to relate, where necessary, to other aspects of human experience.
- very poor grasp of spelling, punctuation and grammar.
- little or no use of technical language and terminology.

#### **Quality of Written Communication**

All questions require candidates to answer in continuous prose in English. Quality of written communication is incorporated within the assessment objectives and reflected in the above assessment bands. Assistant examiners are instructed to take this criterion into account when allocating marks to candidates' responses.

#### Part 2: Contextual Reference Points

The generic level of response mark scheme set out above is elucidated in this part of the mark scheme through the provision of contextual reference points in terms of the content appropriate to the particular question under consideration.

#### AVAILABLE MARKS

[35]

#### Answer **one** question.

- **1** (a) An account of the arguments used to support developments in reproductive technology could include, e.g.
  - the blight of infertility
  - assisted conception as a compassionate and humanitarian response
  - the notion of shared fertility
  - the advent of a child as the completion of marriage and the opportunity to create a family, possible reference to the UNDHR
  - the gift of science and how it can assist human reproduction
  - the notion of reproductive freedom
  - the demise of religious teaching/values
  - personal autonomy and choice
  - enabling same sex couples to experience parenthood
  - the influence of the utilitarian ethic
  - the perspective of Situation Ethics, the advocacy of the primacy of love
  - how the Bible has nothing directly to say about N.R.T.s
  - the need to accommodate consumerist type choices e.g. sex selection
  - various denominational views
  - posible reference to particular developments e.g. IVF, PGD, ICSI
  - technological progress as assisting/respecting the moral imperatives of human life and dignity
  - reference to the views of ethicists e.g. Peter Singer, John Harris, Robert Song
  - (b) An assessment of the claim could include, e.g.
    - the dignity and the rights of the human person how the child has the right to be conceived, carried in the womb, brought into the world and brought up within marriage
    - the moral integrity of the embryo
    - reducing the status of the child to an object of scientific technology
    - a child as a privilege and not a right
    - the principle of the sacredness of human life, sanctity of life as against quality of life
    - the need to retain the mystery of human procreation
    - the commodification of life
    - counteracting consumerist type choices
    - possible reference to surrogacy and how it could possibly depersonalise both the child and the surrogate
    - the possible functional and instrumental character of surrogate arrangements
    - surrogacy as a compassionate and loving act not only for the mother but also for the child
    - possible reference to the issue of abortion and possible justification e.g. rape
    - the need to protect the innocent and the vulnerable, from conception to the grave
    - conception as a personal act, the procreative and unitive nature of conjugal love
    - possible reference to the issue of personhood
    - consideration of conflicting rights e.g. the mother
    - is an open ended response

[15]

2 (a)	An explanation of the case for voluntary euthanasia could include, e.g.	AVAILABLE MARKS
	<ul> <li>the quality of life argument, the right to freedom from unnessary pain and suffering</li> <li>the right to a dignified death, a moral way to die</li> <li>the principle – freedom to live, freedom to die</li> <li>the sovereignty of the individual</li> <li>respect for the autonomy of the dying person</li> <li>the argument for assisted dying rather than assisted suicide</li> <li>the critique of the Acts/Omissions Doctrine</li> <li>the views of various moral philosophers e.g. Peter Singer, James Rachels</li> <li>issues surrounding the Passive/Active distinction</li> <li>assisting the more efficient use of medical resources</li> <li>the demise of religious values, the impugning of the principle of the sanctity of human life</li> <li>issues pertaining to personhood</li> <li>the influence of the utilitarian ethic</li> <li>reference to Situation Ethics</li> <li>the distinction between voluntary enthanasia and other types e.g. involuntary, non-voluntary</li> </ul>	
(b)	An exploration of the view could include, e.g.	
	<ul> <li>the view of the sacredness of human life</li> <li>God as the author of life</li> <li>the body as the temple of the Holy Spirit</li> <li>the teaching of scripture especially the Commandments</li> <li>human life created in God's image</li> <li>personhood as inherent</li> <li>euthanasia as possibly promoting a culture of death</li> <li>implications for infant euthanasia</li> <li>the Slippery Slope argument</li> <li>dangers of misuse, breakdown in trust, the Hippocratic Oath</li> <li>the christian view of suffering and death, the spiritual value of suffering</li> <li>the value of hospice care, the demand for greater palliative care</li> <li>emulating the example of Jesus</li> <li>possible reference to Natural Law</li> <li>reference to various denominational views including conservative and liberal Christian views</li> <li>assisted dying as an act of love and compassion, possible reference to Situation Ethics [15]</li> </ul>	50 <b>50</b>

- **3** (a) A description of the approach of Natural Law to moral decision making with particular reference to the doctrine of Double Effect could include, e.g.
  - an approach characteristic of deontological ethics
  - interest in the moral action itself, the act is either intrinsically right or wrong
  - the importance of the faculty of human reason
  - its religious underpinning, that there is an ultimate purpose to existence
  - origins in Greek philosophy, developed by Aquinas, later development by John Finnis
  - distinction between efficient and final cause
  - distinction between real and apparent goods
  - distinction between interior and exterior acts
  - primary and secondary precepts
  - its profile in Roman Catholic moral teaching
  - explanation of the doctrine of Double Effect while it may be morally
    permissible to perform a good action that may have a bad outcome it is
    morally impermissible to perform a bad action with a good outcome
  - exemplification of this doctrine e.g. abortion may permit indirect therapeutic abortion but not direct therapeutic abortion
  - examples could be drawn from other scenarios such as euthanasia, war
     [35]
  - (b) An assessment of the claim could include, e.g.
    - consideration of the claim in relation to other aspects of human experience
    - possible historical and/or contemporary examples
    - ethical relativism as saying that morality is essentially contextual in character
    - the subjectivist nature of morality
    - the view that there are no fixed moral truths
    - the individual as the supreme moral agent
    - particular problems for the Christian e.g. killing need not always be wrong, the dilemma of different moral judgements being equally valid, morality being a matter of personal preference, the problem of moral chaos, the dictatorship of moral relativism, a lack of regard for established moral norms
    - the views of moral philosophers e.g. Peter Singer, Friedrich Nietzsche
    - the Christian response to ethical relativism e.g. the importance of moral absolutes, of having established moral norms, the external character of moral decision making, how the end cannot justify the means
    - Christians who could identify with a contextual/relativistic approach to ethics
    - Christian utilitarianism
    - relativism as not meaning 'that anything goes'

[15]

50

AVAILABLE MARKS

4	(a)	An explanation of the significance of the Sermon on the Mount for the Christian in relation to moral decision making could include, e.g.	AVAILABLE MARKS
		<ul> <li>how the Sermon offers principles that can guide moral decision making, principles that are unchangeable e.g. the call to perfection, the importance of the proper internal moral disposition, imitating the example of Jesus, the rejection of hypocrisy, show mercy, purity of heart, seek justice, discernment in judgement, the love ethic</li> <li>the values encouraged by the Sermon e.g. dependence on God, spirit of gentleness, being merciful, love of enemy</li> <li>the virtues promoted by the Sermon e.g. sincerity, mercy, love</li> <li>the teaching covered e.g. the portrait of the Christian disciple, murder, adultery, divorce, revenge, attitudes to religious duties, attitudes to materialism, judgement</li> <li>the eschatological nature of morality that is revealed</li> <li>the sermon as a blueprint for Christian ethics, society and all morality</li> <li>context of the Sermon as a defining of Old Testament Law</li> <li>exemplification from the Sermon</li> </ul>	
	(b)	An exploration of the view could include, e.g.	
		<ul> <li>consideration of the view in relation to other aspects of human experience</li> <li>possible historical and/or contemporary examples</li> <li>how biblical teaching can provide principles/guidance for moral dilemmas even those not mentioned in scripture e.g. the sanctity of human life, the importance of human dignity, the Commandments, the command to love your neighbour, the call for the proper internal moral disposition</li> <li>how the Bible does cover issues that have an ageless significance e.g. stealing, murder, adultery, divorce, retaliation, sexual immorality, care of the marginalised</li> <li>biblical teaching as revealing profound truths about the human condition</li> <li>the eternal character of moral decision making</li> <li>how the Bible does not specifically cover issues prominent in the current age e.g. new reproductive technologies</li> <li>how biblical ethics is seen by some as to be outdated e.g. Peter Singer, Richard Dawkins</li> <li>problems surrounding interpretation of biblical teaching</li> <li>the standard of Biblical ethics may be seen as too high, aspirational only</li> <li>the role played by church teaching [15]</li> </ul>	50
		Section B	50
		Total	100