



A-LEVEL

Religious Studies

RST3A Religion and Ethics

Mark scheme

2060
June 2015

Version 1.0: Final Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts. Alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this mark scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced) A2 Level Descriptors

<i>Level</i>	A2 Descriptor AO1	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptor AO2	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptors for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2
7	A thorough treatment of the topic, which may be in depth or breadth. Information is accurate and relevant. A thorough understanding is shown through good use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate good knowledge and understanding of diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is demonstrated. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated convincingly.	28-30 41-45	A very well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed perceptively. Effective use is made of evidence to sustain an argument. Appropriate evaluation is fully supported by the reasoning. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related perceptively and maturely to the broader context and to human experience.	19-20 28-30	Appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
6	A generally thorough treatment of the topic which may be in depth or breadth. Information is almost all accurate and mainly relevant. Clear understanding is demonstrated through use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, alternative views and / or scholarly opinion are satisfactorily explained. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are clearly demonstrated.	24-27 36-40	A well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed. Appropriate evaluation is supported by reasoned argument. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related clearly to the broader context and to human experience.	16-18 24-27	
5	A satisfactory treatment of the topic. Information is mostly accurate and mainly relevant. A reasonable understanding is demonstrated through use of some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, some familiarity with diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is shown. Some knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	20-23 29-35	A satisfactory response to the issue(s) raised. Views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments, and some critical analysis. An evaluation is made that is consistent with some of the reasoning. Some of the response is related satisfactorily to the broader context and to human experience.	13-15 20-23	Mainly appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information; mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
4	Key ideas and facts are included; demonstrates some understanding and coherence using some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, brief reference may be made to alternative views and / or scholarly opinion. Limited knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	15-19 22-28	The main issue is addressed with some supporting evidence or argument, but the reasoning is faulty, or the analysis superficial or only one view is adequately considered. Little of the response is related to the broader context and to human experience.	10-12 15-19	Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
3	A summary of key points. Limited in depth or breadth. Answer may show limited understanding and limited relevance. Some coherence.	10-14 15-21	A basic attempt to justify a point of view relevant to the question. Some explanation of ideas and coherence.	7-9 10-14	
2	A superficial outline account, with little relevant material and slight signs of partial understanding, or an informed answer that misses the point of the question.	5-9 8-14	A superficial response to the question with some attempt at reasoning.	4-6 5-9	Little clarity and organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.
1	Isolated elements of partly accurate information little related to the question.	1-4 1-7	A few basic points, with no supporting argument or justification.	1-3 1-4	
0	Nothing of relevance.	0	No attempt to engage with the question or nothing of relevance	0	

RST3A: Religion and Ethics

Indicative content

Note: This content is indicative rather than prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to all the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels of response.

Question 1 **Libertarianism, free will and determinism**

0

1

Explain the key ideas of Libertarianism with particular reference to:

- **the personality and the moral self**
- **the causally undetermined choice.**

Key ideas of Libertarianism include: the individual is free to make choices; each person has a right to self-determination that must be respected by society; moral responsibility requires freedom; freedom is a defining feature of what it means to be a moral being.

The personality and the moral self

- The personality is formed partly by genetics, partly by the environment in which one is brought up but mainly by the free choices that the individual makes.
- Libertarianism says that people should be allowed to express themselves and not have to conform.
- The worth of the individual must be respected by all others.
- Nevertheless, people have to be aware of any potential harm their use of their liberty / self-expression might bring to another.
- According to Mill, individuality means the development and growth of a human.
- Freedom of speech and action enables a human to develop and extend their moral capacity.
- Human personality is an expression of freedom of will.
- Personal growth and moral responsibility require liberty etc.

The causally undetermined choice

- This means having a **real** choice; not being constrained by any other factor to make a particular decision.
- According to Libertarianism, we are free to act and are also morally responsible for our actions.
- We are not compelled to act by forces other than our moral consciousness.
- Moral actions result from one's values and character.
- We perceive ourselves as being free agents, capable of making choices and accepting the consequences.
- We have a sense of weighing up options before we make a decision etc.

Maximum Level 5 if only part of the question is answered.

[30 marks]

AO1

0

2

‘There can be no such thing as a causally undetermined choice.’**How far do you agree?****In support**

- No person is born totally blank; there are genes, family, environment, historical situation etc which all contribute to an individual's decisions, often quite unconsciously eg Spinoza.
- Every action and decision is done in response to other actions; this means that the choice is already being shaped before any decision is made as the context has been created by others eg Honderich.
- The conscience, ‘the voice of God in the heart and soul of man’, can guide decisions, even though people often only become aware of their conscience once they have done something the conscience disagrees with – the conscience must have been active before the decision was made otherwise there would be no reason for the conscience to create negative attitudes eg Newman, Butler.
- Some people are not capable of being morally responsible for the choices made, therefore they are not undetermined.
- Sometimes moral actions happen by chance / randomly etc.
- Compatibilists begin with the assumption of causal determinism.

Other views

- External factors may suggest that we are not able to do what we want, but we always have a choice whether to go along with external factors or not.
- For Libertarianism, there is always undetermined choice. Libertarians are incompatibilists eg Hume, Campbell.
- The way one is brought up does not affect the ability to choose; many people reject the standards by which they are reared, both towards the positive and the negative.
- We have a sense of being able to make a choice which must reflect a reality, especially if God has given the individual freedom of conscience etc.

[20 marks]**AO2**

Question 2 Virtue Ethics

0

3

Explain the key ideas of Modern Virtue Ethics as developed by both MacIntyre and Foot.

Virtue Ethics is centred on having the right character that enables you to do the right thing and in doing the right thing your character becomes further developed.

MacIntyre

- People need to have a sense of what is and what is not morally right. We have lost our moral base-line.
- We behave morally when our character is right. To a large extent, you are what you do.
- The central question for MacIntyre is how we should make the most of our moral character, rather than which rules we should follow.
- There are commonly agreed virtues within communities that should guide everyone.
- MacIntyre also developed the idea of ‘goods’; valuable outcomes both for the individual and the community.
- MacIntyre thought justice an important virtue, especially in the context of community which featured heavily in his Virtue Ethics theory etc.

Foot

- Virtues are beneficial for humans and to correct harmful passions and temptations.
- Virtues are excellences of the will, not of the body.
- They also relate to a person’s innermost desires, reflecting attitudes but also acting as a corrective against temptation.
- Reasoning is very important in the practice of the virtues and leads to a person flourishing.
- What is virtuous comes from good motivation and intentions and leads to a good outcome, for both the person and society.
- Foot claimed there were four cardinal moral virtues: courage, temperance, wisdom and justice etc.

Maximum Level 5 if only one of MacIntyre or Foot is addressed.

[30 marks]

AO1

0

4

‘Virtue Ethics is too general to guide people.’**Assess this view.****In support**

- Aristotle and others talk about the virtues being the golden mean between two vices, but how can anyone decide either for oneself or for other people where the boundaries between the virtues and the vices lie?
- Most of the classical virtues can have a negative connotation in a specific situation eg what can appear to be a witty remark to observers can mask a biting comment for one member of the audience; courage can be misused to bring about a burglary. How can anyone make definite decisions about actions on this type of ground? etc.
- Who can judge the genuine intentions of oneself? So who can say if an action is a virtuous action or simply because someone wants to appear virtuous?
- Jesus criticised the Pharisees and the scribes for hypocrisy on many occasions, but many others regarded them as virtuous people. It is not the virtues themselves that guide people in actions. People need other rules too.
- Morality / virtuousness is relative (Ayer) so it is impossible to build a definite morality on this moving sand etc.

Other views

- There are many virtues that are absolute eg prudence, sincerity, friendliness, right ambition and these stand firm so can guide people at all times.
- Acting virtuously leads to a virtuous / correct outcome so this builds up the right character to ensure right actions follow.
- Life is not about following hard and fast rules but about learning how to be a good person. Following the virtues leads one to become virtuous and ultimately, happy. The greater the range of situations, the more chance there is of a person developing truly virtuous qualities, which become the solid foundations for all a person's actions.
- People are in agreement with the list of virtues so they must experience them all as positive, regardless of when or how they are used.
- Acting virtuously means one is looking out for others in all situations etc.

[20 marks]**AO2**

Question 3 Religious views on sexual behaviour and human relationships**0****5**

Explain religious teachings on the concept of love in relation to the family and children. You may refer to one or more religion(s) in your answer.

Responses may be based on **one or more religion(s)**. Teachings can come from a range of sources including scripture and / or institutions. This could include church documents and teachings, the views of religious leaders etc.

The concept of love – particularly storge, the natural affection parents have for their children and the bond of commitment that the parents feel towards each other. This commitment also expresses itself through the sexual relationship (eros) through which children are conceived. Family relationships can also include philia, which refers to mutual respect that can include affection, enjoying each other's company, sharing, accepting each other's differences etc.

eg Judaism

- Children are a blessing from God; not to have children can be a sign of lack of fulfilment in life.
- Man and woman are meant to marry to find their own completion as individuals and as a couple.
- 'Spare the rod and spoil the child' (Proverbs).
- Involvement of children in rituals eg Passover, Sabbath.
- 'Honour your father and mother' (Exodus 20), particularly applicable when the parents get older.
- The coming of age ceremonies at 12 (girls) and 13 (boys), that show a change in the mutual responsibilities.
- 'Teach your child a skill or you teach him to become a robber' (Mishnah).
- 'Do not commit adultery' (Exodus 20).
- The Perfect Wife passage (Proverbs 31).
- Parents are required to teach their children a skill, to swim and to instruct them in sexual matters (Talmud).
- Parents, especially the mother, are supposed to teach their children their faith.

eg Christianity

- The family is the place where God's love can best be shown in mutual love and respect.
- Children are God's blessing on the sexual union.
- 'Honour your father and mother' (Exodus 20), particularly applicable when the parents get older.
- 'Give way to one another in obedience to Christ... husbands should love their wives as Christ loved the Church...let every wife respect her husband... Children, be obedient to your parents in the Lord – that is your duty...Parents, never drive your children to resentment but in bringing them up correct them and guide them as the Lord does.' (Ephesians 5-6).
- 'The first obligation of parents is to give their children love, care and security.' (Methodist Statement on a Christian Understanding of Family Life).

eg Buddhism

- The Pali Canon has a list of how the family should interact with each other, including respect, politeness and responsibility.

- The Pali Canon also has a list of parental responsibilities including teaching them skills for a profession, helping to a suitable marriage and giving them their inheritance. In return, children should support their parents, respect them and see that they get a good burial.
- ‘Just as a mother would protect her only child, even at the risk of her own life, even so let one cultivate a boundless heart to all’ (Metta Sutta).
- Tibetan Buddhism urges one to treat all as if they were their mothers and enable them to achieve Nirvana.
- ‘Supporting one’s father and mother, cherishing wife and children, peaceful occupations – that is the highest blessing’ (Mangala Sutta).

[30 marks]

AO1

0	6
---	---

Assess how far such religious teachings are relevant today.

Students must refer to teachings cited in 05.

Relevant

- Teachings about honour for parents apply no matter what age the children or parents are. They could be said to be more important as the parents reach their old age and become more dependent on others, particularly their children.
- While practical details might have changed over the years, the underlying principles are still relevant.
- If religion is taken seriously at home, then these teachings will still have relevance etc.

Other views

- Parents cannot demand respect, it has to be earned.
- Corporal punishment is an offence now in the United Kingdom (UK).
- Parents have to respect their children at the different stages of their development, so blanket rules cannot apply.
- If a child has been abused by their parents, it makes it difficult to have positive feelings towards their parents.
- Children are more likely to learn skills for employment at school or college.
- Today, parents are still responsible for their children and ought to do their best for them.
- There is a huge financial sacrifice in having children so parents are owed a certain amount of obedience / respect from their children.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 4 Science and technology

0

7

Explain ethical issues arising from scientific advances.

Students might answer this from the perspective of particular named advances or more generally.

General responses might include:

- There is an uneasy balance between advances and human rights eg where is the balance between the greatest good of the greatest number and what is good for the individual.
- Some advances seem safe at first and have immediate benefits only to be shown to have serious consequences later – or even greater benefits eg the history of thalidomide.
- Advances are hard to halt once a danger has been alerted; does one apparent danger outweigh possible long-term benefits?
- Many humans are wary of advances – should fear be allowed to limit the work of scientists eg with genetic mutations. Do human responses reflect Natural Law or does Natural Law allow for the use of God-given intelligence and skills to enable scientific developments to take place?
- Scientists need to try and predict future outcomes more successfully and address issues before it is too late.
- How might business etc decide which are the best ethical systems, if any, to apply for a particular scientific development?
- Need for openness, transparency and accountability etc.

For Level 5 and above expect some range of scientific advances with exemplification. If the response is merely descriptive, maximum low Level 4.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

8

‘Scientific advances must not be limited by religious ethics.’**How far do you agree?****In support**

- Religion and religious ethics are irrelevant to many people.
- Many people are suspicious of religious ethical views.
- Religious attitudes about the start, end and value of life, both human and animal, might severely limit the work of scientists and all humanity might lose out in the end.
- Religious ethics are based on the individual's beliefs. One person or group has no right to decide what other people can and cannot do.
- Many advances open the doors to other advances as yet unknown eg the surge in information technology in the last forty years. This could have been limited if ethical theories had been allowed to intervene too much.
- There are so many advances which benefit people but which appear dangerous eg X-rays, radiation, atomic power.
- Ethical theories can make people frightened of any new development as there is an innate fear of the new. People have to get over this otherwise there will never be progress.

Other views

- Religious viewpoints can ensure that everything is done within moderation, respecting the God-given talents as well as protecting humanity.
- Religious and ethical principles can safeguard the whole of society as well as the individuals being experimented on etc.
- Religion is still important for a significant number of people. In most societies ethical views and laws of the land have developed from religious views.
- There have been many negative examples of scientists who have ignored any ethical systems.
- Ethical principles can suggest limitations which are beneficial to the whole population without totally banning experimentation.
- Some scientists can become obsessed by ideas that they lose a sense of proportion; if other scientists are not empowered to restrict them through the application of religious ethical principles, disaster could ensue.

[20 marks]**AO2**