



General Certificate of Education

Religious Studies (5061/6061)

**RS09 *Studies in Religion
and Ethics***

Mark Scheme

2007 examination - June series

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2007 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced Subsidiary) AS Level Descriptors

[Marks for 10-mark questions are shown in brackets]

| Level | AS Descriptors for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2 | AS Descriptor AO1 | Marks | AS Descriptor AO2 | Marks |
|----------|--|---|-------------------------------|---|--------------|
| 5 | Appropriate form and style of writing, clear and coherent organisation of information, with appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar. | A thorough treatment of the topic within the time available. Information is accurate, and good understanding is demonstrated through use of appropriate evidence / examples. | 13-15 [9-10] | A very good response to the issues raised. Different views are clearly explained with supporting evidence and arguments are critically analysed. A process of reasoning leads to an appropriate conclusion. | 13-15 |
| 4 | Appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information, mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of spelling, punctuation and grammar. | A fairly thorough treatment within the time available; information is mostly accurate and relevant. Understanding is demonstrated through the use of appropriate evidence / examples. | 10-12 [7-8] | A good response to the issues raised. Different views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments and some critical analysis. A conclusion is drawn which follows from some of the reasoning. | 10-12 |
| 3 | Mainly appropriate form and style of writing, some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; there may be some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary. Satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar. | A satisfactory treatment of the topic within the time available. Key ideas and facts are included, showing reasonable understanding. | 7-9 [5-6] | Main issues are addressed and views are considered, with some supporting evidence. There is some attempt at analysis or comment. Evaluation may not be fully supported by reasoning or evidence. | 7-9 |
| 2 | Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some clarity and coherence in organisation; there may be some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar adequate to convey meaning. | An outline account, including some relevant material. Limited in depth or breadth. Answer may show limited understanding. Some coherence. | 4-6 [3-4] | A simple argument, with some evidence in support. | 4-6 |
| 1 | There may be little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate or accurate use of specialist vocabulary. The legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar may be very limited. | Isolated elements of accurate and relevant information. Slight signs of understanding. | 1-3 [1-2] | A few basic points which are relevant, but no real argument. | 1-3 |
| 0 | There may be little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate or accurate use of specialist vocabulary. The legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar may be very limited. | Nothing of relevance. | 0 | No attempt to engage with the question or nothing of relevance. | 0 |

RS09: Studies in Religion and Ethics

1 (a) Examine the ethical issues raised by investment and profits.

Candidates will need to examine the ethical issues raised by investment and profits, e.g. the desire for money and assets at all costs; investing 'ethically' or not, whether to boycott companies who are not investing ethically; the issue over investing ethically versus investing soundly and thus making a (good) profit; the question over when a profit is 'healthy' and when it is greed; which is more important to a company – where it invests or the profit it makes.

Maximum Level 2 for answers which only address 'business ethics' in general. If candidates only mention investment **or** profits, maximum Level 4 (13 marks), however well done.

(20 marks) AO1

(b) Explain how the religion you have studied approaches the ethical issues raised by investment and profits, and assess the view that this religion should not concern itself with investments and profits.

Explain

Candidates need to show understanding of the views held within **one** religion. These views should be backed up with evidence from holy books / scripture, religious leaders and / or tradition, and awareness of some diversity of opinion within that religion should be shown.

e.g. Christianity

- Jesus frequently taught that a love, and a greed, for money was wrong.
- The Parable of the Talents could be seen as an injunction to invest.
- In the 5th century, Pope Leo the Great said that it was difficult to avoid sinning in the course of buying and selling.
- However, Calvin / Calvinism saw worldly and financial success as a mark of grace and wealth as a sure sign of salvation. This is still echoed today by US TV evangelists. Some may write at length on Protestant work ethic and Spirit of Capitalism – would suggest that substantial credit could be given – may also appear as AO2.
- It is important within Christianity that all investments are ethical, and guidance has been published as to which companies are seen as unethical by the Christian Ethical Investment group.
- A company could be described as being ethical depending on what it manufactures and / or how it deals with its employees.
- Christianity teaches a sense of corporate responsibility, so it is up to Christian share-holders of a company to investigate its trading practices and standards.
- Christians have been at the forefront of campaigning against Nestlé and its baby-milk policies.

Some candidates might focus their answers mostly on Calvin's ideas and how these have been developed, including the spirit of Capitalism. This is perfectly acceptable.

e.g. Judaism

- Prophets warned Jews against being unconcerned and not helping the poor and needy.
- Leviticus 6¹⁻⁵ implies that making a profit out of someone is wrong.
- Deuteronomy 6.18 'You should do what is honest and good in the eyes of God.'
- Deuteronomy 25¹⁵⁻¹⁶ tells Jews to use 'true and honest weights and measures' and that the Lord 'hates people who cheat' (Good News Bible).
- Rashi warns against giving someone bad financial advice just because they are ignorant.
- 'Caveat emptor', let the buyer beware, may be legal, but is totally contrary to Jewish law, which expects one to disclose everything that someone might want to know, without them having to ask.
- 'Even one word of trickery and deceit is forbidden' (Maimonides).
- The Shulchan Aruch discusses how to accumulate wealth without trampling on others or taking from them what is theirs.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

For the statement

- The role of religion is to be spiritual, not involved in a secular affair.
- Jesus said to have one's mind on heaven rather than treasures on earth.
- The advice given by holy books is out of date.
- The advice given by holy books is unworkable in the 21st century.

Against

Points made in favour **of the religion the candidate has chosen** getting involved in the areas of investment and profits, e.g.

- Frequent mentions in the Bible shows God's concern for the whole of a person's life.
- The establishment of religious ethical investment groups.
- Protestant work ethic arguments.
- Stewardship of money.

(20 marks) AO1

2 (a) Outline Virtue Ethics theory, and examine the responses to Virtue Ethics theory you have studied.

Note that only an **outline** is required for the theory; the responses should be examined.

Candidates should outline Virtue Ethics theory (either from an Aristotelian perspective or from that of MacIntyre, or even from both). Candidates should also mention a variety of scholarly responses to Virtue Ethics theory, such as those by Rosalind Hursthouse, Piers Benn, Edward T Oakes, Julia Annas, A J Ayer, Robert Louden, Richard Bernstein, Judith Jarvis Thomson and Peter Singer, and examine at least two of the responses mentioned.

Maximum Level 2 if only Virtue Ethics theory is written about (i.e. no responses are mentioned).

It is not necessary for candidates to examine every possible response, but more than one response should be examined for Level 4.

Responses need to be clearly related to Virtue Ethics theory.

(20 marks) AO1

(b) Outline views within one religion you have studied on the ethical issue of cloning, and assess whether religion provides an adequate approach to the ethical issue of cloning.

Outline

Candidates need to show understanding of the views held within **one** religion. These views should be backed up with evidence from holy books / scripture, religious leaders and / or tradition, and some awareness should be shown of diversity of views.

e.g. Christianity

- the Church of England would say that God has given us this knowledge to use for the good of mankind, but the birth of children should be natural.
- the Roman Catholic Church is against cloning. Man is not meant to create life. People should be valued for their uniqueness, not try to make a copy of them. Cloning potentially violates the human rights of equality and non-discrimination. Using embryos for experimentation is tantamount to murder, and thus breaks one of the commandments.
- the Church of Scotland agrees with the cloning of animals in order to create birth and continuation of the species, but not for commercial reasons. The Church believes that the cloning of humans is unethical, that there are benefits from embryo research, but only under limited and controlled circumstances.

e.g. Buddhism

- the motivation behind any desired cloning is relevant in Buddhism.
- Buddhists would see any desire for therapeutic cloning as being compassionate.
- Buddhists practise the concept of 'Hiri'; self-respect. This is the quality which causes us to avoid any moral action which might lower our integrity.
- Buddhists also take seriously the concept of 'Ahimsa'; the inviolability of life.
- however, Buddhists would balance all of the above with the need to show compassion for the suffering of others.

Maximum Level 2 if views from the religion not clearly applied to cloning.
Maximum Level 2 if general issues on cloning, not rooted in the chosen religion.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

Candidates should debate whether religion does provide an adequate approach to the issue of cloning.

For

- Religious groups are possibly more likely to be concerned with the ethics of cloning than non-religious groups.
- Most religious groups have well thought policies already about this issue.
- Religion is concerned with the sanctity of life as well as the quality of life.
- Ethical expertise among moral theologians independent of any vested interests of medics / researchers / pharmaceutical industry, etc.

Against

- Religious views are out of date.
- Religious views do not reflect those held by a majority of the population.
- Some religions have not formulated a clear view on this topic.
- Which religious view should one favour?

Conclusion will be based on the debate.

Candidates can answer this AO2 question from the aspect of religion in general.

(20 marks) AO2

- 3 (a) ***Explain what is meant by 'soft' determinism and Libertarianism and show how they may influence ethical decision-making.***

Candidates need to explain both of the terms 'soft determinism' and 'libertarianism'. They should then also relate these explanations to the concept of making ethical decisions in life, by giving and using examples of the same.

e.g. A soft determinist might say that a child brought up by burglars might also turn to crime, but it would be by their choice, albeit swayed by the behaviour of its parents, rather than being 'forced' into it by the behaviour of its parents.

A libertarian would say that any moral and ethical choices in life are through the exercise of free-will. The child that turns to crime does it because it chooses to.

Maximum Level 2 (8 marks) for definitions only.

Maximum Level 4 (13 marks) if only one of the concepts is covered, however well done.

(20 marks) AO1

- (b) ***Examine the concept of determinism in one religion you have studied, and assess the view that religion places much more emphasis on determinism than on free will.***

Examine

Candidates will need to examine the concept of determinism within their chosen religion, including differences of view or explanation where appropriate.

e.g. Within Christianity, there are both the concepts of hard determinism (pre-destination), and 'soft' determinism (i.e. that some of our decisions are not entirely freely made because of a follower's desire to be obedient or fear of punishment). Candidates will need to show understanding of the views within their religion by referring to scripture / holy books or the views of leaders or tradition.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

Candidates should debate which approach (a determinist approach or that of free will) is more dominant in their chosen religion.

Religious emphasis on Determinism

- Do adherents keep the laws because they are fearful of retribution, or because they choose to, or both?
- What factors within the faith do determine a believer's behaviour?
- Within Christianity, how 'deterministic' is the concept of original sin?
- Within Judaism, how 'deterministic' is the concept of being one of the Chosen People, whether one keeps the faith or not?

Religious emphasis on Free will

- Everyone is free to follow a religion; there is no concern.
- Within religion there is the concept of redemption. This would not be there if there was only a deterministic approach.
- Jesus, and others, showed that they could make choices, and did, as to their lifestyle and destiny.
- Emphasis on individual responsibility in, e.g. Jeremiah, Ezekiel, Deuteronomy.

Balance of argument

Some candidates might conclude that the dominant view within their chosen religion is that of hard determinism, and explain why they believe this to be so. It is quite legitimate to answer this question using more than one religion. Some candidates might debate two or more religions in terms of their emphasis on determinism, and this is creditworthy.

(20 marks) AO2