

GCE

Law

Advanced Subsidiary GCE

Unit G152: Sources of Law

Mark Scheme for January 2012

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, OCR Nationals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

OCR will not enter into any discussion or correspondence in connection with this mark scheme.

© OCR 2012

Any enquiries about publications should be addressed to:

OCR Publications PO Box 5050 Annesley NOTTINGHAM NG15 0DL

Telephone: 0870 770 6622 Facsimile: 01223 552610

E-mail: publications@ocr.org.uk

Annotations

Annotation	Meaning
3	Not Relevant or no response or response achieves no credit
REP	Repetition
	Point
D-V	Point developed
	Developed point expanded
[ENK]	Link to the source
Ve	Vague
-51	Level 1
- F E	Level 2
■ 8■	Level 3
П	Level 4
+	Advantage or feature
_	Disadvantage
□K.	Definition
	Undeveloped case The highlight tool may also be used to draw attention to a word or phrase which means that the statement or reasoning is inaccurate

Questio	n Answer	Marks	Guidance
1 (a)*	Assessment Objective 1 – Knowledge and understanding The Council of the European Union: Describe composition – each member state sends a representative; exact membership is dictated by the content of the agenda; twice a year the heads of member states' governments meet in a summit. Describe how the Presidency is held by each member state in rotation for six months Describe the main role as the principal decision making body of the Union Describe the different voting systems used: unanimity, simple majority and qualified majority voting. Commission: Describe the Commission's role in proposing legislation – it has the 'right of initiative' Describe how the Commission helps enforce EU Law in their role as 'guardian of the treaties' Describe how the Commission negotiates on the EU's behalf with other nations Describe its role regarding the EU budget Describe how the Commission is organised – 27 Commissioners responsible for different areas of EU policy etc Use any relevant case example – Re Tachographs.	12	AO1 Level AO1 Marks 4 10–12 3 7–9 2 4–6 1 1–3 Responses will be unlikely to achieve level four without a good description of both and must have a link to the source (LNK). Responses will be unlikely to achieve level three without an adequate description of both institutions. Responses will be unlikely to achieve level two without a limited description of both or adequate one. Responses will be unlikely to achieve level one without 1-3 basic points. Responses which only discuss one institution cannot access levels 3 or 4. Bullet point list only will be unlikely to achieve no more than top of Level two
	Assessment Objective 3 – Communication and presentation Present logical and coherent arguments and communicate relevant material in a clear and effective manner using appropriate legal terminology. Reward grammar, punctuation and spelling.	3	AO1 marks AO3 mark 9-12 3 5-8 2 1-4 1

Quest	ion	Answer	Marks		Guidance)
(b)		Potential answers may:				
		Assessment Objective 2 – Analysis, evaluation and application		AO2 Level For each	AO2 Marks part i, ii, iii	
	(i)	Recognise that the most appropriate source would be a Treaty (CP). This is because Treaties are used to implement major	5	4 3 2	5 4 3	
		change. Use appropriate examples eg The Treaty of Lisbon. Credit reference to the Source.		1	1–2	
	(ii)	Recognise that the most appropriate source would be a directive (CP). Directives are left to Member States to implement and are the major vehicle for harmonisation. Credit reference to examples such as the Working Time Directive. Credit reference to the Source.	5	without identify	ring the most ap	chieve level four propriate source eg case, example or
	(iii)	Recognise that the most appropriate source to use would be a regulation (CP). Regulations are similar to an Act of Parliament and are directly applicable. Use appropriate case citation eg <i>Re</i>	5	•	•	chieve level three propriate source
		Tachographs. Credit reference to the Source.				chieve level two propriate source.
				Responses wil without any ba	•	chieve level one
				point (CP) and	the 'why' before any other relev	essed the critical e a further mark can cant point (eg the
				(b)(ii) Cannot o	redit 'harmonise	e' as in question

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance
Question (i)	Potential answers may: Assessment Objective 1 – Knowledge and understanding Describe the role of the ECJ – ensuring the uniform application of EU law throughout the EU – Article 19 Describe the two roles – hearing direct actions against member states and other institutions and also hearing references for preliminary rulings under Article 267 Describe how actions against Member States are normally brought by the Commission eg Commission of the European Communities v UK: Re Tachographs (1979) Describe how the ECJ deals with referrals from member states' courts through mandatory and discretionary referrals (Torfaen BC v B&Q, Bulmer v Bollinger, Van Duyn v Home Office) Describe the fact that the ECJ is assisted by a Court of First Instance Describe the composition of the ECJ 27 judges – 1 per member state (qualifications set out in Article 253/4) appointed for a renewable 6 year term They sit in 'chambers' of 3 or 5 judges Occasionally 13 judges sit as a Grand Chamber The ECJ may sit in plenary session (all 27) They work as a collegial body publishing a single unanimous decision with no dissenting judgments A President of the Court is chosen from amongst their number for a renewable term of 3 years They are assisted by 8 [9] Advocates General	15	Guidance AO1 Level AO1 Marks 4 13–15 3 9–12 2 5–8 1 1–4 Responses will be unlikely to achieve level four without a good description and must have a LNK. Responses will be unlikely to achieve level three without an adequate description. Responses will be unlikely to achieve level two without a limited description. Responses will be unlikely to achieve level one without 1-3 basic points.

Question	Answer	Marks	rks Guidance				
(ii)*	Assessment Objective 2 – Analysis, evaluation and application • Discuss the role of the ECJ regarding assertion of supremacy through decisions such as Van Gend en Loos, Costa v ENEL, Internationale Handelsgesellschaft & Factortame • Discuss the reaction of UK courts to supremacy: interpretation of section 2 ECA 1972, Bulmer v Bollinger, Garland v BR Engineering, Pickstone v Freemans plc, Factortame and the Merchant Shipping Act 1988 and R v S of State for Employment ex parte EOC • Discuss how the court has supported the concept of direct applicability; conferring rights on individuals • Discuss how the court has developed the concept of horizontal and vertical direct effect through cases such as Van Gend en Loos, Marshall v SW Hants HA, Defrenne v SABENA Airlines, McCarthays v Smith • Discuss the development of indirect effect through cases such as Von Colson v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen (1984) and Marleasing • Discuss the importance of State Liability where the state are liable for compensation for breaches of Community law Frankovitch • Credit reference to the source. Assessment Objective 3 – Communication and presentation Present logical and coherent arguments and communicate relevant material in a clear and effective manner using appropriate legal terminology. Reward grammar, punctuation and spelling.	12	developed poin Well developed Responses will three developed top level 3 or the limited points to (no case) will a (no case) will a Responses will range of limited developed poin Responses will basic point(s). Some use of so two.	AO2 Marks 10–12 7–9 4–6 1–3 be unlikely to a sts of which one of the point must incomplete the points (one maree developed achieve top less the chieve bottom less the unlikely to a strong points (no developed to achieve bottom less the unlikely to a strong level to be unlikely to a strong level to be unlikely to a strong level to a s	achieve level four without four e must be well developed. lude a case or example. achieve level three without nust include a case to achieve points with a number of evel 3); three developed points evel 3; two developed points level 3. achieve level two without a relopment) or a single		

	Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance				
2	(a)*	 Assessment Objective 1 – Knowledge and understanding Explain that the literal rule involves giving the words their plain, ordinary literal meaning Identify that the literal rule involves the judge applying literal rule even if it results in absurdity – Lord Esher in R v Judge of the City of London (1892) Describe how the rule can rely on the use of a dictionary Describe the historical dominance of the literal rule Describe how this rule respects parliamentary supremacy Use cases to illustrate its use – Fisher v Bell, Whiteley v Chappel, LNER v Berriman, Cutter v Eagle Star, Cheeseman v DPP Credit reference to the Sources. 	12	definition and t LNK. All three of words were be outcome – other Responses will definition and t cases must be being interprete otherwise awar Responses will definition and a case or 2 or 3 l points eg defin Responses will basic (relevant	hree cases (excluses must be consest must be consected and learning to a must be unlikely to a must be unlikel	achieve level four without a cluding the source case) + developed (ie must say what and how this affected the vel 3). achieve level three without a uding the source case) both must say what words were affected the outcome — achieve level two without a pp it might be 1 explained he bottom it might be basic bald cases, bald source use. achieve level one without any finition, features, case. Bald ag dictionary meaning,		
		Assessment Objective 3 – Communication and presentation Present logical and coherent arguments and communicate relevant material in a clear and effective manner using appropriate legal terminology. Reward grammar, punctuation and spelling.	3	9–12 5–8 1–4	3 2 1			

Question	Question Answer			Guid	ance
Question (b) (ii) (iii)	Assessment Objective 2 – Analysis, evaluation and application Identify the most appropriate rule of language as <i>ejusdem generis</i> [or the 'general rule'] (CP). This is because there is a list followed by general words. A bear will therefore not be included as it is not a domesticated pet. Use appropriate authority – <i>Powell v Kempton Racecourse</i> . Credit reference to the Source. Identify the most appropriate rule of language as <i>expessio unius alterius</i> [or the 'specific rule'] (CP). This is because there is a specific list and only those in the list are included. As a bear is not mentioned it is excluded. Use appropriate authority – <i>Tempest v Kilner</i> . Credit reference to the Source. Identify the most appropriate rule of language as <i>noscitur a sociis</i> [or the 'context rule'] (CP). This is when the words	Marks 5	Responses wil identifying the other relevant relevant identifying the Responses wil identifying the Responses wil identifying the Responses wil basic point.	AO2 Marks part i, ii, iii 5 4 3 1–2 I be unlikely to a correct rule of la point eg case/Li I be unlikely to a correct rule of la correct rule of	achieve level four without anguage plus 'why' plus any NK/correct outcome achieve level three without anguage plus 'why'. achieve level two without anguage (CP)
(iii)		5	basic point. Both Latin or E Responses nead the 'why' b	inglish phrase is ed to have addr pefore a further	·

Question	Answer	Marks		Guid	ance
(c) (i)	Assessment Objective 1 – Knowledge and understanding Identify that the purposive approach takes a broader approach than the mischief rule in that the court is not just looking to see what the gap was in the old law; the judges are deciding what they believe Parliament is trying to achieve – what is the purpose of the Act? Explain that judges are required to consider the context in which the law was created – what were the concerns of government and Parliament at the time the Act was created? Recognise the essential link with external aids Describe how this rule has been increasingly used Describe how this rule links to a more continental approach to interpretation Describe the perceived unconstitutional nature of the rule Use any relevant cases to illustrate its use – Coltman v Bibby Tankers (1987), Fitzpatrick v Sterling Housing Association (1999), R v Registrar General ex p Smith (1990); Jones v Tower Boot Credit reference to the Sources.	15	definition and t LNK. All three words were be and how this a level 3). Responses will definition and t cases must be being interprete this affected th Responses will definition and a case or 2 or 3 lof basic points source use. Responses will basic (relevant	hree cases (exc cases must be of ing interpreted a ffected the outce I be unlikely to a wo cases (exclu- developed (ie red and/or the in- e outcome — oth I be unlikely to a a case. At the to bald cases. At the eg definition, fe	achieve level four without a cluding the source case) + developed (ie must say what and/or the intent of parliament ome – otherwise award achieve level three without a uding the source case). Both must say what words were tent of parliament and how nerwise award level 2). achieve level two without a p it might be 1 explained he bottom it might be a range eatures, bald cases, bald achieve level one without 1-3 finition, features, case. Bald opean approach.

Question	Answer	Marks	Guidance				
(ii)*	Potential answers may: Assessment Objective 2 – Analysis, evaluation and application Discuss how the approach gives effect to parliament's true intentions Discuss the way the approach avoids harsh and destructive analysis of language Discuss the way the approach avoids the absurdity and injustice of the more literal approaches Discuss the way the approach can allow for judicial law-making which goes against the doctrines of Parliamentary Sovereignty and Separation of Powers Discuss the limitation that the approach can only be used if the judge can find parliament's intention Discuss how trying to find the intention of parliament relies on extrinsic aids, in particular Hansard, and that can cause delays and adds to the cases costs Discuss the difficulties of finding the intent of Parliament Discuss how finding the intent of Parliament prevents cases ending in absurdity or injustice Discuss the different judicial attitudes towards trying to find Parliamentary intent — Lord Denning versus Lord Scarman Discuss whether there is an actual Parliamentary intent Discuss how trying to find intent allows a judge too much power. This has been argued goes against Parliamentary supremacy Discuss how the approach goes further than the mischief rule in that judges are not required to identify a 'mischief' which the Act was intended to remedy Credit reference to the Source	Marks 12	without four de well developed Responses will without three d points with a nulevel; two develovel 3. There is Responses will without a range a single developexclusively one Responses will without basic prodisadvantages Some use of solevel two.	AO2 Marks 10–12 7–9 4–6 1–3 I be unlikely to a eveloped points and there need points are unlikely to a eveloped points with the point and the point are of limited point are	achieve Level four of which one mus t be ds to be some balance. Achieve Level three is or three developed I points for the top of the II achieve bottom the balance. Achieve level two ts (no development); or p level two. Can be achieve level one		

Question	Answer	Marks		Guidan
	Assessment Objective 3 – Communication and presentation	3	AO2 marks	AO3 mark
			9–12	3
	Present logical and coherent arguments and communicate		5–8	2
	relevant material in a clear and effective manner using		1–4	1
	appropriate legal terminology. Reward grammar, punctuation and spelling.			

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations) 1 Hills Road Cambridge **CB1 2EU**

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998 Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations is a Company Limited by Guarantee Registered in England Registered Office; 1 Hills Road, Cambridge, CB1 2EU Registered Company Number: 3484466 **OCR** is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations) Head office

Telephone: 01223 552552 Facsimile: 01223 552553



