

GCE

History A

Y308/01: The Catholic Reformation 1492-1610

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for Autumn 2021

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.


This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2021

1. Annotations

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
BP	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
A	Assertion
AN	Analysis
EVAL	Evaluation
EXP	Explanation
F	Factor
ILL	Illustrates/Describes
IRRL	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
J	Judgement
KU	Knowledge and understanding
P	Provenance
SC	Simple comment
	Unclear
V	View
S	Synthesis
C	Continuity/Change

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
1	<p>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of Philip II as the ‘most Catholic Monarch’.</p> <p>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation A characterises Philip II as embodying the ideal of the ‘most Catholic monarch’.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In evaluating Interpretation A, answers might argue that it is valid because in his foreign policy he did defend Catholicism, for example launching an Armada against England despite being warned against it by advisors. • Answers might argue that it is valid because he took a hard line against Protestantism in the Netherlands, insisting on conformity and episcopal reform despite local opposition. • Answers might argue that it is valid because he intervened in the French Wars of Religion. • Answers might argue that it is valid because he encouraged missionary activity and religious reform in Spanish colonies overseas, for example in the Americas and the Philippines. • Answers might argue that it is valid because he was a highly spiritual individual, who owned hundreds of relics, invested heavily in religious arts and architecture, was heavily reliant on his confessor and other key religious figures, and prioritised his religious routine. • Answers might argue that the interpretation is invalid because it underplays his secular considerations, for example, when Henry of 	30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge, and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme

		<p>Navarre converted to Catholicism, Philip did not halt his war, suggesting dynastic and geopolitical concerns were more important.</p> <p>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate, answers might argue that Interpretation B does not see Philip as a ‘most Catholic monarch’ and instead sees him as dominated by secular, worldly concerns.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In evaluating Interpretation B, answers might argue it is valid because he argued frequently with the Pope and did not recognise Papal authority over the Spanish Church. • Answers might argue that it is valid because Philip had a long running conflict with the Jesuits, particularly when they moved into Italian leadership. • Answers might argue that it is valid because religious reform was instigated by Philip’s predecessors, for example the Inquisition predated him. • Answers might argue that it is valid because in his foreign policy he did not pursue a ‘crusade’: he supported the Protestant Elizabeth I against the Pope for most of his reign, and he did not press his advantage against the Ottomans after the Battle of Lepanto in 1571. • Answers might argue that it is valid because Philip was a very bureaucratic ruler (‘the paper king’), who took decisions based on the minutiae of administrative notes and the advice of a close circle of mainly secular councillors and favourites. • Answers might argue that it is invalid because it falsely dichotomises the sacred and secular domains and fails to recognise that in Philip’s worldview and approach these were unified. 		
--	--	--	--	--

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
2*	<p>'There was little regional variation in the nature of the Catholic Reformation in the period from 1492 to 1610'. How far do you agree?</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that the Catholic Reformation aimed towards uniformity in the way it was implemented.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the structures put in place for episcopal and clerical reform were largely uniform and driven by stipulations made in the Tridentine decrees. • Answers might consider that religious orders generally crossed borders so reform of these tended to span multiple countries. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider the influence of the Jesuits across Europe and the New World, and their importance in driving forward lay and clerical conformity. • Answers might consider that the Tridentine Decrees codified and clarified Catholic belief, thus ensuring this was uniform across all geographical areas. • Answers might consider that there were great similarities in the architectural and artistic expressions of the Catholic Reformation across all regions – even remote regions of European Empires, such as the Churches of the Jesuits in Goa. • Answers might consider that there was widespread reform of popular culture, for example the replacement of profane entertainments with ones with religious messages. 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the nature of the Catholic Reformation. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.

		<p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question, answers might consider that there were significant geographical differences on several scales.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that there were differences between urban and rural areas, with the Catholic Reformation policies often being enacted far more successfully in urban areas, whereas rural areas saw far less reform. • Answers might consider the differences between the ‘new’ and ‘old’ worlds, with the Catholic Reformation being associated with reform and renewal in Europe, but with missionary activity and evangelism in the ‘new’ European colonies. • Answers might consider that the nature and impact of the Catholic Reformation was very different in areas where there was widespread uptake of Protestantism, such as the Holy Roman Empire, compared to areas where Protestantism was negligible such as Italy or Spain. • Answers might consider that rulers were a reason for geographical differences, as they had varied levels of commitment and motives when considering the Catholic Reformation. There could also be dynastic variations, for example between Habsburg and non-Habsburg lands. • Answers might consider that the extent and nature of the Inquisition varied a great deal geographically, but it was largely only very active in Rome and its surrounds and Spain. • Answers might consider that the Catholic Reformation varied along national lines having different characteristics in Spain, France and different Italian territories, for example. 		
--	--	--	--	--

3*		<p>‘Religious orders made a greater contribution to the development of the Catholic Reformation than the Papacy during the period from 1492 to 1610.’ How far do you agree?</p> <p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that religious orders both successfully pushed for change from within the Church, and took the message out to the laity and clergy.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider the importance of the Jesuits in making an enormous contribution to the development of a more spiritual form of Catholicism. • Answers might consider the importance of the Carmelites, with the discalced Carmelites being one of the first religious orders reformed from within. • Answers might consider that the Jesuits played a crucial role in missionary activity, in spreading conformist Catholicism to rural and overseas territories, and in combatting Protestantism, for example in their missions to England. • Answers might consider the importance of the Jesuits in spreading Catholicism to the Spanish Empire and to other Asian territories. • Answers might consider the importance of the foundation of the Daughters of Charity, and their focus on combatting poverty and helping the poor. • Answers might consider that, without the work of the religious orders, especially the new and reformed ones, Popes would have struggled to disseminate the message of the renewed Catholicism. 	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge the impact of religious orders. • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.
----	--	---	----	--

		<p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that the Papacy was crucial to the initiation of the Catholic Reformation and its success.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the Papacy was critical in the convening of the Council of Trent. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the Papacy strengthened the Roman Inquisition, introduced the Index, and focused on a reform of the Papacy from within. • Answers might consider that Pius IV presided over the final session of the Council of Trent, its Decrees, and their take-up by European secular rulers. • Answers might consider that some Popes were highly spiritual, led moral reform and followed a process of Papal reform. • Answers might consider that many Popes worked against Papal corruption and oversaw the implementation of the Tridentine Decrees. • Answers might consider that the Papacy succeeded in delivering a permanent reorganisation and reform of the Curia, as well as transforming Rome itself. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the leaders of many of the traditional religious orders defended their vested interests and were very resistant to change; the example of the Carmelites as compared to the discalced Carmelites demonstrates this. 		
4*		'European rulers were the greatest obstacle to the Catholic Reformation throughout the period from 1492 to 1610.' How far do you agree?	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No set answer is expected • At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge obstacles to the Catholic Reformation.

		<p>In supporting the hypothesis in the question, it might be argued that opposition to reform from European rulers was present throughout the period.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that secular rulers could oppose reform when it threatened their authority, for example Philip II of Spain frequently quarrelled with the Papacy over issues of jurisdiction and obstructed the Jesuits in Spain once they had passed into Italian control. • Answers might consider that French monarchs wanted to uphold Gallican traditions • Answers might consider the attitudes of Henry VIII, Edward VI and Elizabeth I to the Catholic Reformation • Answers might consider the attitude of Charles V who had to come to terms with the Lutherans in order to combat France/Ottomans • Answers might consider that Popes could oppose reform, for example Paul IV was not very supportive of the Council of Trent because he did not want 'outsiders' interfering in the reform of the Papacy. <p>In challenging the hypothesis in the question, answers might argue that other factors were greater obstacles to reform.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the Church was strongly opposed to reform in the period from 1492 to around the 1530s, despite growing anti-clericalism and criticism of Church abuses. • Answers might consider that opposition to reform was found in the religious orders. For example, traditional religious orders like the Dominicans, Franciscans and Carmelites were 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material. • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.
--	--	---	--	---

		<p>strongly opposed to reform and to many of the new religious orders.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Answers might consider that the laity could oppose reform. For example, rejecting attempts to reform popular culture or compel particular religious practices. • Answers might consider that the geography and transport/communication networks of Early Modern Europe (and the European empires) were a major obstacle, with a strong correlation between more remote, rural areas and lower levels of reform. • Answers might consider that apathy was an obstacle. The lack of reform amongst the laity, for example, is arguably due to a general lack of interest/commitment in the reformed Catholicism rather than active opposition to reform. • Answers might consider that the appeal of Protestantism was a major obstacle. For example, the Catholic Reformation did not manage to re-unify the Church in the Holy Roman Empire or the Netherlands, and religious plurality had to be accepted in France. • Answers might consider that lack of resources was an obstacle. For example, the Inquisition was always under-resourced in relation to its goals. • Answers might consider that personal and political rivalries were a major obstacle at times, for example between the Jesuits and Dominicans or between Philip II and the Papacy. • Answers might consider that the European geopolitical situation could act as an obstacle. 		
--	--	---	--	--

			<p>For example, religious renewal in Spain was largely confined to the earlier part of Philip's reign before he became embroiled in wars with England and France and rebellion in the Netherlands. The association of the Jesuits with France and Spain led to brutal reprisals against them in England.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Answers might consider that low levels of literacy amongst both the clergy and laity were a major obstacle to a renewal of belief & spirituality, particularly due to the insistence within the Catholic Reformation of the use of Latin as opposed to the vernacular and the less effective use of visual stimuli as compared to Protestantism.		
--	--	--	--	--	--

APPENDIX 1 – this contains a generic mark scheme grid

	<i>AO3: Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section A, Question 1: Interpretation [30]
Level 6 26–30 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question throughout. It has thorough and sustained evaluation of the interpretations, using detailed and accurate knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a convincing and supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 5 21–25 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question throughout. It has good evaluation of the interpretations, using relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce a supported analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 4 16–20 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. It has evaluation of the interpretations based on generally relevant knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue, in order to produce an analysis of them in relation to the question.
Level 3 11–15 marks	The answer is partially focused on the question. It has partial evaluation of the interpretations based on some knowledge of the historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue. There may be some use of information from one of the two interpretations to support the evaluation of the other, but the evaluation will not rely on this. There is a limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 2 6–10 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the question. Parts of the answer are just description of the interpretations, with evaluation in relation to historical context and the wider historical debate around the issue being weak, and evaluation relying heavily on information drawn from the other interpretation. There is a very limited analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question.
Level 1 1–5 marks	The answer has some relevance to the topic, but not the specific question. The answer consists mostly of description of the interpretations with very limited evaluation based on very generalised knowledge of historical context and minimal or no reference to the wider historical debate. Analysis of the interpretations in relation to the question is either in the form of assertion or lacking.
0 marks	No evidence of understanding and no demonstration of any relevant knowledge.

	<i>AO1: Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.</i>
	Generic mark scheme for Section B, Questions 2, 3 and 4: Essay [25]
Level 6 21–25 marks	The answer has a very good focus on the question. Detailed and accurate knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a fully developed synthesis supporting a convincing and substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed and sustained line of reasoning which is coherent and logically structured. The information presented is entirely relevant and substantiated.
Level 5 17–20 marks	The answer has a good focus on the question. Generally accurate and detailed knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a developed synthesis supporting a substantiated judgement. There is a well-developed line of reasoning which is clear and logically structured. The information presented is relevant and in the most part substantiated.
Level 4 13–16 marks	The answer is mostly focused on the question. Relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and evaluate key features of the period studied in order to reach a synthesis supporting a reasonable judgement. There is a line of reasoning presented with some structure. The information presented is in the most-part relevant and supported by some evidence.
Level 3 9–12 marks	The answer has a partial focus on the question. Some relevant knowledge and understanding is used to analyse and explain key features of the period studied in order to attempt an undeveloped synthesis, which is linked to a judgement, though the supporting explanation may lack detail and clarity. The information has some relevance and is presented with limited structure. The information is supported by limited evidence.
Level 2 5–8 marks	The answer has only a limited focus on the question. Limited relevant knowledge and understanding is used to give a limited explanation and analysis of key features of the period studied. There is a judgement but this may not be clearly linked with the supporting explanation. The information has some relevance, but is communicated in an unstructured way. The information is supported by limited evidence and the relationship to the evidence may not be clear.
Level 1 1–4 marks	The answer has a limited focus on the topic, but not the specific question. The answer is largely descriptive, with only very generalised knowledge of the period studied being used to attempt basic explanation and very limited analysis. Judgements are unsupported and are not linked to analysis. Information presented is basic and may be ambiguous or unstructured. The information is supported by limited evidence.
0 marks	The answer contains no relevant information.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
The Triangle Building
Shaftesbury Road
Cambridge
CB2 8EA

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored