



History 7042
Specimen Question Paper 1A (A-level)
Question 2 Student 4
Specimen Answer and Commentary

V1.0

Specimen answer plus commentary

The following student response is intended to illustrate approaches to assessment. This response has not been completed under timed examination conditions. It is not intended to be viewed as a 'model' answer and the marking has not been subject to the usual standardisation process.

Paper 1A (A-level): Specimen question paper

02 To what extent was effective leadership responsible for the establishment of the crusader states in the years 1096 to 1154?

[25 marks]

Student response

Jerusalem was finally captured by the Christian crusaders in 1099 with Godfrey as the ruler. Outremer had been divided into four crusader states – Tripoli, Antioch, Edessa, as well as Jerusalem. There were many factors which contributed to the establishment of the crusader states in order for them to survive.

Effective leadership was one of the main factors that were responsible for the establishment of the crusader states in 1096 – 1154. For example Godfrey of Bouillon had considerable amount of “military experience,” and his actions on the crusade defined the success of the expedition. Godfrey led the crusaders to be effective in capturing Jerusalem, by taking “advantage of the Muslim disunity” and by climbing up the northern wall, Godfrey and his army was able to siege Jerusalem. This shows the importance of Jerusalem. This shows the importance of leadership, and how much it was needed for the establishment of the crusader states. This is because, with Godfrey’s military genius, Jerusalem was conquered. Another example of great leadership was Bohemond of Taranto; he showed his excellent skills both at the battle of Dorylaeum and Siege Antioch, where he faced the Turkish army, but Bohemond was successful in defeating the Turkish force along with the help of Robert of Normandy. Even after the first crusade, Bohemond of Taranto built a fine territory with a strong army 1100 after taking over Antioch. Strong leadership was an important part of the crusades as the leaders kept their force in line, preventing them from being attacked from the enemy. Without powerful leaders, such as Bohemond and Godfrey, leading the crusading armies would have been difficult, because it would have caused forces to turn against each other. However leadership did have its’ weaknesses’, whilst ruling Antioch, Bohemond made the mistake of moving against the emir of Sebastea, north of Antioch. This led him falling into an ambush and causing him to be captured.

Pilgrimage was another important factor for the establishment of the crusader states. Pilgrimage itself is a journey or search of moral and spiritual significance based on religion, something which the crusade was founded on. Jerusalem was the most holy site in Christianity as it was where Christ lived his life, died and resurrected. Not only that, it was only important thing is that Jerusalem was where Christians could go on pilgrims to walk in the footsteps of Christ and gain forgiveness for the sins that they have committed in their life. The crusade was won by the Christians with powerful leaders at the forefront, but would it have succeeded in terms of crusader states flourishing afterwards if it were not for pilgrimage? That is the question which is asked frequently as pilgrimage brought about many benefits to the crusader states and their establishment. Throughout their journey, pilgrims would spend money on things such as food and shelter as well as gaining access fee. The church of the Holy Sepulchre was free to enter, however many pilgrims gave money here in the name of Christ. Factors such as these are what allowed there to be an economy built, thus making crusader states richer and able to grow and expand more. One states which flourished here was Tripoli, as it was where many pilgrims landed from their ship journeys. Here they spent money on food and shelter, as well as supplies for their journey.

In addition, trade was also another factor that was responsible for the establishment of the crusader states because the economy of the Christian states had proven to be good, as they provided ports for imports from new regions to the rest of Europe. Most of the merchant activity was controlled by the Italians hand. This is because the Italian ports had an outstanding mixture of connections to the rest of

Europe and sea routes to the Middle East. Trading was very important for the crusader states because, in order for them to expand their territory, they had to rely on the ports to bring in supplies such as spices, leather etc; therefore, the crusader states had to make sure they held a powerful relationship with Italy. The coastal town benefited from the high increase of trade as ships from Venice, Genoa and Barcelona arrived with supplies, reinforcement and pilgrims. Ships would also return home with pilgrims and merchandises of eastern goods such as cotton to the markets of the west. Furthermore, Palestine was also involved in the trading route; this trade extended to Europe as well. European goods, such as woollen textiles of northern Europe, made their way to the Middle East and Asia while Asian goods were transported back to Europe. The Christians started to take control of the whole coastline and to create states. The foundation of the Italian trading cities Venice, Pisa, and, surprisingly at this stage, Genoa, was crucial. The economic continuance of Outremer builds upon the movements of goods through the coast to the rest of Europe. Trading was responsible for the establishment of the crusader states because, it enabled the states to build castles, and strengthen their army in case of Muslim invasion; it allowed trading between the east and the west to be done, which could strengthen their relationship.

Finally Military order was also responsible for the establishment of the crusader states because, according to Bernard of Clairvaux Templars was “the knights of Christ” this meant that Bernard believed monks also could be warriors. Templars were a new sort of knight who fought evil in the world and their faith and efforts, the holy land would be preserved in Christian hands. As the military and financial strength of the new Templars grew they were given custody of a number of castles and landholdings in the holy land. The first of these were in the late 1130s was around the castle of Bagdad in Antioch, strategically crucial region that controlled the Bellen Pass, one of the main routes into northern Syria. Other acquisitions followed including castles at Gaza (1149-50), Safed (before 1168) and Toron (before 1172). Military was such an important factor because even Saladin viewed the Templars as “a profoundly serious threat to Islam”. This clearly shows a judgment that reveals how successful the idea of the warrior monk had become. It also shows that how important the military orders were to the Latin settlement of the holy land. Another group of monks devoted to the “care of pilgrim”, and they were known as the “Hospitallers”. They dedicated their life to assist the poor and the sick; however what pilgrims needed the most besides medical care, was physical protection because Outremer was not safe. This shows the importance of military order because if the pilgrims did not feel safe when visiting holy cities, then cities would have collapsed because there is no-one to protect them and the ports, which would therefore lead to an economic crisis because each crusader state relied heavily on trade, in order to survive.

To conclude I believe that effective leadership, pilgrimage, trade and military order were all important factors contributing to the establishment of the crusader states but at different times. For example effective leadership was there and vital during the journey of the crusaders and the beginning of the Frankish rule. However, effective leadership was in short supply by the 1130s and towards the beginning of the second crusades. I believe that without trade the crusader states wouldn't be able to expand and grow territories, as each crusader state relied heavily on trade in order to survive. Therefore trade was the most important factor responsible for the establishment of the crusader states.

Commentary – Level 3

The question requires that answers consider the years 1096 to 1154 and this answer only partially achieves this. It has a reasonable assessment of leadership and its relative importance, but the assessment of the importance of pilgrimage is narrowly and perhaps inevitably focused on the foundation of the states during the First Crusade only. The reference to the importance of trade is appropriate, if not always clear and would have been more effective if assessed in terms of the importance of external support for the states. Finally, the assessment of the military orders cites developments which are beyond the scope of the chronology of the question. Other issues, such as Muslim disunity, are not covered and this is a Level 3 answer as a result.
