



General Certificate of Education

AS History 1041

Unit 2: HIS2B

The Church in England: The Struggle for Supremacy, 1529–1547

Mark Scheme

2009 examination – January series

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2009 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Generic Introduction for AS

The AS History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level candidates. Most questions address more than one objective since historical skills, which include knowledge and understanding, are usually deployed together. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses candidates' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how candidates have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Candidates who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or Level 2 depending on its relevance. Candidates who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at high Level 2 or low-mid Level 3 depending on how explicit they are in their response to the question. Candidates who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(a) and (b) and will have access to the higher mark ranges. AO2(a) which requires the evaluation of source material is assessed in Unit 2.

Differentiation between Levels 3, 4 and 5 is judged according to the extent to which candidates meet this range of assessment objectives. At Level 3 the answers will show more characteristics of the AO1 objectives, although there should be elements of AO2. At Level 4, AO2 criteria, particularly an understanding of how the past has been interpreted, will be more in evidence and this will be even more dominant at Level 5. The demands on written communication, particularly the organisation of ideas and the use of specialist vocabulary also increase through the various levels so that a candidate performing at the highest AS level is already well prepared for the demands of A2.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:

AS EXAMINATION PAPERS

General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that candidates might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other candidates' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Candidates should never be doubly penalised. If a candidate with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a candidate with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- The accuracy of factual information
- The level of detail
- The depth and precision displayed
- The quality of links and arguments
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- Appropriate references to historical interpretation and debate
- The conclusion

January 2009

GCE AS History Unit 2: Historical Issues: Periods of Change

HIS2B: The Church in England: The Struggle for Supremacy, 1529–1547

Question 1

- (a) Use **Sources A** and **B** and your own knowledge.

Explain how far the views in **Source B** differ from the views in **Source A** in relation to the aims of those who led the Pilgrimage of Grace in 1536. (12 marks)

Target: AO2(a)

- L1:** Answers will **either** briefly paraphrase/describe the content of the two sources **or** identify simple comparison(s) between the sources. Skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources and identify some differences and/or similarities. There may be some limited own knowledge. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed. **3-6**
- L3:** Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources, identifying differences **and** similarities and using own knowledge to explain and evaluate these. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed. **7-9**
- L4** Responses will make a developed comparison between the views expressed in the two sources and will apply own knowledge to evaluate and to demonstrate a good contextual understanding. Answers will, for the most part, show good skills of written communication. **10-12**

Indicative content

Candidates will see clear differences between the two sources but also some similarities. Both Source A and Source B have a focus on Cromwell and the advice being given to the king 'to have the Lord Cromwell....receive punishment' (Source A) and 'Cromwell had misused the power and trust Henry had given him' (Source B) is much more general about the religious aspect 'subverted the laws of God' whereas (Source A) gives very specific religious demands relating to Rome and the abbeys. Source B indicates a wide range of issues relating to economic, social and political issues whereas Source A is more limited.

Candidates need to explore the context of these two views. Source A was the second set of demands presented to the king at the Crisis meeting in Doncaster whereas Source B is an historian's attempt to offer an overall explanation of events. Source A attempted to bring the demands of disparate groups together and Source B attempts to separate out views of different groups.

- (b) Use **Sources A, B and C** and your own knowledge.

How far was the Pilgrimage of Grace in 1536 a threat to Henry VIII?

(24 marks)

Target: AO1(b), AO2(a), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may comprise an undeveloped mixture of the two. They may contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may contain a mixture of the two. They may be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the focus of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question using evidence from **both** the sources **and** own knowledge. They will provide some assessment backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

Most historians argue that those involved in the Pilgrimage of Grace did not believe that they were threatening Henry VIII; rather than being rebels they were seeking to restore the monarchy to a former position of stability (Source B). The main focus of their discontent was Cromwell (Sources A, B and C). The issue was bad government (Source B) arising out of misuse of power by Cromwell. This argument would suggest that none of the demands articulated in any sources were aimed directly at Henry VIII. It would seem that the discontent of the pilgrims was rooted in religious conservatism married with concern about their social and economic position.

Recently Geoffrey Moorhouse has suggested that the military force of those encamped at Doncaster far outweighed the forces of the king and had the power to overthrow the monarch. This is debateable but clearly there were direct threats to Henry VIII in the pilgrims' demands –

the king's right to nominate his heir was challenged, the compromise to his power in the return to Rome, his right to appoint his own councillors was compromised by the demands articulated in Sources A and B. Source C considers the Feudal aspect of the Pilgrimage and the involvement of the Percys and other men of northern influence. These issues were threatening to Henry.

Henry VIII was able to survive the Pilgrimage because pilgrims did not cross the Don and because he duped the leaders. It was a northern phenomenon with little support in the south, but Henry's response to what happened suggests that he had felt threatened by the uprising.

Question 2

- (a) Explain why Henry VIII wanted to end his marriage to Catherine of Aragon in 1529.
(12 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

- L1:** Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**
- L3:** Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**
- L4:** Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

The date of 1529 is significant in this as it removes discussion of Henry's increasing frustrations with Rome. Whilst this remains a contentious issue there are a number of key reasons, which should be discussed. Candidates may refer to the fact that Henry sought an annulment not a divorce.

- Henry was increasingly concerned by lack of a male heir. He was conscious of the potential for the fall of the Tudor dynasty should he die without a male heir. The example of the civil war which had ensued following the succession of Matilda should be seen in the context of the recent Wars of the Roses and the surviving Yorkist claimants to the throne. Catherine was past child-bearing age and there would be no male heir.
- He believed that his marriage was invalid due to Catherine's marriage to Arthur and the strictures of the book of Leviticus. Catherine refused to accept this and go into an abbey.
- Anne Boleyn wanted to be Henry's wife, not his mistress, and a divorce was necessary for this.

- (b) 'Anne Boleyn was the most important person in bringing about the King's divorce in the years 1529 to 1533.'
Explain why you agree or disagree with this view. (24 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

The responsibility for securing the divorce is shared between a number of key individuals as well as the role played by Parliament. The three key players were Anne Boleyn, Thomas Cromwell and Thomas Cranmer. It is arguable as to which is the most significant. It would also be possible to argue that the pope, who refused to grant an annulment of the marriage, was also significant in securing a divorce.

Anne Boleyn:

- Refused to become Henry's mistress and was determined to use her wiles to ensure that she became queen
- She introduced Henry to texts such as those of Tyndale, Fish and St Germain, which demonstrated that the King should be the head of the Church in his own country and not bow to the rule of Rome

- Anne accompanied Henry on his visit to Francois I which was deemed necessary in terms of securing continental support for the divorce. Anne's knowledge and experience of the French Court was believed to be vital in this mission.

Thomas Cromwell:

- Masterminded the development of Parliamentary legislation which enabled Henry to secure the divorce
- He was responsible for the manipulation of individual members of Parliament as well as for the overall policies
- He enabled the break with Rome and the divorce to be achieved by stages.

Thomas Cranmer:

- Cranmer was a leading Cambridge academic and can be seen as the most exalted specimen of Anne's religious patronage (D. MacCulloch) but as archbishop of Canterbury, a position secured before the final break with Rome, he not only married Anne to Henry but also confirmed to Henry that he was well within his rights to reject the authority of the pope.

Question 3

- (a) Explain why acts of Parliament were passed in the years 1529 to 1534 to reduce the power of Rome. (12 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

- L1:** Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**
- L3:** Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**
- L4:** Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

Henry was attempting to put pressure on Rome, initially to force the pope to grant him the annulment of his marriage to Catherine of Aragon. To use Parliament demonstrated the authority of his secular power as King in Parliament. As time passed Henry saw the legislation as a means to increase his power and wealth. Ultimately, it established Henry power in the place of that of Rome. Parliament gave support initially to tackle the abuses of the church and then to increase their own power.

- 1529 Acts passed to control clerical fees, to end the benefit of the clergy, to limit pluralism and to end clerical involvement in commerce
- 1531 Act passed to remove the charge of praemunire in return for a fine
- 1532 Act limiting the payment of Annates
- 1533 Act in Restraint of Appeals prevented English people appealing to Rome in legal cases
- 1534 Act to stop payment of taxation to Rome, Act to ensure that appeals in church matters were dealt with by the king's court, and the Act of Succession which registered Henry's marriage to Catherine as invalid and passed the succession to Anne's children.

- (b) 'Between 1530 and 1541 Henry VIII made himself dependent on Parliament.'
Explain why you agree or disagree with this view. (24 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

The use of Parliament to ensure that Henry gained his divorce from Catherine and secured the succession has been seen by historians as crucial in establishing the importance of King in Parliament. Traditionally Parliament had been called for the reason of rising extraordinary revenue, meetings which enabled Members of Parliament to pass legislation relating to their localities. The length and importance of the Reformation Parliament suggested that the role of Parliament had grown substantially and was necessary for the king's power.

Candidates should demonstrate knowledge or a range of reasons to explain the changed nature of the king's relationship with Parliament.

- Following the break with Rome Henry used Parliament, under the guidance of Thomas Cromwell, to secure further legislation to increase his power for example the dissolution of the monasteries
- Parliament was also used to shape doctrine and liturgy increasing Henry's controls of the church, for example the Act of Ten Articles and the Act of Six Articles
- Parliament was used in the Act to abolish sanctuary and the Act of Union of 1536.

However, it can also be argued that Henry used this legislation to make himself independent of Parliament.

- The dissolution of the monasteries resulted in a doubling of the king's income and created a degree of financial independence from parliament through the augmentation of crown lands
- The King's Book suggests that Henry was acting independently in directing religious developments
- The establishment by Cromwell of the Court of Augmentations, for example, enabled Henry to manage money without raising taxes and calling Parliament
- The Council of the North had increased authority following the Pilgrimage of Grace in 1536.