



History

Paper 2H (AS) Specimen Question Paper

Question 01 Student 1

Specimen Answer and Commentary

V1.0 26/02/16

Specimen Answer plus commentary

The following student response is intended to illustrate approaches to assessment. This response has not been completed under timed examination conditions. It is not intended to be viewed as a 'model' answer and the marking has not been subject to the usual standardisation process.

Paper 2H (AS): Specimen question paper

01 With reference to these sources and your understanding of the historical context, which of these two sources is more valuable in explaining why the Civil Constitution of the Clergy led to divisions in France?

[25 marks]

Student response

When looking into the two sources and their how valuable they are in studying how the Civil Constitution of the Clergy divided Paris is source B as it is directly from a Archbishop who was affected by the changes the constitution brought to the clergy. Source A is also useful as it shows us the reaction of the people and gives us evidence of the divide in Paris, however it is not as useful as B as this shows a much wider spread across France.

Source A shows us how the people of Paris celebrated the end of the power the clergy held in France, the Sans Culottes where a radical group that where majorly stationed in Paris, they were against the Catholic Church and the power that they possessed. The source shows us how supporters of the civil constitution, like the Sans Culottes reacted to the reduction in church power in France. The constitution was brought forward by the National Assembly and led to the removal of Tailles, which were forced taxes to the Church that the people had to pay; this removal meant that the Church was not as economically safe as they had been. The source states that as the church tries to regain its remaining power it is only increasing the speed at which it loses it, this was due to the constitution taking away the lands of the church and turning them into state land for the people, this meant that the Clergy was under the control of the state and the National Assembly, now known as the National Constitutional Assembly, would stop any attempt to regain the power. The source is made to persuade the people of Paris to support the constitution as not all of France was in support of the changes to the Church's power due to being a highly Catholic country many people believed that power should be with the church but due to the spread of Enlightenment ideas that challenged the Ancien Regime and thus challenged how the Church held power over France which has persuaded many citizens to want change, this caused some division in France and some people supported Enlightenment and the Sans Culottes who wanted change and more equality in France and the people who were faithful to the church and wanted the power to remain with the clergy. Source B only shows us how the people of Paris reacted to the Civil Constitution and how the divide was there, not across France and thus is less valuable in studying how the Civil Constitution led to dividing in France.

Source B is much more useful is studying how the Civil Constitution led to divisions across France, it is the view of an Archbishop who had lost his seat and his Diocese which was an area of France that was under the control of the Bishop's, this first person recollection makes it much more valuable and useful however it could be one sided as he was majorly affected by the changes the constitution brought. The civil constitution led to the removal of the Church power and gave it to the state, it did this by removing Bishops from power, 135 Bishops where reduced to just 83 all with their own

diocese to control, this reduction meant less people had the power to control the areas, alongside the reduction the new constitution stated that Bishops and Priests could only be voted into power by the people which furthered the control they had over France. The source shows us the other view to that of Source A and is against the constitution and is overall very negative toward, however not all of the clergy were against the constitution and some agreed to sign it and although it was not a large amount some still did, this caused a divide between the members of the clergy itself, journer priests who were happy to sign the constitution became less favourable with the non-journer priests who had refused to sign the constitution and agree to these changes. This division was furthered when the Pope condemned the constitution stating that it was against the Catholic church, this divide affected all of France and not only the clergy but also the people did not want to go against the Pope's wishes, the source says that laws should come from God and that the constitution took this power from God which only led to increase the divide between the people who supported the Catholic Church and those who agreed to the change. Source B gives a wider perspective on the divisions across France and not just within Paris and thus is more valuable in studying how the Civil Constitution led to divided France.

Overall Source A is much more valuable in showing us the divides in France as it shows us how a larger proportion of France was affected due to the removal of Bishop's power over the dioceses across France and how the people of the Church reacted personally to the Constitution, source B is also valuable in studying the divide but only within a smaller area of France and thus is not as valuable in studying how the Civil Constitution led to divisions in Paris not only between the clergy and the National Assembly but between the people of France and between the clergy and the people.

Commentary – Level 3

The answer is not convincing, although it does try to evaluate the two sources. There is very limited and undeveloped assessment of provenance and there is a tendency to summarise the content of the sources, with occasional reference to context, but these references are somewhat generalised and there is no direct link to value as a result of this deployment. It is, therefore, a modest level 3 response.