



AS HISTORY

Paper 1G Challenge and Transformation: Britain, c1851–1914

Mark scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

AS History Paper 1 Specimen Mark Scheme

1G Challenge and Transformation: Britain, c1851–1914

- | | | | |
|---|---|---|-------------------|
| 0 | 1 | With reference to these extracts and your understanding of the historical context, which of these two extracts provides the more convincing interpretation of the failure to achieve Home Rule for Ireland? | [25 marks] |
|---|---|---|-------------------|

Target: AO3

Analyse and evaluate, in relation to the historical context, different ways in which aspects of the past have been interpreted.

Generic Mark Scheme

- | | | |
|------------|---|--------------|
| L5: | Answers will display a good understanding of the interpretations given in the extracts. They will evaluate the extracts thoroughly in order to provide a well-substantiated judgement on which offers the more convincing interpretation. The response demonstrates a very good understanding of context. | 21-25 |
| L4: | Answers will display a good understanding of the interpretations given in the extracts. There will be sufficient comment to provide a supported conclusion as to which offers the more convincing interpretation. However, not all comments will be well-substantiated, and judgements may be limited. The response demonstrates a good understanding of context. | 16-20 |
| L3: | The answer will show a reasonable understanding of the interpretations given in the extracts. Comments as to which offers the more convincing interpretation will be partial and/or thinly supported. The response demonstrates an understanding of context. | 11-15 |
| L2: | The answer will show some partial understanding of the interpretations given in the extracts. There will be some undeveloped comment in relation to the question. The response demonstrates some understanding of context. | 6-10 |
| L1: | The answer will show a little understanding of the interpretations given in the extracts. There will be only unsupported, vague or generalist comment in relation to the question. The response demonstrates limited understanding of context. | 1-5 |
| | Nothing worthy of credit. | 0 |

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

In responding to this question, students may choose to respond to each extract in turn, or to adopt a more comparative approach of individual arguments. Either approach could be equally valid, and what follows is indicative of the evaluation which may be relevant.

Extract A: Students could assess the extent to which the interpretation is convincing by drawing on contextual knowledge to corroborate as follows:

- the view that British policy had been floundering since 1868, if not before, may be explored
- the persistence of Gladstone against the political difficulties of managing the issue and his dependence on support from the Liberals and from the Parnellites may be developed
- students might also use contextual knowledge to develop the idea that ‘it was a seriously flawed bill’.

Students could assess the extent to which the interpretation is not convincing by drawing on contextual knowledge to challenge as follows:

- contextual knowledge could be used to argue Gladstone’s motives were more overtly political calculations than the ‘moral’ motives given in Extract A
- contextual knowledge could be used to support the view that Extract B, with its emphasis on the ‘Orange card’ is more convincing.

Extract B: Students could assess the extent to which the interpretation is convincing by drawing on contextual knowledge to corroborate as follows:

- the argument that Gladstone was totally dependent on Parnell may be demonstrated, e.g. by reference to the 80+ seats of the Home Rule Party
- the argument that Tory/Unionist obstructionism was decisive may be examined
- contextual knowledge might be used to develop the idea that the ‘Orange card’ continued to be a powerful obstacle long after 1886 – including the rejection of Gladstone in 1893 and the Ulster Crisis of 1912–1914.

Students might assess the extent to which the argument is not convincing by drawing on contextual knowledge to challenge as follows:

- challenge the extent to which the Bill was ‘flawed’
- similarly challenge the view that the flaws were more important than Unionist opposition.

Section B

0 2 'New Unionism emerged in the 1880s because of the failure of the New Model Unions to protect the interests of all workers.'

Explain why you agree or disagree with this view

[25 marks]

Target: AO1

Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.

Generic Mark Scheme

- L5:** Answers will display a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be well-organised and effectively communicated. There will be a range of clear and specific supporting information showing a good understanding of key features and issues, together with some conceptual awareness. The answer will be analytical in style with a range of direct comment leading to substantiated judgement. **21-25**
- L4:** Answers will show an understanding of the question and will supply a range of largely accurate information which will show an awareness of some of the key issues and features. The answer will be effectively organised and show adequate communication skills. There will be analytical comment in relation to the question and the answer will display some balance. However, there may be some generalisation and judgements will be limited and only partially substantiated. **16-20**
- L3:** The answer will show some understanding of the full demands of the question and the answer will be adequately organised. There will be appropriate information showing an understanding of some key features and/or issues but the answer may be limited in scope and/or contain inaccuracy and irrelevance. There will be some comment in relation to the question. **11-15**
- L2:** The answer will be descriptive or partial, showing some awareness of the question but a failure to grasp its full demands. There will be some attempt to convey material in an organised way although communication skills may be limited. There will be some appropriate information showing understanding of some key features and/or issues, but the answer may be very limited in scope and/or contain inaccuracy and irrelevance. There will be some, but limited, comment in relation to the question and statements will, for the most part, be unsupported and generalist. **6-10**
- L1:** The question has not been properly understood and the response shows limited organisational and communication skills. The information conveyed is irrelevant or extremely limited. There may be some unsupported, vague or generalist comment. **1-5**
- Nothing worthy of credit. **0**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Arguments which agree with the view might include:

- New Model Unions were unions of skilled men, who were proud and protective of their own positions and did not identify with the mass of unskilled workers
- the possession of skills and the income it brought enabled the New Models to flourish in the 1850s, since members could negotiate from a position of strength. There was no incentive to extend membership to the unskilled who would have diluted and weakened the elite workers they were set up to protect
- the economic and social context of the 1850s worked against more inclusive unions. Agriculture and domestic service were the biggest employers and most workers were scattered in small workshops. Unskilled men did not look to the New Models for help. They had no commitment to a particular industry, lacked education and had no cash to support union funds
- the New Unions of unskilled workers emerged in 1880s because these exclusive, inward-facing New Model Unions offered nothing for the mass of workers.

Arguments which disagree with the view might include:

- it was not the fault of the New Model Unions but the change in composition and structure of the labour force that propelled New Unionism in the 1880s. By this decade, there was a much greater percentage of workers in industry and in larger-scale enterprises. This made a less exclusive unionism more attractive and necessary
- New Model Unionism was no longer appropriate. The spread of machinery enlarged the class of semi-skilled workers so there was less of a gap between the 'aristocracy of labour' and mass of workers and the workforce became more homogeneous
- the New Unions were, in some ways, an extension of the New Models' principles. Workers had become more literate and came to follow a 'trade for life' which gave them more reason to join a union to protect themselves and their families in the present and future – in much the same way as the skilled workers of the New Models in the 1850s
- other reasons for the emergence of the New Unionism included: workers had a new self-confidence and interest in political matters after the extension of the franchise in 1867 and 1884
- the broader economic context of the 1880s was favourable to wider union growth: the Great Depression (1873–1896) brought a fall in prices and profits – making employers vulnerable, whilst a rise in real wages gave workers sufficient surplus for union dues and funds to support strikes and provide for union activity
- emigration in the wake of the Depression helped improve the bargaining position of those left behind
- New Unions were helped by the repeal of the 1875 Criminal Law Amendment Act in favour of the Conspiracy and Protection of Property Act which legalised peaceful picketing and the Employers and Workmen's Act which prevented prison sentences being given to employees who broke contracts.

Students might conclude that it was not so much the 'failure' of the New Models as a change in circumstances which hastened the birth of New Unionism. They might also point out that the New Unionists conceived themselves as a movement of all workers and enjoyed a very different philosophy from the New Model Unions.

0 3 'New Liberalism improved the lives of the British people in the years 1906 to 1914.'

Explain why you agree or disagree with this view.

[25 marks]

Target: AO1

Demonstrate, organise and communicate knowledge and understanding to analyse and evaluate the key features related to the periods studied, making substantiated judgements and exploring concepts, as relevant, of cause, consequence, change, continuity, similarity, difference and significance.

Generic Mark Scheme

- L5:** Answers will display a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be well-organised and effectively communicated. There will be a range of clear and specific supporting information showing a good understanding of key features and issues, together with some conceptual awareness. The answer will be analytical in style with a range of direct comment leading to substantiated judgement. **21-25**
- L4:** Answers will show an understanding of the question and will supply a range of largely accurate information which will show an awareness of some of the key issues and features. The answer will be effectively organised and show adequate communication skills. There will be analytical comment in relation to the question and the answer will display some balance. However, there may be some generalisation and judgements will be limited and only partially substantiated. **16-20**
- L3:** The answer will show some understanding of the full demands of the question and the answer will be adequately organised. There will be appropriate information showing an understanding of some key features and/or issues but the answer may be limited in scope and/or contain inaccuracy and irrelevance. There will be some comment in relation to the question. **11-15**
- L2:** The answer will be descriptive or partial, showing some awareness of the question but a failure to grasp its full demands. There will be some attempt to convey material in an organised way although communication skills may be limited. There will be some appropriate information showing understanding of some key features and/or issues, but the answer may be very limited in scope and/or contain inaccuracy and irrelevance. There will be some, but limited, comment in relation to the question and statements will, for the most part, be unsupported and generalist. **6-10**
- L1:** The question has not been properly understood and the response shows limited organisational and communication skills. The information conveyed is irrelevant or extremely limited. There may be some unsupported, vague or generalist comment. **1-5**
- Nothing worthy of credit. **0**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Arguments that people's lives were improved by New Liberalism might include:

- the Education Act of 1906 ensured needy children were provided with free school meals and received medical inspections
- the 1908 Children Act reduced parental neglect and set up juvenile courts
- the 1908 Old Age Pensions Act provided pensions paid out of general taxation
- the 1911 National Insurance Act covered millions of workers for unemployment and sickness benefits
- numerous other measures were taken between 1906 and 1911, such as the Shops Act, Merchant Shipping Act and the Coal Mines Acts, to provide regulation and protection for employees.

Arguments that New Liberalism had only a limited impact on people's lives might include:

- many measures such as the Education Act were permissive, not compulsory. Implementation was often patchy or inadequate
- Old Age Pensions only covered people over 70 who were very poor
- many 'new' measures wrapped up in New Liberalism were actually recycled from previous legislation and were not really new at all
- National Insurance only covered certain 'insured trades'. Sickness benefits only covered one-third of the population
- there was still a Victorian distinction between the 'deserving' and 'undeserving' poor
- the Welfare State established after 1945 showed how limited and partial welfare provision in 1906–1914 really was.

