



General Certificate of Education

AS History 1041

Unit 2: HIS2H

Britain, 1902–1918:

The Impact of New Liberalism

Mark Scheme

2009 examination – January series

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2009 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Generic Introduction for AS

The AS History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level candidates. Most questions address more than one objective since historical skills, which include knowledge and understanding, are usually deployed together. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses candidates' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how candidates have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Candidates who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or Level 2 depending on its relevance. Candidates who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at high Level 2 or low-mid Level 3 depending on how explicit they are in their response to the question. Candidates who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(a) and (b) and will have access to the higher mark ranges. AO2(a) which requires the evaluation of source material is assessed in Unit 2.

Differentiation between Levels 3, 4 and 5 is judged according to the extent to which candidates meet this range of assessment objectives. At Level 3 the answers will show more characteristics of the AO1 objectives, although there should be elements of AO2. At Level 4, AO2 criteria, particularly an understanding of how the past has been interpreted, will be more in evidence and this will be even more dominant at Level 5. The demands on written communication, particularly the organisation of ideas and the use of specialist vocabulary also increase through the various levels so that a candidate performing at the highest AS level is already well prepared for the demands of A2.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:

AS EXAMINATION PAPERS

General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that candidates might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other candidates' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Candidates should never be doubly penalised. If a candidate with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a candidate with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- The accuracy of factual information
- The level of detail
- The depth and precision displayed
- The quality of links and arguments
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- Appropriate references to historical interpretation and debate
- The conclusion

January 2009

GCE AS History Unit 2: Historical Issues: Periods of Change

HIS2H: Britain, 1902–1918: The Impact of New Liberalism

Question 1

- (a) Use **Sources A** and **B** and your own knowledge.

Explain how far the views in **Source B** differ from those in **Source A** in relation to the improvements that the National Insurance Bill would bring to working people in Britain.

(12 marks)

Target: AO2(a)

- L1:** Answers will **either** briefly paraphrase/describe the content of the two sources **or** identify simple comparison(s) between the sources. Skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources and identify some differences and/or similarities. There may be some limited own knowledge. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed. **3-6**
- L3:** Responses will compare the views expressed in the two sources, identifying differences **and** similarities and using own knowledge to explain and evaluate these. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed. **7-9**
- L4** Responses will make a developed comparison between the views expressed in the two sources and will apply own knowledge to evaluate and to demonstrate a good contextual understanding. Answers will, for the most part, show good skills of written communication. **10-12**

Indicative content

Candidates need to identify areas of agreement and disagreement. Clearly the degree of disagreement is significant but there is some implicit agreement:

Differences:

- **Source B** suggests that the workers would willingly contribute their financial share into the system because this will enhance their self-respect. **Source A** suggests that the measure simply takes money from workers but offers little in return. There is no suggestion in **Source A** that the workers would have a heightened sense of self-respect
- **Source B** refers to the workers 'gratitude' in having a 'vital guarantee' of security while **Source A** suggests worker 'revolt'. This conflicts with the idea in **Source B** and the Bill contributing 'stability to the existing order of things'
- **Source A** also challenges the idea of security referred to in **Source B** when it notes the inadequacy of 7/- per week.

Similarities:

- **Source A** emphasises that the Bill does nothing to address the root causes of poverty. **Source B** implicitly accepts this by omission. It emphasises that a key element and benefit of the Bill is that it preserves the status quo. In 1911 the status quo for many working people was poverty.

Candidates may develop an explanation of the scale of the differences by exploring the origins of the sources. The Labour Party was increasingly moving towards developing an independent political stance free from Liberal influence. Lansbury was trying to win the hearts and minds of the working class by belittling the real impact of the Liberal welfare reforms. Similarly Lloyd George was the key architect in the development of New Liberalism and regarded the Bill as a flagship example of it in practice. He may be seen as trying to be all things to all men, both working class and middle and upper classes in English political society. Candidates may also suggest that Lloyd George's words were largely political rhetoric.

(b) Use **Sources A, B** and **C** and your own knowledge.

How successful were the Liberals in promoting the welfare of children, workers and the elderly in the years 1906 to 1914?

(24 marks)

Target: AO1(b), AO2(a), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may comprise an undeveloped mixture of the two. They may contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers may be based on sources or on own knowledge alone, or they may contain a mixture of the two. They may be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the focus of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question using evidence from **both** the sources **and** own knowledge. They will provide some assessment backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**

L5: Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence from the sources and own knowledge, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary.

22-24

Indicative content

Candidates may use the sources to suggest:

- **Source A:** this offers a largely generalised commentary on specific benefits. It refers more to an improved state of mind rather than to a measure of clear welfare improvements. The benefits for the elderly and children were implied rather than specified. If workers benefit from the 'vital guarantee in their daily lives' then by implication so will their children and other elderly dependents
- **Source B:** this source is more specific: It emphasises the inadequacy of the 7/- payment. It also raises the key issue of the failure of the Bill to address the 'root cause of poverty'. This clearly suggests that the Liberals had no real success in terms of welfare reforms. By failing to improve security of workers it failed to improve the security of children and elderly
- **Source C:** This is much more focused. There is a wide range of detail and comment which suggests the major limitations of the welfare reforms. There was a lack of radicalism and a failure on the part of the 'New Liberals' to break free from the constraints of traditional Gladstonian Liberalism. The statistical limitations of the welfare reforms are well developed through this source.

From candidates own knowledge:

Candidates may suggest that there were significant limitations inherent in the changes, such as the lack of compulsion in the provision of school meals. Medical examinations for children were introduced but the problem of pay for subsequent treatment still remained. The inadequacies of the pension's scheme for the elderly were apparent; the maximum age for receipt – 70 – excluded many people. Similar deficiencies existed in the amounts paid to workers through the National Insurance Scheme. Despite these many limitations candidates may consider the profound shift that had taken place in the role of the state. New Liberalism may have had ulterior motives beyond those improving the lot of vulnerable groups but it did start the process of change.

Question 2

- (a) Explain why the campaign to win the vote for women became increasingly militant in the years 1906 to 1914. (12 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

- L1:** Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**
- L3:** Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**
- L4:** Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

This question is focused on the shift in nature of the campaign for the vote for women. Candidates may develop some illustrative detail to support the arguments they make. It may be relevant to consider some background detail in terms of the relatively passive nature of the campaign prior to 1906.

- Asquith's opposition amounted to obstinacy. Many campaigners believed that force was the only possible response to Asquith's intransigence. Asquith was committed to an alliance with the Irish Nationalists, who for their own self interested reasons were opposed to female emancipation.
- The motto of the WSPU was 'Deeds not Words'. The WSPU was never going to be a passive organisation that waited for the political scene to mellow enough to change the system. Candidates may consider the background and attitudes of the Pankhurst leadership and its influence on the methods of the WSPU.
- Between 1905 and 1908 the campaigners displayed fairly controlled resistance. This involved Suffragettes chaining themselves to railings and disrupting meetings. Nevertheless this was considerably more direct than anything the NUWSS had attempted.
- 1913 was a significant year in reinforcing militancy. The discharge for Ill Health Act (the so called Cat and Mouse Act) was passed and Emily Davison became a Suffragette martyr. Both events strengthened female resolve to achieve objectives.
- All attempts to gain the vote through non-militant agitation had failed.

- (b) 'Women won the right to vote in 1918 entirely because of the contribution they had made to Britain's war effort from 1914.'
Explain why you agree or disagree with this view. (24 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

This question is focused on an evaluation of the significance of the role women played during the First World War in the achievement of women's emancipation.

Factors Linked to role of women during the War:

- there was a popular perception that women were widening their repertoire of labour skills and that the old view of the limited nature of female skills was now redundant
- the war brought a new confidence to woman and made more of them willing to support the suffrage movement. The government was faced with the possibility of a great increase in suffrage militancy when the war ended. Such action would become more widely accepted and acceptable.

Other factors:

- most of the labour carried out by women during the war was done by those women who had already worked in other trades before the war. Large numbers of pre-war non-working women still did not work. Therefore the view that women's working shifted popular support in favour of the vote for women is misleading
- the campaign for the vote was brought to a halt when the war started. This increased respect and increased an acceptance that women should have the vote etc
- there was already considerable support politically. This existed before 1914. Many liberals were already behind the change
- the Legislation did not extend the vote on equal terms. Women had to be over 30 in order to qualify to vote, men had to be only 21. Many of the women war workers were under 30. There were other unequal constraints imposed on female suffrage.

Question 3

- (a) Explain why state control over society increased in the years 1914 to 1916. (12 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b)

- L1:** Answers will contain either some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question or some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-2**
- L2:** Answers will demonstrate some knowledge and understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they will provide some explanations backed by evidence that is limited in range and/or depth. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **3-6**
- L3:** Answers will demonstrate good understanding of the demands of the question providing relevant explanations backed by appropriately selected information, although this may not be full or comprehensive. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **7-9**
- L4:** Answers will be well-focused, identifying a range of specific explanations, backed by precise evidence and demonstrating good understanding of the connections and links between events/issues. Answers will, for the most part, be well-written and organised. **10-12**

Indicative content

This question is focused on the growth in state power during the First World War. Candidates may seek to challenge the idea that the increased power actually significantly changed the government's traditional role. This approach may be rewarded if it is made relevant to the specific question set.

- The war was the first one to anything close to global proportions. Candidates may refer to the notion of 'total war'. The government acted early to establish its control through D.O.R.A..
- The nature of a static war focused on artillery left Britain unprepared in terms of ammunition supplies. The 'shell scandal' of 1915 necessitated greater centralised control of labour and industrial war production rather than relying on private enterprise and the market economy to determine production.
- Lloyd George assumed a very central role in the process of state control through his role as Minister of Munitions from May 1915. He pushed the munitions of war act through Parliament even at the expense of creating some divisions within his own party. This greatly strengthened the government's ability to exercise control and to create state owned munitions works.
- Lloyd George had limited faith in the Commander in Chief, Haig. He established the Supreme War Council in order to exercise more control over the land war.
- The need for fresh troops also heightened the government's ability to exercise control. This may be illustrated through the Conscription Act, 1916
- The idea of greater state control had already begun through the early pre-war developments of the welfare state.

- (b) 'Lloyd George was entirely responsible for the decline of the Liberal Party in the years 1915 to 1918.'
Explain why you agree or disagree with this view. (24 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

- L1:** Answers may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a limited part of the period of the question. Alternatively, there may be some explicit comment with little, if any, appropriate support. Answers are likely to be generalised and assertive. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **0-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be almost entirely descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain some explicit comment with relevant but limited support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-11**
- L3:** Answers will show a developed understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, but they will lack depth and/or balance. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, be clearly expressed and show some organisation in the presentation of material. **12-16**
- L4:** Answers will show explicit understanding of the demands of the question. They will develop a balanced argument backed by a good range of appropriately selected evidence and a good understanding of historical interpretations. Answers will, for the most part, show organisation and good skills of written communication. **17-21**
- L5:** Answers will be well-focused and closely argued. The arguments will be supported by precisely selected evidence leading to a relevant conclusion/judgement, incorporating well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate. Answers will, for the most part, be carefully organised and fluently written, using appropriate vocabulary. **22-24**

Indicative content

The key word in this question is 'entirely'. Candidates are required to make a balanced evaluation of the factors which contributed to the decline of the Liberal Party between 1915 and 1918. It would be reasonable to credit relevant pre-1915 material but the focus lies in the period defined in the question.

Lloyd George's role:

- in December 1916 Lloyd George agreed to head a new, mainly Conservative, coalition with himself as Prime Minister. This deepened a feud between himself and Asquith, each of whom had their supporters within the Party
- he was perceived by many as a self serving man who was willing to split the Party in order to fulfil his own political ambitions
- he negotiated the 1918 'coupon Election' with Bonar Law. This was the final indicator of the demise of the liberal party.

Other factors responsible for the decline of the Liberal Party:

- Asquith's apparently indecisive and weak leadership in the months of the war and the consequences of his decision to form a coalition in May 1915
- the Labour MP, Henderson, was forced to resign from the Cabinet in 1917. This event ended the 'Lib-Lab' electoral pact which had strengthened the Liberals. It ended the united front that had helped the liberals diminish the electoral threat from the Conservatives
- the Labour Party became a significant electoral threat to the Liberals. Candidates may refer to the growing class awareness that was developing and Labour stood to benefit from the extension of the vote in 1918. Better organisation and developed socialist policies also served to reinforce Labour as a threat to Liberals.
- internal divisions were already present a product of the outcome of issues central to liberal thinking and generated by the war. This is best illustrated through a split early in 1916 over support for the Conscription Bill. Sir John Simon (Home Secretary) resigned and 27 Liberal MPs voted against the Bill
- candidates may make some controlled references to the pre -1915 condition of the party and suggest that the decline was already in place.