



ASSESSMENT and
QUALIFICATIONS
ALLIANCE

Mark scheme January 2004

GCE

Government and Politics

Unit GOV6

Copyright © 2004 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING

Introduction

The AQA's revised Government and Politics specification has been designed to be objectives-led in that questions are set which address the assessment objectives published in the specification. The assessment objectives for A Level and AS are the same, but the weightings are different at AS and A2. Details of the weightings are given in paragraphs 7.2 and 8.4 of the specification.

The schemes of marking reflect these objectives. The mark scheme which follows is of the *levels of response* type showing that candidates are expected to demonstrate their mastery of the skills required in the context of their knowledge and understanding of Government and Politics. Mark schemes provide the necessary framework for examiners but they cannot cover all eventualities. Candidates should be given credit for partially complete answers. Where appropriate, candidates should be given credit for referring to recent and contemporary developments in Government and Politics.

Consistency of marking is of the essence in all public examinations. It is therefore of vital importance that assistant examiners apply the marking scheme as directed by the Principal Examiner in order to facilitate comparability with the marking of other options.

Before scrutinising and applying the detail of the specific mark scheme which follows, assistant examiners are required to familiarise themselves with the general principals of the mark scheme as contained in the Assessment Matrix.

Using a levels of response mark scheme

Good examining is about the **consistent** application of judgement. Mark schemes provide a framework within which examiners exercise their judgement. This is especially so in subjects like Government and Politics which in part rely upon analysis, evaluation, argument and explanation. With this in mind, examiners should use the Assessment Matrix alongside the detailed mark scheme for each question. The Assessment Matrix provides a framework ensuring a consistent, generic, source from which the detailed mark schemes are derived. This supporting framework ensures a consistent approach within which candidates' responses are marked according to the level of demand and context of each question.

Examiners should initially make a decision about which Level any given response should be placed in. Having determined the appropriate Level the examiners must then choose the precise mark to be given within that Level. In making a decision about a specific mark to award, it is vitally important to think first of the mid-range within the Level, where that Level covers more than two marks. Comparison with other candidates' responses to the same question might then suggest whether the middle mark is unduly generous or severe.

In making decisions away from the middle of the Level, examiners should ask themselves questions relating to candidate attainment, including the quality of language. The more positive the answers, the higher should be the mark awarded. We want to avoid "bunching" of marks. Levels mark schemes can produce regression to the mean, which should be avoided. A candidate's script should be considered by asking "Is it:-

- precise in its use of factual information?
- appropriately detailed?
- factually accurate?
- appropriately balanced or markedly better in some areas than others?
- generally coherent in expression and cogent in development (as appropriate to the level awarded)?
- well presented as to general quality of language?"

The overall aim is to mark positively, giving credit for what candidates know, understand and can do.

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (a) (Total: 8 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Levels 3-4 (2 marks) The candidate demonstrates a good to excellent knowledge and understanding of political data, concept(s) or term(s). Where appropriate, the candidate produces accurate and/or relevant examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 3-4 (3-4 marks) The candidate applies a good to excellent range of developed concepts and uses appropriate political theory to construct a clear and cogent explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 3-4 (2 marks) The candidate communicates clearly and effectively using appropriate political vocabulary. The answer has a clear sense of direction, is focused on the question and, where appropriate, has a conclusion which flows from the discussion.</p>
	<p>Levels 1-2 (1 mark) The candidate demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding of political data, concept(s) or term(s). The candidate produces few or inaccurate examples and/or limited evidence to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 1-2 (1-2 marks) The candidate applies a limited range of concepts and makes little or limited use of political theory or ideas in developing an explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 1-2 (1 mark) The candidate communicates explanations or arguments with limited clarity and effectiveness using limited political vocabulary. The answer may lack either a clear focus on the question or a sense of direction. A conclusion, where appropriate, may be offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion is modest or implicit.</p>

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (b) (Total: 12 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (5-6 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate fully addresses the requirements of the question and provides developed and effective to comprehensive interpretation. The answer also provides clear to accurate evidence and, where appropriate good to excellent examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 3-4 (3-4 marks) The candidate applies a good to excellent range of developed concepts and uses appropriate political theory to construct a clear and cogent explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 3-4 (2 marks) The candidate communicates clearly and effectively using appropriate political vocabulary. The answer has a clear sense of direction, is focused on the question and, where appropriate, has a conclusion which flows from the discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (3-4 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate clearly addresses the requirements of the question and provides sound interpretation and contextual awareness. The answer includes good examples to illustrate points made.</p>		

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Levels 1-2 (1-2 marks) The candidate demonstrates slight to basic knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate makes a very limited to limited attempt to address the requirements of the question and provides little to partial and reasonably effective interpretation. Answers offer limited or little evidence and few or inaccurate examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 1-2 (1-2 marks) The candidate applies a limited range of concepts and makes little or limited use of political theory or ideas in developing an explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 1-2 (1 mark) The candidate communicates explanations or arguments with limited clarity and effectiveness using limited political vocabulary. The answer may lack either a clear focus on the question or a sense of direction. A conclusion, where appropriate, may be offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion is modest or implicit.</p>

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (c) (Total: 20 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (7-8 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer fully addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates excellent contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes excellent examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 4 (7-8 marks) The candidate displays excellent awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is an excellent focus on the specific question asked. There is a clear evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a sophisticated awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>Appropriate parallels and connections are clearly identified together with comparisons. A wide range of concepts is used.</p>	<p>Level 4 (4 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions with clarity. Excellent use is made of political vocabulary to construct cogent and coherent arguments. The answer has a clear sense of direction, culminating in a conclusion that flows from the preceding discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (5-6 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer clearly addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates sound contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes good examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 3 (5-6 marks) The candidate displays sound awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is a clear focus on the question. There is a sound evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays good awareness of viewpoints and issues. There is good recognition of parallels and comparisons. Appropriate concepts are used.</p>	<p>Level 3 (3 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions well. Good use is made of political vocabulary to construct clear arguments and explanations.</p> <p>The candidate produces an answer with a conclusion linked to the preceding discussion.</p>

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 2 (3-4 marks) The candidate demonstrates outline knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and some awareness of the relationships between them. The answer makes a limited attempt at addressing the question and demonstrates contextual awareness covering part of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes simple examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 2 (3-4 marks) The candidate displays limited awareness of the implications and demands of the question resulting in a restricted focus. There is a limited evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays partial awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is some recognition of basic parallels and comparisons with limited use of concepts.</p>	<p>Level 2 (2 marks) The candidate communicates arguments and conclusions adequately with limited use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion is offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion may be modest or implicit.</p>
	<p>Level 1 (1-2 marks) The candidate demonstrates a slight and incomplete knowledge and understanding of political institutions and processes and limited awareness of the relationships between them. There is little attempt to address the requirements of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes few, if any, examples which may be inaccurately reported or inappropriately used.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1-2 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question and focus is lacking. Evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour is superficial, with little awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is little, if any, recognition of parallels and comparisons. The use of concepts is superficial and naïve.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1 mark) The answer relies upon narrative, which is not fully coherent. There is little or no use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion, if present, is not adequately related to the preceding discussion.</p>

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Questions 2, 3 and 4 (Maximum 40 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (13-16 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer fully addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates excellent contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes excellent examples to illustrate points made. The answer includes detailed and comprehensive interpretations or explanations as well as accurate evidence and relevant examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 4 (13-16 marks) The candidate displays excellent awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is an excellent and sustained focus on the specific question asked. There is clear and full evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a sophisticated awareness of differing viewpoints and recognition of issues.</p> <p>Appropriate parallels and connections are clearly identified together with well-developed comparisons. A wide of concepts are used and developed.</p>	<p>Level 4 (7-8 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions with clarity. Excellent use is made of political vocabulary to construct cogent and coherent arguments and explanations. The answer has a clear sense of direction, culminating in a conclusion that flows from the preceding discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (9-12 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer clearly addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates sound contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes developed and effective interpretations or explanations and also clear evidence and good examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 3 (9-12 marks) The candidate displays sound awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is a clear focus on the question. There is a sound evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays good awareness of differing viewpoints and recognition of issues. There is good recognition of parallels and comparisons. Appropriate concepts are used and developed.</p>	<p>Level 3 (5-6 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions well. Good use is made of political vocabulary to construct clear arguments and explanations.</p> <p>The candidate produces an answer with a conclusion linked to the preceding discussion.</p>

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 2 (5-8 marks) The candidate demonstrates outline knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and some awareness of the relationships between them. The answer makes a limited attempt at addressing the question and demonstrates contextual awareness covering part of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes a partial and reasonably effective attempt at interpretation or explanation with some examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 2 (5-8 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question resulting in a restricted focus. There is a limited evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a partial awareness of differing viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is some recognition of basic parallels and comparisons. Arguments and explanations are undeveloped with limited use of concepts.</p>	<p>Level 2 (3-4 marks) The candidate communicates arguments and conclusions adequately with limited use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion is offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion may be modest or implicit.</p>
	<p>Level 1 (1-4 marks) Candidate demonstrates a slight and incomplete knowledge and understanding of political institutions and processes and limited awareness of the relationships between them. There is little attempt to address the requirements of the question. There is only superficial awareness, if any, of the context of the question, with little interpretation and few, if any, examples often inaccurately reported or inappropriately used.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1-4 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question and focus is lacking. Evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour is superficial.</p> <p>Analysis shows little awareness of differing viewpoints and issues. There is little, if any, recognition of parallels and comparisons. Arguments, explanations and use of concepts is superficial and naïve.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1-2 marks) The answer relies upon narrative, which is not fully coherent. There is little or no use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion, if present, is not adequately related to the preceding discussion.</p>

1**Total for this question: 40 marks**

- (a) Using the extract, explain the statement *Politics in Scotland has already diverged from the rest of the UK.* (8 marks)

Devolution gives Scottish Parliament power to pass legislation/pursue policies different from the rest of the UK. For higher marks, extra information, eg explanation that Scottish Parliament unlike Welsh Assembly has primary legislative (and taxation) powers; some powers (defence, foreign affairs) still retained by Westminster.

- (b) Using the extract and your own knowledge, explain why the right of Scottish MPs to vote on matters that affect only England is controversial. (12 marks)

Accurate knowledge and understanding that MPs representing Scottish constituencies can vote in Westminster Parliament on matters affecting only England. For ‘controversial’ appropriate explanations, eg English MPs can’t vote on purely Scottish matters. Scottish MPs in House of Commons can’t vote on purely Scottish matters affecting their constituencies.

For higher marks, accurate contrasts and similarities (eg with Welsh MPs) and contextual analysis, eg West Lothian question, Scotland still over-represented at Westminster, financial arrangements.

- (c) “There is no political case for an English Parliament.” Discuss. (20 marks)

Discussion should include: political implication for England of devolution to Scotland and Wales and Northern Ireland, including composition and functions of devolved assemblies; the role of Westminster and Whitehall in the government of England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland; policy differences emanating from multi-level governance; the relationship between devolved assemblies/executives and Westminster and Whitehall, including the West Lothian question, financial arrangements and reserved powers.

In addressing ‘no case’, candidates should analyse: political and constitutional arguments for and against an English Parliament, including threat/reinforcement of maintenance of unity of UK; need for written constitution; lack of demand in England; lack of English ‘nationalism’. Likelihood of regional/federal solutions, etc; extra layer of bureaucracy; European dimension. Concepts such as devolution, federalism, independence, regionalism. Possible to argue case for or against. Accept references to government’s proposals for regional assemblies in England, including use of material in extract, but do not penalise if ignored – not explicit in specification which pre-dates policy announcement.

2**Total for this question: 40 marks**

“Everyone’s second-best solution.” Discuss this view of direct rule of Northern Ireland from Westminster. (40 marks)

Discussion should include historical context of Northern Ireland conflict; the constitutional status of Northern Ireland within the United Kingdom; ‘direct rule’ in the context of Northern Ireland, including aspirations of Unionist and Nationalist traditions and London and Dublin perspectives; alternative proposals for the government of Northern Ireland including the Good Friday Agreement and subsequent developments.

Analysis of ‘second-best solution’ should address experience with direct rule; continuing significance of values and beliefs of Unionists; perspectives of British and Irish governments; political developments relevant to the imposition of direct rule (which may include the Good Friday Agreement and its aftermath and problems associated with decommissioning and power-sharing). Concepts such as nationalism, Unionism, sovereignty and power sharing are appropriate.

For higher marks, candidates should focus not only on why ‘direct rule’ is the main preference of no group but also why it may be preferred as ‘second best’ to other solutions proposed by particular groupings and opposing traditions, etc.

3**Total for this question: 40 marks**

To what extent, and why, does Wales have a weaker form of devolution than Scotland? (40 marks)

Discussion should include: constitutional and political status of Scotland and Wales within the United Kingdom, political processes, institutions and governmental structures relevant to Scotland and Wales (including composition, powers and functions of Welsh Assembly and Scottish Parliament and executives); political context and background of devolution in Scotland and Wales; nationalism in Scotland and Wales; the government of Scotland and Wales and relations with Westminster and Whitehall; the impact of the Scottish Parliament and Welsh Assembly in the government and politics of Scotland and Wales, including policy examples.

Candidates should then address ‘to what extent’ (ie parallels, connections, similarities and differences between the Scottish Parliament and Welsh Assembly and their executives, including composition, powers, functions, relations with Westminster and Whitehall, etc); and ‘why’ (ie historical factors and economic and political context underlying devolution initiatives in Scotland and Wales; similarities and differences in the government of Scotland and Wales pre-devolution, similarities and differences between Scottish and Welsh nationalism). Concepts, eg devolution, independence, nationalism, sovereignty, accountability are appropriate.

4**Total for this question: 40 marks**

Discuss whether there are still any similarities at all between Welsh and Scottish nationalism.

(40 marks)

Discussion should include: nationalism as a concept; the political environment and culture in Scotland and Wales; the nature of Scottish and Welsh nationalism (aspirations, causes/roots, development, etc) Plaid Cymru and SNP; policies, electoral support, and political significance; and the impact of nationalism on devolution in Scotland and Wales.

In addressing ‘similarities’ and ‘at all’, candidates should consider: similarities and parallels (eg common goal of greater self-determination, common experience of English domination/Thatcherism), and differences (eg Welsh cultural/religious/linguistic influences; Scotland’s lost statehood and economic base) between Welsh and Scottish nationalism; similarities and differences in the political and electoral significance of Plaid Cymru and SNP; connections and similarities between Scottish and Welsh nationalism and other forms of nationalism (eg Northern Ireland). ‘Still’ should address historical experience and changes over time. Concepts such as nationalism, devolution, independence are appropriate.