

ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE
CRITICAL THINKING
Assessing and Developing Argument

F502/01
F502/02

Tuesday 7 June 2011
Morning

Duration: 1 hour 30 minutes

Candidates answer Section A on the answer sheet and Sections B and C on the question paper.

OCR supplied materials:

- Answer sheet for Section A Multiple Choice
- Resource booklet

Other materials required:

None



Candidate forename		Candidate surname	
--------------------	--	-------------------	--

Centre number						Candidate number				
---------------	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	--	--	--	--

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the boxes above. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Answer Section A, questions 1–15, on the answer sheet provided. You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on Section A.
- On completion of Section A move directly on to Sections B and C.
- Answer Sections B and C in the spaces provided on the question paper.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided. If additional space is required, you should use the lined pages at the end of this question paper. The question number(s) must be clearly shown.
- Additional paper may also be used if necessary.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **75**. Section A comprises 20% of the available marks, Sections B and C comprise 80% of the available marks.
- Up to 5 marks are awarded for quality of written communication within Section C.
- This document consists of **16** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

Section A: Multiple Choice

Answer **all** questions in this section using the separate answer sheet provided.

You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on this section of the paper.

Questions 1 and 2 refer to the following passage:

There has been an increase in the sale of Fair Trade products in supermarkets because people want to support small businesses in developing countries. Fair Trade helps these small businesses to get a better price for their products. Despite the apparent success of this approach, it is not clear that Fair Trade is beneficial to developing countries. Many people feel that by buying Fair Trade products they are doing enough to support developing countries. They are therefore less likely to donate money to overseas development charities.

- 1 Which of the following is the **main conclusion** of the above argument?
- (a) It is not clear that Fair Trade is beneficial to developing countries.
 - (b) Many people are less likely to donate money to overseas development charities.
 - (c) Many people feel that by buying Fair Trade products they are doing enough to support developing countries.
 - (d) There has been an increase in the sale of Fair Trade products in supermarkets.

[1]

- 2 What is the name given to the following **argument element** in the above passage?

“People want to support small businesses in developing countries.”

- (a) Evidence
- (b) Explanation
- (c) Intermediate conclusion
- (d) Reason

[1]

Question 3 refers to the following passage:

UK researchers have found that clenching fists before blood is taken can raise potassium levels in the blood test, potentially confusing results. In a study looking at 200,000 tests, when staff were told not to ask patients to clench fists, the number of cases of high potassium fell significantly. Many doctors want to ask patients to clench fists before blood is taken as this makes the veins stand out more clearly.

3 Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- (a) Doctors should be retrained in how they practise medicine.
- (b) Doctors should find a different method of making veins stand out clearly.
- (c) Doctors should ignore blood tests which show a high level of potassium.
- (d) Doctors should not use blood test results to diagnose medical conditions.

[1]

Questions 4 and 5 refer to the following passage:

Many people are willing to spend thousands of pounds on sophisticated camera equipment but in most cases expensive digital cameras are pointless. The most common problems with photographs are bad composition and poor timing, and a new camera will not improve your composition or help you to be in the right place at the right time. Instead of expensive camera equipment, most people should spend their money on photography lessons.

4 Which of the following is an **intermediate conclusion** of the above argument?

- (a) A new camera will not improve your composition or help you to be in the right place at the right time.
- (b) In most cases expensive digital cameras are pointless.
- (c) Instead of expensive camera equipment, most people should spend their money on photography lessons.
- (d) The most common problems with photographs are bad composition and poor timing.

[1]

5 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- (a) Bad composition and poor timing are not the only causes of bad photographs.
- (b) It is generalising from bad photographers to all photographers.
- (c) The argument conflates expense and sophistication.
- (d) The argument restricts the options to expensive camera equipment or photography lessons.

[1]

Questions 6 and 7 refer to the following passage:

People are always complaining that politicians are liars, but it is voters, not politicians, who are to blame for politicians' lies. Voters like politicians who tell them everything will get better if their party wins. The electorate does not vote for honest politicians who admit the negative consequences of their views. Voters encourage politicians to lie.

6 Which of the following is the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

- (a) It is voters, not politicians, who are to blame for politicians' lies.
- (b) People are always complaining that politicians are liars.
- (c) Voters encourage politicians to lie.
- (d) Voters like politicians who tell them everything will get better if their party wins.

[1]

7 Which of the following is the **best statement** of a **weakness** in the above argument?

- (a) Even if a policy has some negative consequences, it may be a good policy.
- (b) It is possible that we should blame both voters and politicians.
- (c) It is unlikely that voters want politicians to lie.
- (d) Most people lie occasionally.

[1]

Questions 8, 9 and 10 refer to the following passage:

The majority of women who have had a fracture are not getting treatment to prevent future breaks. A Cambridge University study shows that of 1,600 women going to a fracture clinic, a third have had a previous break but only a small number have been put on bone-strengthening drugs. The health service should increase the number of women that join bone-strengthening drug programmes. Doctors must make more effort to advertise these drugs to women with repeated breaks.

- 8 Which of the following is the **intermediate conclusion** of the above argument?
- (a) Doctors must make more effort to advertise these drugs to women with repeated breaks.
 - (b) Only a small number have been put on bone-strengthening drugs.
 - (c) The health service should increase the number of women that join bone-strengthening drug programmes.
 - (d) The majority of women who have had a fracture are not getting treatment to prevent future breaks.
- [1]
- 9 Which of the following is a **principle** which would **best support** the above argument?
- (a) Doctors should try to avoid unnecessarily prescribing drugs.
 - (b) Medicine should aim to prevent future harm.
 - (c) Patients should be given a range of treatment choices.
 - (d) Women are more likely than men to break their bones.
- [1]
- 10 Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?
- (a) Long-term use of bone-protection drugs may have side effects.
 - (b) Some combinations of drugs are harmful.
 - (c) Treating fractures costs more than providing bone-strengthening drugs.
 - (d) Women are aware of the drugs but choose not to use them.
- [1]

Questions 11 and 12 refer to the following passage:

To do well in public exams, students need to make sure they are not sleep deprived. Therefore they should have at least nine hours' sleep on the night before an exam. Tests have shown that after 18 hours of being awake, performance is equivalent to having drunk three units of alcohol. So lack of sleep clearly affects performance.

11 A student responded, "You can interrupt 18 hours of being awake with even half an hour of sleep."

Which of the following **best describes** the student's response?

- (a) It challenges the intermediate conclusion.
- (b) It contradicts the evidence.
- (c) It disproves the conclusion.
- (d) It indicates a weakness with the use of the evidence.

[1]

12 Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- (a) Alcohol affects people in the same way.
- (b) A significant number of students have less than nine hours of sleep before exams currently.
- (c) Performance usually declines after three units of alcohol.
- (d) Some people are more confident after drinking alcohol.

[1]

Questions 13, 14 and 15 refer to the following passage:

The British Museum has a set of bronzes which were taken from the Kingdom of Benin, now part of Nigeria, in 1897. Nigeria now wants them back. But the British Museum has refused to return many other artefacts over the years; for instance it has frequently refused to return the Parthenon Marbles, which were taken from Athens in the 1800s and which Greece wants back. Since the British Museum has decided not to return other items, it must not return the Benin Bronzes either.

13 What is the name given to the following **argument element** in the above passage?

“... it has frequently refused to return the Parthenon Marbles ...”

- (a) Counter-assertion
- (b) Evidence
- (c) Example
- (d) Reason

[1]

14 Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- (a) The British Museum has the best expertise to preserve and display ancient artefacts.
- (b) The British Museum is very popular with tourists from all over the world.
- (c) The majority of the Benin Bronzes are on display in the British Museum, not in storage.
- (d) The Parthenon Marbles were not being cared for properly in 19th century Greece.

[1]

15 The above argument contains a **flaw** in the reasoning. The flaw would be **best described** as:

- (a) Circular argument
- (b) Hasty generalisation
- (c) Post hoc
- (d) Reasoning from wrong actions

[1]

Section A Total [15]

Section B – Analysing and Evaluating Argument

Answer all questions.

Read the passage in the Resource Booklet.

You should use the exact words of the author in your answers to 16 (a), (b) and (c).

16 (a) State the main conclusion of the argument presented in paragraphs 1 to 5.

.....
.....
..... [2]

(b) State a counter-assertion in paragraphs 1 to 5.

.....
.....
..... [2]

(c) State two intermediate conclusions in paragraphs 1 to 5.

(i)
.....
..... [2]

(ii)
.....
..... [2]

17 Paragraph 1 gives the following explanation for the increase in the number of homes with internet access:

“most homes have internet access now that it has become cheaper.”

Give two alternative explanations.

(i)
..... [1]

(ii)
..... [1]

18 Evaluate the reasoning in paragraph 3 and the support it gives to the author’s overall argument. You should make **two** points about **weaknesses and/or flaws**.

(i)
.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

(ii)
.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

19 Suggest a **principle** that would **support** the argument made in paragraph 4.

.....
.....
..... [2]

20 The reasoning in paragraph 4 uses an **analogy**.

(a) State precisely what is being compared in this analogy.

.....
.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

(b) Make **one** point of evaluation about this analogy. You must explain how effectively it supports the author’s reasoning.

.....
.....
.....
.....
..... [4]

21 In paragraph 5, the author says that the student is unlikely to do as well in her Law course because of not practising the right skills. What do we need to assume about the Law course for this to be true?

.....
.....
..... [2]

22 The response given by *Kevin’s Mum* uses an **appeal**. Name the appeal and explain why using it may not give strong support to her argument.

(a) Name [1]

(b) Explanation

.....
.....
.....
..... [2]

Section B Total [30]

Section C – Developing your own arguments

Answer **all** questions.

23 ‘Teachers should not set homework that involves the use of the internet.’

Give **two** reasons which **support** this claim.

(i) Reason 1:
.....
..... [2]

(ii) Reason 2:
.....
..... [2]

24 The response given by *Dr_Net* claims “it is more dangerous to take risks away from children” than to expose them to risks.

Give **one** example other than internet use that would **support** this claim.

Example
.....
..... [2]

