GCE

Classical Civilisation

H408/34: Democracy and the Athenians

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for June 2019

Annotations

These are the annotations, (including abbreviations), used in RM Assessor, which are used when marking:

Symbol	Description	Comment
✔	Tick	worthy of credit
?	?	unclear
S	S	error of spelling
E	E	error of grammar, punctuation or expression
F	F	error of fact
^	^	omission
∫	H Wavy Line	to draw attention to something
~~	H Wavy Line	to draw attention to something
………	Highlight	as directed by PE
IRRL	IRRL	irrelevant point
REP	REP	conspicuous repetition

L	L	illegible word or phrase
BP	BP	Blank Page – this annotation **must** be used on all blank pages within an answer booklet and on each page of an additional object where there is no candidate response.

Section A

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
1	**What was the name of the Solonic property class to which the 'hoplites' in line 4 belonged?** Answers may include: • The zeugite class/*zeugitai* (1).	1 **(AO1)**	*All legitimate answers should be credited.*
2	**Explain why the term 'vote' in 'vote by lot' (line 6) is incorrect when used in source A.** Answers may include: • Choosing by lot is a random system (sortition) and does not involve conscious voting by anyone (1).	1 **(AO1)**	*All legitimate answers should be credited.* *Credit any response which shows correct understanding of 'sortition'.*

3	**The anonymous author of Source A is usually called 'The Old Oligarch'. How well does the passage suggest that this nickname is justified?**
	
	Points made could include the following:
	• The author of this work seems to be showing how the Athenian system favours the lower-class citizens. (AO2)
	   o *'more power than…the noble and the good men'. (AO1)*
	
	• It could be argued that he shows some understanding of this viewpoint. (AO2)
	   o *"it seems fair for every citizen to have a share in the offices of state'. (AO1)*
	
	• He acknowledges that the key to Athenian power is the navy, and that necessarily favours those who man the ships. (AO2)
	   o *'It is the common people who man the fleet and bring the city her power; the helmsmen, boatswains, sub-boatswains, lookouts and shipbuilders give far more strength to the city than the hoplites, the noble and the good men.' (AO1)*
		5
		(AO1)
		
		5
		(AO2)
			Use the 10-mark marking grid.
			
			AO1 marks are awarded for the selection of material from the source.
			
			AO2 marks for the interpretation, analysis and evaluation of this outlined in the Levels of Response grid.
			
			The indicative content is a description of possible content. All legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance

	• He treats the main citizen body/views of ordinary citizens with contempt. (AO2)
	    ○ *'the poor and the common people'. (AO1)*
	    ○ Coupled with reference to those not listed as contributing to the navy as *'the hoplites, the noble, and the good men'. (AO1)*
	
	 • He feels that the lower class citizens realise that they are not capable of making important decisions in a time of crisis. (AO2)
	    ○ *'The common people understand that it is better off for such decisions to be taken out of their hands and given to the most capable men.' (AO1)*
	    ○ *'the offices which….provide safety or bring danger'. (AO1)*
	
	 • Effectively implies that people are motivated by money. (AO2)
	    ○ *'Keen to hold the positions which offer a salary and benefits for their household'. (AO1)*
	
	 • But he thinks that the lower classes themselves realise that they are not qualified to hold senior leadership roles. (AO2)
	    ○ *'The common people take no share in these positions'. (AO1)*
	
	 • Therefore the views expressed in Source A are nearer to those of an oligarch. (AO2)
	    ○ W*ho believes that power should reside only in the hands of those few citizens with the education, time and competence to govern. (AO1)*
	
	 • But he doesn't understand the Athenian voting system and forgets – or doesn't know – how the commanders are elected. (AO2)
	    ○ *'they do not believe they should be allotted a vote in the selection of generals or cavalry commanders'. (AO1)*
	
	 • The candidate's conclusion will probably be reached through deciding how well the material in the passage on the paper reflects the known attitude of an oligarch. (AO2)
	    ○ *An oligarch believes in governance by the few, not the whole citizen population. (AO1)*
			In reaching their conclusion, candidates should show that they understand the term 'oligarch'.
			 They are not required to show knowledge of other parts of the prescribed material from this work.
			
			 Credit discussion of whether 'Old' is justified.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
4(a)	**Name two of the three broad geographical regions into which Cleisthenes divided the population of Attica.** Credit **any two** of the following: • City/*Asty* (1). • Coast/*Paralia* (1). • Inland/*Mesogaia* (1).	**2 (AO1)**	*All legitimate answers should be credited.* *It is not necessary for candidates to use the Greek terms.*
4(b)	**Cleisthenes then divided these groups into smaller divisions, so that there were 30 small divisions in all. What Greek name is given to these 30 divisions?** • *Trittyes* (1).	**1 (AO1)**	*All legitimate answers should be credited.*

5	**Explain why the people of Athens might have welcomed the changes made by Cleisthenes in the way people identified themselves.**
	
	Examples might include:
	
	• He boosted the independence of all citizens from the old clans by increasing the role of the local community. (AO2)
	    o *Each citizen was now identified by his patronymic and deme, rather than the previous system. Demes were local communities, sometimes as small as two or three streets in the city.* (*AO1*)
	
	• There was a closer identification with place, which increased a sense of local community. (AO2)
	    o *Each deme was responsible for making decisions about purely local matters. (AO1)*
	
	• *Demes* allowed ordinary citizens of all classes to develop the skills they needed to contribute to the wider community later. (AO2)
		5 (AO1)
		
		5 (AO2)
			Use the 10-mark marking grid.
			
			AO1 marks are awarded for the selection of material. relating to candidates' study of the Key Thinkers.
			
			AO2 marks for the interpretation, analysis and evaluation of this outlined in the Levels of Response grid.
			
			The indicative content is a description of possible content. All legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance

	o *Citizens were chosen by lot to participate in the deme council, which made local decisions. (AO1)*
	
	 • His reforms undermined the old clan/*phratry*-based divisions based on family allegiances and kinship. (AO2)
	      o *He did this by reforming the entire tribal structure of Attica, basing it on breaking down regional loyalties. (AO1*
	
	 • The new tribal system put an end to inter-family feuds which had led to civil war on several occasions since the time of Solon. (AO2)
	      o *The new Tribes were deliberately developed around locations rather than family. (AO1)*
	
	 • It reduced ties to the old Eupatrid families. (AO2)
	      o *Supporters of each family were now split into smaller groups and redistributed among the ten new Tribes. (AO1)*
	
	 • Potentially, the identification of citizens with *deme* rather than clan/*phratry* created a united and strong *polis*, preventing any further civil conflict. (AO2)
	      o *Previous family loyalties had been exploited by the people who had caused problems between the time of Solon and the events of 508. (AO1)*
	      o *This had created instability (AO1)*
	
	 • The new tribe names clearly marked a fresh start. The new tribes gave a shared view of the legendary past. (AO2)
	      o *They were quite deliberately chosen to link every citizen with an Athenian legendary figure from which none of the old clan/phratry leaders or Eupatrid families claimed descent. (AO1)*
			Credit references to Peisistratus, the assassination of Hippias and the role of the Alcmaeonids, as well as the invasion of Attica by Cleomenes of Sparta and his attempt to impose a government opposed to Cleisthenes' reforms.
			
			 Credit examples of new tribal names.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance

6*	**'Cleisthenes was the first person to involve all the citizens of Attica in everyday decisions.' Explain how far you agree with this statement. You may use your understanding of Cleisthenes' reforms as a starting point in your answer.**
	
	AO1
	Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of:
	• Opportunities to be involved in decision-making at local level in the *Deme* council which was chosen entirely by sortition.
	• *Boule* of 500.
	• Good performance in the *Deme* council could lead to proposal for inclusion in that tribe's 100 candidates for the *Boule*.
	• From which 50 would be chosen by sortition to make up that tribe's contingent in the *Boule* for the year.
	• Rotation of *prytaneis* and of chairman.
	• Boule members were provided with board and lodging for the term of their duty *prytanis.*
	• *Boule* members had to be involved full-time for only one-tenth of the year.
	• All proposals affecting the state as a whole had to be ratified by the Assembly, in which all citizens could speak and vote.
	'First' might include consideration of:
	• Solon's possible Council of 400 and other reforms, including:
	  ○ Clear division of rights of the classes
	  ○ The right to appoint an advocate
	  ○ The *Heliaea*
	• The proposals of Ephialtes and Pericles.
	
	AO2
	Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments:
	• People would not lose control of their normal day-to-day activities (e.g. farming) by being on the *Boule.*
	• *Bouleutai* would not suffer financially.
	• Involvement in *Deme* affairs would train people in civic issues and give opportunities for talented speakers to develop their skills.
	• Possibly discussion opportunities at home.
		10 (AO1)
		
		10 (AO2)
			Assess using the marking grids for the 20-mark extended response.
			
			The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.
			
			Whilst candidates may use the provided source as a starting point, they should not be penalised if they offer a full and detailed response which does not do so.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
	'First' may include consideration of: • Not all offices open to all classes. • Payment for office introduced later by Ephialtes/Pericles. • Jury courts and *euthunai* making all officials accountable to the Assembly. • Curbing of influence of the Areopagus in the 462 – 458 reforms.		

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance

7*	**'Aristophanes is the most effective critic of Athenian Democracy.' Using evidence from the plays of Aristophanes and the writings of at least one other author, discuss how far you agree with this statement. Justify your response.**
	
	AO1
	Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of:
	
	Aristophanes
	• Criticisms of the Assembly.
	• Criticisms of the way officials misused their office/public money.
	• The influence of Cleon on the jury-courts, including the benefits or drawbacks of the payment system.
	• Assemblywomen indicates the extent to which matters of public interest might or might not be discussed in the home.
	
	Other authors
	    • Plato
	    • Old Oligarch
	    • Thucydides
	    • Euripides *Suppliants*
	
	AO2
	Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments:
	• Candidate's understanding of 'effective'.
	• Candidate's assessment of the seriousness of the criticisms in the sources selected.
	• Whether Aristophanes' criticisms are 'effective' and also their effectiveness in relation to other sources.
	• Discussion of the effectiveness of the criticisms in other sources (will depend on sources chosen).
	• Modern comments on the nature of the developed Athenian Democracy.
	• Modern comments on the prejudices of the ancient sources.
		10 (AO1)
		
		20 (AO2)
			Assess using the marking grids for the 30-mark extended response.
			
			The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.
			
			Learners are expected to make use of scholarly views, academic approaches and sources to support their argument; the approach to crediting this is outlined in the Levels of Response Grid.
			
			Evidence from The Old Oligarch should not be taken only from the stimulus passage.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
	• Political/philosophical standpoint of the modern commentator (if known). • The candidate's own argument and conclusion. Overall evaluation and analysis: **In support of the statement:** • Aristophanes' criticisms are made directly to an Athenian audience and he would expect an instant response. • Aristophanes' criticisms of the working of the Assembly are clearly expressed. • Aristophanes attacks both named politicians and classes or groups of politicians, making specific charges. • The *Parabasis* of *Frogs* is cited as a reason why this play was awarded a second performance. • Plato is writing later than Aristophanes and may have different motives and experiences. • The Old Oligarch has a fundamentally different political agenda **Against the statement:** • Aristophanes' criticisms of Cleon have no lasting effect – he keeps being re-elected as *strategos*. • Aristophanes' attacks on politicians are personal in tone. • There is no evidence of any policy changes in Athens as a result of his plays. • Plato's arguments are more cogent. • The Old Oligarch shows that there are very specific flaws in the model of democracy practiced by the Athenians. • Thucydides comments on the successors of Pericles • Evidence of the oligarchic coup of 411.		

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
8*	**'The Athenians were proud of their government institutions and legal system.' Using evidence from at least two of the authors you have studied, evaluate how far you think that this is an accurate judgement.** **AO1** Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of: Answers and evidence will vary according to the sources chosen, but could include: Ancient sources: **In support of the statement:** • Thucydides *Funeral Oration* • Aeschylus: *Eumenides* extract • Continuing hatred of tyranny/the Peisistratids • Failure of the oligarchic regimes of 411 and 404 **Against the statement:** • Criticisms levelled by Aristophanes • The Old Oligarch • Plato Euripides' *Suppliants* extract can be seen as supporting both sides of the argument **AO2** Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments: • Purpose and nature of the *Funeral Oration.* • Purpose and nature of the extracts from drama. • Are Aristophanes' criticisms more a criticism of the exploitation of the institutions by specific individuals than a criticism of democracy itself? • Comments on the likely 5th century reception of the above sources. • The extent to which we can trust the motives of the Old Oligarch. • Trial of Socrates and the possible effect on Plato's views. • Modern comments on the nature of the developed Athenian Democracy. • Modern comments on the prejudices of the ancient sources. • Political/philosophical standpoint of the modern commentator (if known). The candidate's own argument and conclusion.	**10 (AO1)** **20 (AO2)**	*Assess using the marking grids for the 30-mark extended response.* *The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.* *Learners are expected to make use of scholarly views, academic approaches and sources to support their argument; the approach to crediting this is outlined in the Levels f Response Grid.*