

AS-LEVEL Classical Civilisation

CIV1E Menander and Plautus Mark scheme

2020 June 2015

Version 1: Final mark scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts. Alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this mark scheme are available from aga.org.uk

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the student uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of students after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Students are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the student's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

- accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question
- clear understanding of central aspects of the question
- ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion
- ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question
- some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 2 Demonstrates

either

a range of accurate and relevant knowledge

or

 some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.

Level 1 Demonstrates

either

· some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge

or

 an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it. 1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- ability to sustain an argument which

has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion

is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and

makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the question
- ability to develop an argument which

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail and has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question
- some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them
- and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge
- or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it
- and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

19-20

14-18

9-13

5-8

1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- ability to sustain an argument which

has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion

is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and

makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the guestion
- ability to develop an argument which

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question

 some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar

some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them
- and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge
- **or** an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it
- **and** little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

1-6

7-12

27-30

20-26

13-19

This page has been left intentionally blank

Unit 1E Menander and Plautus

Section 1

Option A

01 Whose mother speaks in line 1?

Sostratos' [1].

[1 mark]

02 'Nymphs next door are a perpetual nuisance.' (lines 7-8). Which god is also worshipped at the shrine next door?

Pan [1].

[1 mark]

03 What difficulty has Sikon had in bringing the sheep?

(from his shoulders) ate (fig) leaves / struggled (to escape) / (on ground) refused to move / turned Sikon into 'mincemeat' [1].

[1 mark]

04 What are the mother's reasons for carrying out the sacrifice? Make two points.

Two of eg

to ensure happy ending [1] to dream [1] that god / Pan giving son / Sostratos fetters [1] leather jacket [1] mattock [1] and telling him to dig (on neighbour's land) [1] etc.

[2 marks]

To what extent does the passage rely on social stereotypes for its comic effect and how far does it rely on other types of humour? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the passage.

Answers may include (with possibility of overlap between categories) discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **eg**

social stereotypes:

- caricature of Knemon as gruff peasant curse 'Damn and blast', impious comment about Nymphs, extreme reaction to minor inconvenience 'I think I'll knock the house down'
- Knemon's satirical observations about 'piety' of rich who give inedible bits to gods while enjoying hampers of food and fine wine themselves
- Knemon's assumption that wealthy 'you lot' sacrificing bull (for which single pot hardly appropriate) rather than more modest sheep, and Getas' retort to peasant 'I shouldn't expect you to sacrifice as much as a snail'
- Getas' verbal abuse characteristic of cheeky slave in comedy, if not in real life –
 'hophead', 'You're all dopey from a hangover!'

other types of humour:

- Getas' comment that sheep can't wait to be killed because 'pretty well dead already'
 normally victim had to be perfect; not usual way in which victim should appear to be willingly killed
- o Getas' mock pity for sheep 'poor thing'
- o Getas' shouting at door
- portrayal of Knemon's extreme misanthropy, abuse and threats of violence go beyond social stereotypes – 'miserable trash', 'godless rubbish' (the latter particularly inappropriate given Knemon's own disregard for Pan / Nymphs); extreme violent threats 'eat you alive'; excessive anger at request to borrow mere pot, etc
- sexual stereotypes: Getas' comment on girls as 'useless', sex-obsessed and deceitful; Knemon's command to 'Woman!' to open door.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[10 marks]

of 'The main point of 'Old Cantankerous' is that people should be sensitive to the needs and feelings of others.'

To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from 'Old Cantankerous'.

You might include discussion of:

- how Knemon treats others and what happens to him
- the behaviour of Sostratos, Gorgias and other characters
- the prologue
- the ending of the play
- other aspects of 'Old Cantankerous' you think are important.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of eg

- Pyrrhias' agitated account of Knemon's violent treatment of him in contravention of customs of 'xenia'; scene from which passage taken, showing his complete inability to understand others' motives; Knemon's abuse of Simiche; a rural loner who wants to isolate himself from all social contact, etc
- Sostratos from start shown in positive light, in conversation with Chaireas anxious that
 has acted with impropriety in sending slave to Knemon; prepared to dig with mattock in
 order to win over Knemon on Knemon's terms; politely and considerately helps Knemon's
 daughter fill jug, though this is misinterpreted by slave Daos who feels obliged to report
 incident to Gorgias; sympathetic towards Gorgias and so easily convinces him of his
 honourable intentions towards girl; resists temptation to kiss daughter when Knemon
 down well and praises Gorgias' gallant rescue; persuades father Kallipides to allow
 Gorgias to marry his daughter, etc
- Gorgias also portrayed very positively and acts considerately throughout treats
 Sostratos well despite original suspicions, rescues Knemon despite problems he has
 caused him; betroths Knemon's daughter to Sostratos as soon as he can in recognition of
 Sostratos' good character, etc
- Pan shows Knemon's insensitivity in exaggerated light (eg only polite to himself) in contrast to daughter (attentive to needs of Nymphs) and son Getas, etc
- after rescue from well by Gorgias, Knemon demonstrates partial conversion to considering needs and feelings of others in adopting him as heir and guardian of daughter; in final scene, Getas' and Sikon's mocking of Knemon not sensitive to his needs as he sees them, but finally brings him reluctantly into celebratory party, etc
- overall 'Old Cantankerous' may be thought to have a high moralising content (whether
 with message as stated in quotation or modified), but situations Menander creates
 provide opportunities for interactions between range of contrasting, though frequently
 stereotypical, characters that give rise to comic abuse, violence, banter and stock jokes
 with a feel-good ending in line with audience expectations, etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[20 marks]

Option B

07 What has caused Amphitryo to believe there is a 'fornicator' (line 8) in the house? Make two points.

Two of eg:

when Amphitryo arrived back that day for first time / had spent night on ship [1] Alcmena said he had come back previous night [1] had dinner with her [1] gone to bed with her [1] had told him all about battle [1] given her (golden) bowl [1] and had just left (to go back to ship) [1], etc.

[2 marks]

08 What did Amphitryo want Naucrates to prove?

had been on ship / in harbour with Amphitryo [1].

[1 mark]

09 What has been happening at the palace while Amphitryo has been looking for Naucrates? Give two details.

Two of eg:

Jupiter returned (disguised as Amphitryo) [1] made up with Alcmena [1] sent Sosia to invite captain / Blepharo to lunch [1] went inside to sacrifice to himself [1] ordered Mercury to bamboozle Amphitryo [1] Mercury made 'servus currens' entry [1], etc.

[2 marks]

10 In the passage, how entertainingly does Plautus prolong the confusion? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the passage.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **eq**

- Amphitryo, unaware that Mercury has set trap letting audience in on plot, enters and increases suspense by delivering relatively long soliloquy expressing his grumpiness with absurdly long list of places that has visited in search of Naucrates ('beauty parlour' perhaps particularly unlikely)
- Amphitryo's bafflement and frustration at finding door locked
- Mercury misinterpreting Amphitryo's 'I am' as his name
- Amphitryo's violent attack on door, to which Mercury responds with ironical reference to Jupiter, threats inappropriate from slave to master ('It's the way you're going on that you will be sorry for, for the rest of your life'), insults ('you silly man', 'you owl') and lesson about how to treat doors talking down to him as if child
- Amphitryo's outrage at not being recognised by man he believes is his slave (repeated 'Who 'am' I?') and his abusive name-calling ('cat-o-nine-tails!'), bizarre alliterative expletive ('Perishing pitchforks') and threat of violence ('I'll tan your hide for this')
- Mercury's insult about Amphitryo's profligate youth leading to truly groan-worthy pun ('asking for 'harms'')
- Amphitryo's crescendo of anger with alliterative threat of ultimate violence and more name-calling ('You'll be gibbering on a gibbet very soon, you swab')
- passage ends with dregs, euphemistically (and ironically since humans normally poured them to gods) described as 'libation', being poured over Amphitryo.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[10 marks]

11 'Gods behaving badly, humans behaving well.'

To what extent do you think this is an accurate description of the play 'Amphitryo'? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the whole play.

You might include discussion of:

- the activities and motives of Jupiter and Mercury
- the behaviour of Alcmena
- Amphitryo's treatment of his wife and Sosia
- Sosia
- the ending of the play.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of eg

- Jupiter's philandering totally amoral, particularly at odds with Mercury's pseudomoralising in prologue; relishes his seduction of Alcmena and thoroughly enjoys cuckolding Amphitryo, asking Sosia to invite Blepharo to lunch precisely so that he can witness Amphitryo's total humiliation; but in the nick of time intervenes to avert tragic destruction of Amphitryo's marriage and household by coming clean what has happened, justifying these events solely by the irresistibility of his power comic inversion of gods' terrifying intervention in many myths, but still confirmation that mortals merely playthings of gods who have little concern for human suffering, etc
- Mercury joins in the pranks with enthusiasm and relish, going beyond the simple requirements of his role to bring about the maximum confusion and humiliation in Sosia and Amphitryo, showing all the cheekiness and slipperiness of a stereotypical comic slave, etc
- Amphitryo portrayed as traditional hero returning victorious from war covered in martial glory, highly prized Roman virtue, for defeat of Teleboians, yet reduced to tragic despair by domestic confusion and apparent infidelity of wife; correctly tries to seek corroboration from Naucrates before finally condemning Alcmena; at end piously accepts Jupiter's explanation, etc
- Alcmena portrayed as loving dutiful matrona who embodies Roman female ideal, impressed by accounts of military prowess, and priding herself on her chastity and particularly and appropriately outraged when this challenged by Amphitryo; nevertheless, despite Jupiter's infinite charm and chat-up skills, she might seem a bit too susceptible to blandishments and over-reliant on appearances, etc
- Sosia, the antitype of heroic valour as appropriate to a comic slave, freely admits his
 cowardice in battle and seeks to deceive Alcmena with his account of it; shows other
 stereotypical attributes of a comic slave, eg cheekiness, disobedience, so can hardly be
 said to be behaving well, but as befits his dramatic function, etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[20 marks]

Section 2

Option C

12 'The main source of comedy in the plays of Menander and Plautus is fear of the loss of dignity and property.'

To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the plays by Menander and Plautus you have read.

You might include discussion of:

- Knemon in 'Old Cantankerous'
- Philolaches, Tranio and Theopropides in 'The Ghost'
- Plesidippus, Labrax, Gripus and Daemones in 'The Rope'
- Amphitryo and Alcmena in 'Amphitryo'
- · other sources of comedy in the four plays.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of eg

'Old Cantankerous'

Knemon is extreme caricature of misanthrope who, in attempt to protect property from incursions by visitors to neighbouring shrine, comically loses all dignity in his treatment of intruders both as described to audience by Pyrrhias and seen by them in cases of Getas and Sikon; further humiliation while attempting to retrieve property from well leads to partial reformation, which continued when mocked by Getas and Sikon and eventually led into party celebrating double wedding, a happy outcome which has only been made possible by Kallipides' suspension of normal concerns about the preservation of family property, etc

'Ghost'

starting point of play, Philolaches' roistering and carousing, shows no fear of loss of property or dignity, just some mock self-pity ('And now...I'm good for nothing') – until father's return announced; main part of play reveals Theopropides, repeatedly tricked by machinations of Tranio, to be much concerned about property and dignity as is to be expected of wealthy, upright 'paterfamilias'; but in the end, to provide happy ending, quickly persuaded by Callidamates' money and 'boys will be boys' argument to pardon son, and after some delaying threats to forgive Tranio, etc

'Rope'

starting point Plesidippus' love for Palaestra and outrage that has been humiliatingly tricked by Labrax and cheated of girl whose freedom he had bought; in comic doubleact, Labrax and Charmides have lost all dignity and property as emerge bedraggled and drenched from shipwreck; Gripus, with comically exaggerated ambitions to improve his status and wealth after finding trunk, fiercely tussles with Trachalio verbally and physically in fear of the loss of both and further frustrated later by Labrax and Daemones; ending brings about appropriate restoration of property and dignity, etc

'Amphitryo'

Alcmena's succumbing to Jupiter's oleaginous charms causes near catastrophe in which Alcmena outraged by Amphitryo's attack on her virtue and he believes his honour and household have been destroyed; 'inter alia' this creates comedy through fact that audience always in on plot, much embellished by antics of Mercury and Sosia; Jupiter shows little fear of loss of dignity in his mean seduction of innocent mortal, but reasserts it anyway in 'deus ex machina' appearance at end, etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[30 marks]

Option D

How important are women both to the plots and to the comic effects of the plays of Menander and Plautus? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the plays by Menander and Plautus you have read.

You might include discussion of:

- · the Girl and Simiche in 'Old Cantankerous'
- Philematium, Scapha and Delphium in 'The Ghost'
- Palaestra, Ampelisca and Ptolemocratia in 'The Rope'
- Alcmena and Bromia in 'Amphitryo.'

Answers may include discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of eg

'Old Cantankerous'

- o plot driven by Sostratos' love at first sight for Knemon's daughter according to Pan's spell, which leads to Pyrrhias' comic description of his pelting by Knemon, incongruity of urbane Sostratos wielding mattock, Kallipides' valuing romance over economic security and agreeing to double wedding, and final celebration, appropriate to comedy, at which Knemon comically tricked and undergoes final, albeit reluctant, transformation into more civilised and socialised citizen, etc
- Simiche cause of Knemon's fall into well, which leads to start of his conversion, etc.

'Ghost'

- Philolaches' passion for Philematium, expressed metaphorically and hyperbolically as having flooded him out, rotted his beam and destroyed the edifice (alluding to male anxieties about the consequences for household of uncontrolled passion) of his character, has caused the indolence and prodigality that necessitates Tranio's trickery when Theopropides unexpectedly returns, etc
- his overhearing of Scapha's cynical comments to Philematium provide a stock comic alternative view of male-female relations while audience waits to see how Tranio's trickery will play out, etc
- Delphium has small part but provides short visual demonstration of young people's carefree drink-fuelled lifestyle, etc
- o main focus of plot is Tranio's inventiveness, ingenuity and irrepressible cheek, so that at the end, Theopropides readily forgives Philolaches' debauchery in interests of happy ending despite damage to household, etc.

'Rope'

- another example of stock comic situation in which youth falls in love at first sight
 with apparently unsuitable girl, which forms starting-point of plot; causes comedy in
 contrast between naive, gullible Plesidippus and nasty, greedy Labrax, a cartoon
 caricature of wickedness rather than a portrait of a truly evil owner and exploiter of
 sex-slaves
- Palaestra central to plot because, as well as her providing comedy in finding Ampelisca, it is her reunion with Daemones, made possible by Gripus' discovery of trunk, that enables marriage to Plesidippus to happen
- o to provide happy ending, in parallel Trachalio gets Ampelisca, who earlier provided a comic scene in her encounter with lustful Sceparnio
- Ptolemocratia has small role in helping to establish sanctity of shrine to Aphrodite that Labrax later comically attempts to violate, etc.

• 'Amphitryo'

- supernatural situation of easy seduction by Jupiter of Alcmena, caricature of
 matrona (chaste, loving, dutiful, admiring husband's military glory and about to
 produce his heir) drives plot and provides ultimate cause of much of humour –
 duping of Sosia and above all her husband Amphitryo, great military hero
 incongruously brought to verge of despair by trickery of Jupiter and Mercury and
 wife's apparent infidelity that nearly results in tragic destruction of household,
 though audience kept in on the plot, etc
- o Bromia, slave woman playing part of Messenger in tragedy, announces miraculous double-birth and its aftermath, thus preparing way for Jupiter's final appearance as 'deus ex machina' to bring about happy conclusion, etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

[30 marks]

Assessment Objectives Grid Unit 1E Menander and Plautus

Section 1

Either Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	1	-	1
02	1	-	1
03	1	-	1
04	2	-	2
05	5	5	10
06	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or **Option B**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
07	2	-	2
06	1	-	1
09	2	-	2
10	5	5	10
11	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section 2

Either Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
12	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or **Option D**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
13	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%