

A-LEVEL

CLASSICAL CIVILISATION

CIV1D Women in Athens and Rome

Mark scheme

2020
June 2014

Version/Stage: Final v 1.0

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the student uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of students after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Students are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the student's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail and has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	27-30
Level 4	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	20-26
Level 3	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	13-19
Level 2	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7-12
Level 1	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-6

This page has been left intentionally blank

Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Option A

- 01 In Passage A, in what circumstances is Ischomachus talking about his wife? Make two points.**

TWO of e.g. waiting for foreigners [1] in agora / market (allow forum) [1] in stoa / colonnade (of Zeus Eleutherios) [1] when asked by Socrates [1] why (unusually) at leisure [1] and why known as excellent [1] and explaining that wife trained / in charge of work indoors [1] etc.

(2 marks)

- 02 In Passage B, what are the circumstances in which Romulus is talking to the Sabine women? Make three points.**

THREE of e.g. no reproduction because of lack of women [1] offers of marriage rejected [1] neighbours invited to games / show (Consualia in honour of equestrian Neptune) [1] at prearranged signal [1] Roman youths seized girls [1] most beautiful for senators [1] parents ran away [1] accusing Romans of breach of laws of hospitality [1] and appealing to god [1] Romulus told girls that fathers' inflexibility to blame [1] followed by other men's blandishments [1] etc.

(3 marks)

- 03 How different is the way Ischomachus tries to win over his wife in Passage A from the way Romulus tries to win over the Sabine women in Passage B and how far are they similar? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from both passages.**

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- Ischomachus: to wife who is presented as passive, pliant and acquiescent, and whose loyalty to the firm therefore seems to be assumed, emphasises management of household for profit and power, and consequently pleasure, this will bring her; sets challenge for her to become better than him and to increase her status, but only within household, as business partner; everything in terms of her value to household, including him and children, latter being mentioned almost incidentally; no hint of emotional bond etc.
- Romulus: also stresses status, bringing material rewards but also citizen rights in public sphere, and, unlike Ischomachus who mentions children as another part of the household without reference to any emotional satisfaction they may bring, specifically emphasises procreation of children as particular joy; in this case women enraged, their devotion cannot be assumed, and so attempt to appease, largely on grounds that they cannot reverse what has taken place and so had better make the best of it; implies there is some emotional element to marriage and, unlike Ischomachus, promises kind treatment by men, but as kind of compensation etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

- 04 To what extent is the ideal Athenian woman that Ischomachus describes different from the ideal women from Roman legends that Livy describes? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from Passage A and Passage B.**

You might include discussion of:

- the different purposes Xenophon and Livy had in writing
- all of Ischomachus' account of his dealings with his wife that you have read
- Livy's version of the legends of the Sabine women
Lucretia
Cloelia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Xenophon writing a quasi-philosophical dialogue, Livy a history with moral purpose for age of Augustus etc.
- Ischomachus' wife: presented as passive, compliant and acquiescent, married young after sheltered upbringing with a few basic domestic skills so that she can be easily trained to do the bidding of the *kurios*; assigned entirely indoor role as manager of household on basis of god's differentiation of the sexes, with emphasis on her organisational skills in manner of leader bee which she is expected to deploy assertively to ensure maximum profit; obedience in all matters is expected, including wearing of high boots and make-up for fear of attracting extra-mural male interest; what makes her sexually attractive to Ischomachus and distinct from other women is her commanding supervisory position in the household and the physical fitness she gains from this role etc.
- Sabine women: valued for their reproductive capacities in service of Rome, willingness to accept that fault lay with their fathers, since had opposed Rome's destiny, and to transfer loyalty to tribe that was fated to be greatest, and bravery in intervening to prevent bloodshed between Romans and Sabines, who can therefore be used in argument (e.g. by Valerius) as examples of admirable behaviour; beauty seen as indication of suitability for marriage to elite etc.
- Lucretia: part of foundation myth of Republic, presented as *exemplum* for future generations of ideal *matrona* who first wins prize for unparalleled diligence and industriousness and then for her extreme initiative and courage in defending her chastity and honour, with awareness of her duty to both family and state and of the moral and political impact of her actions etc.
- Cloelia: with some emphasis on novelty of both her behaviour and its commemoration, presented as girl of extreme bravery, initiative, astuteness, all of which is deployed in interests of state rather than household and is so extraordinary that it is admired even by the enemy king etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

05 Who had brought Calpurnia up?

aunt / Calpurnia / Hispulla [1]

(1 mark)

06 Give two ways in which Calpurnia showed an interest in Pliny's work when she was in Rome.

TWO of e.g. (re)reads books [1] memorises them [1] solicitous when starting new case [1] happy when it ends [1] sends messengers to see how case going [1] sits behind curtain / soaks up praise when Pliny recites his work [1] sings verses (to lyre) [1] etc.

(2 marks)

07 In a letter to Calpurnius Fabatus, Pliny says Calpurnia nearly died. Who was Calpurnius Fabatus and why did Calpurnia nearly die?

grandfather [1] miscarriage / did not take care of herself when pregnant [1]

(2 marks)

08 'In Passages C and D, Pliny is more concerned about his own feelings and image than about Calpurnia.' How far do you agree? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from Passages C and D.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- both letters intended for publication rather than genuinely personal / private
- C: emphasis on importance of his duties that prevent him from being with Calpurnia; concern to create *persona* for himself as deeply, incurably caring despite public burdens; appears to be as much concerned about her moral well-being as her physical health; seeks to express a general truth rather than something directly personal ('there is an anxious suspense in not knowing about someone you love dearly'; 'typical of frightened people') and to point out a general rather paradoxical psychological state ('I see with my mind's eye exactly what it is I wish least to happen'); expectation in demand for daily letter (quite considerable from person in poor health given state of postal service) that Calpurnia should satisfy his needs, even though with some exaggeration he says this will not work 'will start worrying again as soon as I've finished the letters') etc.
- D: another attempt at expressing rather paradoxical psychological state ('I read and reread ... but that only makes my longing for you worse'; 'the pleasure is tinged with pain'); emphasis on his books, which serve as a substitute for the man himself, and on Calpurnia's longing for and devotion to Pliny, which reflects well on him and is main source of comfort; values what she does for him – her conversation and companionship, and in meantime the daily letter etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

09 'Pliny judges women only on how well they serve the interests of men.'

To what extent is this true of women other than Calpurnia in Pliny's letters? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from Pliny's letters.

You might include discussion of:

- **Calpurnia Hispulla**
- **Minicia Marcella**
- **the Helvidiae sisters**
- **Arria**
- **Fannia.**

Do not write about Calpurnia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Calpurnia Hispulla: praise for devotion to brother, upbringing of Calpurnia so that she is model wife for Pliny and worthy of male ancestors, and her influence on Pliny etc.
- Minicia Marcella: in epistolary eulogy, praised for having all qualities of *matrona* despite youth so that she reflected well on her father, whom she cheered in her final illness, and was an excellent match for her husband-not-to-be etc.
- the Helvidiae sisters: after brief expression of grief at their deaths in childbirth, laments more that their father now has only one surviving son for the continuation of the family and its reputation etc.
- Arria: in epistolary essay on theme that famed actions are not always the most noble, subordinates her courage at death with famous 'Paetus, it doesn't hurt', to give husband both example and consolation, to her devotion and stoical fortitude in caring for him when sick despite death of son, supporting him throughout the consequences of the revolt of Scribonianus and being determined to die as exemplified in her words after she recovered from head-butting a wall etc.
- Fannia: stresses her extreme devotion to husband Helvidius in opposition to emperor, her obedience to priests in caring for Vestal Virgin Junia despite the damage to her own health, what she means to Pliny himself and the example she sets not only to 'our wives' but also to men etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Section 2

Option C

10 'Useful but dangerous.'

To what extent are women portrayed like this in Athenian lawcourt speeches and Aristophanes' *Women at the Thesmophoria*? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from these sources.

You might include discussion of:

- Apollodorus' speech against Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano
- the poisoning trial
- Euphiletus' defence speech
- the speech about Ciron's daughter
- the various ways in which women are portrayed in *Women at the Thesmophoria*.

Do not write about Ischomachus.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- *In Neaeram*: Apollodorus categorises women in terms of their usefulness and emphasises dangerous consequences if roles confused by acquitting Neaera, though portrays jurors' wives themselves as usefully berating husbands if they acquit Neaera; Phano allegedly used by Stephanus as means to political and social advancement; Phano's divorce by Phrastor due to danger promiscuous and illegitimate wife posed to *oikos*, but temporary acceptance of her son shows usefulness in providing heir, a need that is later properly satisfied by marriage to uncontroversial Athenian woman; Phano's marriage to Theogenes shows usefulness of women in performing important religious functions, but dangers to whole *polis* if not legitimate etc.
- poisoning trial emphasises extreme danger posed by disgruntled wife who is scheming and villainous, which could be emphasised by allusion to myth (Clytemnestra) reflecting this male anxiety etc.
- Euphiletus expresses difficulty in managing a new wife – she needs watching to avoid danger, but not so closely as to create a dangerous situation – and shows that even when she has demonstrated her usefulness by producing heir so that she might be trusted to display further usefulness in managing the *oikos*, she is still dangerously susceptible to the charms of a seducer causing threat to both *oikos* and *polis*; his comments on laws concerning adultery show male fear of danger of wife transferring affection to seducer etc.
- speech about Ciron's daughter all about usefulness of women in establishing legitimate line of succession on which citizenship and inheritance based etc.
- in reality women's performance of Thesmophoria of vital importance to Athens' prosperity in ensuring fertility, but Aristophanes inverts this to portray women as stereotypically bent on revenge against Euripides for portraying their dangerousness and misusing male democratic procedures to achieve this evil end; initial hymn includes curses on those who betray women (e.g. seducer who does not hand over promised gifts, barman who serves short measure) implying male anxieties about women's dangerous predilection for sex and alcohol true; Mica's speech does not demonstrate Euripides' supposed allegations false, but they have increased husbands' suspicions and so curtailed wives' activities; her attack on Mnesilochus more because of moral weakness he is revealing than its falsehood; women cannot deny

Mnesilochus' guesses that women drank excessively at previous Thesmophoria; their addiction to alcohol further demonstrated in scene with Mica's 'baby' parodying *Telephus*; at end of play women quickly and inconsistently accept Euripides' deal, implying there is much more he could reveal about their dangerous and subversive behaviour etc.

- in *parabasis* women defend themselves, mainly with reference to fictitious women apart from apparently well-known whore Salabaccho, and urge that women be honoured in accordance with usefulness of sons' service to Athens etc.
- absurdity of central premise of plot shown by choice of *Helen* and *Andromeda* to parody, in which heroines not villains but victims etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

- 11 'Between the war against Hannibal and the end of the 1st century BC, Roman men thought that women's behaviour became shockingly bad.'

To what extent do the Roman sources you have studied about this period support this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the sources.

You might include discussion of:

- the nature of the sources
- the speeches of Cato and Valerius
- Cornelia
- Clodia
- Sempronia
- Turia
- Murdia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- debate about repeal of Oppian Law shortly after Second Punic War dramatised by Livy with 2 speeches that present each side of argument; Cato outraged by women's independence in staging protest, believing in accordance with tradition women should not conduct any business without guardian and should not meddle in public affairs, fearing their desire to dominate and extravagance, and claiming law necessary to curb female instincts because husbands could not otherwise do it; Valerius wins debate by praising occasions on which women have acted independently in a crisis for benefit of state including in war with Hannibal; agrees with Cato that women should not normally act independently in the male world but argues that women have lived for centuries to highest standards without legal compulsion, women enjoy being under men's control, which should be based on respect and authority rather than mastery, and women's intervention in the present situation justified rather than shocking because it affects them directly etc.
- Sempronia presented by Sallust in moralising historical monograph on Catilinarian Conspiracy in 1st cent. BC as example of moral decline that had contributed to conspiracy; despite her good family and some praiseworthy talents, in the light of which her misbehaviour is all the more shocking, she is criticised for the linked failings of extravagance and promiscuousness which led her into crime and 'masculine boldness' etc.

- Clodia portrayed maliciously by Cicero in forensic speech in 1st cent. BC in order to obscure dubious activities of client Caelius and get revenge on political enemy Clodius; by adopting theatrical *personae* to entertain jury on holiday, gives two alternative negative views of Clodia; as authoritarian Appius Claudius Caecus, portrays her behaviour as truly shocking bringing dishonour on family by abusing all his achievements for her sordid purposes because unconstrained by example of forebears; as liberal or lax Clodius (with whom alleged to have had incestuous relationship), depicted as perversely persisting in pursuing lover who rejected her etc.
- Cornelia: daughter of Scipio who had defeated Hannibal, publicly commemorated with statue inscribed 'Mother of the Gracchi' and praised in biographies about sons Tiberius and Gaius by Plutarch; despite their controversial revolutionary careers as tribunes, Cornelia was remembered as the perfect *matrona* who proved herself worthy of husband's sacrifice by educating sons, refusing remarriage, showing stoical endurance and, urging Gaius to show political restraint (if letter genuine) etc.
- Turia: in eulogy referring to exceptional circumstances of civil wars in later 1st cent. BC (and with some concern to demonstrate political correctness under Augustus' regime), praised for extreme devotion to family (prosecuted parents' murderers, ensured father's will upheld, arranged dowries for females etc.) and husband (hid him from political opponents, ensured well-being in exile, endured brutish treatment by Lepidus, defended home against Milo, offered divorce when infertile etc.); length of their marriage said to have been exceptional for the time etc.
- Murdia: in fragmentary eulogy praised for judiciousness in legacies etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid**Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome****Section 1****Either
Option A**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	2	-	2
02	3	-	3
03	5	5	10
04	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

**Or
Option B**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
05	1	-	1
06	2	-	2
07	2	-	2
08	5	5	10
09	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section 2**Either
Option C**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
10	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

**Or
Option D**

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
11	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%