



**General Certificate of Education
January 2011**

Classical Civilisation 1020

CIV1B Athenian Democracy

AS Unit CIV1B

Final

Mark Scheme

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the candidate uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of candidates after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Candidates are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the candidate's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen, accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which• has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus,• responds to the precise terms of the question,• effectively links comment to detail,• has a clear structure• reaches a reasoned conclusion• is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and• makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate, accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus,is broadly appropriate to the question,mainly supports comment with detail andhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen, accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structurereaches a reasoned conclusionis clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language andmakes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	27-30
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate, accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detailhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	20-26
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	13-19
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	7-12
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-6

This page has been left intentionally blank

Mark Scheme
Unit 1B Athenian Democracy

Section One

Option A

01 Before Solon's reforms, which class used to have all the power in Athens?

nobles / well-born / Eupatridae [1]

(1 mark)

02 For what reasons had the Athenians chosen Solon, rather than anyone else, to draw up a new constitution? Make three points.

THREE of e.g. had reputation for iron will / determination [1] as war hero [1] and as mediator / man of justice [1] because in poetry (at public recitations or aristocratic *symposia*) [1] championed both sides equally [1] criticizing greed of rich [1] but describing poor as 'worthless' / not deserving equality with rich / needing to be kept in check / who would follow leaders best if neither too free nor too restrained [1] one of leading men / Eupatridae by birth [1] but 'middle class' / moderate in wealth [1] which said to have acquired through trade [1] and said to have travelled widely [1] so likely to understand all interest groups in Attica [1] but cautious / conservative / aiming at compromise to keep nobles in power [1] to achieve *eunomia* / good order [1] and remove threat of tyranny [1] etc.

(3 marks)

03 What did Solon do after he carried out his reforms?

left Athens / Attica / went abroad / travelled (to Egypt) [1]

(1 mark)

04 How important was Solon's ban on loans on the security of a person's freedom? Give the reasons for your views.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- crisis in Attica because of poverty caused by poor land / harvests; all land under control of nobles; *hektemoroi* / sixth-parters had to pay one-sixth of produce to landlord; failure to repay debts led to slavery because all loans *epi somati* / on security of person etc.
- banning *epi somati* loans both for the future and retrospectively gave fresh start economically to poor; peasants owned land outright; established principle that no Athenian citizen could legally be compelled to work for another and fundamental right that citizenship could not be removed because of economic hardship; established clear distinction between status of slaves and citizens; provided basis for creation of new classes and right of *thetes* to attend *ekklesia* etc.
- *seisachtheia* included abolition of *hektemoroi* and removal of humiliating *horoi* (mortgage stones) and apparently bringing / allowing back those who had been sold / fled abroad because of debt, but ? this exacerbated problem etc.
- other economic measures e.g. banning export of agricultural produce except olive oil etc.
- went some way to eliminating grievances of poor but did not address underlying economic problems because did not redistribute land as peasants had demanded so only temporary alleviation; perhaps loans more difficult to secure because poor had no other collateral; so conditions in which tyranny could emerge not removed etc.
- also angered rich etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

05 **'Solon's reforms gave the Athenians equality before the law but not political equality.'**
To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- **third-party redress**
- **the right of appeal**
- **changes to the laws and how Solon publicised them**
- **changes to the classes**
- **archons, Areopagos and assembly (ekklesia)**
- **what Solon did not change.**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- introduction of third-party redress enabled any citizen who wanted to take legal action on behalf of someone who had been wronged / to prosecute crimes affecting the community and so made justice a *polis* matter rather than a purely personal one, gave more protection to weak and made possible greater access to judicial process for poor (Plutarch 'accustomed citizens to understand and sympathise with one another as parts of one body') etc.
- introduction of right of appeal against decision of archon established principles of trial in front of peers, of checking officials' power, that magistrates not infallible and could be held to account in front of people in *heliaia* (*ekklesia* sitting as jury court) so poor potentially had some say in legal process and some redress against officials of higher class, even if limited etc.
- abolished Draco's law code because of its severity apart from law on homicide and replaced it with fairer, less arbitrary laws with punishments more fitted to crime; new laws displayed publicly in agora on *axons / kurbeis* so all who could read had direct access to laws themselves and less at mercy of whims of magistrates etc.
- creation of timocratic wealth-based classes established principle that all citizens should have some say in running of state in accordance with their wealth; those eligible for archonship and Areopagos now a slightly wider group (*pentakosiomedimnoi*); right of all citizens, including *thetes*, to attend *ekklesia* confirmed and guaranteed etc.
- main power remained with nobles, who probably made up most of *pentakosiomedimnoi*, and who still exerted their influence over poor by means of clans and Ionic tribes, which Solon did not change; Areopagos, made up of ex-archons serving for life, retained wide undefined power as guardian of the constitution etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

06 **How many citizens served on the Council (Boule) as a whole each year?**

500 [1]

(1 mark)

07 **By what method were citizens selected to serve on the Council (Boule)?**

lot / sortition [1]

(1 mark)

08 Which citizens were not allowed to serve on the Council (Boule)? Make two points.

TWO of e.g. not *thetes* [1] not under 30 [1] not those who served in year immediately before [1] not those who had already served twice [1] Give credit for women only if specified as wives or legitimate.

(2 marks)

09 Give one complaint this author makes about Athenian democracy apart from what he says in the passage.

prefers interests of mob to those of respectable people / lawless / gives slaves too much freedom etc.

(1 mark)

10 How important a part did the Council (Boule) play in the Athenian democracy? Give the reasons for your views.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- represented cross-section of Attica
- met daily
- set agenda for assembly (*ekklesia*), chaired by *epistates* of *prytaneis*, and ensured assembly's decisions carried out – major role in ensuring efficiency and effectiveness of democratic decision-making process
- received heralds / ambassadors – important in foreign relations
- had limited judicial functions but far less important than *dikasteria*
- conducted investigations into conduct of most officials (subject to appeal to *dikasterion*) – important role in ensuring accountability
- approved suitability of following year's *bouleutai* and archons
- in charge of triremes, on which Athens' power depended
- inspected all public buildings
- reviewed cavalry and disabled
- received tribute, major source of Athens' income
- reviewed those registered as citizens by demes, so important role in regulating citizen body
- each tribal group of 50 *bouleutai* took on special responsibility for one month; ate together in *tholos* in Agora so always available
- perhaps issues of experience / continuity, but minimum age requirement etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

11 What, in your opinion, were the strengths and weaknesses of the assembly (*ekklesia*) in making political decisions? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- **where meetings were held**
- **who attended**
- **the agenda**
- **how meetings were organised and how order was kept**
- **who spoke**
- **how decisions were made**
- **prosecution for an illegal proposal (*graphe paranomon*).**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- meetings in open air on Pnyx; speakers needed to be strong; meetings abandoned in bad weather causing discontinuity in debate; central location encouraged participation, though coming from outlying *demes* more problematic etc.
- all citizens over 18 (or 20) eligible to attend, though perhaps more difficult for poorer, more distant farmers; Pnyx seems to have been designed for c.6000 participants (percentage of *demos*?); red rope to encourage attendance; no pay till c.400 BC etc.
- agenda decided and published by *Boule* (but apparently preliminary vote whether *Boule*'s motion should be put to assembly); motion might not be specific proposal but simply indicate topic to be discussed; assembly could pass motion requiring *Boule* to put particular item on next meeting's agenda; some items compulsory at particular meetings; regular schedule of meetings but emergency sessions possible; assembly always had final decision; no evidence of any conflict between assembly and *Boule*; *Boule* might be seen as sub-committee of assembly etc.
- *epistates* chosen by lot for day from *prytaneis* – impartial but risk of incompetence, though no evidence for latter; otherwise order kept by herald and Scythian slaves; religious context with purification / prayers by priests at start; all entitled to speak as invited to do so by herald; wore garland while speaking; educated rich more likely to speak; expected to keep to single subject at a time, presumably controlled by (dis)approval of listeners; fears that uneducated audience susceptible to misleading rhetorical persuasion etc.
- secret voting (black and white pebbles) only for most serious issues (e.g. *atimia*); voting normally by show of hands so open to influence / pressure etc.
- *graphe paranomon*: alleged illegal proposal suspended even if passed by assembly; provided time for reflection; final decision in *dikasteria* (relatively large sub-group of potential members of assembly) where voting secret; potential tool for political manipulation etc.
- views of sources and references to particular examples, but neither are required.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Section Two

Option C

12 **How important for the development of Athenian democracy was the period from 510 to 480 BC? Give the reasons for your views.**

You might include discussion of

- **the consequences of the expulsion of Hippias**
- **the changes Cleisthenes made to the demes, tribes, Council (*Boule*) and generals (*stratego*i)**
- **the first uses of ostracism**
- **the significance of the creation of the fleet and the battle of Salamis.**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- severity of Hippias' last four years as tyrant left lasting hostility in all sections of *demos* towards monarchical rule, which democracy would prevent etc.; Cleisthenes used support of people to thwart Isagoras; when Isagoras retaliated by calling in Cleomenes, people took decisive action to oppose Isagoras and abolition of Council by besieging Cleomenes and Isagoras on Acropolis and ensuring recall of Cleisthenes etc.
- Cleisthenes' reorganisation of demes minimised aristocratic patronage and power over

phratries and hence citizenship since citizenship guaranteed by membership of deme, supervised by demarch, appointed annually and therefore accountable; demes provided local government so influence of nobles over local affairs reduced; local assemblies and other institutions provided opportunities for political experience by wider range of citizens, who would therefore have greater confidence and expertise in participating at *polis* level, reducing noble power nationally etc.

- formation of 10 new tribes based on demes, allocated by means of groupings in *trittues*, broke power of clans and old Ionic tribes; new cults and military functions increased cohesion of new tribes, loyalty of which to *polis* rather than local aristocrats; treated Attica as single political entity; made it very difficult for an individual to seize power etc.
- Council (*Boule*) of 500, based on new tribes, open to all over 30 except *thetes*; annual appointment by lot with maximum service of two, not consecutive years, to encourage / enable widespread participation; importance of *prytaneis* (if set up by Cleisthenes); major task of *Boule* to set agenda for assembly and so increased its importance as decision-making body which all citizens eligible to attend etc.
- generals (*strategoí*), elected annually one per tribe, of increasing importance as Athenian overseas influence increased and directly accountable to people etc.
- ostracism gave potential each year for one political leader to be exiled for 10 years by vote of people subject to quorum of 6000; weapon against tyranny and factional infighting; clear demonstration of people's control over leaders; apparently not used successfully until 487 BC when greater confidence among people, especially *zeugitai*, after victory at Marathon and suspicion of aristocratic support for Persians – Hipparchus (relative of Peisistratus) 487, Megacles and another supporter of tyrants 486 and 485, Xanthippus (Alcmaeonid not connected to tyrants) 484, Aristides (? because of conflict with Themistocles over use of silver for fleet) 482 etc.
- archons still from *pentakosiomedimnoi* (and ? *hippeis*) but from 487 BC selected by lot, reflecting and/or increasing shift of power to *strategoí* etc.
- fleet, created on Themistocles' proposal 483, and rowed predominantly by *thetes*, defeated Persians at Salamis, setting scene for formation of Delian League and Athenian Empire, with Athenian foreign policy and wealth dependant upon *thetes* who therefore, as Old Oligarch concedes, were justified in exercising power by means of the democracy etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

- 13 **'In *Wasps*, Aristophanes makes as much fun of ordinary Athenians as he does of Athens' leaders.'**

To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the play.

You might include discussion of

- **the conversation Sosias and Xanthias have with the audience at the beginning of the play**
- **what Bdelycleon and the chorus say about Cleon and other political leaders**
- **the trial**
- **the preparations for the drinking party and its outcome**
- **the behaviour of Philocleon throughout the play**
- **the characterisation of the chorus.**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- main characters named in relation to Cleon though Xanthias says Aristophanes will not make mincemeat of him in this play and in argument with Philocleon Bdelycleon refers to gang of demagogues rather than Cleon in particular; however, the odious absurd caricature in Sosias' dream clearly refers to Cleon with its reference to stock joke of tanning, insults later picked up by chorus in *parabasis* ('camel's arse and stinking unwashed balls'); allegations of corruption and insinuations of foreign birth standard features of Athenian political invective etc.
- jokes at expense of other leaders e.g. Theorus' sycophancy with image of him as scavenging raven, mimicry of Alcibiades' lisp / lambdacisms, Amynias and his diplomatic mission to Thessaly, Cleonymus dropping shield etc.
- in trial, Dog from Cydathenaeum = Cleon accusing another dog Labes = Laches on immoral grounds that did not share stolen cheese; some suggestion this refers to an actual trial but no clear evidence; absurd clowning parody of rigmarole of judicial procedure, with Philocleon easily gulled etc.
- in preparation for drinking party, mockery of the pretensions and taste for exotic foreign (even enemy) luxuries of the rich, in whose refined company reclines the previously loathsomely described Cleon and cronies etc.
- comic exaggeration of Philocleon's ludicrously obsessive vindictiveness in courts; comic reversals from vicious juror to gullible buffoon acquitting dog as result of pseudo-emotional appeal and then to anti-social, binge-drinking and sex-crazed reveller, a peasant gone wild who anarchically threatens to destroy both upper-class decorum and the democratic rule of law etc.
- chorus also an exaggerated caricature of old farmers whose glory days at Marathon are long since past, concerned not with justice but only the pay and anything else they can get, obsessed with securing a guilty verdict, in the thrall of Cleon and easily fooled despite their belief in their own alertness etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid
Unit 1B Athenian Democracy

Section 1

Either
Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	1	-	1
02	3	-	3
03	1	-	1
04	5	5	10
05	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or
Option B

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
06	1	-	1
07	1	-	1
08	2	-	2
09	1	-	1
10	5	5	10
11	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section Two

Either
Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
12	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or
Option D

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
13	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%