



**General Certificate of Education
June 2010**

Classical Civilisation 1021

Women in Athens and Rome

AS Unit CIV1D

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2010 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the candidate uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of candidates after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Candidates are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the candidate's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which• has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus,• responds to the precise terms of the question,• effectively links comment to detail,• has a clear structure• reaches a reasoned conclusion• is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and• makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus,is broadly appropriate to the question,mainly supports comment with detail andhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	27-30
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	20-26
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	13-19
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7-12
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-6

Mark Scheme

Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

SECTION ONE

Option A

- 01 How had Mnesilochus got into his 'hopeless plight' (line 12)? Make three points.**

THREE of e.g. after Agathon's refusal [1] disguised as a woman [1] infiltrated Thesmophoria [1] to speak in Euripides' defence [1] because women plotting his death [1] because of his (alleged) slanders [1] but women offended by Mnesilochus' speech [1] warned (by Cleisthenes) that Euripides had sent a man in disguise [1] uncover Mnesilochus [1] despite his protestations [1] and keep him under guard (by Mica) [1] etc.

(3 marks)

- 02 How does Euripides finally rescue Mnesilochus? Make two points.**

TWO of e.g. promises women never to slander them again [1] dresses up as old woman [1] distracts Scythian with dancing girl [1] unties Mnesilochus [1] etc.

(2 marks)

- 03 To what extent does parody of Euripides' plays contribute to the comedy of Mnesilochus' rescue both in the passage and later in Women at the Thesmophoria?**

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- passage: parody of *Palamedes* (415 BC) in which Palamedes executed (as Euripides ridiculously threatened and Mnesilochus now about to be) through false accusation by Odysseus and unfair trial (as ludicrously Euripides / Mnesilochus by women); before execution in Euripides' improbable version Palamedes ingeniously sent message to brother on oar-blades thrown into sea (here votive tablets laughably scattered on Pnyx); Mnesilochus' song perhaps parody of specific passage but more likely mocking banality of Euripides' lyrics in general; ineffective in its aim and does not bring the revenge that occurred in the tragedy etc.
- parody of *Helen* (412 BC), a play which does not sustain a tragic tone throughout in the original: adaptations from Helen's opening monologue with vulgar insertions ('dark-clogged'), conversation between Menelaus (Euripides) and palace door-keeper (Crytilla, who does not realise she is supposed to be acting out a part in a play and takes everything literally) and recognition scene (absurdity of aged Mnesilochus as beautiful Helen, mixture of quotations and general tragic diction); again a failure in its outcome etc.
- parody of *Andromeda* (412 BC): ridiculous use of *mechane* a device perhaps invented for descent of gods / flight of heroes in Euripides' plays; absurdity of aged Mnesilochus as beautiful virgin, coarsely exploited by Scythian like Crytilla not realising he is acting a part in a play; adaptation of Andromeda's lament to chorus with comic insertions which apply only to situation of Mnesilochus; role of Echo; Euripides' parody of a monologue by Perseus including quotation, pastiche and incongruous comic coarseness; again ineffective in securing Mnesilochus' release etc.
- in both latter plays Euripides presented main female character as virtuous, so Aristophanes' use of them here points up the absurdity of the women's alleged grievance against Euripides etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

04 How far does Aristophanes portray women as 'everything dire in life' (line 20) in *Women at the Thesmophoria*? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- *their attitude towards Euripides*
- *the opening of the meeting at the Thesmophoria*
- *the speeches at the meeting*
- *the women's reaction to Mnesilochus' speech*
- *the scene with Mica's 'baby'*
- *the views which the Chorus-leader puts forward after the passage*
- *the prayers and hymns of the Chorus.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- implausible starting-point of plot is women's alleged desire for retribution in retaliation for their alleged vilification by Euripides; their alleged plotting his death parallels notorious female monsters in myth / tragedy, picked up by Mica's speech later (cf. portrayal of wife in poisoning trial) but not those Aristophanes chooses to parody later in play etc.
- much of portrayal depends on stereotypes and stock jokes e.g. Mnesilochus' 1st prayer that imaginary daughter finds 'rich-but-dim husband'
- rituals of Thesmophoria secret so opening of meeting parodies opening of Assembly also held on Pnyx with incongruity of women mimicking men; high tone of invocations to gods subverted by concerns about adultery, childbirth, legitimacy and alcohol, standard jokes about women reflecting male anxieties about female propensity to undermine *oikos* and male honour etc.
- Mica's speech, not declaring women's innocence but condemning Euripides for making it more difficult for them to get away with their deceits, followed by Mnesilochus' speech confirming women's duplicity and mendacity and the women's outraged response and the vicious altercation in which Mnesilochus' crime is not falsification but admitting female misdemeanours etc.
- Mica's prurient interest in Mnesilochus' phallus and distress at Mnesilochus' 'sacrifice' of her 'baby', a wineskin (parody of *Telephus*)
- Chorus-leader's defence of women accusing men of voyeurism and comparing women favourably with some individual men (lampooning of contemporaries a regular feature of Aristophanes' comedies) etc.
- Critylla's stupidity in taking parody of *Helen* literally (women possibly not present at performance of tragedy – their hatred of Euripides has been mainly presented as stemming from their husbands' reaction to watching Euripides' plays, not from what they have seen themselves) and as with Scythian in *Andromeda* parody joke functions to bond together male citizen audience by exclusion of outsiders (women, slaves)
- Euripides' sympathetic portrayal of Helen and Andromeda in contrast to Aristophanes' more misogynistic one etc.
- spectacle of the prayers and dances to various divinities, breaking up the parodies into separate sections, appropriate to a religious festival (but not specifically Thesmophoria or Dionysia)
- speed with which women do deal with Euripides to finish play at appropriate length, parodying Euripides' plays in which catastrophe averted at the last moment by surprise intervention etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

05 Give two of the restrictions which the Oppian Law had imposed on Roman women when Hannibal was 'close to the city' (lines 13-14).

TWO of: limited gold women could wear (half an ounce) [1] prohibited them from wearing purple / multi-coloured dresses [1] forbade riding in carriage in / within 1 mile of city (unless at religious festival) [1]

(2 marks)

06 In what circumstances was the Oppian Law repealed? Give three details.

THREE of e.g. had been in force for 20 years [1] 10 years after defeat of Hannibal [1] (2) tribunes brought in motion to repeal law [1] opposed by (2) other tribunes [1] women blockaded streets / entrance to Forum [1] lobbied men coming into Forum / solicited officials/ consuls / praetors [1] (argued they should have their luxuries back) as republic prospering [1] debate between senator / consul (Cato) who supported retention of law and tribune (Valerius) who advocated its repeal [1] reference to Valerius' argument [1] etc.

(3 marks)

07 'Poverty made Latin women chaste in the old days, hard work and a short time to sleep and hands calloused and hardened in wool-working' (lines 12-13). How closely does Livy's version of the Lucretia legend match this opinion? Give the reasons for your views.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- none of characters in legend poor but members of royal family etc.
- Lucretia wins competition because does continue wool-working late into night giving her short time to sleep, but other wives dining etc.
- Livy does not imply Lucretia disfigured by her industriousness but does not make clear whether Sextus Tarquinius' lust aroused by her beauty, her virtue, a desire for revenge or a combination of these etc.
- Lucretia's qualities go beyond chastity and industry and include hospitality, courage, determination, honesty, dutifulness to her family and concern for the future well-being of Rome etc.
- Lucretia's chastity does not stem from the lack of opportunity caused by poverty and the necessity for hard work (Juvenal's cynical implication in passage), but from nobility of character, taking her to extreme lengths in her resistance to Tarquinius and in determination to commit suicide and ensure Tarquinius' punishment despite protestations of husband and father etc.
- whereas Juvenal, in an exaggeratedly misogynistic rant designed to deter his recipient from marriage, portrays men as victims of female lust and duplicity, Livy portrays Lucretia as the victim of male (royal) lust and duplicity as part of the foundation myth of the Republic etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

08 During the Roman Republic, to what extent were women criticised, or praised, for acting like men? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- **the nature of the evidence**
- **Cloelia**
- **the repeal of the Oppian Law**
- **Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi**
- **Turia**
- **Murdia**
- **Sempronia.**

Do not discuss the women Pliny writes about.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Cloelia: moral basis to *History* so legends of women recorded with a view to their value as *exempla* – Cloelia, despite youth, admired for her initiative and courage, ‘new in a woman’, and commemorated by equestrian statue, but only because outcome was in interests of Rome etc.
- repeal of Oppian law: Livy recreates debate with just two opposing speeches which may be worked up from actual speeches or may be dramatic inventions by Livy to present views relevant to discussions of own time under Augustus which, by our standards, are not opposites etc.; Cato outraged by women’s meddling in public affairs, in his view the province of men, and advocates return to strict control of women confined to domestic sphere as he believes existed at start of Republic; Valerius concedes that women have intervened in public during several crises for the good of the state, and legitimate for them to do so now because issue that directly affects them, but paucity and exceptional nature of occasions cited reinforces a view of the abnormality of women behaving like men and believes men should still control women, allowing them luxuries in dress which is their proper area for honour distinct from that of men etc.
- Cornelia: the epitome of the ideal *matrona*, highly praised for her rearing of sons, advice in possibly spurious letter, endurance and fortitude after deaths of husband and sons, refusal to marry Ptolemy, patronage of Greek culture etc.; independent but at all times knowing her proper place and upholding the values of her family and Rome etc.
- Turia: highly praised for her manly courage, initiative, independence in her husband’s and family’s interests necessitated by exceptional circumstances of their marriage during civil war in exceptionally long eulogy which mentions only briefly her domestic qualities because of political as well as personal motives of husband in recording it etc.
- Murdia: praised for sensible judgements in allocating her legacy (given credit for a level of independence which Livy’s Cato believed women should be denied) and tantalising reference to courage in times of danger, but fragmentary nature of eulogy makes interpretation difficult etc.
- Sempronia: seen by Sallust as symptom of Rome’s moral decline; criticised for misusing her natural advantages, behaving as a male sexual predator and becoming involved in Catiline’s revolution etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

SECTION TWO

Option C

- 09 ***Judging from the lawcourt speeches you have read, to what extent do you think Roman wives had greater freedom than Athenian wives? Give the reasons for your views.***

You might include discussion of

- ***Athenian laws relating to marriage, adultery and rape***
- ***Euphiletus' speech***
- ***the poisoning trial***
- ***the speech about Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano***
- ***the speech about the legitimacy of Ciron's daughter***
- ***Cicero's speech about Clodia.***

Do not write about the Oppian Law debate or about other women who are not involved in a legal case.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Athenian laws: adultery restricted by severe penalties – possible death for adulterer, certain divorce for wife, or *atimia* for husband; adulteress banned from public sacrifices with threat of any punishment short of death if disobeyed; Euphiletus portrayed adultery as crime against whole *polis* and himself as protector of *polis* – rhetorical but presumably plausible; emphasis on legitimacy increased by Pericles' Citizenship Law; fear of disgrace in society dominated by code of honour etc.
- Euphiletus has taken wife into his *oikos*, claims to have guarded her initially as is proper and only relaxed when son born, at which point gave her more trust, control of his property and abnormal domestic arrangements; speech implies wife generally secluded, identifying funeral as specific occasion on which Eratosthenes first saw wife and maid as only means of communication between lovers, though Euphiletus readily accepts her explanation for leaving the house at night and clear he is away from home from time to time and no apparent shame involved in her allegation that he was mauling the maid etc.
- poisoning trial: wife exploited concubine's freedom of movement to carry out alleged murder etc.
- Apollodorus, in highly rhetorical ending to speech, makes clear distinction between wives for the procreation of legitimate children and to be faithful guardians of the *oikos* and other women for pleasure and puts forward (male) view that respectable women took pride in their guarded status which they would not want men to undermine; taken for granted that Stephanus arranges Phano's marriages to suit his interests and seen as quite reasonable that Phrastor and Theogenes divorce Phano when she does not suit theirs etc.
- the speech about Ciron's daughter emphasises the importance of the woman in questions of legitimacy and of being able to provide evidence and witnesses in cases of dispute etc.
- Cicero's speech about Clodia assumes it is quite proper for Roman wives to have considerable independence and freedom of movement and association; criticisms whether in his own voice or in his impersonations of Appius Claudius Caecus or brother Clodius are based on her misuse of her freedom and failure to live up to the standards of her ancestors and husband or conform to the virtues of the ideal *matrona* etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

10 ***To what extent was Pliny's attitude towards women different from that of the Athenian Ischomachus? Give the reasons for your views.***

You might include discussion of

- ***the nature of the evidence***
- ***Pliny's attitudes and feelings when writing to or about his wife Calpurnia***
- ***Pliny's attitude towards Minicia Marcella, the Helvidiae sisters, Arria and Fannia and his reasons for writing about these women***
- ***Ischomachus' relationship with his wife, his expectations and anxieties***
- ***Ischomachus' views about the different characteristics and roles of women.***

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Ischomachus: imaginary dialogue with Socrates by Xenophon in which Socrates has asked reasons for reputation for excellence, so likely Ischomachus' version was ideal etc.
- Pliny's letters, personal in appearance, intended for publication to create appropriate image of himself and/or flatter recipient; each has literary style, clear theme and often moral point, which Pliny emphasises to reader etc.
- Pliny's feelings / attitudes towards Calpurnia: concern for physical and moral well-being when apart; misses her companionship (allusions to love poetry in his description of his loneliness); in sending her to Campania, Pliny allows his wife far more freedom than Ischomachus does and does not imply Calpurnia as central to economic prosperity of household as Ischomachus' wife, but his absences on business similar to Ischomachus' etc.; to Calpurnia Hispulla Pliny refers briefly to Calpurnia's chastity, modesty and frugality (whereas Ischomachus in response to Socrates' questions focuses almost exclusively on management of *oikos*) but main emphasis on Calpurnia's devotion to his glory, interest in his legal career and literary pursuits and companionship; major element of letter is praise of aunt for her upbringing of Calpurnia, whereas Ischomachus takes credit for wife's training etc.; to grandfather Pliny writes with less warmth emphasising continuation of family line and achievement of glory in public life whereas in context of discussion with Socrates procreation of heirs mentioned only in passing and seen as securing care in old age etc.
- as appropriate in discussion with Socrates, Ischomachus justifies his treatment of young bride with practical arguments based on her naivety / seclusion and theoretical ones based on his view of divine distribution of different qualities and hence different roles to men and women, with analogy of leader bee particularly emphasising wife's supervisory, managerial, authoritative role; lengthy but rather oblique justification of his opposition to her attracting the gaze of other males by wearing make-up and high boots, but open about differences between sex with wife and sex with slaves; overall approach paternalistic, tone patronising etc.
- Pliny praises Minicia Marcella for exhibiting, though a child and having the charms of a child, the matronly qualities of decorum and wisdom, embodying her father's and Pliny's values; he praises Arria and Fannia for Stoic self-sacrificing devotion to husband and family in extreme circumstances which he accepts require independence, initiative and courage all of which went way beyond Ischomachus' experience and expectations etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid

Unit 1

Option D Women in Athens and Rome

SECTION ONE

Either

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	3	-	3
02	2	-	2
03	5	5	10
04	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
05	2	-	2
06	3	-	3
07	5	5	10
08	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

SECTION TWO

Either

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
09	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
10	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%