



General Certificate of Education

Classical Civilisation 2020

CIV1D Women in Athens and Rome

Mark Scheme

2010 examination - January series

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the candidate uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of candidates after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Candidates are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the candidate's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which• has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus,• responds to the precise terms of the question,• effectively links comment to detail,• has a clear structure• reaches a reasoned conclusion• is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and• makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus,is broadly appropriate to the question,mainly supports comment with detail andhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	27-30
Level 4	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	20-26
Level 3	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	13-19
Level 2	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7-12
Level 1	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, 	1-6

punctuation and grammar.

Mark Scheme

Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

SECTION ONE

- 111** *'I thought of persuading Agathon to go to the Thesmophoria' (line 15). What reason does Agathon later give for not going to the Thesmophoria? Make one point.*

no reason to stand up for Euripides / one must cope with own troubles / women hate him even more / it would be even more dangerous for him / they think he takes away their nocturnal trade / he pretends to be a woman / fears women's wrath [1]

(1 mark)

- 112** *Who is later disguised as a woman instead of Agathon?*

Mnesilochus [1]

(1 mark)

- 113** *In what way does Agathon help to disguise this person? Give one detail.*

lends clothes / (yellow / smelly) dress / wig / shawl / shoes [1]

(1 mark)

- 114** *Give two other ways in which Euripides changes this person's appearance.*

TWO of: shaving (beard) [1] and further detail [1] and/or singeing (pubic / body hair) [1] and further detail [1] tells him to put on a feminine voice [1]

(2 marks)

- 120** *How important was the festival of the Thesmophoria both to Athenian women and to the city as a whole? Give the reasons for your views.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- restricted to women of unblemished reputation who were wives of Athenian citizens; so attendance could be used as in speech about Ciron's daughter to demonstrate a woman had these qualities and resolve dispute about legitimacy / inheritance; slaves / metics and all males excluded etc.
- restrictions on women eligible to attend emphasised festival's importance to Athenians etc.
- lasted 3 days in honour of Demeter and Persephone; valued break from domestic activities
- central to well-being / fertility of state; held at crucial time in agricultural year / autumn ploughing / sowing
- held in central Athens on Pnyx, hill where political Assembly met; women's husbands paid for expenses
- included strange, ancient rituals which were kept secret; details of these as far as known, including central day of fasting on which Aristophanes' parody takes place etc.

- Aristophanes' light-hearted parody does not undermine its importance but rather, in line with his comic inversion elsewhere, serves to emphasise it etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

- 130 **'In *Women at the Thesmophoria* tragedy is a more important source of humour than either women or religion.'** To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- *the passage*
- *Aristophanes' portrayal of Agathon and Euripides in the rest of the comedy*
- *the use Aristophanes makes of Euripides' plays elsewhere in the comedy*
- *the portrayal of women*
- *what happens during the festival in *Women at the Thesmophoria*.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- passage: Euripides' mock-tragic outburst ('O Zeus ...') picked up by Mnesilochus' mock-tragic response 'Why do you weep?...' but only after interjection of conversational aside ('I must say, ...'); women's exaggeratedly violent response to their belief that Euripides denigrates them – perhaps additionally bizarre because unknown whether they even attended tragic performances and on evidence of Euripides' surviving plays (and particularly those Aristophanes goes on to parody) he portrayed women as victims as much as monsters etc.; Euripides' plan for disguise modelled on notorious *Telephus* ('very much your style'); comic domestic use of *ekklema* used in tragedy for display of corpses (here a reprise of a scene in *Acharnians* also making fun of tragedy and *Telephus* in particular); caricature of Agathon's alleged effeminacy (Cyrene = courtesan), comic assumption that to compose effectively one has to dress up as the character; parody of Agathon's lyrics, mocked by Mnesilochus ('ants in his larynx'); much of humour from downgrading high art form to mundane domestic context etc.
- parody of *Telephus* continued in Mica's baby / wine-skin scene; further parodies of more recent plays *Palamedes*, *Helen* and *Andromeda* – absurdity of aged Mnesilochus as beautiful wife / virgin; literal responses of Critylla and Scythian, use of *mechane*, Echo etc.
- frequent one line references to / quotations from Euripides' plays in absurd contexts
- stock joke that Euripides' mother sold greens in the market and throughout his alleged slippery ingenuity etc.
- structure of comedy as whole alludes to some of Euripides' plays with delayed averting of catastrophe
- Aristophanes' portrayal of women (if taken seriously) much more misogynistic than Euripides' – based on chauvinistic stereotypes (duplicious, addicted to extravagance, drink, sex etc.), exaggerated versions of male fears of women's potential to destroy rather than enhance *oikos* with their subversive behaviour; women's riposte in *parabasis* etc.
- Thesmophoria provides setting and framework for plot, including many prayers and much dancing / singing, but not those actually appropriate to the festival; parody of Assembly procedure instead etc.; various dances and prayers provide spectacle appropriate to religious context of Dionysia - and some vulgarity (e.g. Mnesilochus' prayers about Fanny and Willy) etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

211 *In what circumstances did Cicero give the speech from which the passage comes? Give two details.*

TWO of e.g. as a lawyer / in (law) courts [1] at Caelius' trial / defending Caelius [1] who was Clodia's (former) lover [1] and Cicero's protégé [1] and had been charged under law against riot [1] trial being held on holiday [1] Cicero's feud with Clodia's brother [1]

(2 marks)

212 *Cicero mentions three achievements of Caecus, the Blind, which he claims Clodia has misused. Give one of them.*

Peace (with Pyrrhus) / (first) aqueduct (Aqua Claudia) / road (Via Appia) [1]

(1 mark)

213 *What had the Vestal Virgin Quinta Claudia done which 'brought glory to our house' (line 15)?*

protected father / prevented him being pulled from chariot (by enemy / tribune of people during triumph) / comment on status of Vestal Virgin / performance of a specified duty [1]

(1 mark)

214 *In his speech about Clodia, who else does Cicero pretend to be apart from Caecus, the Blind?*

her brother / Clodius [1]

(1 mark)

220 *How special were the customs and status of Vestal Virgins? Give the reasons for your views.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- chosen young aged 6-10, taken out of control of *paterfamilias* / father and put under control of *Pontifex Maximus* etc.
- only 6 at any one time so small elite group; lived in community in *atrium Vestae* close to forum in centre of Rome next to Temple of Vesta where had duty of ensuring Vesta's fire never extinguished, a role of major importance because believed Rome's safety depended on this; attended all other major religious ceremonies including triumphs (as Quinta Claudia) whereas other women had relatively little participation in state religion except rites of Ceres etc.
- in the event of serious illness had to be removed from *atrium Vestae* and placed in care of *matrona* (as Fannia's relative Junia)
- sat with emperor at bottom level of theatre / amphitheatre whereas other women at top; allowed to drive through Rome in carriage always preceded by *lictors* / bodyguards like male officials / magistrates etc.

- special regulations e.g. accidentally met criminal on way to execution, he was pardoned; any man who fell under Vestals' carriage executed etc.
- had right to make will and conduct other business without guardian; could not be bound by oath; sworn to chastity; buried alive if unchaste, flogged if fire went out
- served for 30 years; tended not to marry after this period because (according to Plutarch) prone to depression etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

230 *'What Roman men feared most about women was their "sheer, unbridled passion" (lines 12-13).' How far do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views.*

You might include discussion of

- *the nature of men's fears*
- *the rest of Cicero's speech about Clodia*
- *Livy's version of the debate between Cato and Valerius about the repeal of the Oppian Law*
- *Sallust's portrayal of Sempronia*
- *Juvenal's portrayal of women.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- nature of male fears: where they surfaced, tended to centre on women's alleged lack of self-control and sound judgement which could lead to behaviours (e.g. extravagance as well as passion) damaging to male interests in family and state; some also feared women's alleged desire to dominate men but Cato lost the argument to Valerius and the views expressed by Juvenal exaggerated to such an extent that he may seem to be ridiculing them; etc.
- repeated and graphic allegations of Clodia's promiscuity (everybody's friend, incest with brother, Appius Claudius' protests that didn't build Aqua Claudia for Clodia's 'post-incest ablutions' or Via Appia for her to promenade with other men's husbands, caricature impersonation of permissive brother who objects not to her voyeurism but to her pursuit of the one man who rejects her, character assassination at end of prescribed extract supposedly of a different woman from Clodia building to climax 'slave to her appetites' so that a man who takes liberties not culpable) all designed to obfuscate facts, denigrate Clodia and win sympathy of jury by arousing their prejudices and portraying her prosecution of Caelius as merely the malicious revenge of a jilted lover etc.
- Livy's history written during principate of Augustus had moral purpose; Cato's speech either worked up or invented by Livy to make dramatic contrast with Valerius' and to reflect debate about attitudes towards women of his own day; Cato's attack on women stems from his fear of their lack of judgement (should not meddle in public affairs, their lack of self control (once women have freedom they will demand more and abuse it) and extravagance which can only be controlled by force of law etc.; Valerius remembers examples of women's good judgement which benefited the state at times of crisis, but regards personal adornment as the proper sphere for female prestige which, according to him, they want men to control but through judgement rather than law etc.
- Sempronia used by historian Sallust as example of Rome's moral decline since

despite her potential she failed to live up to traditional expectations and showed neither domestic qualities nor those of males in family; among her faults (being outside husband's control, extravagance, debt, criminal record) her debauchery chasing men and wantonness in dancing / singing given prominence, making her a suitable person for Catiline to enlist to further his revolution by inciting slaves, burning city, winning over / killing husbands etc.

- Juvenal writing satire in the form of a ranting monologue attempting to dissuade the recipient from marriage because women have been totally corrupted by the evils of a long peace (exaggerated version of Sallust's more nuanced view); extract starts with graphic descriptions of Eppia's and Messalina's lust, sees mothers-in-law as promoting promiscuity, complains that athletic women could not be chaste ('How could a woman who wears a helmet be chaste?') and, despite a digression on the evils of an educated woman, concludes with the fear that a wife's pregnancy if not terminated will produce an Ethiopian as an heir etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

SECTION TWO

300 *To what extent does Ischomachus' conversation with Socrates give a different picture of an Athenian marriage from the lawcourt speeches you have studied? Give the reasons for your views.*

You might include discussion of

- *the nature of the evidence*
- *the circumstances of an Athenian marriage and its purposes*
- *the roles of wives*
- *communication between husband and wife*
- *husbands' attitudes towards wives*
- *wives' freedom and protection.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- evidence: Ischomachus – an imaginary dialogue with Socrates by Xenophon in which Socrates has asked reasons for reputation for excellence, so probable Ischomachus' version was an ideal, and focuses particularly on how wife trained rather than other aspects etc.; lawcourt speeches deal with particular and sometimes extreme cases of dispute, rhetorical to persuade jury, so possible to discern underlying attitudes and assumptions with which jury of male citizens over 30 expected to sympathise but likely distortion of details and problems of generalisation etc.
- marriages arranged (Ischomachus), wife young / inexperienced / naïve who needed training / watching when brought into husband's *oikos* (Ischomachus, Euphiletus); to produce legitimate heirs to inherit / look after parents in old age (Ischomachus refers to latter but concern about wife's make-up / boots reflect his anxiety about the former; Euphiletus' change in attitude once son born); legitimacy subject to approval of phratry and deme (Apollodorus about Phrastor, Ciron's daughter); to run internal affairs of *oikos* (particularly emphasised by Ischomachus); Apollodorus 'wives for procreation of legitimate children and to be faithful guardians of *oikoi*'; Theogenes seems to have married to secure Stephanus' financial backing etc.
- wife as bearer of legitimate children emphasised in Phrastor's divorce of Phano

when her legitimacy in question, desperate attempts when seriously ill to secure heir and eventual marriage to woman of unblemished reputation when recovered, and by Euphiletus' trust and reorganisation of *oikos* claimed to facilitate wife's care of child, also emphasising adultery could not have preceded birth; Ischomachus refers in passing to children, assuming this will happen subject to gods' approval, but mainly focuses on wife's domestic duties compared to leader bee with separate female characteristics and roles laid down by god etc.

- Ischomachus speaks to wife paternally / patronisingly (in Athenian eyes as befitted her youth and inexperience) in order to train wife to run *oikos* exactly as he wishes and objects strongly with long-winded justification to her initiative in making herself look more attractive; claims they will consult together on upbringing of children; clear that he will spend most of time outside *oikos* (waiting in agora for foreigners when accosted by Socrates); little evidence of discussion between Euphiletus and wife apart from tiff over mauling maid upstairs, takes for granted he makes decisions and she fits in with him often away in country, he accepts without question her explanation of leaving the house and not questioning her use of make-up, and responds to adultery completely behind her back to trap Eratosthenes; poisoning trial also implies wife confined to house while husband absent; but Apollodorus' rhetoric at end of speech implies wives did ask about husbands' activities and express a view about it which might be taken seriously by men etc.
- in honour-based society and particularly after Pericles' Citizenship Law, fear of illegitimacy seems to have been main concern, only incidental in Ischomachus but because of context far more prominent in legal speeches, where we hear about specific laws regarding adultery and possible punishments etc.; as a consequence Athenian males had to demonstrate in public they were guarding and protecting their wives from sexual impropriety etc.; Apollodorus puts forward male view that wives took pride in their guarded status etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

400 *'Roman men did not value individual women for their personal qualities but as models of behaviour that was useful to males.'*

To what extent do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views

You might include discussion of

- *the different kinds of evidence we have*
- *Livy's portrayal of Lucretia and Cloelia*
- *Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi*
- *Turia and Murdia*
- *Pliny's writing about Calpurnia, Minicia Marcella, Arria and Fannia.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- Livy's *History* written during principate of Augustus had moral purpose and relevant examples here are legends to do with establishment of Republic etc; prescribed evidence for Cornelia from Plutarch and Nepos (letter of dubious authenticity) relying heavily on her memory as manipulated by her family etc.; Turia's funeral eulogy exceptionally long, designed not only to commemorate her

exceptional qualities but also to position husband within Augustan settlement etc.; Murdia's eulogy fragmentary with just tantalising reference to her 'wisdom in time of danger' etc.; Pliny's letters, though ostensibly personal, intended from outset for publication, immortalising his qualities as a husband and literary stylist (one letter owes much to tradition of Latin love poetry), recording his relationship with prominent contemporaries (e.g. Minicia's father), positioning himself politically and expounding philosophical or general issue more in style of essay (e.g. Arria) etc.

- legendary Lucretia not characterised as individual but regarded as *exemplum* of ideal *matrona* – a prize-winning wife who shows unparalleled diligence, courage, duty, honour, chastity etc. acting always in interests of family and Rome and conscious of the model of behaviour she is setting etc.
- Cloelia seen as unique but not as an individual; honoured with equestrian statue in prominent position on *Via Sacra* for her courage, intelligence, duty towards Rome despite youth and sex, and risks etc.
- Cornelia's memory as 'Mother of the Gracchi' enshrined in statue; their qualities said to have come not so much from their noble lineage as from the exemplary way in which she brought them up (her 'jewels'); her emphasis on great Roman values of duty to family and state expressed with considerable rhetorical skill in letter which purports to dissuade son from seeking tribunate; in other ways too she was turned into a historical legend admired for her fortitude in enduring her husband's death and murder of sons whom she regarded in a detached, patriotic way as if heroes of ancient Rome; at the same time she was admired for her education and culture and association with / patronage of Greek intellectuals; a particular source of admiration was her refusal to accept Ptolemy's offer of marriage and share in his kingdom etc.
- Pliny portrays Calpurnia as the model young wife – frugal, chaste, devoted to his glory – with some individuality (e.g. her setting his poems to music on the lyre, sending messenger to find out progress of his law cases) but her qualities portrayed as a reflection of her upbringing by her aunt whom Pliny is concerned to flatter; elsewhere she is portrayed as the object of Pliny's (literary) love; in letter to her grandfather there is perhaps a hint of criticism at her naivety and main purpose of letter to set down Pliny's hopes for an heir in accordance with Fabatus' wishes etc.
- letter about Arria is to demonstrate the general point that what is remembered about someone is not necessarily their greatest moment; although Pliny agrees with consensus that Arria noble in committing suicide as encouragement and consolation to husband after his conviction for opposition to emperor and admirable in her determination despite opposition from son-in-law, he wants particularly to praise her less known Stoic endurance in concealing son's death from sick husband; she is remembered too for the example she set her granddaughter Fannia, as she is for the example she sets men as well as women e.g. in her devotion to family, courage and vigorous spirit despite fatal illness etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid
Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

SECTION ONE

Either

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
111	1	-	1
112	1	-	1
113	1	-	1
114	2	-	2
120	5	5	10
130	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
211	1	-	2
212	1	-	1
213	1	-	1
214	1	-	1
220	5	5	10
230	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

SECTION TWO

Either

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
300	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
400	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65

%	46%	54%	100%
----------	------------	------------	-------------