



General Certificate of Education

Classical Civilisation 2020

CIV1D Women in Athens and Rome

Mark Scheme

2009 examination – June series

This mark scheme uses the [new numbering system](#) which is being introduced for examinations from June 2010

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2009 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the candidate uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of candidates after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Candidates are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the candidate's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question,effectively links comment to detail,has a clear structurereaches a reasoned conclusionis clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language andmakes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus,is broadly appropriate to the question,mainly supports comment with detail andhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	27-30
Level 4	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	20-26
Level 3	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	13-19
Level 2	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7-12
Level 1	<p>Demonstrates</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-6

Mark Scheme

Unit 1

Option D Women in Athens and Rome

SECTION ONE

Option A

- 01 In Passage A, what does the speaker hope to gain by proving his mother is legitimate?**

her father's property / inheritance [1]

(1 mark)

- 02 Why does the speaker in Passage A not give the names of his mother and Diocles' wife?**

customary not to give names of respectable women in public / at trial / to protect them etc. [1]

(1 mark)

- 03 What evidence from Phrastor has Apollodorus just given before Passage B to show Neaera was a foreigner? Make three points.**

THREE of e.g. alleged Phano was Neaera's daughter [1] previously called Strybele [1] rather than Stephanus' daughter by a previous marriage [1] Phrastor divorced Phano [1] partly because learnt she was not legitimate [1] partly because she was not well behaved / obedient [1] refused to give back dowry [1] Stephanus started lawsuit to reclaim dowry / interest [1] which he dropped [1] when Phrastor retaliated with lawsuit alleging Stephanus had given him alien woman [1] because penalty loss of citizen rights / property / *atimia* [1]

(3 marks)

04 Judging from the rest of the speech you have read about Ciron's daughter and from what Apollodorus goes on to say about Phrastor in his speech against Neaera, how important do you think phratries were to the position of women in Athenian society? Give the reasons for your views.

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Pericles' Citizenship Law restricted citizenship to legitimate males whose father was a citizen and whose mother was a legitimate daughter of a citizen; citizenship depended on membership of a deme which a man entered when he was 18 provided that the demarch / fellow demesmen were satisfied the qualifications were met; part of the evidence for their judgement was the attitude of the phratry, extended family group, who controlled acceptance within the family and admitted children of both sexes into phratry soon after birth at time when father recognised them and presented them to phratry under oath etc.
- speech about Ciron's daughter claims phratry took its role very seriously (father's oath, their large numbers and careful investigation, possibility of rejection); phratry provides witnesses in trial where legitimacy in dispute; demes also corroborated a woman's legitimacy by allowing her to play (leading) role in Thesmophoria etc.
- Phrastor's alleged behaviour: when after divorcing Phano he thought he was terminally ill and needed an heir to prevent property going to relatives whom he disliked, took back Phano's child but phratry refused to accept child as member of phratry; when Phrastor initiated lawsuit, phratry challenged him to swear by holy sacrifice in front of arbitrator that he believed son to be legitimate, which Phrastor refused to do; as soon as Phrastor recovered he married a woman of impeccable pedigree and character to produce heir which phratry could not reject etc.
- part of Apollodorus' definition of marriage is presenting sons to phratry and deme etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

05 *How important to the comic effect of Aristophanes' play **Women at the Thesmophoria** is his parody of the festival of the Thesmophoria? Give the reasons for your views.*

You might include discussion of

- *Aristophanes' portrayal of the women who attended the festival*
- *differences between the behaviour Aristophanes describes and what might really have happened at the festival*
- *how serious the festival was in real life and in the play*
- *other sources of humour in the play.*

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- who attended: only women of unblemished reputation who were wives of Athenian citizens and (perhaps) already had a child; Aristophanes inverts this so that the women are portrayed as embodiments of Athenian male fears, addicted to sex and drink, not denying Euripides' (and Mnesilochus') alleged accusations, but objecting to these practices being revealed and quick to do a deal with Euripides at end of play (time's up); ridicule of women an easy target at a drama festival which few if any women attended and provided social bonding and the feel-good factor among males in audience when politics fraught and divisive etc.
- precise rituals of Thesmophoria secret and so unknown; Aristophanes' alleged 'revelations' of what was in reality overwhelmingly serious for fertility of whole community all part of the fun; play set on middle of 3-day festival, apparently a day of fasting, not boozing as Aristophanes alleges; the day doubtless included prayers and dancing, but not those Aristophanes gives; parody of assembly meeting entirely fictitious but appropriate to plot and to fact that Thesmophoria held on Pnyx etc.
- Thesmophoria provides imaginary and topsy-turvy setting for Aristophanes' other main target in play – ridicule and parody of Euripides – but also allows ridicule of Cleisthenes, Scythian etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

- 06 Describe how the Romans came to be at war with the Sabines. Make four points from Livy's version of the story.**

FOUR of **e.g.** Rome had no women to produce children [1] attempts to secure wives by diplomatic means failed [1] Rome / Romulus invited Sabines (and others) to festival (Consualia) [1] at given signal Romans seized Sabine women [1] in violation of laws of hospitality [1] Sabine women acquiesced to their capture after Roman blandishments [1] Sabine men initially ran away [1] but subsequently returned and occupied Capitol [1] etc.

(4 marks)

- 07 What did the Sabine women do to bring the war to an end, according to Valerius in the debate about the repeal of the Oppian Law?**

ran between the opposing battle lines (in the Forum) [1]

(1 mark)

- 08 Judging from the passages you have read, to what extent do you think Juvenal's dislike of Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi, was typical of Romans? Give the reasons for your views.**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Cornelia was remembered as the ideal *matrona*, an example for emulation
- her maternal qualities were so highly regarded that statue erected with inscription 'Mother of Gracchi'; sons' qualities particularly said to have come from the way Cornelia brought them up (she is said to have described them as her 'jewels'); letter survives which purports to be attempt by Cornelia to dissuade son Gracchus from seeking tribunate, appealing to the great Roman virtues of duty to family and the state and demonstrating her rhetorical skills; whether genuine or not, letter shows how Cornelia was remembered (or her memory manipulated) positively for her transmission of Roman values to sons
- also admired for her fortitude in enduring the death of her husband and murders of her sons, which she treated in a detached, patriotic way as if heroes of ancient Rome
- admired too for her education and culture and association with / patronage of Greek intellectuals (contrary to Juvenal's dislike of educated women)
- praised for alleged refusal to accept Ptolemy's offer of marriage and share in his kingdom rather than criticised for standoffishness
- her pride in her father, Scipio Africanus, who had defeated Hannibal and her living up to family values in the ways open to a woman was also praised not generally regarded as snobbish; Juvenal's rejection of her family advantages part of his satirist's *persona* as an ordinary down-to-earth, back-to-basics Roman who values above all the simplicity of Rome's peasant origins etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

- 09** *'Beautiful, graceful, rich, fertile, ... virginal' (lines 2-3). To what extent are these the qualities Pliny praises in the women he writes about? Give the reason for your views.*

You might include discussion of

- *Calpurnia (Pliny's wife)*
- *Calpurnia Hispulla (his wife's aunt)*
- *Minicia Marcella (a girl who died young)*
- *the Helvidiae sisters*
- *Arria*
- *Fannia (Arria's granddaughter).*

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Calpurnia: letter to Hispulla praises Calpurnia's chastity, which seen as sign of love, but also her frugality, her education and above all her devotion to his career and glory which she demonstrates in a modest, discreet way; in letter when she is recuperating in Campania demonstrates some anxiety about her well-being in place notorious for its lax morals; in letter to Fabatus emphasis on her fertility proved by miscarriage etc.
- Hispulla praised for way she has brought up Calpurnia to be a suitable wife for Pliny as above – education and breeding more important than wealth (something Juvenal in his *persona* as down-to-earth, common-sense Roman mentions, but not someone who is, or wants to appear to be, upper-class)
- Minicia Marcella praised for exhibiting, though a child and having the charms of a child, the matronly qualities of decorum and wisdom, embodying her father's (and Pliny's) values etc.
- fertility of Helvidiae mentioned because have died in childbirth, but otherwise we learn very little about them since Pliny's concern in letter is not so much with them as with family as a whole and his relationship to it etc.
- Arria praised for none of the qualities Juvenal lists but for her Stoic self-sacrificing devotion to husband both during sickness and death of son and when he was arrested and condemned for his part in Scribonianus' plot etc.
- Fannia praised for demonstrating similar qualities to those of her grandmother – devotion to family and husband in extreme circumstances and fortitude in the face of illness and death etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

SECTION TWO

Option C

- 10 ***Judging from the evidence you have studied, how much freedom and how much responsibility do you think Athenian wives had? Give the reasons for your views.***

You might include discussion of

- ***the purposes of an Athenian marriage, including Apollodorus' comments at the end of his speech Against Neaera***
- ***the laws relating to Athenian women and marriage***
- ***wives' roles, including the evidence of Ischomachus and Euphiletus***
- ***male attitudes towards women, including the sources of humour in Aristophanes' Women at the Thesmophoria***
- ***women's participation in religion.***

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- purposes of marriage determined by male citizens for their own interests: to produce legitimate heirs to inherit, care for parents in old age, become citizens; to preserve / enhance economic well-being and status of *oikos*; Apollodorus: *hetaerae* for pleasure, *pallakai* for daily attendance upon person, wives for procreation of legitimate children and to be faithful guardians of *oikoi*; marriages arranged by male *kurioi* etc.
- laws: adultery restricted by severe penalties – death for adulterer, divorce for wife, or *atimia* for husband; adulteress banned from public sacrifices with threat of any punishment except death if disobeyed; Euphiletus portrayed adultery as crime against whole *polis*, not just individual, and himself as protector of *polis* – rhetorical but presumably believed to be plausible; after increased exclusivity of citizenship because of Pericles' law, greater fear of disgrace etc.
- wives' roles: emphasis on staying indoors and managing *oikos* by both Ischomachus and Euphiletus; Ischomachus' leader bee analogy; Ischomachus' training of previously secluded wife to act in his interests, including not wearing make-up although done to please him, because of fears of attracting unwanted male gaze; nevertheless both Euphiletus and Ischomachus reveal they gave wives considerable responsibility within *oikos*, allowing both men time outside *oikos* where could pursue other economic interests and leisure and in Ischomachus' case at least gain honour etc.
- male attitudes: apparently motivated by underlying anxieties about women's trustworthiness and ability to perform required roles leading to stereotypical jokes in Aristophanes about their obsession with sex and drink; Euphiletus allowed his wife greater freedom after birth of son when some of his anxieties eased, but her alleged abuse of this responsibility reinforced male fears; Ischomachus' attitude towards far younger wife may be seen as paternalistic or patronising, but Apollodorus' rhetoric at end of *In Neaeram* implies both male view that wives took pride in their guarded status and that wives took some interest in public world and their views could carry weight etc.
- religion: importance of priestess of Athena Polias and *Basilinna* but within system devised by males; importance of arcane rituals of Thesmophoria, performed away from the sight of men though paid for by husbands; Aristophanes' portrayal of festival as opportunity for female licence comic inversion with element of male prurience; role in funerals and honouring dead with offerings at and maintenance of tombs etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

- 11 **From the founding of Rome to the end of the 1st century BC, to what extent did Roman men attempt to control women and to what extent did they allow them to act independently? Give the reasons for your views.**

You might include discussion of

- **the different kinds of evidence we have**
- **Livy's descriptions of Lucretia and Cloelia**
- **Livy's account of the repeal of the Oppian Law**
- **Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi**
- **the eulogies of Turia and Murdia**
- **Sallust's views on Sempronia**
- **Cicero's portrayal of Clodia.**

Answers may include discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Livy: moral basis to history so legends of women recorded with a view to their value as *exempla*; story of Lucretia shows women left to their devices while men away; Lucretia prized for fulfilling her obligations more diligently than others, tenaciously valuing chastity and her husband's honour and her initiative and independence in responding to the actions of Tarquinius etc; Cloelia, despite her youth, also admired for her courage and initiative but only because they were in the interests of Rome etc.
- repeal of Oppian Law: Livy represents debate with just two opposing speeches which may be worked up from actual speeches or may be dramatic inventions by Livy to present two views, with relevance to discussions of his own time as much as to early 2nd century BC, that by our standards are not entirely opposites; Cato outraged by women's meddling in public affairs and advocates return to strict control of women he believes existed at start of republic; Valerius allows that women have intervened in public during several crises for the good of the state and legitimate for them to do so now because issue that directly affects them, but overall men should still control women, though treating them reasonably and with respect (i.e. repetition of attitudes implicit in Livy's telling of Romulus' treatment of Sabines after they had been seized) and allow them luxuries in dress which is their sphere of honour etc.
- Cornelia: became the epitome of the ideal *matrona* - highly praised for her rearing of sons, endurance and fortitude following deaths of husband and sons, refusal to marry Ptolemy, patronage of Greek culture etc. independent but at all times upholding the values of her family and Rome etc.
- Turia: highly praised for her courage, initiative, independence in her husband's and family's interests necessitated by the exceptional circumstances of their marriage during civil war; judgements need to take into account the fact that this is an extraordinarily long eulogy spoken and recorded in stone not just to praise wife but to please Augustus etc.
- Murdia: praised for sensible judgements in allocating her legacy and tantalising reference to her courage in times of danger, but fragmentary nature of eulogy makes judgement difficult etc.
- Sempronia seen by Sallust as a symptom of Rome's moral decline; Clodia attacked by Cicero in forensic speech defending Caelius to divert attention away from Caelius' actions, entertain jury on public holiday, satisfy Cicero's grudges against family etc.; neither criticised for being independent in itself, but for misusing the independence they quite normally had to behave in ways that were the opposite of what was expected of a *matrona* etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid**Unit 1****Option D Women in Athens and Rome****SECTION ONE****Either**

		AO1	AO2	TOTAL
A	01	1	-	1
	02	1	-	1
	03	3	-	3
	04	5	5	10
	05	12	12	20
	TOTAL	18	17	35

Or

		AO1	AO2	TOTAL
B	06	4	-	4
	07	1	-	1
	08	5	5	10
	09	8	12	20
	TOTAL	18	17	35

SECTION TWO**Either**

		AO1	AO2	TOTAL
C	10	12	18	30
	TOTAL	12	18	30

Or

		AO1	AO2	TOTAL
D	11	12	18	30
	TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%