

A-LEVEL

RELIGIOUS STUDIES

RST3C The History of Christianity OR Religion and Art
Mark scheme

2060
June 2014

Version: 1.0 Final

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced) A2 Level Descriptors

<i>Level</i>	A2 Descriptor AO1	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptor AO2	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptors for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2
7	A thorough treatment of the topic, which may be in depth or breadth. Information is accurate and relevant. A thorough understanding is shown through good use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate good knowledge and understanding of diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is demonstrated. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated convincingly.	28-30 41-45	A very well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed perceptively. Effective use is made of evidence to sustain an argument. Appropriate evaluation is fully supported by the reasoning. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related perceptively and maturely to the broader context and to human experience.	19-20 28-30	Appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
6	A generally thorough treatment of the topic which may be in depth or breadth. Information is almost all accurate and mainly relevant. Clear understanding is demonstrated through use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, alternative views and / or scholarly opinion are satisfactorily explained. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are clearly demonstrated.	24-27 36-40	A well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed. Appropriate evaluation is supported by reasoned argument. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related clearly to the broader context and to human experience.	16-18 24-27	
5	A satisfactory treatment of the topic. Information is mostly accurate and mainly relevant. A reasonable understanding is demonstrated through use of some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, some familiarity with diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is shown. Some knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	20-23 29-35	A satisfactory response to the issue(s) raised. Views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments, and some critical analysis. An evaluation is made that is consistent with some of the reasoning. Some of the response is related satisfactorily to the broader context and to human experience.	13-15 20-23	Mainly appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information; mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
4	Key ideas and facts are included; demonstrates some understanding and coherence using some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, brief reference may be made to alternative views and / or scholarly opinion. Limited knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	15-19 22-28	The main issue is addressed with some supporting evidence or argument, but the reasoning is faulty, or the analysis superficial or only one view is adequately considered. Little of the response is related to the broader context and to human experience.	10-12 15-19	Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
3	A summary of key points. Limited in depth or breadth. Answer may show limited understanding and limited relevance. Some coherence.	10-14 15-21	A basic attempt to justify a point of view relevant to the question. Some explanation of ideas and coherence.	7-9 10-14	
2	A superficial outline account, with little relevant material and slight signs of partial understanding, or an informed answer that misses the point of the question.	5-9 8-14	A superficial response to the question with some attempt at reasoning.	4-6 5-9	Little clarity and organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.
1	Isolated elements of partly accurate information little related to the question.	1-4 1-7	A few basic points, with no supporting argument or justification.	1-3 1-4	
0	Nothing of relevance.	0	No attempt to engage with the question or nothing of relevance	0	

Section A *The History of Christianity* *The Christian Church in the 20th century*

Question 1 Feminist theology

0

1

Examine the development of feminist theology in the 20th century.

Students should be able to refer to and exemplify the stages through which Feminist Theology developed in the 20th century.

Answers are likely to make reference to:

- Historical development arising from secular feminism. 1st phase begins from within feminism at start of 20th century through writings of Mary Cady Stanton.
- Reference could be made to the three distinct steps within feminist theology, as suggested by Grenz and Olson:
 - 1 Critique of past;
 - 2 Examination of alternative biblical (and extra biblical traditions) to support feminist understanding of theology;
 - 3 Setting out of their own theology with revision of Christian categories. E.g. effects of and coincidence with Liberation Theology.
- 1980's distinct movement towards a feminist theology becomes increasingly contextual. Addresses specific ideas e.g. mujerist, womanist, and eco-feminist theologies.
- Key figures likely to include Daly; Radford Reuther; McFague and Fiorenza.

[30 marks]

AO1

0

2

'Feminist theology has successfully promoted the place of women in the ordained ministry.' Assess this view.

Expect a balanced and reasoned assessment of the statement tightly focused upon how feminist theology has or has not been successful in promoting the place of women in ordained ministry.

In support

- Answers may include reference to feminist understandings of egalitarianism within teachings of Jesus.
- Feminist arguments in dispute over theological reasons why women should not be ordained. Work of Katharine Bushnell, Elizabeth Cady Stanton etc. Modern feminist movements such as Women's Ordination Conference etc.
- Success in some denominations but not in others. Examples of female ordination within Anglican communion and other denominations.

Other views

- Success is limited especially within Roman Catholic and Orthodox Churches where women are still not admitted to priesthood or episcopate.
- In those denominations which accept the ordination of women how much was the acceptance a result of Feminist Theology? Needs to be set in the context of wider feminist movement.
- Current debate over Women Bishops within Anglican communion stimulated by factors other than feminist theology etc.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 2 The Roman Catholic Church in the second part of the 20th century

0

3

Examine the reasons why the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II) was called.**Answers should consider a range of relevant factors:**

- The legacy left by Vatican I.
- The problems created by and in light of 'Modernist crisis' under Pius X.
- Sociological advances in 20th century and the need for Roman Catholic Church to not appear anachronistic in liturgy, social thought, and scholarship etc.
- Biblical studies e.g. *Divino Afflante Spiritu* (1943).
- Developing liturgical movement e.g. *Mystici Corporis/ Mediator Dei*.
- The need for '*Aggionamento*' (an updating) and the personal attitudes of John XXIII.
- Reaction towards centralised and authoritarian governance of Catholic Church.
- Need for Church to meet needs of modern world post WWII and on the death of Pius XII.
- Some may provide further evidence and reference to specific areas during the progressive reign of Pius XII.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

4

To what extent has Vatican II benefited the Roman Catholic Church?

A balanced argument reviewing successes and failures of Vatican II is to be expected. Reference could be made to specific areas of:

- Liturgy.
- Collegiality.
- Biblical Studies and other theological scholarship.
- Position of the Catholic Church within modern world post Vatican II; Reference to 'In the spirit of Vatican II' and variety of responses to it.
- Reaction to Liberation Theology.

Other views

- Was Vatican II a missed opportunity, only some areas are updated other attitudes e.g. Ordination of Women are still left unsuccessfully resolved.
- Attitudes towards other Christian denominations and other faiths.
- Not all aspects discussed have come to fruition. Certain areas e.g. Liberation Theology and bias to poor have been suppressed or ignored.
- Reversion to Tridentine mass.

[20 marks]**AO2**

Question 3 **New forms of Christian fundamentalism in the second half of the 20th century**

0

5

Examine the attitude of Christian fundamentalism towards:

- **abortion and**
- **gay rights.**

Answers may refer to some of the following:

Abortion:

- Supports Pro-Life and against abortion.
- Views taken from inerrancy of bible and support a similar stance to Catholicism as regards the unborn foetus.
- Denies women have a right to choose, and makes this a political agenda especially in light of Obama's support for abortion.
- Active in justifying visual campaigns against abortion and civil unrest as necessary to voice opinions about anti abortion.
- Extreme cases will support the killing or attacking of medical practitioners who practice abortion. Arguing "We will fully and ungrudgingly render to Caesar what is Caesar's. But under no circumstances will we render to Caesar what is God's".
- Sees abortion as eroding of biblical family values and as a result of sexual immorality and promiscuity.

Gay rights:

- Evangelical Fundamentalists and Religious Right in particular tend to blame the sexual revolution for increasing social acceptance of homosexuality, which Evangelical Fundamentalists regarded as a contagious sin and directly against family and sexual values taught by scripture.
- Uses political pressure against same sex unions and relationships. Radical views expressed through various movements and work of Don Wildmon. As a contagious sin homosexuality needs to be repented of and eradicated for good of society.
- The scripture declares that homosexuality is unnatural and sinful. It is a sin grievous to God and repulsive to Christians because it rejects God's design for mankind as heterosexual.
- Homosexuals have only one hope of being reconciled to God and rejecting their sinful behaviour - faith in Jesus Christ alone. Some seek to use every opportunity to promote and encourage the efforts of ex-gay ministries and organizations.
- Opposes the gay movement's efforts to convince society that their behaviour is normal because we fear the judgment of God.
- Extreme cases support the need for gender re-education.

Students should address both issues, if only **one** issue attempted Max L5.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

6

‘The main attraction of Christian fundamentalism is its attitudes towards moral issues.’ Assess this view.

In support

- Many fundamental churches have arisen because of reactions towards liberal attitudes amongst other denominations on ethical issues (exemplification of issues is to be expected for top levels).
- They appeal and grow because they allow individuals to uphold their own prejudices and ideas about ethical issues especially human sexuality.
- They appear to offer a moral code in tune with scriptural understanding of the ‘word of God’ and strict adherence to a moral code ensures personal salvation.
- Fundamental attitudes appeal to those who are unable to cope with or are uneasy towards perceived erosion of ethical values in modern society.
- They offer moral certainty.

Other views

- Other factors may be significantly more important. E.g. offering a strong sense of identity and belonging, attractive style of charismatic worship and biblical interpretation.
- Ethical certainty may not be attractive to all but association with political pressure is.
- Ethical issues secondary to imminence of eschatology and thus preparation for personal salvation is more important than ethical issues.
- Relative deprivation theory may account for attraction.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 4 Black-led churches in the United Kingdom (UK) today

0

7

Examine reasons why black-led churches developed in the United Kingdom.

Students should be expected to highlight AND explain a variety of reasons including:

- Immigration- post war shortage of semi-skilled labour; ‘Windrush’ effect.
- Lack of welcome from white UK churches, racism within UK churches and society.
- Dissatisfaction of rising black population with white expressions of faith, liturgies, music etc.
- Separate black-led churches meet a distinct liturgical and doctrinal need not provided by mainstream white churches.
- Distrust of white leadership.
- Sociological factors; cultural cohesion of Afro-Caribbean communities facilitates starting and subsequent development of ‘black-led’ churches which meet shared specific sociological and theological demands.
- Desire to worship in their own way. ‘How shall we sing the Lord’s song in a strange land?’

[30 marks]

AO1

0

8

‘Black-led churches developed as a response to theological needs, not social needs.’

Assess this view.

Answers may include:

In support

- The dominant fundamentalist theology of many groups meant that theological groups were paramount.
- Met distinctive attitudes towards personal holiness; Baptism by the Holy Spirit.
- Met demands for particular liturgical/ theological expression, not provided by mainstream white churches.
- Emphasis on biblical inerrancy.
- Expression of particular biblical teaching on ethical attitudes.
- Empowerment of laity.

Other views

- For many new arrivals who were feeling displaced and suffering racism, social needs were more important.
- Facilitated community identity and support groups; in light of racial prejudice from some white communities.
- Provided cultural cohesion and identity.
- Allowed preservation of social attitudes in a ‘strange land’.
- Sociological factors allow for expression of particular cultural and ethical attitudes which are not particularly dependent on a theological understanding.

[20 marks]

AO2

Section B *Religion and Art*

Question 5 Iconography in the Orthodox Church

0	9
---	---

Examine the defence of icons as presented by John of Damascus.

Some may begin by considering the need for the defence of icons which led to John of Damascus' theological defence against rise of Iconoclasm:

Rise of Iconoclasm.

- Decrees of Leo III, political and theological influences upon him.
- Rise of Islam.
- Paulician theology.
- Monophysite theology.

The main thrust of examination should then focus upon:

The theological defence of icons put forward by John of Damascus which rests on four essential points: Students should be expected to unpack these key areas with clear reference to each. Some may refer to the work of scholars such as Ouspensky, Baggley and Ness which will help clarify issues.

- **The place of matter within God's creation.** E.g. since God became Man in matter, matter is acceptable to use in revelation of spiritual truth.
- **The reality of the Incarnation.** e.g. To deny the use of matter to reveal spiritual truth is to argue against reality of incarnation which is contra theological teaching contained in creeds and scripture "The Word made flesh deified flesh".
- **The defence of icons as revelation through sight as well as sound or speech.** E.g. reference could be made to teachings of John of Damascus specifically which see a 'fundamental equivalence' between the written word and image.
- **The difference between veneration and worship.** E.g. examination of the difference between *proskynesis* and *latreia* (veneration and worship). Icon being a mimesis of prototype etc. as expressed in writings of John of Damascus.

[30 marks]

AO1

1

0

'Icons are merely paintings on a religious theme.'**Assess this view.****In support**

- At one level they are merely religious works of art, depicting religious people and religious scenes in a particular style.
- There is no particular extra status to be given, they are depictions using a particular set of rules and medium.
- For some people they do not have any meaningful theological purpose.
- Remove an icon from its religious environs and it becomes merely another work of religious art. Viewed and collected as such by individuals and galleries.

Other views

- They possess a sacred status, the form being the receptacle for the content.
- They do not attempt to depict realism but are intended to have an anagogic function leading towards the heavenly realm, hence often expressed as 'windows or doorways into heaven'.
- Seen as channels of divine grace to the viewer and channels towards divine for the viewer.
- They are painted to convention and therefore there is no freedom of expression.
- They have liturgical and dogmatic status in eyes of Orthodox church which normal paintings do not. Icons can never stand alone as a work of art because it refers to and is part of a spiritual dimension.
- Can only be fully understood in a spiritual sense through knowledge of Orthodox iconography.

[20 marks]**AO2**

Question 6 Protestant art of the Reformation

1

1

Examine ways in which Protestant religious art contributed to the Protestant Reformation.

Expect some explanation of Protestant attitudes towards religious art; Depiction of biblical material. Students may confine their answers to the named works on the specification. Top answers may well push beyond these examples.

Answers may include specific reference to Cranach but other protestant artists are to be credited providing there is a clear explanation of how their art contributed to the Protestant Reformation.

- 'Law and Grace' expressing the key foundational teachings of Protestantism.
- Expressing sola fides sola gratia etc.
- Protestant altarpieces e.g. at Wittenberg, Schneeberg and Weimar, and how these expressed Lutheran Protestant teaching. Especially doctrine of Sacraments as at Wittenberg altarpiece. Alters the function of altarpieces to didactic rather than devotional (Noble).
- Use of woodcuts as anti papal/ Catholic propaganda; e.g. Passional Christi und Anti-Christi; (Duffy) Scatological woodcuts; Christ in the sheep shed; or Penz Two kinds of sermon (Scribner).
- As illustrative of key teachings of Lutheran Church e.g. Old Church New Church.
- Art publicising the key reformers; images of Luther and other reformers.
- Panel paintings revealing key reformation themes e.g. Christ and adulteress (forgiveness); Christ blessing Children (infant Baptism and open childlike faith); Call of Matthew (responding in faith to call of Christ).
- Cranach's illustrations for Lutheran Biblical translations; catechisms and hymnals.
- All help publicise and promote visually what was being promoted verbally and in writing.

[30 marks]**AO1**

1

2

'The religious art of the Protestant Reformation has little significance today.'
Assess this view.

In support

- The content and purpose of the art is clearly contextual to the time it was produced.
- The propaganda expressed in some of the art has more relevance and significance to the time it was produced than today.
- Responses to the art of the Reformation was informed by what was occurring at the time, and therefore significant to that time, and the didactic and/or theological significance is largely lost today.
- Increasingly secular society may not understand theological significance.

Other views

- There is timelessness about some of the issues, images and theology expressed in the art and therefore there is still a relevance and significance for today. E.g. teaching on sacraments; and grace rather than works.
- May still inspire and inform as the art did then.
- Responses may be different but equally significant.
- Significance may lie in the historical study of religion and therefore such art allows insight into the ideas current at the time by contemporary scholars.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 7 Catholic art of the Counter-Reformation

1	3
---	---

Analyse how Bernini's religious art promoted the teachings of the Catholic Reformation.

Expect reference to what theological teachings the Catholic Reformation, in the light of the Council of Trent, wished to publicise: e.g. Importance of Mass; Power of papacy; legitimacy of Petrine succession; role of saints and relics; role of Blessed Virgin as intercessor.

Then expect some **detailed analysis** of how key works of Bernini selected reflect/publicised this theology.

Students may refer to any of the key works below;

- **Baldacchino:** Power of Papacy, Petrine succession and importance of Mass.
- **Cathedra Petri:** Petrine Succession; efficacy of relics; power of popes as legitimate successors; divine guidance through Holy spirit etc.
- **Four logia under Dome of St Peter's:** Depository for key relics, and example of saints. Logia and Baldacchino conceived of as a whole to sanctify the sacred space around the dome.
- **Ecstasy of St. Teresa;** Divine love and intimacy of divine revelation.

Other examples may be used e.g. Piazza; or other religious art (St. Bibiana) etc.

The key thrust of the question is how Bernini's **religious art** promoted the teachings of Catholic Reformation.

A list of Bernini's work without any further theological comment will score Max Level 4.

[30 marks]

AO1

1

4

‘Bernini’s religious art was simply a reflection of his own faith rather than of Catholic teaching.’ Assess this view.

Expect some unpacking of how far it reflected his own faith as a Catholic layman or how far it was overt Catholic propaganda in the light of post-Conciliar teaching.

In support

- He was a devout Catholic layman who embraced the Ignatian ‘Spiritual Exercises’ and the importance of art to devotion in light of teachings on art in worship following Council of Trent.
- He was supportive of and understanding of the Catholic faith in light of Catholic Reformation; wished to convey in his art those key teachings.
- Deliberate selection of themes and material conversant with teachings of Catholic Reformation.

Other views

- Patronised by Catholic Church, especially the papacy therefore to some extent was expected to reflect Catholic teaching in light of this.
- Religious work for private patrons.
- His art reflected key changes within teachings of Catholic Church, and expression of papal power and authority. E.g. importance of Papacy as direct spiritual successors to Peter (Cathedra Petri); importance of saints and relics (the four reliquaries in St. Peter’s; Ecstasy of St Teresa); the Catholic Church as the spiritual mother of the faithful (the enclosure of piazza); the importance of the mass (Papal altar and Baldacchino).

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 8 Pre-Raphaelite religious art

1

5

Examine Holman Hunt's use of religious imagery with reference to either 'The Shadow of Death' or 'The Finding of the Saviour in the Temple'.

'The Shadow of Death'

- Reference may be made to texts upon which painting is based (Christological hymn in Philippians 2, and/or gospel expressions to Jesus the carpenter).
- Imagery of crucifixion provided by shadow, tools of crucifixion symbolised by tool rack.
- Skein of wool refers to crown of thorns.
- Angle of saw prefigures the spear into side of Jesus at crucifixion.
- Mary kneeling at foot of shadow indicative of Mary kneeling at foot of cross.
- Trunk containing the gifts of Magi; Star of David.
- Nimbus created by window.

Higher level answers may explore imagery of pomegranate (resurrection), the scrolls on window sill, the fig tree outside window and/or make reference to the unseen horror on face of Mary remembering words of Simeon's prophetic utterance to her in the Temple 'And a sword shall pierce your own heart too.' (Luke 2:35)

'The Finding of the Saviour'.

Reference to the text upon which this is based is to be **expected** particularly as this was Holman Hunt's paraphrase of Luke 2 46-48.

Within painting students may refer to:

- Foreground Jews seated and Holy family standing, suggesting impotence of Jews, and activity of Holy family.
- Money changer prefiguring Christ's Cleansing of Temple (Matthew 21:12-13).
- Sacrificial lamb prefiguring Christ as Lamb of God.
- Biblical text from Malachi on Temple doorway.
- The blind beggar outside the temple.
- Scrolls of Torah held by blind rabbi.
- The completion of the building in the temple courtyard and cruciform shape of lifting gear in courtyard alludes to biblical passage 'The stone the builders rejected has become the chief cornerstone'.

Top level answers may well deal with the imagery around the frame before discussing the imagery in picture.

Clear unpacking of the religious/biblical imagery is to be expected. A mere list of images without any theological comment is to gain Max Level 4.

[30 marks]**AO1**

1

6

'Holman Hunt's religious paintings are so full of symbolism that they need to be de-coded to be understood.' Assess this view.

In support

- Holman Hunt has used a variety of symbolism both allegorical and typological, and these do need complete decoding for the meaning of the pictures to be fully understood.
- Reference could be made to specific typological examples e.g. extreme typology of 'The Scapegoat'.
- Similar reference could be made to the fact that knowledge of the biblical texts and/or Christian faith is necessary to facilitate decoding of symbolism, e.g. with reference to Shadow of Death or Finding of the Saviour.

Other views

- They can be fully understood as works of art in an aesthetic sense without the thorough decoding of symbols.
- They portray beauty and realism, and thus knowing the code or decoding the symbolism is not necessary for an aesthetic appreciation nor of an appreciation of how Holman Hunt reformed the presentation of religious art.
- Students may use other works of his religious art to exemplify e.g. the general meanings of Shadow of Death and of Finding of the Saviour in temple may be clear without decoding.
- 'The sheltering of a priest from Druids' is equally accessible without decoding.
- All above examples show truth to nature etc. which can lead to an appreciation but not necessarily a full understanding.

[20 marks]

AO2