
A-LEVEL RELIGIOUS STUDIES

RST3A Religion and Ethics
Mark scheme

2060
June 2014

Version: 1.0 Final

Mark schemes are prepared by the Lead Assessment Writer and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all associates participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every associate understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each associate analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, associates encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Lead Assessment Writer.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from aqa.org.uk

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced) A2 Level Descriptors

<i>Level</i>	A2 Descriptor AO1	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptor AO2	Marks <i>Unit 4 italics</i>	A2 Descriptors for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2
7	A thorough treatment of the topic, which may be in depth or breadth. Information is accurate and relevant. A thorough understanding is shown through good use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate good knowledge and understanding of diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is demonstrated. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated convincingly.	28-30 41-45	A very well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed perceptively. Effective use is made of evidence to sustain an argument. Appropriate evaluation is fully supported by the reasoning. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related perceptively and maturely to the broader context and to human experience.	19-20 28-30	Appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
6	A generally thorough treatment of the topic which may be in depth or breadth. Information is almost all accurate and mainly relevant. Clear understanding is demonstrated through use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, alternative views and / or scholarly opinion are satisfactorily explained. Knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are clearly demonstrated.	24-27 36-40	A well-focused response to the issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and critically analysed. Appropriate evaluation is supported by reasoned argument. There may be evidence of independent thought. The argument is related clearly to the broader context and to human experience.	16-18 24-27	
5	A satisfactory treatment of the topic. Information is mostly accurate and mainly relevant. A reasonable understanding is demonstrated through use of some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, some familiarity with diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is shown. Some knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	20-23 29-35	A satisfactory response to the issue(s) raised. Views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments, and some critical analysis. An evaluation is made that is consistent with some of the reasoning. Some of the response is related satisfactorily to the broader context and to human experience.	13-15 20-23	Mainly appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information; mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
4	Key ideas and facts are included; demonstrates some understanding and coherence using some evidence and examples. Where appropriate, brief reference may be made to alternative views and / or scholarly opinion. Limited knowledge and understanding of connections with other elements of the course of study are demonstrated.	15-19 22-28	The main issue is addressed with some supporting evidence or argument, but the reasoning is faulty, or the analysis superficial or only one view is adequately considered. Little of the response is related to the broader context and to human experience.	10-12 15-19	Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.
3	A summary of key points. Limited in depth or breadth. Answer may show limited understanding and limited relevance. Some coherence.	10-14 15-21	A basic attempt to justify a point of view relevant to the question. Some explanation of ideas and coherence.	7-9 10-14	
2	A superficial outline account, with little relevant material and slight signs of partial understanding, or an informed answer that misses the point of the question.	5-9 8-14	A superficial response to the question with some attempt at reasoning.	4-6 5-9	Little clarity and organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.
1	Isolated elements of partly accurate information little related to the question.	1-4 1-7	A few basic points, with no supporting argument or justification.	1-3 1-4	
0	Nothing of relevance.	0	No attempt to engage with the question or nothing of relevance	0	

RST3A: Religion and Ethics**Question 1 Libertarianism, free will and determinism**

0	1
---	---

Examine various understandings of the concept of free will.

Answers can come from a philosophical and/or religious perspective i.e. students may discuss free will as an essential part of human nature, from a (soft) deterministic, compatibilist and libertarian perspective, possibly including psychological understandings, the mind/body debate or from the understanding of religion(s) which might include the concepts of God's gift, karma and predestination.

Answers may include the idea of nature versus nurture, the conflict of free will within any society or religion.

'Various' can be taken to mean a variety of understandings within religion(s) e.g. God has given us free will but we need to be aware of the consequences of our actions; free will within boundaries, such as observing the commandments, or philosophical perspective(s) or 'variety' as in number/scope.

The focus has to be on free will and not be on libertarianism or determinism although these concepts may well be included in any response.

Some attempt to 'examine' the issues is necessary for level 7.

Maximum level 4 if the answer is mostly about libertarianism and/or determinism.

Maximum level 5 if there is only one understanding of free will cited.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0	2
---	---

'Free will is necessary for making ethical choices.' Assess this view.
In support

- Not really an *ethical* choice if one is coerced.
- Many religions teach that God did not create robots, but humans with reason and free thinking.
- Need to be able to understand the difference between right and wrong.
- Need to be held responsible for our choices and that only comes through freedom.
- What else is required as necessary for ethical choices?

Other views

- Is there such a thing as free will?
- One can make a choice even if coerced or incapable.
- It is not free will which is necessary but a knowledge/application of ethics/right and wrong.
- Sometimes one needs to do what is required by a higher authority, such as God.
- Many religions have a concept of pre-destination, and thus (ultimately) no free will but a person may still believe they are making an ethical choice.

[20 marks]**AO2**

Question 2 Virtue Ethics**0****3**

Examine the differences between Virtue Ethics and deontological and teleological systems of decision making.

Students will need to define all three key terms and then compare and contrast the various approaches.

Virtue Ethics focusses not on the action being right or wrong but on what makes a person 'good' with an emphasis on their character.

Deontological ethical systems claim that certain actions are right or wrong regardless of the consequences e.g. Natural law, Kantian ethics and the Divine Command theory. (Certain religious views might also be considered here). There is an emphasis on 'duty'.

Teleological ethical systems look at the consequences of an action to decide whether it is right or wrong e.g. Utilitarianism, Situation Ethics and certain religious views.

Most people would state that, ultimately, they want to be happy and pursue certain goals (thus teleological) to achieve this.

VE and teleological systems would both focus on the end result of certain behaviours or courses of action.

In order to address the trigger word 'Examine', students might approach this answer in depth or breadth.

If no mention of deontological and teleological, maximum level 4

If only address deontological and teleological, maximum level 5

If only mention deontological and teleological (no virtue ethics)- level 2

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

4

‘Virtue Ethics is a weak ethical system.’ Assess this view.

In support

- Virtues are subjective and possibly culturally relative.
- Virtue Ethics can be an unwieldy system to operate so not practical.
- Virtue Ethics doesn’t give us a clear response as to what to do.
- Surely motives matter as well as actions yet VE doesn’t take motive into account.
- An ethical system which tells us clearly what is right or wrong must be a strong one.

Other Views

- VE does allow some insight into a person’s motives.
- VE stresses the importance of educating a person in the virtues which leads to a better society in the long run.
- A person’s character should stay the same throughout life once a certain maturity is acquired.
- VE can operate in all sorts of situations.

The emphasis of the debate should be on the strengths and weaknesses of Virtue Ethics as an ethical system, not its advantages and disadvantages.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 3 Religious views on sexual behaviour and human relationships**0****5****Explain institutional-based ideas from one religion about sexual behaviour.**

Views cited may well be rooted in an interpretation of scripture, which will be explained, but the emanation must be from the institution. Answers can come from any source except directly from scripture or a personal perspective. E.g. Christianity, ideas could be cited from the Vatican, the Church of England, the Methodist Church etc.

E.g. Islam; the Muslim Public Affairs Council allows the use of contraception, but not for relationships outside of marriage and not for abortion purposes. The Council also says that homosexuality is contrary to Islamic guidelines, because it is a relationship outside marriage. To convict someone of this crime, there has to be a confession or at least 4 eye witnesses to the act of intercourse.

Sexual polygyny and polygamy happen extensively within the Muslim community in Nigeria despite the fact that religious leaders are against it. Because of this proclivity, many leaders have claimed that the AIDs virus is divine punishment for sexual immorality. Female sexual behaviour is more severely looked upon than male sexual behaviour.

Shari'a law endorses chastity and faithfulness within marriage. It also states that both men and women are entitled to sexual gratification within marriage and refusal to have sex is grounds for a divorce. Shari'a law also forbids rape; some branches consider it to be part of zina (forced adultery).

Sexual behaviour can include permitted and/or prohibited (such as rape, adultery, homosexuality) behaviour. The emphasis must be on behaviour rather than a relationship e.g. whilst an answer about adultery or sex before marriage is acceptable, one about marriage (or the wedding ceremony) solely would not be.

Maximum level 4 if the answer is mostly about marriage/weddings rather than sexual behaviour.

Maximum level 4 if *institutional-based* ideas are not the focus of the response.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

6

'Marriage can only be between a man and a woman.' Assess this view, with reference to religious teachings.

Not every point of view has to be connected to a specific religious teaching but most should be. Answers can come from one or more specified religions.

In support

- The definition of 'marriage'.
- Tradition.
- The teaching within scripture e.g. Genesis and Matthew ('A man shall leave his father and mother' etc.).
- Islam teaches that one of the purposes of marriage is to have children which only a heterosexual couple can do. The Prophet also said to 'marry fertile women'.
- The wording of religious marriage services.
- The fact that *religious* places of worship are not obliged to conduct 'gay' marriage services.

Other views

- The religious teachings which allow some religious groups to support gay marriage.
- Restricting marriage to heterosexual couples goes against many religious teachings on discrimination.
- The concept of love itself is paramount in many religions.
- Many religious people believe God created everyone and loves them as they are.

[20 marks]

AO2

Question 4 Science and technology

0

7

Examine the role of ethics in making decisions about animal experimentation.

- The 3R's of replacement, reduction and refinement are fundamental to the ethics of animal experimentation and should underlie the work on animals undertaken by scientists. Reduction – the aim for fewer experiments taking place; Refinement – not doing unnecessary procedures; Replacement – can it be done by other means?
- Any ethical system (such as Utilitarianism, religion, Kant etc.) can be taken when answering this question, or a general ethics approach can be used.
- The answer must be focussed on animal experimentation (although hybrid embryos, using animals as 'spare parts', genetically modified animals could be included in this answer).
- Ethics can either inform decisions or it can play catch-up after decisions have been made.
- Sometimes ethical decisions can be made after an emotional or knee-jerk response or after considered debate.
- Issues will inevitably centre around the problem of any animal suffering unnecessary pain, the reduction of their quality of life versus the increase of a human quality of life, lack of consent, animals as having instrumental or intrinsic value and about the use of live versus dead animals.
- Decisions concerning therapeutic and non-therapeutic research can be included.

Maximum level 5 if the focus of the answer is about the role of ethics in animal experimentation rather than the making of the decisions about animal experimentation.

[30 marks]**AO1**

0

8

'The rights of animals have no place in scientific developments.' Assess this claim.

In support

- In the opinion of some, animals have no rights.
- Scientific developments must proceed and someone/thing needs to be tested on.
- Human rights supercede animal rights so 'better' to test on animals than humans e.g. Northwick Park hospital.
- Animals don't sue so better to use them.
- The religious concept of dominion would agree.

Other views

- Animals are sentient beings and should be treated with dignity and respect as a minimum.
- Singer, and others, would say they should have the same rights as us; possibly more as they are innocent and defenceless.
- Religions teach stewardship and care for the animal kingdom implying rights.
- Can test on embryonic stem cells these days so no need to infringe any animal rights.

Maximum Level 5 if the idea of rights is not addressed

[20 marks]

AO2