



General Certificate of Education

Religious Studies 6061

**RS09 *Studies in Religion
and Ethics***

Mark Scheme

2008 examination – June series

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2008 AQA and its licensors

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced) A2 Level Descriptors

[Marks for 10-mark questions are shown in brackets]

Level	A2 Descriptor for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2	A2 Descriptor AO1	Marks	A2 Descriptor AO2	Marks
5	Highly appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A thorough treatment of the topic, which may be in depth or breadth. Information is accurate and relevant. A thorough understanding is shown through good use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate good knowledge and understanding of diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is demonstrated.	17-20 [9-10]	A very good response to issue(s) raised. Different views, including those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and evaluated perceptively. Effective use is made of evidence to sustain an argument. Systematic analysis and reasoning leads to appropriate conclusions. There may be evidence of independent thought.	17-20
4	Appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A generally thorough treatment of the topic. Information is accurate and relevant. Good understanding is demonstrated through use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, alternative views and / or scholarly opinion are satisfactorily explained.	13-16 [7-8]	A good response to issue(s) raised. Different views, including those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed. A process of reasoning leads to an appropriate conclusion. There may be some evidence of independent thought.	13-16
3	Mainly appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information; mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A satisfactory treatment of the topic. Information is mostly accurate and relevant. A reasonable understanding is demonstrated through use of some relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, some familiarity with diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is shown.	9-12 [5-6]	A satisfactory response to issue(s) raised. Views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments, and some critical analysis. A conclusion is drawn that follows from some of the reasoning.	9-12
2	Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A superficial answer, which includes some key facts and demonstrates limited understanding using some evidence / examples. Where appropriate, brief reference may be made to alternative views and / or scholarly opinion.	5-8 [3-4]	Main issue is addressed with some supporting evidence or argument, but the reasoning is faulty, or the analysis superficial or only one view is adequately considered.	5-8
1	Little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.	Isolated elements of accurate and relevant information. Some signs of understanding. Evidence and examples are sparse.	1-4 [1-2]	Some simple reasons or evidence are given in support of a view that is relevant to the question.	1-4
0	Little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.	Nothing of relevance.	0	No valid points made.	0

RS09: Studies in Religion and Ethics

1 (a) Explain Virtue Ethics as formulated by Alasdair MacIntyre.

MacIntyre believes we live in a moral vacuum, and we wrongly look up to 3 types of virtue-less people: the bureaucratic manager, the rich aesthete and the therapist. MacIntyre teaches that people take part in many 'practices' in life, and these involve co-operation with others, and internal and external 'goods'. People pursue excellence in these 'practices', by demonstrating certain virtues, and true happiness is a by-product of this strive for excellence. Living such a life allows people to 'flourish' and MacIntyre feels there are 3 characteristics of a flourishing person: evaluation, the ability to choose objectively and to rationalise. There are 3 important virtues: justice, courage and honesty. True happiness is for a community, rather than an individual.

Maximum Level 2 (8 marks) if only Aristotelian ethics are written about.

(20 marks) AO1

- (b) ***Explain one religious perspective on the issue of business espionage, and assess the view that neither Virtue Ethics nor this religious perspective is helpful with regard to this issue.***

Buddhism

The Dhammapada teaches that contentment is the greatest wealth. All wealth should be made normally. The Right Livelihood of the Eightfold Path says that one's livelihood should not be based on dishonesty. Espionage might well break the 2nd precept.

Christianity

The second of the 10 commandments forbids the worship of idols, which could include material wealth. The Bible also condemns all forms of theft and dishonesty, e.g. Leviticus 6 vs 1-5, Deuteronomy 25 vs 15-16, Proverbs 11 v 1, Exodus 20. St Paul wrote that 'thieves.....the greedy.....swindlers' do not inherit the kingdom of God (1 Corinthians 5 v 11 and 6 v 10). Fraud is sinful and immoral as it harms one's neighbour, alienates one from God and sets a bad example. One needs to examine one's motives.

Hinduism

Intention is very important. Espionage would go against the principle of Karma Yoga. It would also break the 2nd precept, the 3rd Yama and proper conduct.

Islam

The Hadith warn against greed at work. Trading should be honest and non-exploitative. Any form of cheating or unfair trading is dishonourable. Espionage would be haram.

Judaism

Greed and materialism are warned against in the Torah. They lead people to sin.

Sikhism

Espionage would go against the Sikh virtues of truthfulness, justice and contentment. It would also be against the principle of right livelihood. It would not be setting the right example to others (Dharamsal).

Maximum Level 2 (4 marks) if only general business ethics are discussed.
Maximum Level 3 (6 marks) if religious views are stated but not explained.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

For

- Most religions have nothing to say about the issue.
- Religious views are irrelevant in a largely secular world.
- It is hard to directly apply Virtue ethics to business espionage, as there is no hard and fast answer.
- Business espionage is seen as inevitable in the business world. The 'crime' is not doing it, but being caught.

Against

- Religion still has a lot of relevant things to say against greed and corruption.
- Virtue ethics focuses on the person, rather than the deed, as a good person does good things.
- Virtue Ethics looks at why someone has done something, and then offers strategies of help.
- There have to be some laws against business espionage, and either approach would provide a good starting point.

Conclusion based on debate.

Maximum Level 2 (8 marks) if discussion is only about general business ethics.

(20 marks) AO2

- 2 (a) Explain how both 'soft' determinists and Libertarians see people as using their free will to make ethical decisions.**

Candidates need to explain both of the terms 'soft' determinism and libertarianism and how these standpoints affect ethical decision making. 'Soft' determinism is a middle way between 'hard' determinism and libertarianism. 'Soft' determinism is the view that whilst we act freely, our responses are inevitably affected by our background, upbringing, etc. Within the 'soft' determinist stance, there are 'internal' and 'external' causes; the difference between choosing to do something, or having to do it. 'Soft' determinists believe that we are not forced to do things, but there might be some strong 'persuading' factors.

Libertarianism is the view that people are totally free when making ethical decisions. People are not determined or forced. Libertarians distinguish between one's personality and one's moral self; what one might want to do, versus what one knows one should do.

Both of these positions need explaining, with examples of an ethical nature. Maximum Level 3 (12 marks) if sparse or no examples of an ethical nature.

(20 marks) AO1

- (b) **Explain what is meant by a ‘hard’ determinist position on making ethical decisions, and, with reference to the religion you have studied, assess the view that religion cannot accept that ethical decisions are always determined.**

‘Hard’ determinism is the view that there are causes for every event / decision that happens. There is no moral / ethical choice; it is an illusion (e.g. Locke’s locked room). We are not responsible therefore for our ethical decisions.

Maximum Level 2 (4 marks) if ‘hard’ determinism is not explained with reference to ethical decisions.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

e.g. Christianity

For

- Christians believe that God gave humanity free will, viz the garden of Eden.
- On the cross, and in the desert, even Jesus had the choice of what to do.
- Although there are laws, humans are free to obey them or not.
- Even the concept of pre-destination allows for freedom as one does not know for what one is predestined.
- God does not want robots, but people who have chosen to follow him.
- Humans are responsible for own decisions.

Against

- There is not much choice, as, if one disobeys the rules, one can end up in Hell.
- The concept of predestination implies a lack of real freedom.
- The story of Job implies that choice is an illusion.
- Did Jesus, as Messiah, really have that much choice?
- So much contemporary evidence to suggest that decisions / life is determined. Religion could be wrong.
- A lot of ‘bad’ people seem to get away with things, so are people responsible for their decisions / actions?

Conclusion based on debate.

Maximum Level 3 (12 marks) if assessment is not related to ethical decisions.

(20 marks) AO2

- 3 (a) **Outline the ethical issues raised by genetic engineering, and examine the ways in which one religion has responded to these issues.**

Candidates may outline general ethical concerns raised by genetic engineering, and then put a religious viewpoint, or may combine the two. Ways include teachings but could also include practices.

Buddhism

Might well break the first precept. Life begins at conception. But the happiness of both the unborn foetus and the born should be taken into account, and an overriding principle is the avoidance of suffering. When making such moral decisions, Buddhists are asked to examine their motives.

Christianity

Scientists and doctors are 'playing God', but other Christians have argued that if God has given people this power and knowledge, then it should be used for the benefit of mankind. The Church of Scotland permits genetic engineering of animals to provide treatment of diseases, and animal organs being genetically modified, but animals should not suffer in experiments. There is also concern that humans may be trying to make themselves immortal by forever 'improving' themselves. The Methodist Church supports research on embryos not required for IVF treatments, up to the first 14 days, for answers to human infertility and certain genetic diseases. As regards genetic engineering on humans, the Roman Catholic Church does permit some interventions by Somatic Cell therapy but not Germ Line therapy. In 1995, Pope John Paul II said the idea of parents 'genetically enhancing' their children was 'shameful' and he believed that it would open up the way to the legislation of infanticide and euthanasia.

Hinduism

Intention is seen as important. Genetic engineering might break the first Precept, and affect one's karma and reincarnation. It could be against Aparigraha (the disciplining of desire and greed).

Islam

All life is in Allah's hands. To alter genetic material is to become Allah. It is haram.

Judaism

The first commandment in the Torah is to have children, so Judaism supports anything that can lead to couples having a family.

Sikhism

It could be argued that genetic engineering is performing dharamsal – looking after oneself and one's health. Motivation is important. Others should not be exploited.

Maximum Level 2 (8 marks) for general comments on genetic engineering.

(20 marks) AO1

- (b) ***Outline Virtue Ethics as formulated by Aristotle, and assess the view that, with regard to genetic engineering, following a Virtue Ethics approach is better than following a religious approach.***

Aristotle believed that everybody pursued the goal of happiness, eudaemonia. To achieve this, humans should follow the Virtues. Virtues can be bodily, character and intelligence. One has to learn and practise to become virtuous, and it involves following a middle way between a virtue and a vice. Self control is essential. Following a virtuous lifestyle, leads to eudaemonia which is happiness for the community rather than the individual.

(10 marks) AO1

Assess

For

- Virtue ethics is more flexible, for a modern situation.
- There is no mention of genetic engineering within any religion.
- A religious stance is inappropriate in a largely secular world.
- Virtue Ethics concentrates on the character of the person making the decision, rather than on the decision itself.

Against

- Virtue ethics seems to allow virtually anything; religion does have some rules to follow.
- Religion looks from the viewpoint of humanity and long-term issues rather than individual circumstance or self-aggrandisement.
- Religion is more concerned with sanctity of life issues rather than quality of life at any price.
- Religious views still have a part to play in today's world, and often act as a brake.

Conclusion based on debate.

Maximum Level 2 (8 marks) if the debate is not about genetic engineering.

(20 marks) AO2