GCE 2004
June Series

AQA

ASSESSMENT and
QUALIFICATIONS
ALLIANCE

Mark Scheme

Religious Studies Specification
RS09: Studies in Religion and Ethics
(Subject Code 5061/6061)

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Examination Levels of Response

Religious Studies (Advanced) A2 Level Descriptors

[Marks for 10-mark questions are shown in brackets]

Level	A2 Descriptor for Quality of Written Communication in AO1 and AO2	A2 Descriptor AO1	Marks	A2 Descriptor AO2	Marks
5	Highly appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A thorough treatment of the topic, which may be in depth or breadth. Information is accurate and relevant. A thorough understanding is shown through good use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate good knowledge and understanding of diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is demonstrated.	17-20 [9-10]	A very good response to issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed and evaluated perceptively. Effective use is made of evidence to sustain an argument. Systematic analysis and reasoning leads to appropriate conclusions. There may be evidence of independent thought.	17-20
4	Appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of information; appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A generally thorough treatment of the topic. Information is accurate and relevant. Good understanding is demonstrated through use of relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, alternative views and / or scholarly opinion are satisfactorily explained.	13-16 [7-8]	A good response to issue(s) raised. Different views, including where appropriate those of scholars or schools of thought, are discussed. A process of reasoning leads to an appropriate conclusion. There may be some evidence of independent thought.	13-16
3	Mainly appropriate form and style of writing; generally clear and coherent organisation of information; mainly appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; good legibility and fairly high level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A satisfactory treatment of the topic. Information is mostly accurate and relevant. A reasonable understanding is demonstrated through use of some relevant evidence and examples. Where appropriate, some familiarity with diversity of views and / or scholarly opinion is shown.	9-12 [5-6]	A satisfactory response to issue(s) raised. Views are explained with some supporting evidence and arguments, and some critical analysis. A conclusion is drawn that follows from some of the reasoning.	9-12
2	Form and style of writing appropriate in some respects; some of the information is organised clearly and coherently; some appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; satisfactory legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar.	A superficial answer, which includes some key facts and demonstrates limited understanding using some evidence / examples. Where appropriate, brief reference may be made to alternative views and / or scholarly opinion.	5-8 [3-4]	Main issue is addressed with some supporting evidence or argument, but the reasoning is faulty, or the analysis superficial or only one view is adequately considered.	5-8
1	Little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.	Isolated elements of accurate and relevant information. Some signs of understanding. Evidence and examples are sparse.	1-4 [1-2]	Some simple reasons or evidence are given in support of a view that is relevant to the question.	1-4
0	Little clarity and coherence in organisation; little appropriate and accurate use of specialist vocabulary; legibility and level of accuracy in spelling, punctuation and grammar barely adequate to make meaning clear.	Nothing of relevance.	0	No valid points made.	0

RS09: *Studies in Religion and Ethics*

1   **(a)**   *Examine the views within <u>one</u> religion you have studied regarding the issues raised by cloning.*

Candidates may begin with a brief definition of cloning and its purposes.

Candidates will be expected to answer from only one religion but should be aware of variations of thought within that religion, and be able to account for them.

For example, **within Christianity**

- The Church of England would say that God has given us this knowledge to use for the good of mankind, but the birth of children should be natural.

- The Roman Catholic church is against cloning. We are not meant to create life. We should value people for their uniqueness, not try and copy them. Cloning potentially violates the human rights of equality and non-discrimination. Using embryos for experimentation is tantamount to murder.

- The Church of Scotland agrees with the cloning of animals in order to create birth, but not for commercial reasons. Cloning humans is unethical. There are benefits of embryo research under limited circumstances.

For example, **within Buddhism**

- Motivation behind cloning is important in Buddhism.
- Would see desire for therapeutic cloning as compassion.
- Concept of 'Hiri' – self respect; the quality which causes us to avoid any moral action which might lower our integrity.
- Concept of 'Ahimsa' – the inviolability of life.
- However, balance all this with compassion for the suffering of others.

Maximum Level 3 for a simply descriptive answer. For Levels 4 and 5 candidates need to recognise different views and show understanding of them.

                                   (20 marks)   **AO1**

(b) *"Cloning in itself is not necessarily unethical; it is what might be done with the clones that is potentially unethical."*

Examine the issues raised by this statement, and assess how far it can be said to be true.

Examine the issues

Candidates should unpack the quotation to show knowledge and understanding of the ethical issues involved in cloning. They may include such points as:

Potential benefits of cloning
- Greater understanding of the causes of cancer, diseases which damage cells, replacing failing organs, reducing the process of ageing, infertility
- Halting the extinction of certain plants, animals
- Enabling sick children to get better by cloning a sibling
- Enabling superior genes (i.e. genius) to continue

Potential unethical uses of cloning
- 277 wasted attempts before Dolly; issue of embryo experimentation
- Eugenics and Hitler
- Unknown psychological effects upon the clone
- Black market for cloned embryos may occur

Other issues raised
- The technique employed (e.g. ethical implications of reproductive versus non-reproductive cloning)
- The legality of cloning
- The unforeseen consequences and dangers

Basic answers
Will be narrowly focused on one aspect or superficial.

Developed answers
Will refer to a diversity of issues or explore some in depth.

(10 marks) **AO1**

Assess the claim

There may be some repetition of points here, or some of the points listed may appear for the first time in this part of the answer. Because of the nature of the quotation, allow maximum flexibility, and expect both separated and integrated answers.

Look for a focus on the claim itself and for assessment of the ethical arguments.

Arguments **for** the claim
Will focus on the possibilities of the misuse of clones, some candidates may discuss the ethical neutrality of the procedure itself. This may be approached in a variety of ways.

Arguments **against** the claim may be
- That cloning is unethical in itself regardless of any benefits or potential dangers
- That cloning may be neutral or ethical but there are other unethical consequences than the use of clones.

There may be some debate of the application of ethical principles, which might come from Virtue Ethics or a religion, or even from Utilitarianism or Kant.

(20 marks) **AO2**

2   **(a)**   *Explain the Virtue Ethics approach as presented by Alisdair MacIntyre.*

Candidates should include some of the following points:
- Influential book 'After Virtue'
- MacIntyre questioned all modern moral reasoning, including Kant and Utilitarianism
- Said there was too much stress on 'reasoning' and not enough on the way one lived.
- The effect is a 'moral vacuum'; nobody knows what is definitively right or wrong
- MacIntyre's allegory regarding the teaching of Science
- Moral issues today boil down to opinion based on emotion
- In the moral vacuum, there are 3 main types; the bureaucratic manager, the rich aesthete and the therapist
- Need to introduce Aristotelian view of 'Telos'
- People should aspire to be virtuous in order to achieve 'goods'
- Goods can be internal and external
- The 3 most important virtues are: justice, courage and honesty
- Virtue Ethics should be for the community, rather than individuals
- The need to become 'independent practical reasoners'.

Candidates need to show some explanation of the key ideas. Maximum Level 3 for an outline account that does not explain.

(20 marks)   **AO1**

(b)   *Outline a religious approach to the problem of business espionage, and assess how far a Virtue Ethics approach may be seen to be better than a religious approach.*

Outline
Candidates should only write about the views of one religion on business espionage but be aware of and be able to explain different strands of opinion within that religion. Only an outline is expected.

e.g. Christianity and Business Espionage

- Business espionage is essentially spying on the activities of an institution to gain some advantage.
- It is essentially 'stealing', thus breaking a commandment.
- Concept of greed, and love of money and prestige.
- Warnings of prophets about unjust practices.
- Idea of being accountable to God.
- "The love of money is the root of all evil." 1 Timothy 6 [10]

e.g. Buddhism and Business Espionage

- Concept of Justice – is spying on another company 'just'?
- The problem of how the information has been acquired.
- The conflict between 'right consumption' and 'wrong consumption'.
- Dishonest practices will lead to bad rebirth.
- Espionage breaks the second moral precept – do not steal.

(10 marks)   **AO1**

Assess
Candidates should discuss what 'better' might mean and the relative merits of a
Virtue Ethics approach and a religious approach to business ethics, e.g.

For
- Virtue Ethics is concerned with the whole person, considering both character
  and achievements
- Virtue Ethics encompasses all aspects of life, rather than particular actions
- Virtue Ethics looks at motives rather than rules
- Virtue Ethics wants us to be ultimately happy.

All of the above would be echoed by Christianity

But
- Darwin said we did things solely to benefit ourselves. Morality is simply
  socially advantageous behaviour – most religions would disagree
- Ayer claims that all moral judgements are based on emotion, on what we feel
  is right or wrong. Morality is also relative, and thus likely to change dependent
  on the circumstances
- 'Virtuous' behaviour can be interpreted differently, religious view can also be
  open to interpretation, e.g. Does 'Do not steal' apply to ideas? But religious
  laws are generally more 'set', tried and agreed than Virtue Ethics which is
  usually agreed to be open to interpretation.
- More people in the world are probably guided by religious view, than Virtue
  Ethics
- Religion tends to think of the whole community rather than enabling oneself to
  become a better / happier person
- Idea of accountability, in this life and the next

There might be some discussion about MacIntyre's 3 types and / or the 3 most
important virtues of justice, courage and honesty.

Candidates also need to evaluate what the religion they have chosen has to say about
business ethics.

                                                                              (20 marks)   **AO2**

3   **(a)**   *Define the terms Free Will and determinism and examine the relationship between them.*

Candidates should define both terms, and then explain the problems regarding the co-existence of the two ideas. Good explanations should include exemplification and / or scholars.

Definition of Free Will:

- Idea of free choice
- But also, being responsible and aware of the consequences of our actions
- Blame or praise can only be attributed to freely done actions

Definitions of Determinism:

- Our decisions and choices are already established by earlier causes, existing situations or natural laws
- The future is planned out
- Choice is an illusion
- Behaviour is controlled by genetic and environmental facts
- We cannot control our behaviour

The **relationship** between the two should include:
- Is it possible to exercise any choice? (soft determinism)
- Do we have moral responsibility for our actions? (hard determinism says No)
- Internal and external cause debate (choice versus being forced)

Maximum Level 3 if only one of these referred to, however well done.

(20 marks)   **AO1**

(b)   *"Morality depends on Freedom."*

Explain the main moral principles of <u>one</u> religion you have studied, and assess how far within that religion it can be said that morality depends on freedom.

Explain
Candidates should discuss the main moral principles of one religion. For Christianity this might include the Ten Commandments, love thy neighbour, love of and obedience to God, agape, responsibility for Free Will, need for repentance.

(10 marks)   **AO1**

Assess
Whether the ability to be moral depends on personal freedom or not. There may also be a discussion on the place of personal freedom within the cited religion.

For
The idea for personal freedom includes the concept of sin and need for forgiveness and repentance. If we had no freedom, we would not make decisions, and sin. The idea of being accountable, both in this life and the next Jesus on the cross submitting to God's will.

Against
The idea against personal freedom within Christianity is the concept of all tainted by Original Sin; the idea of being 'called'; Predestination; idea of God 'knowing' us and having a plan for each of our lives.

(20 marks)   **AO2**