

Examiners' Report
June 2019

GCE History 9HI0 33

Edexcel and BTEC Qualifications

Edexcel and BTEC qualifications come from Pearson, the UK's largest awarding body. We provide a wide range of qualifications including academic, vocational, occupational and specific programmes for employers. For further information visit our qualifications websites at www.edexcel.com or www.btec.co.uk.

Alternatively, you can get in touch with us using the details on our contact us page at www.edexcel.com/contactus.



Giving you insight to inform next steps

ResultsPlus is Pearson's free online service giving instant and detailed analysis of your students' exam results.

- See students' scores for every exam question.
- Understand how your students' performance compares with class and national averages.
- Identify potential topics, skills and types of question where students may need to develop their learning further.

For more information on ResultsPlus, or to log in, visit www.edexcel.com/resultsplus. Your exams officer will be able to set up your ResultsPlus account in minutes via Edexcel Online.

Pearson: helping people progress, everywhere

Pearson aspires to be the world's leading learning company. Our aim is to help everyone progress in their lives through education. We believe in every kind of learning, for all kinds of people, wherever they are in the world. We've been involved in education for over 150 years, and by working across 70 countries, in 100 languages, we have built an international reputation for our commitment to high standards and raising achievement through innovation in education. Find out more about how we can help you and your students at: www.pearson.com/uk.

June 2019

Publications Code 9HI0_33_1906_ER

All the material in this publication is copyright
© Pearson Education Ltd 2019

Introduction

It was pleasing to see candidates continue to be able to engage effectively across the ability range with A Level paper 33 which deals with the Witchcraze in Britain, Europe and North America, 1580-c1750.

The paper is divided into three sections. Section A contains a compulsory question which is based on two enquiries linked to one source. It assesses source analysis and evaluation skills (AO2). Section B comprises a choice of essays that assess understanding of the period in depth (AO1) by targeting five second order concepts - cause, consequence, change and continuity, similarity and difference, and significance. Section C comprises a choice of essays that relate to aspects of the process of change over a period of at least 100 years (AO1). Most candidates appeared to organise their time effectively and there was very little evidence of candidates being unable to attempt all three sections of the paper within the time allocated this summer. Examiners continued to comment on the fact that a significant minority of scripts posed some problems with the legibility of hand writing. Examiners can only give credit for what they can read.

In Section A, the strongest answers demonstrated an ability to draw out and develop reasoned inferences from the source for both enquiries and to evaluate the source thoroughly in relation to the demands of the two enquiries on the basis of both contextual knowledge and the nature, origin and purpose of the source. It is pleasing to note that last summer's advice was taken on board by many candidates and there were fewer examples this summer of candidates suggesting that weight can be established by a discussion of what is missing from a source. This summer there was some evidence of more candidates using often extensive contextual knowledge to drive an answer to the enquiry, rather than using it to illuminate and discuss the source. This resulted in candidates not dealing with the source adequately.

In Section B, examiners were impressed by the number of responses that clearly understood the importance of identifying the appropriate second order concept that was being targeted by the question. However, it continues to be the case that weaker candidates often wanted to turn questions into a main factor/other factors approach, even where this was not appropriate to the focus of the question. Candidates should be aware of key dates, as identified in the specification, and ensure that they draw their evidence in responses from the appropriate time period.

In Section C, most candidates were able to engage with the elements of the process of change that are central in this section of the examination. This is a breadth question and the questions that are set encompass a minimum of 100 years. Candidates are reminded again that this has important implications for the higher levels in bullet point 2 of the mark scheme. To access bullet point 2 at Level 5 candidates are expected to have responded 'fully' to the demands of the question. The requirements of questions will vary and key developments relating to the question may be more specific to the entire chronological range in some questions and options than in others. However, it was judged not possible for candidates to have 'fully met' the demands of any Section C question unless at least 75% of the chronological range of the question was addressed. To access bullet point 2 at Level 4 candidates need to meet most of the demands of the question. It was unlikely that most of the demands of the question would be met if the answer had a restricted range that covered less than 60% of its chronology.

In both Sections B and C when dealing with AO1, not all candidates demonstrated a secure understanding of what is meant by 'criteria' in terms of bullet point 3 of the mark scheme. Some candidates explicitly state in the introduction to the essay that they are naming the criteria that they plan to use, when in actual fact they are referring to the issues or the factors that will be discussed in the response. 'Criteria' in bullet point 3 of the mark scheme refers to the basis on which candidates reach their judgement, not the issues that are discussed in the process of

reaching that judgement. There was some tendency this summer, in all sections of the paper, for some candidates to replicate the words and phrases of the mark scheme in their responses. It is the application of the requirements of the mark scheme that is crucial.

The candidates' performance on individual questions is considered in the next section.

Question 1

Most candidates were able to make several inferences from the source. Often these were reasoned and were relevant to the two enquiries. Equally, most candidates attempted to address both enquiries, although candidates were more confident in addressing the first enquiry, regarding the beliefs in the power of witches, which was covered well. A number of responses said that the source was not useful in showing how witch-hunts were organised, showing a lack of comprehension of the source. In lower scoring answers, candidates often called upon limited own knowledge that was sometimes only vaguely relevant to the question. Another issue that was more prevalent this year was the inclusion of own knowledge from other case studies, or general points about witchcraft that were not necessarily relevant to the two enquiries. Most candidates attempted to address the provenance of the source with varying levels of success. Higher scoring candidates were able to utilise the provenance of the source when making judgements, and showed genuine insight into the reasons for Potts' inclusion of certain material (eg his agenda was to report on the extreme danger posed by witches and he therefore selected material that focuses on the harm and deaths they caused). However for many provenance was often used in a simplistic fashion, asserting that because Bromley checked and revised the account he must have falsified it. In a significant minority of lower scoring answers, too many candidates concentrated on what the source didn't include rather than what it did, particularly when candidates were attempting to explain the limitations of the source (eg including information that was simply missing from the source without explaining why this may have been missed out by the author).

- 1 Assess the value of the source for revealing beliefs in the power of witches and the organisation of witch-hunts in early seventeenth-century Lancashire.

Explain your answer, using the source, the information given about its origin and your own knowledge about the historical context.

(20)

The Lancashire witch trials of 1612 to 23 were ~~inquired by Roger Nowell~~ ^{centred around} ~~centred around~~ resulted in the accusation of 61 people, ~~some~~ ⁶ of which came from the two families the Charltoes and Demolines who were all found guilty of witchcraft. Therefore this source is ~~useful~~ ^{valuable} for a historian to understand beliefs regarding how the power of witches originates and where it derives from as well as how the witch-hunt was actually conducted. It is prudent to assess the value of the source by examining its comprehensiveness, objectivity, accuracy and typicality. Therefore overall the comprehensiveness and accuracy of the source makes it useful for exploring both issues.

In terms of the content of the source, a historian could regard the source

as valuable in explaining the beliefs in the powers of the witches. The source states that Chatterbox confesses to being 'seduced to become a member of that devilish abominable profession of witchcraft' which ~~evidences~~ ^{showcases} the belief in the diabolical part. It was superstition that the ~~best~~ witches formed a pact with the devil and they received their powers as a result, this is compounded by Chatterbox's comparison of swearing the 'spirit' 'Tibb' which witches received to aid with spells and potion and is further evidence of the diabolical part. Furthermore, it is indicative of how witches were typically regarded as women and also poor as they were easily seduced by the charms of the devil and the riches he would offer in exchange of their servitude; the 'gold, silver and worldly wealth'. This justifies and legitimates the belief that witches were more likely to be poor as the devil offered witches and the Chatterbox and Remdishes had reputations of begging and supporting themselves with white magic. The Chatterbox were also squatters

on Nutter's land and this testimony makes it believable that witches were typically old, female and poor, ^{evidently} conforming the stereotype. ~~However the source could also be regarded as limited~~ therefore the source is valuable for a historian understanding how beliefs about who who was a typical witch were perpetrated, as well as understanding how witches power originated. The source provides factual and typical beliefs which is entirely accurate in the context of the Lancashire witch-hunt. However the source is perhaps limited in ~~it~~ detailing another likely characteristic that caused victims to be suspected of witchcraft. Alice Nutter, ^{who was also accused} depicts the stereotype as she was wealthy and came from a respectable family. However she was ~~reputed~~ ^{suspected} to be a witch as she was suspected of being Catholic and her guilt is reinforced as she did not attend Easter Sunday service and according to Jennet Devore was present at the Murther Tower ~~meeting~~.

meeting. This reveals to a historian how different beliefs caused different individuals to be targeted and suspected. However overall the source is still very comprehensive, and thus valuable for describing different beliefs held about the beliefs in the power of witch-hunt.

Regarding the content of the source, it can also be described as valuable for detailing the organisation of the witch-hunts for a historian. 'First, the said Anne Whittle... said' is indicative of the importance of a confession as being central to the trials, as it implicates the witch and ~~confirms~~ ^{confirms} the existence of witchcraft, and is arguably the most crucial as ~~the~~ evidence to convict and execute the witches. ~~Therefore~~ Therefore this provides accurate and valuable detail for a historian understanding the organisation of the hunt. Furthermore the source details that Chatter's confession was ~~crucial~~ prompted 'after the wished permission and counsel of ... Demdike'

which is valuable for understanding
how ^{as part of the organisation of the witch-hunt} ~~organisations are important~~
^{it} ~~regards~~ includes how ^{were prompted} ~~are able~~
to implicate others as it enables
officials to gather as many ^{made easy by the chattox, Demdike &ivalry.} ~~witches~~
as possible. This also evidences the
fundamental belief that ^{believing} ~~no~~ other
witches must also exist. Jennet
Denne was able to implicate her
entire family as well as naming
Alice Nutter and Anne Bedeigne at
the Malton tower meeting, which
reinforces ~~by~~ the importance of naming
as driving the momentum of the
witch-hunt. Therefore this source
is very accurate in detailing how
organisations are conducted making
it valuable. However the source can
be seen as limited to an extent as
it only details the proceedings and
organisation of the trials, rather
than the hunt overall, it mentions that
'chattox was further questioned' but does
not detail how the interrogation was
conducted and the types of methods

such as watching and sleep deprivation which was central for extracting confessions from defendants. It also does not detail how other evidence such as the effigy found at Mathun Tower was collected by Roger Nowell ~~was~~ to be used as further evidence against the accused. Therefore the source will provide ^{value in its} evidence of many of the procedures and organisation, but is less comprehensive in the organisation of the witchhunt preceding the court trial.

~~Table~~ Regarding the provenance of the source, the source is arguably ~~very~~ valuable to a large extent for a historian to use to understand beliefs in the power of witches and the organisation of the witchhunt. The account is by 'Thomas Polts' who was present during the ~~trial~~ trial and testimony of the Demidkes and Chatter. Furthermore being a clerk and acting as an official of the court a historian would expect his accounts to be detailed and factual which makes

his account ~~is~~ valuable and reliable.

Furthermore as an official he would have a detailed awareness of the procedure and organisation of the witch hunt. However Potts' testimony may be less valuable to a historian due to its

subjectivity as Potts was influenced by 'two presiding judges' Bromley and Atham who checked his accounts and also wrote sections of the account.

Bromley and Atham would have a political agenda to present the trial as compromising to King James' daemonic reign in order to gain favour from the King and further their career. This compromises the accuracy of the accounts as some detail regarding methods used (particularly as torture was illegal in England) and how evidence was collected may have been obscured to present the judges in the best way. However alternatively their subjectivity could be valuable to a historian gleaming beliefs about the power of witches as it provides them with an idea of stereotypical views

as well as what the appraisals and judge were looking for. Therefore the source overall is ~~useful~~ ^{valuable} as limits of its subjectivity is combatted by the accuracy of the sources.

Therefore overall the sources have immense value to a historian exploring the belief in the power of witches and the organisation of the courts as they are very comprehensive and accurate. Despite Potts not being from ~~the area~~ Lancashire and perhaps being ignorant of local superstition and beliefs his accounts details the testimony of the local families and suggest that these beliefs were typical. Moreover he is very ~~useful~~ ^{valuable} in detailing the organisation of the trial and alludes to the organisation preceding the trial. Therefore the source is of value of both issues, but moves on for a historian understanding beliefs about the powers of witches.



This is a Level 5 response where the candidate fully considers both enquiries and only brings in contextual knowledge to weigh up and evaluate what is in the source. The candidate also explores the provenance of the source in some detail and uses this to weigh up the value of the source.



Make sure you are including contextual knowledge which is linked to and explains what is in the source, rather than focussing on what is not included.

Question 2

This question was selected by the majority of candidates of the two depth questions. Overall this was done well. Candidates were clearly well prepared for this question and this is reflected in the number of answers that received Level 4 or above. Most candidates were able to explain the various economic issues facing Germany in the 1620s and 30s, with many linking this to the Thirty Years' War. Most candidates were able to provide substantial evidence on economic hardship, particularly the adverse weather conditions, inflation, plunder during the Thirty Years' War and the profits the Prince-Bishops were able to make. Surprisingly, only a minority of candidates were able to adequately explain other causes of inflation (eg coin clipping and the decline of silver imports from America). Most candidates compared economic issues to a range of other factors, including the role of Prince Bishop von Dornheim, the use of torture and the context of the Counter-Reformation. Lower scoring candidates tended to present these issues in a list-like approach without evaluating the relative importance of the factors.

The Bamberg witch trials of 1629-32 were brutal - with contemporary records claiming that 642 individuals were accused with only 45 being released or escaping. The enormity of the witch hunt can be attributed to a culmination of factors and in order to analyse whether economic factors - which can find itself intertwined with the allowance of property confiscation under the ~~economic~~ law-~~code~~ must be analysed in comparison to the religious context, the Thirty Year's War and the Zeal of Prince Bishops and their overzealous use of torture.

Bamberg suffered significantly from environmental irregularity which impacted crops and caused widespread misery - with the 1620's being coined the little Ice Age. This can be seen to create a need for scapegoats - with accusations peaking in 1629 - the year the frost killed the wine crop and petitions to overlords demanding the eradication of witches in a particular village or parish ~~increasing~~ increasing after the 1626 frost according to the Mayor of Zeil. Ultimately the poor weather and witchcraft accusations are intertwined with

Merchurien being changed with plating to ~~freeze~~ freeze Bamberg's crops in 1626. The supply of money was also an issue which caused widespread insecurity and created the ideal conditions for a witch hunt to manifest - with imports, from America, of silver declining in 1610 and the gold content of the florin decreasing from 79-77% in ~~1610~~ 1626 - causing Margarethe Eissmannin to turn to the devil after the value of money ~~increase~~ decreased and the price of goods increased. A further example is Margarethe Gussbacherin who confessed to prostituting herself to a man in a black feather hat to save herself from poverty - seen to be a securing of the diabolic pact with the Devil. Ultimately, it was in the interest of the Prince Bishop that the frost did not return, after having to levy higher taxes when debt from the war increased to 800,000 florins. This can be seen to correlate to property confiscations - whilst they were undoubtedly used by the Prince Bishop's in order to increase their own wealth - 500,000 florins were collected which enabled the authorities to pay some of the debt (100,000 were taken from Georg Neudecker). The law allowed this and the victim also had to pay for the travel costs of torturers, the court costs and the family had to pay for every aspect of the execution -

this benefitted the local economy and increased the profits of blacksmiths and lawyers. However, it did mean that those of higher social classes were disproportionately targeted - 10 members of the town's council or Mayor's office were executed and 20 relatives were found guilty. In conclusion, the economic hardship provided the ideal conditions for fears about witches to manifest themselves into a witch hunt and to act as a catalyst in accusations. Residents of Bamberg had little understanding of economics and so were quick to blame misfortune on the popular scapegoat - witches. Persecutions also were functional to paying off war debts which performed the ideological function of appearing to make the Prince Bishops successful - thus securing their role.

However, economic problems alone are not the only precursor to the hunts, the religious conflicts ~~also~~ were also significant in creating tension and uncertainty. In 1548, Charles V decided that the religion of the ruler would be the religion of the region and after bishops became prince-bishops in 1242 and led a counter-reformation in the 16th century - many regions were Catholic, and whilst the Calvinists, Catholics and Lutherians all lived in

harmony - this could easily be disrupted. This is especially so due to the political and judicial fragmentation in Germany which meant that parties could easily take hold and Protestants became popular scapegoats. This was particularly so in Bamberg after von Ach~~ba~~ussen was elected Prince Bishop in 1609 and converted protestant parishes to catholicism through imposing fines and restricting the supply of wood to parishes who would not convert and through rounding up and imprisoning Lutherans. He had approximately 300 witches executed during this time. This created increased tension, especially when combined with the Thirty Years' War (1618-48) - whose ^{causes} ~~causes~~ lay in the religious divisions of Northern Europe and the ambitions of the Habsburg monarchy. This caused disruption through soldiers requisitioning food (causing famine) and horses being taken by the horses when they were travelling through - young men were also conscripted - the population which would decline by 40% during the war was already in decline - which can be seen to have caused widespread insecurity and the need for a scapegoat. Therefore, not only did the war create debt which led to economic problems - but its very happening attributed to construct the ideal conditions for a witch hunt - whilst the

Underlying condemnation of Protestants in Bamberg led to stark religious divisions which enabled the Prince Bishops to exercise their zeal and increase the scale of the hunts.

The persecutions began in 1595 with Margarethe Kemmerin who was executed by von Thuringen for worshipping the Devil for 10 years, following the accusation of Lena Pantzerin for witchcraft in 1612. An intense period of witchhunting also occurred under von Achaussen between 1616-19. However, it was the election of von Dornheim in 1623 which removed any opposition to witchhunting. Von Dornheim took a personal interest in the hunts (known as Hexenbischof) and built Molefiz House - a specially designed witch prison to house torture devices in 1627, which involved torture such as the Bamberg Kneeler, Strappado, flogging, salt and peppering food followed by water deprivation and burning women's hair (allowed under the 1532 Carolina law code). This significantly increased the scale of the hunts with the Mayor of Bamberg, John Junius, being subjected to the most brutal torture documented - sending a letter to his daughter saying that it forced him to confess despite being innocent. Dornheim hired his

legal adviser, Frederick Forner and interrogator, Ernst Vasolt Forner provided the intellectual framework required for the hunts and the pair both agreed that it was acceptable to torture suspected witches because the Devil used violence and that the Protestant rebellion and increased maleficium was evidence of the final stage of the battle between God and the Devil. Furthermore, Vasolt demanded that suspects provide 100 names of suspect accomplices. Ultimately, the Prince Bishops increased religious conflict through their condemnation of Protestants, increased the economic difficulties in their pursuit of wealth and were instrumental in the escalation of the hunts - which only stopped when von Dornheim fled in 1632.

In conclusion, the ~~and~~ accumulation of these factors enabled the conditions ideal for a witch hunt to manifest itself, however, arguably, economic factors are at the center of this, with all other factors underpinning this. The economic difficulties were the result of unchangeable phenomena for the most part - yet the religious conflict which resulted in the Thirty Years War meant that there was widespread famine and increased debt. This encouraged the Prince Bishops to seek

out witches in order to confiscate their property and pay back the debt - it also increased their enthusiasm when they experienced the financial rewards of the hunts, subsequently encouraging them to use torture to ~~the~~ gain more confessions and thus confessions - impoverishing families in a period of economic misfortune - and thus the ideal, unstable conditions in which witch hunts apparently thrived. As Peter Wilson noted ~~regarding~~ - "this economic difficulty caused widespread misery and made it harder for people to cope with the resumption and intensification of the conflict from 1625". Despite the accumulation of these factors, the factor which prompted the initial persecution can be seen to lay in the economic difficulty which heightened societal tension and created a necessity for a scape goat.



In this Level 5 response the candidate has a range of detailed evidence to back up the points made. Each factor is compared back to the stated factor before the response reaches a convincing conclusion where this evidence is weighed up.



Make sure you compare the alternative factors back to the stated factor at the end of each paragraph.

Question 3

Although this question was less popular than Question 2, the candidates that did attempt it were generally well prepared and were often able to provide detailed knowledge of the period. Higher scoring candidates discussed in detail the role of children, both before the trials and during their peak (eg through the use of spectral evidence). Better scoring candidates were also able to provide links between the role of children and other issues in Salem, such as the trauma they may have experienced as a result of Indian attacks. Lower scoring candidates focused too closely on a small number of issues, such as the role of Tituba, without putting them into context or providing comparisons between factors. The key issue with answers to this question was the level to which candidates addressed the term severity. The best answers tried to measure the severity by measuring the number of victims resulting from a particular factor but most simply focused on the causes of the Salem hunt. These answers tended to describe the role of children before the trial and compare them to other causal factors.

It could be argued that it was the involvement of the children, religious ambitions and the tensions between Salem Town and village that resulted in the severity of the trials from 1692-3. The involvement of children from the Parris family in particular may have exacerbated the severity of the trials, however it could be argued that village tensions as a result of radical Puritanism in Salem had more historical significance. Perhaps due to religion being the root of the persecutions with individuals such as Cotton Mather attempting to persecute any non-conformists. Therefore, whilst the children may have partly pulled the severity of the trials from below, it could be argued that the other factors pivot on religion and the severity of the trials which was exacerbated from above.

Firstly, the involvement of the children in Salem may have increased the severity of the trials, due to their use of spectral evidence in court and what may now be considered to be false fits and possessions. In the Salem trials Elizabeth, daughter to Samuel Parris and her cousin Abigail Williams had allegedly been practicing fortune telling and sorcery, with help from the house slave Tituba. The girls eventually began to break out in fits and doctor Griggs blamed witchcraft as the cause. The girls implicated many women between them, with over 30 being executed and their scenes in testifying became notorious. The *thergo* precedent for child testimonies being set by Fennet Devise in the Lancashire trials of 1610 and recorded in Potts' 'The Country Justice'. Therefore, the involvement of children in Salem may have emphasised the severity of the trials, as they implicated the majority of the

executed witches and also, were arguably the catalyst which allowed religious individuals such as Mather to pursue their condemnation of witches. However, it could be argued that whilst the involvement of children contributed, it may have been the judiciary's willingness to accept spectral evidence from the girls which facilitated the growth of the panic in Salem and without this, the child testimonies may have been discredited. Therefore, although the courts and the children had a role to play in driving the witch hunt in Salem from below, it may ultimately be suggested that religious fanaticism holds overarching historical significance, as the other factors are arguably reliant on this and it demonstrates the continuity of religious persecution against minorities.

The village tensions which prevailed in Salem may have also aided the severity of the trial, perhaps in line

with historian Brian Macfarlane's view that the witch trials are driven by villager accusations ~~and~~ when viewing history from below. In Salem there were two main areas, the Village and the Town, with the majority of the accusations coming from the village, perhaps due to further isolation in comparison to the town. There were the rivalling Porter and Putnam families from the town and village, who arguably may have increased the severity of the trials by battling for religious primacy and governance of Salem. For example, a large number of the Putnam family were involved in accusations, with child Ann Putnam begrudging Elizabeth Parris and denouncing women as witches, thereby linking to the previous theme. Therefore, villager tensions between the Porters and the Putnams, similar to the rivalling Chattox and Demdike in Lancashire may have driven the severity of the trials with local

grievances driving the Salem hunt from below. However, it may be argued that the village tensions alone were not enough to completely emphasise the severity of the Salem trials, as it's clear that the tensions are perhaps reliant on the involvement of the children to facilitate the pursuit of their local grievances and also the tensions were ultimately rooted in religion. Therefore, this may hold the least historical significance in comparison to other factors, as it must also be considered how the trials were driven from above by the religious elite.

Finally, it may be argued that it was the fanatical Puritanism of the Mather's in Salem which ultimately fuelled the severity of the trials, with the prosecution of witches perhaps being a result of the continuation of Puritanism in Salem. For example, Cotton Mather was a Puritan minister who

became a respected, religious authority in the English colonies.

His book 'Memorable providences' in 1689 arguably became a guide to conducting the Salem trials and he arguably had overarching authority in the town, due to its Puritan roots.

This may be supported by the fact that the first women implicated, such as Sarah Osborne was seen to deviate from Puritan values and was therefore seen as a social outcast. It may be argued that

the fact she was implicated and executed may have been a result of radical Puritans and therefore,

this may demonstrate how religion ~~or~~ drove the severity of the trials in Salem, by persecuting religious enemies. Although, it may

be considered that Puritans such as Increase Mather became sceptical about the Salem hunt

and therefore may not have contributed to the severity. It must be

considered that Puritanism may have kick started the initial

moral panic in Salem and therefore this may be the most historically significant. This is due to the displaying of the forces of history from above through the religious elite and also the effects on below when examining village tensions induced by religion. Furthermore, the other factors are arguably reliant on religion.

In conclusion, whilst it must be considered that historians disagree about the significance of different factors. Religion in the purging radical Puritanism may be seen as the most significant, as it highlights how history can be driven from above and below whilst also facilitating the other factors. Therefore, religious fanaticism may be seen to have caused the severity of the Salem witch trials from 1692-3.



The candidate focuses clearly on the stated factor before considering alternative factors in this response, although these comparisons could be slightly stronger. The candidate also has detailed supporting evidence to support the arguments made which means that this response is just into Level 5.



Make sure you are clearly comparing the alternative factors back to the stated factor at the end of each paragraph - this will ensure that you are analytical throughout.

Question 4

This was the most popular of the breadth questions and candidates were largely able to provide a variety of material from across the period. Higher scoring candidates included detailed knowledge of Bekker's work and significance, putting Bekker in a clear contextual position, linking his work to the Demon Drummer of Tedworth case and assessing his reaction across Europe. Some lower scoring candidates failed to address Bekker at all, or gave only a superficial or vague overview of his work. These candidates clearly preferred to discuss other sceptical cases and publications. At higher levels, candidates were able to closely evaluate the various authors and thinkers, often presenting their drawbacks as well as their strengths. At lower levels, the achievements of sceptical writers and thinkers were listed with little analysis and many responses were generic discussions of sceptical publications and fraudulent cases, without analysing them against the relative significance of Bekker. It also appeared many candidates were hoping for a 'Science' question and it is worthwhile remembering that in Section C both questions may be on one breadth study.

The years 1580 - 1750 saw a gradual development in the growth of scepticism which was due to a variety of reasons. For example, the rise in the coming of age of science and reason resulted in the growth increase of logical ~~approach~~ and rational approaches towards dealing with the witch trials. Balthasar Bekker's publication 'The Enchanted World' (1690) also played a key role in the growth of scepticism during the time period in question as Bekker's work had a ~~an~~ ~~very~~ tangible impact ~~on~~ ~~people~~ ~~been~~ on the attitudes ^{in Holland} ~~in~~ ~~the~~ ~~area~~. With that being said, Bekker's work cannot be viewed as the key development in the growth of scepticism seeing as it was released at a time when trials ~~was~~ were already on the decline, meaning its influence ~~is~~ is limited.

Bekker's use of Cartesian methodology meant that he was able to ~~include~~ ~~a~~ utilize a rational approach towards making his conclusions. He identified that natural events were the cause of witchcraft cases, and that no magic is ~~was~~ involved.

besides the 'imagination of man'. Moreover, 'The ~~Book~~ Enchanted World' sold over 4000 copies within its first two months, proving that the publication clearly had a noticeable impact on the people's views. Bekker's work presented such radical ideas that he received numerous pamphlets criticising him for causing the decline of witchcraft beliefs. The fact that he ~~was~~ lost his job as a Calvinist Minister and was put on trial for atheism and blasphemy ~~are~~ indicates that Bekker's views were radical enough to challenge church doctrine on witchcraft. ~~The~~ Historian Gottlieb Solder claimed that Bekker struck at the heart of the witch craze by destroying belief in the devil. However, while all of the aforementioned points prove that Bekker had an evident impact on changing attitudes in society, the reality was that by the time ~~the~~ 1691 (the publication ~~of~~ date), ~~all~~ beliefs in witchcraft were already on the decline. Thus, while Bekker's work accelerated the growth in scepticism, it cannot be viewed as the key development because it was released at a time when ~~was~~ the increase in sceptical attitudes was a trend.

The Changing Philosophical and scientific climate had a far longer-lasting impact than Bekker's publication in the growth of sceptical attitudes because soon the use of rationality towards witchcraft cases began to be adopted from the 1660s. The Royal Society's founding of the Royal Society and the use of deductive logic by Thomas Hobbes provided a new way for the elite in society to view the hunting of witches. Deductive proof offered clear evidence which disproved a number of beliefs about witches and as a consequence, it led to a growth in scepticism. In addition, the ~~The Dregon Drummer of Redworth Case (1662)~~ ~~which~~ A logical approach was utilised towards the evidence presented in the Dregon Drummer of Redworth case of 1662 and by ~~the~~ the fact that the last witch executed in England was in the year 1685 proves that the ~~changing~~ ~~scient~~ ~~changing~~ of age of science and reason had a resulted in a greater level of change on attitudes because than 'The Enchanted World' because it had a major effect on influence on the views of the elite in society, especially judges who used these new ~~the~~ use of Hobbes' science, logic and rationality in a way to accelerate the decline of the witch beliefs.

With that being said, it must be mentioned that in 17th Century Britain, 70% of people were illiterate, meaning the coming of age of science and reason ~~was~~ only had an impact on a small minority of the population, those who were the elite and educated. Another ~~factor~~ which played ~~a role~~ in a crucial role in the growth of scepticism was Reginald Scot's 'The Discoverie of Witchcraft' (1584). Scot's work influenced not only ~~both~~ Bekker but other notable sceptics such as Thomas Ady whose publication was essentially a revision of Scot's Message. Moreover, Scot's publication presented the most radical view as it was banned by King James VI which proves that 'The Discoverie of Witchcraft' was perceived as a genuine threat to the attitudes of the people. Scot's impact was long-lasting due to the fact that he influenced Bekker and without Scot, ~~then~~ the growth in sceptical attitudes would not have accelerated to the lengths that it did because without Scot, ~~the~~ Ady and Bekker's publications would have potentially ceased to exist. Thus, it would be more accurate to state that Scot's work was the key development rather than Bekker because of

~~The~~ massive Scot was essentially the catalyst in changing attitudes, he was the first sceptic. Scot's impact was therefore more long-lasting than Bekker.

However, 'The Discoverie of Witchcraft' predated the most ferocious period of witch-hunting in England and the fact that a new statute of witchcraft would be passed 20 years later proves that Scot's publication did not have an immediate impact on society. What did have an immediate impact on society ~~was~~ was ~~the~~ Thomas the role of the judges. Under Sir George Mackenzie dismissed a number of trials while Lord Advocate (1677-1686), especially when torture was used to extract a confession. While Sir John Holt used radical methods to influence an immediate growth in scepticism by ensuring each trial ended in an acquittal. In the Sarah Murdock case of 1701, Holt imprisoned the accuser of bar Murdock for fraudulence. These points prove that the judges used their high status and power in a way to bring about ~~the end~~ a change in attitudes. Although ~~the role of judge~~ higher stands growth

In scepticism among judges did result in the decline in witchcraft trials, it must be mentioned that, like Becker, ~~those judges~~ the role of the judges only came about after 1660 when the ~~trials were already decline~~ beliefs were and trials were in decline. This would support the view that ~~as for~~ accusations increased due to people's negative experiences of the ~~with~~ witch-hunts.

Ultimately, it ~~cannot be denied~~ ^{is inaccurate to state} that ~~the~~ 'The Enchanted World' by Balthasar Bekker was ~~the~~ the key development in the growth of scepticism because it was released at a time when trials and beliefs were already in decline. ~~Rather, the coming of a changing philosophical and scientific climate~~ ~~the publication of~~ Any real growth in sceptical attitudes from 1691 onwards would be due to the changing philosophical and scientific climate because ~~it~~ through the use of logic and reason,

conclusive evidence was provided to disprove any accusations. To add to that, Bekker's work did not result in a high level of change outside of the Dutch language, as historian Trevor-Roper described Bekker's significance as largely a myth because he had a limited impact on

those who did not speak Dutch. The key development Bekker's work did not have the tangible, long-lasting impact that Scot's 'The Discoverie of Witchcraft' had, nor did it result in ~~then~~ a great deal of change like the coming of age of science and reason did. ~~It would be more accurate to state that 'The discoverie of~~
Thus, ~~it is inaccurate~~ the notion that Balthasar Bekker's publication was the key development in the growth of scepticism in the years c1580-1750 is ~~is~~ inaccurate, to a large extent.



ResultsPlus
Examiner Comments

In this Level 5 response the candidate has both range across the period and depth, particularly on the stated factor of Bekker. Here the candidate very effectively compares Bekker to alternative significant events and publications before reaching a well supported conclusion.



ResultsPlus
Examiner Tip

In the breadth questions make sure you have a range of examples that cover the whole time frame in the question.

Question 5

Most candidates were able to discuss Holt's influence, notably his acquittal of those accused and his subsequent influence over the lower courts, and were able to place the work of Holt in context, often referring to the fact that he was a product of a changing intellectual climate. The majority of candidates were able to bring in other factors such as publications before Holt, fraudulent cases and the persistence of popular belief in witchcraft in order to come to some sort of judgement. Where criteria were made clear there was some good evaluation of impact over time, which naturally devalued Holt's position, and the impact on popular or elite attitudes. Weaker answers tended to basically list the key stepping stones in the period without focusing very clearly on 'changing attitudes', and failed to cover the time frame of the question. Stronger answers pleasingly were able to use quite a bit of detail in order to reinforce their argument.

The years between 1580-1750 were marked by a changing in ~~att~~ attitudes towards witchcraft as a result of the influence of Lord Chief Justice Holt, fraudulent cases and the sceptical opinion within publications. Now to value the factors as to which is the most significant factor in changing attitudes to witchcraft in the years 1580-1750 certain criteria would need to be taken into consideration such as widespread impact and long or short term impact. ~~Now~~ ~~the~~ sceptical opinion within publications was the most significant factor in changing attitudes to witchcraft rather than the influence of Lord Chief Justice Holt as it had a wider impact that caused attitudes to change as it was accessible by all levels of society through the newspaper although the majority of the population were illiterate but it also illustrated and word of mouth causing a changing attitudes to witchcraft.

Lord Chief Justice was very influential in the changing attitudes towards witchcraft due to his high position. He became recorder

of London in 1694 allowing him to oversee 11/12 acquittals during his career as a judge. His most famous case is the Sarah Mordock case of 1701 in which he questioned the evidence brought against Mordock rather than questioning the ideology of witchcraft. This set a precedent as he was the first to question the evidence. This caused a changing attitudes to witchcraft as it suggested that ^{some} accusations may be of false nature. His influence is also seen within the Jane Wenham case of 1721 in which he influenced a judge to change her so she may be set free. However Holt's influence is limited in changing attitudes to witchcraft in the years 1580-1750 as Mordock faced backlash from her village as she was acquitted showing that there was still a sense of scepticism and no changing attitudes to witchcraft in the years 1580-1750. In addition Holt's influence is limited as it can be suggested that he was copying and reiterating the beliefs of Sir George Henken, who was Holt's predecessor. These beliefs are found in the laws and customs in Scotland.

concerning matters of the criminal. This limits
Holt's influence in changing attitudes to
witchcraft in the years 1580-1750 as he
was continuing the work of Sir George
Mackenzie as he laid down the foundations
of change. But Holt was the first to question
the evidence brought rather than ideology of
witchcraft which set a precedent. Although
it is still a significant factor but sceptical
opinion within publications is more significant
in the changing attitudes as it reached
all levels of society through the pamphlet
was allowing for different ideas within
the society which caused a change in
attitudes to witchcraft.

Sceptical opinion within publications is significant
in the changing attitudes to witchcraft in
the years 1580-1750 as
shown by Thomas Aley in A candle
in the dark which was published in
1656. Aley's work is significant in
changing attitudes to witchcraft in the
years 1580-1750 as he uses the bible
as the only source which juxtaposes
with the use of the bible by witchfinders

as they also used the bible to hunt witches - this is significant in the changing attitudes to the witchcraft as it challenged the general consensus as to what a witch is and if anyone were to question this belief they may be accused of blasphemy as they would speak against the bible. Ady's book is split into three parts in which he tries to define a witch as a sorcerer and a necromancer. However, his neutral and sceptical opinion is limited in changing attitudes towards witchcraft as it can be suggested that he was reiterating the work of ~~Reginald~~ Reginald Scot in 'The Discoverie of Witchcraft' that was published in 1584 but was banned and burnt by James 6 so it had a limited impact on changing the attitudes - the publications of the 16th and 17th are significant to the changing attitudes towards witchcraft as they questioned the use of the bible for witchhunting to support their claim for witchhunting as in the bible it doesn't mention that witches should be hunted. Sceptical publications within publications is more significant than the influence of

felt as it caused a widespread impact through the pamphlet was in response to Webster's 'displaying of supposed witchcraft in 1699' as it was able to reach all levels of society including the urban elites and illiterate through the use of illustrations that would cause a change in attitudes towards witchcraft. However, due to Holt's status he was able to influence the urban elites who had the power and were able to change the law in terms of witchcraft. By Sir Geoffrey's opinion in publications still more significant in changing attitudes he was able to affect all levels of society, causing a wider change in attitudes to witchcraft.

It could also be suggested that fraudulent cases were very significant in changing attitudes to witchcraft. Fraudulent cases were widespread as it happened all across Britain with the Bay of Burton case, 1597-1597 within Burton and the Pendle suicide case in 1634 in Lancashire. The widespread impact of the fraudulent cases show a change in attitudes to witchcraft as the

fraudulent nature of these cases were known especially in the case of the Pendle witch in 1634 in which the king had representatives interrogate the subjects of witchcraft. Due to the king's influence, the subject of the case is widespread demonstrating the king's scepticism which could be passed onto the people through his divine right of kings causing attitudes towards witchcraft to change as a result of increased scepticism. The demon drummer case of 1662 is of utmost importance in changing attitudes to witchcraft as it was written about in two largely read newspapers in London causing a widespread in the changing attitudes towards witchcraft however this was limited as the majority of the population were ~~illiterate~~ illiterate and unable to read the views within the newspaper. John Webster wrote about the demon drummer case in 'The displaying of supposed witchcraft' claiming that he was told by a reliable source that the whole case was fabricated as Mompesson created the noises he was hearing. This then discredits the view of Joseph Glanville

who claimed that he also heard the voices
However, fraudulent cases are limited in the
changing attitudes to witchcraft as they had
been occurring as early as 1596 so ~~whole~~
to be the most significant factor as they have
been ongoing which facilitated the change but
~~not~~ Sceptical opinion within publications is
more significant in changing attitudes to
witchcraft as they had a wider impact
being accessible to all levels of society. But
it should be noted that Ady mentioned
that he was influenced by the fraudulent
cases he heard about such as by of
burton, 1596-1597 and gentle swindle. So
fraudulent cases aided his writing illustrating
its significance but ~~to~~ it was Ady's
work as a whole that caused the
changing attitudes of witchcraft through
challenging the witch finders use of the
Bible.

To conclude, it was the influence of Lord
Chief Hall that was the most significant
factor in changing attitudes to witchcraft
as it could be seen that he was continuing
the work of George McKenzie so not actually

changing attitudes. But it was sceptical opinion within publications that was facilitated by the uses of fraudulent cases that caused the changing attitudes of witchcraft. As Aely was inspired by fraudulent cases he heard about that caused him to write a candle in the dark. Additionally, it was ~~fraudulent cases~~ that the demon drummer case that was written about in two London newspapers causing them to be a widespread impact allowing for the changing attitudes to witchcraft. Although ~~the~~ majority of populations were illiterate news were able to be shared via the pamphlet war which aided the changing attitudes to witchcraft.



In this Level 5 response the candidate has detailed supporting evidence on the stated factor before including a range of alternative examples from across the time period in the question. The candidate then reaches a conclusion where the stated factor is effectively weighed up and a supported judgement is reached.



Make sure that you spend enough time on the stated factor in the question before moving on to alternatives, and that you compare back to this factor throughout your response.

Paper Summary

Based on their performance on this paper, candidates are offered the following advice:

Section A

- Candidates should ensure that they deal with both enquiries.
- Candidates should aim to draw out reasoned and developed inferences that go beyond comprehension of the sources.
- Candidates should move beyond stereotypical approaches to the nature, origin and purpose of the source. Comments about this should be specific to the provided sources rather than generic comments that might apply to any source.
- Contextual knowledge should be used to illuminate and discuss what is in the source, rather than provide an answer to the enquiry.

Sections B and C

- Candidates should not assume that every question will require a main factor/other factors approach.
- Candidates should avoid a narrative/descriptive approach; this undermines the analysis that is required for the higher levels.
- Candidates must be aware of key dates, as identified in the specification, so that they can address questions with chronological precision.
- Candidates should aim to range across the breadth of the chronology in Section C questions. This entails not just the bookend dates but some range across the whole chronology within the parameters of the specification.

Grade Boundaries

Grade boundaries for this, and all other papers, can be found on the website on this link:

<http://www.edexcel.com/iwantto/Pages/grade-boundaries.aspx>

