

MARK SCHEME for the May/June 2012 question paper
for the guidance of teachers

9697 HISTORY

9697/06

Paper 6, maximum raw mark 100

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the report on the examination.

- Cambridge will not enter into discussions or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

Cambridge is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2012 question papers for most IGCSE, GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.

Page 2	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

GENERIC MARK BANDS FOR ESSAY QUESTIONS

Examiners will assess which Level of Response best reflects most of the answer. An answer will not be required to demonstrate all of the descriptions in a particular Level to qualify for a Mark Band.

Band	Marks	Levels of Response
1	21–25	The approach will be consistently analytical or explanatory rather than descriptive or narrative. Essays will be fully relevant. The argument will be structured coherently and supported by appropriate factual material and ideas. The writing will be accurate. At the lower end of the band, there may be some weaker sections but the overall quality will show that the candidate is in control of the argument. The best answers must be awarded 25 marks.
2	18–20	Essays will be focused clearly on the demands of the question but there will be some unevenness. The approach will be mostly analytical or explanatory rather than descriptive or narrative. The answer will be mostly relevant. Most of the argument will be structured coherently and supported by largely accurate factual material. The impression will be that a good solid answer has been provided.
3	16–17	Essays will reflect a clear understanding of the question and a fair attempt to provide an argument and factual knowledge to answer it. The approach will contain analysis or explanation but there may be some heavily descriptive or narrative passages. The answer will be largely relevant. Essays will achieve a genuine argument but may lack balance and depth in factual knowledge. Most of the answer will be structured satisfactorily but some parts may lack full coherence.
4	14–15	Essays will indicate attempts to argue relevantly although often implicitly. The approach will depend more on some heavily descriptive or narrative passages than on analysis or explanation, which may be limited to introductions and conclusions. Factual material, sometimes very full, will be used to impart information or describe events rather than to address directly the requirements of the question. The structure of the argument could be organised more effectively.
5	11–13	Essays will offer some appropriate elements but there will be little attempt generally to link factual material to the requirements of the question. The approach will lack analysis and the quality of the description or narrative, although sufficiently accurate and relevant to the topic if not the particular question, will not be linked effectively to the argument. The structure will show weaknesses and the treatment of topics within the answer will be unbalanced.
6	8–10	Essays will not be properly focused on the requirements of the question. There may be many unsupported assertions and commentaries that lack sufficient factual support. The argument may be of limited relevance to the topic and there may be confusion about the implications of the question.
7	0–7	Essays will be characterised by significant irrelevance or arguments that do not begin to make significant points. The answers may be largely fragmentary and incoherent.

Page 3	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

Section A: Source based Question

1 Perceptions of a 'Labour crisis'.

'The great issue troubling the British sugar industry in the Caribbean in the period 1840 to 1860 was the lack of a suitable work force.' How far does the evidence of Sources A-E support this statement?

L1 WRITES ABOUT THE HYPOTHESIS, NO SOURCE USE [1-5]

These answers write generally about the 'labour crisis' but they ignore the key issues in the question, i.e. they do not use the sources as information/evidence to test the hypothesis. Include in this level answers which use information taken from the sources but only in providing a summary of views expressed by the writers, rather than testing the hypothesis.

L2 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [6-8]

These answers use the sources as information rather than as evidence, i.e. sources are used at face value only with no evaluation/interpretation in context, e.g. Sources A, B and C offer support individually and collectively. Source D offers a hint.

L3 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [9-13]

As in L2, these answers use sources at face value. They show that testing a hypothesis involves both attempting to confirm and disconfirm it. Sources D and E blame proprietors in various ways.

L4 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT, FIND EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [14-16]

These answers show a capacity to use sources as evidence, e.g. demonstrating their utility in testing the hypothesis by interpreting them in their historical context, i.e. not simply accepting them at face value.

For example, *Sources A, B and C illustrate responses in agreement with the hypothesis. Source A is from a source in Britain, possibly lacking personal experiences of the Caribbean but is backed by B and C from people with direct knowledge.* Background knowledge of the impact of the ending of apprenticeship could be introduced as could the possibility of one-sidedness. The group hang together well.

L5 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT FINDS EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [17-21]

These answers demonstrate that testing a hypothesis involves both attempting to confirm and disconfirm the hypothesis, and are capable of using sources to do this (i.e. both confirmation and disconfirmation are done at this level).

As L4 plus use of Sources D and E.

For example, *Source D is by someone who was present in the West Indies, an eye witness. It covers two smaller colonies. On Grenada it offers a critique of proprietors. On Tobago it has a multi-causal approach, citing equally significant factors. Source E is by a US observer, tossing aside the complaint of the proprietors and loading the problems on them. It has a polemic quality, but is based on personal observation.*

Page 4	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

L6 as L5 PLUS EITHER (a) EXPLAINS WHY EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE/SUPPORT IS BETTER/PREFERRED OR (b) RECONCILES/EXPLAINS PROBLEMS IN THE EVIDENCE TO SHOW NEITHER CHALLENGE NOR SUPPORT IS PREFERRED [22-25]

(a) Either case has strengths. There is no evidence that one source has drawn on the other(s), yet they make similar points. Perhaps D, with its multi-causal aspect, gives the case against the edge.

(b) Candidates could look closely at the 'How far' element in the question to assess the strengths of the cases. It could be suggested that the hypothesis is over-simplistic by being too sweeping and introduce the Barbados situation, or that by 1860 Indian immigration was becoming significant in Trinidad and British Guiana.

Section B

2 Explain the factors leading to the emancipation of slaves in the Caribbean colonies of different European states.

A key issue would be the respective roles of humanitarian fervour, resistance of the enslaved, political developments and economic forces. Other issues (the role of gender particularly in British abolition) could be raised. Candidates should provide illustrations from differing colonial backgrounds. Specific references to some of British, Danish, Dutch, French and Spanish emancipations are expected.

The factors approach:

1. Humanitarian fervour would probably be best illustrated from Britain and France, though it was present elsewhere. It provided an important background of propaganda and raised awareness over the longer term and became an important contributor when other circumstances provided the opportunity.
2. Resistance of the enslaved also had an impact - frequent revolts in British colonies (1824 British Guiana, 1831 Antigua and Jamaica), French colonies (Haiti 1790s, Guadeloupe, Martinique), Danish Virgin Islands (1848).
3. Political developments were significant in Britain (change of government, reforming agenda), France (1848 2nd Republic), Cuba (aftermath of 10 Years War) etc.
4. Economic forces included the declining importance of sugar to the metropolitan countries (beet in France), changing economic priorities (Britain: industrialisation, Adam Smith, rising influence of industrialists).

The Williams Thesis - the importance of the demands of European capitalism which preferred free markets and free labour to monopolies and slavery.

Most historians would ascribe a mix of motives - political, economic, social - to the ending of slavery.

3 Why did the emancipation laws in most cases fail to grant immediate freedom to slaves?

Though the case for emancipation had been accepted by governments there were elements of conservatism in the details. Broadly there was an aim to retain a workforce for a period to support the continuance of the sugar industries. Apprenticeship in the Dutch and British colonies, free birth / free womb in the Danish Caribbean, patronato in Cuba and regimen de contratacion in Puerto Rico could each be considered.

Page 5	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

Britain: The aims were many. Proprietors would retain labour for 4 or 6 years. This would allow time for freed people to adjust to wage labour (many proprietors would not have been able to pay wages immediately). It was a way of ensuring the continuance of sugar production. The former enslaved would be given an opportunity to adjust to their new situation, earn wages, save etc.

Dutch: There was a considerable slave population in Surinam. Planters had resisted emancipation and, on freedom in 1863, freed people were expected to register to work on an estate, and remain there.

Cuba: The situation was similar to Britain, though *with* a phased ending of patronato. Patrocinados to substitute until alternative labour available.

Denmark: 1847 immediate freedom for newborn. Apprenticeship 12 years for others. In some ways the Dutch system summed up what was happening. In 1863 those aged 15 to 60 were to be apprenticed for 10 years. The reasons given were:

- to provide a peaceful transition from slavery to freedom
- to train freed people for the responsibilities of free citizenship
- to guarantee adequate and captive labour for a period of years.

4 To what extent did emancipation from slavery' affect the lives of fully freed people?

Emancipation was a legal issue. It ended slavery but did not immediately change the way people lived. Once fully free, opportunities to express freedom were available. But how free were the slaves? They were free in the sense that they were no longer tied to the proprietors and the estates; they could no longer be bought and sold. Free did not mean equal opportunities. Freedom meant new responsibilities. Free meant choices, to stay on estates or leave.

One option was to stay on the same estate as in slavery, but working for wages. This was the most likely option in Barbados and St. Lucia. This left the terms to be worked out. Employers often reacted as in slavery, seeking to tie their workers to the estates. Rent, wages and use of plots were issues. Sometimes the severity of conditions led to movement off estates. Wage rates were contentious. Gangs of workers were formed, undertaking task work (payments per job).

Over time there was movement off the estates (not an immediate mass exodus). For some this meant remaining in the vicinity of estates, where land was available and work on the estates was undertaken. Later in Jamaica they spread to mountainous areas. Free villages (Jamaica and British Guiana) were established.

This movement was just one aspect of freedom. Emigration (Antigua and Barbados to Trinidad), family life (women at home), movement to towns (new occupations), marketing, social mobility (education, becoming teachers) were all part of the picture.

There was little opportunity for involvement in official government activity.

The success of the peasantry financially led to the import of consumer goods, clothes, pots and pans and also agricultural implements.

There was a gradual social transformation, based on land ownership and community organisations, free villages, cooperatives and communal work groups, mutual loan schemes, education.

Page 6	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

5 How did members of the plantocracy react to the development of the peasantry?

The departure of labourers from the estates was one of the problems anticipated in emancipation legislation. It was one of the results of emancipation that movement from the estates became possible. It raised issues which varied from place to place according to population density and available land. There were efforts to impede the development of peasantry via measures concerning access to land and restrictive laws passed in favour of the plantocracy.

The use of immigrant labour to fill the gaps and provide wage competition was another area to be explored. In some cases, planters became more relaxed in making land available to peasants, e.g. land on the edges of a plantation could be used to settle peasants who were then available for tasks on estates (Jamaica 1840s).

Tactics of coercion used by planters in British areas

- use of magistrates and police as agents of labour discipline
- linking residence on estate with labour
- refusal of task-work system (sticking to pay by the day)

State actions in French colonies on behalf of a plantocracy

- higher tax on town dwellers
- efforts to maintain sugar and coffee production: tax on land producing other crops
- pass system, ateliers de discipline etc.

Jamaica: Planters felt they possessed sufficient power through legislation to limit the effective possibilities of black freemen and to assure a supply of docile estate labourers. They required the power of the House of Assembly to carry out their policy of creating a landless peasantry. Ejectment and the rent question – rent was used to lower wages and force freedmen to work in the field i.e. coercion by law. Field labour was compulsory for freedmen living on estates, otherwise pay high rent or be ejected. 1840-65 laws and taxes became increasingly severe.

British Guiana: Limits were placed on numbers combining to buy land.

6 Examine the impact of immigrant labour on the Caribbean economy after emancipation.

Though immigrant labour was geographically widespread, its greatest impact was in British Guiana and Trinidad. Jamaica, where it would have been a boon, did not adopt any large measure of immigration. Some early immigration, of Portuguese and Chinese, resulted in the immigrants moving into businesses, often as shopkeepers.

Both Trinidad and British Guiana were effectively new sugar colonies. The slave population had been comparatively low in relation to the area involved. During the 1840s both needed an influx of labour and a continuing supply. From 1850 onwards Indian immigration was established on a yearly basis and was quickly acknowledged as a sort of salvation for the colonies. The immigrants provided field labour which was not otherwise available and this helped the growth of production (which was also assisted by the use of better extraction processes, scientific farming and improved estate management and organisation).

Beyond this, immigrants brought with them knowledge of agriculture so that rice growing developed and became a staple of the local diet. In addition there were various social impacts. Indians tended to keep together, retaining customs etc.

In the later nineteenth century, alongside Barbados, Trinidad and British Guiana were the most productive sugar colonies in the British West Indies, partly as a result of the presence of waves of immigrants from India.

Page 7	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

There was inter-colonial movement on a smaller scale e.g. to Puerto Rico where immigrants lived on estates and gave full time labour.

Immigrants to Cuba (often from Spain after emancipation), French colonies (Indians), Dutch (Indonesia), played some part in sugar production.

Other points

- Immigrants created competition for jobs and helped lower wages.
- Existing estates were maintained and there was increased output through extension of the sugar industry.

7 In what ways did the provision of education for the masses affect the lives of inhabitants of the British Caribbean after 1835?

In broad terms it is best to remember that education was not universally available or compulsory in the nineteenth century. Also the partners in mass education, the British government, colonial governments, providers such as churches, employers, inspectors, parents and children all had inputs.

The critical phase from 1835 to 1845 was led by the British government with an annual education grant. Schools themselves were often provided by churches (Baptists self-financing). Parents could choose to send their children to school and some saw this as a means of changing the life prospects of pupils, though there was much irregular attendance. Those with church connections had that as an additional motive. By the 1850s early enthusiasm had waned. The missionaries were less influential and there was concern about the content of education. Colonial authorities favoured useful 'industrial' education whereas parents saw education as a means by which their children might succeed in escaping the limitations of lives devoted to plantation life. The plantocracy queried the benefits of education.

Later in the century, education was providing a vehicle for some social change. Some pupils later became teachers and, for a few, openings to middle class occupations became available. Some secondary education was available.

It is important to note that the white population opted out of the system, retaining links with Britain for educational provision.

Enthusiasm for education among the masses did vary but continued, especially among the churchgoing and more aspirational sections of the communities.

Attendance fell off in mid-century as many parents could not afford school fees. Up to 1865 not more than 30% of children aged 5 to 15 years received formal day school education in Jamaica.

8 How was Haitian independence achieved by 1804?

Haiti emerged as an independent country in 1804 after a turbulent period dating back to the early 1790s. Answers to this question would best take 1799–1800 as a pivotal point. Direct French influence had declined and Toussaint had emerged as the effective ruler and unifier of Haiti, though without the formal acknowledgement of independence.

By way of explanation of this situation, reference could be made to the link with France, the importance of the eighteenth century sugar production and the impact of the French Revolution on Haiti. During the 1790s turmoil on the island, involving both mulattoes and slaves led to the French using troops, and to much bloodshed. The slave rebellion led to the emergence of

Page 8	Mark Scheme: Teachers' version	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE AS/A LEVEL – May/June 2012	9697	06

Toussaint who also defeated British involvement in 1794–8. Spain acquired part of the island in 1795.

By 1800 Toussaint restored peace. He wanted slaves to be free and for all the population to have the opportunity to share in the government. He was the undisputed master of St. Domingue. Great cruelty was committed.

In 1801 Toussaint sent a constitution to France (it was already effective). The import of this was that independence had been effected. He proclaimed himself ruler for life. Napoleon would not tolerate this and sent a large force (LeClerc) which was supported by some Haitian leaders, jealous of Toussaint. Toussaint was tricked and sent to France. Napoleon's intention was to restore slavery. He wanted nothing less than the restoration of the colonial ancien regime. The French were decimated by disease. In 1803 resumption of war in Europe ended the prospect of reinforcements from France. French forces surrendered. Haiti was free from the French (Nov. 1803).

Insurgent groups united under Dessalines. There followed a scorched earth policy, again with much cruelty. After the French withdrew Dessalines declared himself Emperor of independent Haiti (Jan. 1804).