



History 7042
Specimen Question Paper 1A (A-level)
Question 2 Student 5
Specimen Answer and Commentary

V1.0

Specimen answer plus commentary

The following student response is intended to illustrate approaches to assessment. This response has not been completed under timed examination conditions. It is not intended to be viewed as a 'model' answer and the marking has not been subject to the usual standardisation process.

Paper 1A (A-level): Specimen question paper

02 To what extent was effective leadership responsible for the establishment of the crusader states in the years 1096 to 1154?

[25 marks]

Student response

Jerusalem was finally captured by the Christians Crusaders in 1099 with Godfrey as the ruler. Outremer had been divided into four crusader states- Tripoli, Antioch, Edessa as well as Jerusalem. There were many factors which contributed to the establishment of the Crusader States in order to survive.

Effective leadership was one of the main factors that were responsible for the establishment of the crusader states between 1096 and 1154. Godfrey of Bouillon had considerable amount of "military experience," and his actions on the crusade defined the success of the expedition. Godfrey led the crusaders to be effective in capturing Jerusalem, by taking "advantage of the Muslim disunity," and by climbing up the northern wall, Godfrey and his army was able to siege Jerusalem. This shows the importance of leadership, and how much it was needed for the establishment of the Crusader States. This is because, with Godfrey's military genius, Jerusalem was conquered and was offered the crown of Jerusalem. Another example of great leadership was Bohemond of Taranto, he showed his excellent skills both at the Battle of Dorylaeum and Siege of Antioch, where he faced the Turkish army, but was able to be successful in defeating the Turkish force along with Robert of Normandy. Even after the First Crusade, Bohemond of Taranto built a fine territory with a strong army in 1100 after taking over Antioch. Strong leadership was an important part of the Crusader States as the leaders kept their forces in line, preventing them from dissolving into a problematic situation, such as enemy attack from the Muslim forces. Without powerful leaders, such as Bohemond and Godfrey, leading the Crusading armies would have been difficult, because it would have caused forces to turn against each other. However leadership did have its' weaknesses', whilst ruling Antioch, Bohemond made the mistake of moving against the emir of Sebastea, north of Antioch. This led him to fall into an ambush and causing him to be captured. Leadership was only effective at the beginning of the Frankish rule but towards the end, the crusader states (Jerusalem, Edessa, Antioch and Tripoli) were vulnerable and there was weak leadership as there were many divisions between the leaders.

On the other hand, pilgrimage was responsible for the establishment of the Crusader States, because by going to Jerusalem, pilgrims were able to get an idea of what Christ's life was like. Despite there being other holy sites in Europe, Jerusalem was the most prominent because it was where pilgrims could gain the most spiritual reward and forgiveness for their sins. Pilgrimage was seen as an important aspect of a person's life, as it fulfils the human need to reach within for an interior wholeness and completeness. Even when pilgrims were economically advantaged, all were equal in God's eyes. Jerusalem itself had many sacred sites and held relics which was significant to Christians, for example, Sephora- where the Virgin Mary was sent to spend her childhood, and the River Jordan which was significant because it was the site of Christ's baptism. The population of Jerusalem grew from 20,000 to 30,000- most being pilgrims; this helped to establish the crusader states, because with the population growing, it allowed people to work, settle by bringing relics from Europe as well as praying. In order for the Crusader States to survive, it needs people to help expand the territory. Furthermore one state which flourished was Tripoli, as it was where many pilgrims landed from their ship journeys. Without the crusader states, pilgrims from all over Europe would not be able to do their pilgrimage easily and safely. Pilgrimage helped to establishment the Crusader States, by resupplying, and visiting holy sites; therefore the states were able to build castles and strengthen their army.

Moreover, trade was another factor that was responsible for the establishment of the crusader states because the economy of the Christian states had proven to be good, as they provided ports for imports from new regions to the rest of Europe. Most of the merchant activity was controlled by Italian hands; this is because the Italian ports had an outstanding mixture of connections to the rest of Europe and sea routes to the Middle East. Trading was very important for the Crusader States because, in order for them to expand their territory, they had to rely on the ports to bring in supplies such as spices, leather etc; therefore the Crusader States had to make sure they held a powerful relationship with Italy. Jerusalem was especially involved in silk, cotton, and the spice trade. The coastal towns benefited from the high increase of trade as ships from Venice, Genoa, and Barcelona arrived with supplies, reinforcements and pilgrims. Ships would also return home with pilgrims and merchandises of eastern goods for the markets of the west. The pilgrims supplied income for lodging houses and souvenir sellers as well as guides. This boosted the economy of the crusader states, because the survival of Outremer depended on the movement of the goods through the coast. Additionally, Palestine was involved in the trading route, this trade extended to Europe as well. European goods, such as the woollen textiles of northern Europe, made their way to the Middle East and Asia while Asian goods were transported back to Europe. The Christians started to take control of the whole coastline and to create states. The foundation of the Italian trading cities of Venice, Pisa, and, surprisingly at this early stage, Genoa, was crucial. The economic continuance of Outremer builds upon the movements of goods through the coast to the rest of Europe. Trading was responsible for the establishment of the Crusader States because, it enabled the states to build castles, and toughen their army in case of attacks; it allowed trading between the east and the west to be done, which could nourish their relationship.

Finally Military Order was also responsible for the establishment of the crusader states because, according to Bernard of Clairvaux Templars were “the knights of Christ,” this meant that Bernard believed monks also could be warriors. Templars were a new sort of knight who fought evil in the world and their faith and their efforts, the holy land would be preserved in Christian hands. As the military and financial strength of the Templars grew, they were given custody of a number of castles and landholding in the Holy Land. The first of these were in the late 1130s, around the castle of Bagdad in Antioch, a strategically crucial region that controlled the Belen Pass, one of the main routes into northern Syria. Other acquisitions followed including castles at Gaza (1149-50), Safed (before 1168) and Toron (before 1172). Military was such an important factor because even Saladin viewed the Templars as “a profoundly serious threat to Islam.” This clearly shows a judgement that reveals how successful the idea of the warrior monk had become. It also shows how important the military orders were to the Latin settlement of the holy land. Another group of monks devoted to the “care of pilgrims,” and they were known as the “Hospitallers.” They dedicated their life to assist the poor and the sick; however what pilgrims needed the most besides medical care, was physical protection, because Outremer was not safe. This shows the importance of military order because if pilgrims did not feel safe when visiting holy cities, then the cities would have collapsed because there is no-one to protect them and the ports, which would therefore lead to an economic crisis, because each Crusader States relied heavily on protection, in order to survive.

To conclude I believe that effective leadership, pilgrimage, trade and military order were all important factors contributing to the establishment of the crusader states but at different times. However I believe that without military order, the crusader states wouldn't be able to defend it from attacks and trade wouldn't have been possible without protection of the ports and people. Therefore military order was the most important factor responsible for the establishment of the crusader states.

Commentary – Level 4

The answer is consistently focused on the question and offers a clear judgement supported, on the whole, by appropriate detail. It has some balance and is convincing in its assessment of the importance of leadership. The assessment of the importance of trade and economic links with Italy is well supported.

It has, however, some weaknesses in relation to responding to the chronology of the period in the question. It is not convincing in its assessment of pilgrimage being a key reason throughout the period and the assessment of the Military Orders extends beyond the chronology of the question, although this does not detract from their importance significantly. It is, overall, a Level 4 answer rather than Level 5 as it lacks some range and is not fully developed in places.