



**General Certificate of Education
June 2012**

A2 History 2041

HIS3G

Unit 3G

British State and People, 1865–1915

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation events which all examiners participate in and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation process ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for standardisation each examiner analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed and legislated for. If, after the standardisation process, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been raised they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2012 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered schools and colleges for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to schools and colleges to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Generic Introduction for A2

The A2 History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level students. Most questions address more than one objective since a good historian must be able to combine a range of skills and knowledge. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses students' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how students have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Students who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or low Level 2 if some comment is included. Students who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at Level 2 or low Level 3 depending on their synoptic understanding and linkage of ideas. Students who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(b)) and will have access to the higher mark ranges.

To obtain an award of Level 3 or higher, students will need to address the synoptic requirements of A Level. The open-ended essay questions set are, by nature, synoptic and encourage a range of argument. Differentiation between performance at Levels 3, 4, and 5 therefore depends on how a student's knowledge and understanding are combined and used to support an argument and the how that argument is communicated.

The mark scheme emphasises features which measure the extent to which a student has begun to *'think like a historian'* and show higher order skills. As indicated in the level criteria, students will show their historical understanding by:

- The way the requirements of the question are interpreted
- The quality of the arguments and the range/depth/type of material used in support
- The presentation of the answer (including the level of communication skills)
- The awareness and use of differing historical interpretations
- The degree of independent judgement and conceptual understanding shown

It is expected that A2 students will perform to the highest level possible for them and the requirements for Level 5, which demands the highest level of expertise have therefore been made deliberately challenging in order to identify the most able students.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:**A2 EXAMINATION PAPERS****General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)**

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that students might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other students' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Students should never be doubly penalised. If a student with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a student with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- Depth and precision in the use of factual information
- Depth and originality in the development of an argument
- The extent of the synoptic links
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- The way the answer is brought together in the conclusion

June 2012

A2 Unit 3: The State and the People: Change and Continuity

HIS3G: British State and People, 1865–1915

Question 1

- 01** To what extent was there a Great Depression in the British economy in the years 1873 to 1896? (45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**
-

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need to assess the extent to which there was a Great Depression in the years 1873 to 1896 and balance this against evidence that the economy as a whole was not unduly undergoing severe problems. They may also refer to historical debate on the issue.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the view that there was a Great Depression:

- the British economy went into relative decline during these years
- a main reason for the Great Depression was successful foreign competition especially from Germany and the USA and to a lesser extent from France and Russia. British exports expanded less slowly than those of her main competitors
- Britain suffered from continuing its free trade policy whereas most of her competitors increasingly adopted protectionist policies
- the success of the staple industries made British industrialists generally unwilling to develop new industries such as chemicals, or adopt methods such as mass production, or use electrical power instead of steam, as rivals were doing
- a Great Depression was very clear in agriculture where problems were more severe than those of industry. Competition in wheat from the USA, Canada and Australia and in meat from Australia, New Zealand and Argentina, with improvements in refrigeration and transport, led to depression in British arable and pastoral farming with many farmers going out of business and labourers becoming unemployed
- unemployment, though worse in the countryside, generally increased (though no official statistics were kept to quantify this).

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- despite the foreign competition Britain kept its leadership in industry
- exports were still increasing in the late nineteenth century
- wages showed some increases, or at least remained fairly constant, but prices went down so many were (marginally) better-off
- in agriculture there was diversification from wheat growing and beef cattle into market gardening, fruit growing and milk herds
- though many deserted the countryside for the towns, some of these 'immigrants' found better paid jobs and an improved standard of living in the urban environment
- though the depression in agriculture lasted throughout the period there were periods of relative growth in industry in some years in the 1870s, 1880s and 1890s.

Furthermore, students may:

- note that the age of railway building had come to an end
- note that during the period almost seven million emigrated from Britain for better prospects in Australia, New Zealand, South Africa, Canada and particularly the USA.

In conclusion, students may:

- argue that though there was clearly depression in agriculture, for wheat and meat in particular, decline in industry and trade was less severe, but failed to sustain previous

levels of growth. In those terms there was a Depression, though whether it is correctly described as Great remains subject to debate. Despite the poverty of the increased number of unemployed, those in work benefited from a rise in real wages and falling prices.

Question 2

02 'British governments dealt successfully with the problems of Ireland in the years 1906 to 1914.'

Assess the validity of this view.

(45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**
-

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need to identify and evaluate how successfully the Liberal governments were in dealing with the problems of Ireland in this period and balance this against factors which limited or prevented success.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the success of the governments:

- Ireland was relatively peaceful in the years 1906 to 1910 and the Liberal government made no attempt to introduce Home Rule
- the results of the General Elections of 1910 made the Liberal governments dependent on Irish Nationalists' support to maintain majority support within the Commons
- the price of this support was a Home Rule Bill which could now eventually pass the Lords because of the 1911 Parliament Act
- the Liberals managed to pass the Third Irish Home Rule Bill which entered the statute book in 1914
- the governments were able to prevent the outbreak of civil war in Ireland during the period, though the outbreak of the First World War probably prevented it happening in 1914.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- the governments were unable to gain acceptance of Home Rule by the Protestants, principally those in Ulster
- they failed to combat successfully the effective Ulster Unionist leadership of Carson and Craig, who gained great success in getting large numbers to sign the Solemn League and Covenant opposing the government's plans for Home Rule
- the Ulster Unionists were able to put themselves into a position militarily, through the Ulster Volunteers, as well as politically with strong support from Bonar Law and the Conservative Opposition, in being able to prevent the 'imposition' of Home Rule for Ireland
- the government was unable to prevent the formation of the armed Irish Volunteers and the growth of support for Sinn Fein and the Gaelic League
- the government's attempt at compromise (exclusion of Ulster from Home Rule for six years) failed
- the government lost the loyalty of at least part of the British Army in the 'Curragh Mutiny'
- Government failure to prevent the arming of both nationalists and unionists led to a state of near civil war in Ireland (and possibly in Britain) in 1914.

Furthermore, students may:

- note the intractability of the 'Irish Question'
- argue that Home Rule was not only rejected by unionists but also increasingly by emerging republican views which undermined the position of Redmond and his Irish Nationalist Party.

In conclusion, students may:

- reach a judgement about the degree of success achieved overall by the Liberals in dealing with the problems of Ireland
- see that the problems escalated in seriousness, both politically and militarily, in the years 1906 to 1914.

Question 3

- 03** To what extent did parliamentary and constitutional reforms in the years 1867 to 1911 make Britain a democracy? (45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**
-

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and students are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Students will need to assess the extent to which the reforms in the period made Britain a democracy and balance this against the limitations of those reforms. They may also argue that the movement towards Britain becoming a democracy was gradual and had not been fully achieved by 1911.

Students may refer to some of the following material in support of the case that the reforms did make Britain, or move it towards, a democratic political system:

- the consequences of the 1867 Second Reform Act especially in extending the franchise to skilled artisans
- the Ballot Act (1872) and Corrupt Practices Act (1883)
- the consequences of the Third Reform Act and Redistribution Act (1884–1885)
- changes in Party organisation
- the outcome of the 1909–11 constitutional crisis in reducing the powers of the House of Lords under the Parliament Act
- payment of MPs to make possible increased representation by the less wealthy.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- the limitations in the extensions of the franchise. Even after the Third Reform Act approximately 20 per cent of men were still excluded from the vote for Parliament
- despite women being allowed to vote for, and be members of, local government and bodies by the early 20th century, they were denied the vote for Parliament even with the relative strength of both suffragist and suffragette movements by 1911
- the House of Lords still retained 'a delaying power' after 1911 and was unelected
- despite some success of the Labour Party in the Elections of 1906 and 1910 both government and Parliament were still made up overwhelmingly of wealthy men
- all political Parties had extended membership and extra-parliamentary activities, e.g. the Primrose League and Women's Liberal Federation.

Furthermore, students may:

- argue that Britain moved cautiously in stages towards becoming more democratic and, in the main, peacefully
- note that plural voting was retained for some members of the electorate
- demonstrate understanding of the changes in the nature of political Parties, both established and the relatively new Labour Party, as well as on the extension of the vote for Parliament.

In conclusion, students may:

- argue that over the whole period there was a move towards Britain becoming a democracy, but that a full democracy had not been achieved by 1911
- despite attempts to achieve it, both by attempted legislation and activity outside Parliament, the most glaring omission from a democratic system by 1911 was the failure to enfranchise women.

Converting marks into UMS marks

Convert raw marks into marks on the Uniform Mark Scale (UMS) by using the link below.

UMS conversion calculator: www.aqa.org.uk/umsconversion