



**General Certificate of Education
June 2011**

A2 History 2041

HIS3G

Unit 3G

British State and People, 1865–1915

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2011 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

Generic Introduction for A2

The A2 History specification is based on the assessment objectives laid down in QCA's GCE History subject criteria and published in the AQA specification booklet. These cover the skills, knowledge and understanding which are expected of A Level candidates. Most questions address more than one objective since a good historian must be able to combine a range of skills and knowledge. Consequently, the marking scheme which follows is a 'levels of response' scheme and assesses candidates' historical skills in the context of their knowledge and understanding of History.

The levels of response are a graduated recognition of how candidates have demonstrated their abilities in the Assessment Objectives. Candidates who predominantly address AO1(a) by writing narrative or description will perform at Level 1 or low Level 2 if some comment is included. Candidates who provide more explanation – (AO1(b), supported by the relevant selection of material, AO1(a)) – will perform at Level 2 or low Level 3 depending on their synoptic understanding and linkage of ideas. Candidates who provide explanation with evaluation, judgement and an awareness of historical interpretations will be addressing all 3 AOs (AO1(a); AO1(b); AO2(b)) and will have access to the higher mark ranges.

To obtain an award of Level 3 or higher, candidates will need to address the synoptic requirements of A Level. The open-ended essay questions set are, by nature, synoptic and encourage a range of argument. Differentiation between performance at Levels 3, 4, and 5 therefore depends on how a candidate's knowledge and understanding are combined and used to support an argument and the how that argument is communicated.

The mark scheme emphasises features which measure the extent to which a candidate has begun to '*think like a historian*' and show higher order skills. As indicated in the level criteria, candidates will show their historical understanding by:

- The way the requirements of the question are interpreted
- The quality of the arguments and the range/depth/type of material used in support
- The presentation of the answer (including the level of communication skills)
- The awareness and use of differing historical interpretations
- The degree of independent judgement and conceptual understanding shown

It is expected that A2 candidates will perform to the highest level possible for them and the requirements for Level 5, which demands the highest level of expertise have therefore been made deliberately challenging in order to identify the most able candidates.

CRITERIA FOR MARKING GCE HISTORY:

A2 EXAMINATION PAPERS

General Guidance for Examiners (to accompany Level Descriptors)

Deciding on a level and the award of marks within a level

It is of vital importance that examiners familiarise themselves with the generic mark scheme and apply it consistently, as directed by the Principal Examiner, in order to facilitate comparability across options.

The indicative mark scheme for each paper is designed to illustrate some of the material that candidates might refer to (knowledge) and some of the approaches and ideas they might develop (skills). It is not, however, prescriptive and should only be used to exemplify the generic mark scheme.

When applying the generic mark scheme, examiners will constantly need to exercise judgement to decide which level fits an answer best. Few essays will display all the characteristics of a level, so deciding the most appropriate will always be the first task.

Each level has a range of marks and for an essay which has a strong correlation with the level descriptors the middle mark should be given. However, when an answer has some of the characteristics of the level above or below, or seems stronger or weaker on comparison with many other candidates' responses to the same question, the mark will need to be adjusted up or down.

When deciding on the mark within a level, the following criteria should be considered *in relation to the level descriptors*. Candidates should never be doubly penalised. If a candidate with poor communication skills has been placed in Level 2, he or she should not be moved to the bottom of the level on the basis of the poor quality of written communication. On the other hand, a candidate with similarly poor skills, whose work otherwise matched the criteria for Level 4 should be adjusted downwards within the level.

Criteria for deciding marks within a level:

- Depth and precision in the use of factual information
- Depth and originality in the development of an argument
- The extent of the synoptic links
- The quality of written communication (grammar, spelling, punctuation and legibility; an appropriate form and style of writing; clear and coherent organisation of ideas, including the use of specialist vocabulary)
- The way the answer is brought together in the conclusion

June 2011

A2 Unit 3: The State and the People: Change and Continuity

HIS3G: British State and People, 1865–1915

Question 1

- 01** To what extent was Conservative dominance of British politics in the years 1886 to 1905 due to Gladstone's policies on Ireland? (45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**
-

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Candidates will need to assess the significance of Gladstone's policies on Ireland as a reason for Conservative dominance and balance this against the relative importance of other factors. They may also consider the personal appeal of politicians such as Salisbury and Chamberlain as well as that of Gladstone.

Candidates may refer to some of the following material in support of the view that Conservative dominance was due to Gladstone's policies:

- the policy of Home Rule was consistently rejected by the British electorate and particularly in the Elections of 1886 and 1895
- it was Gladstone's policies on Ireland which had finally split the Liberal Party (already somewhat divided over social reform and imperial policy) and led to Chamberlain and the Liberal Unionists joining with the Conservatives
- the brief interlude of Liberal government from 1892–95 was only made possible by the support of the Irish Nationalists in the Commons, the Liberals having won 42 seats fewer than the Conservatives and Liberal Unionists combined in the Election of 1892
- the rejection of the 2nd Home Rule Bill by the Lords was supported by the overwhelming victory of the Unionists in the 1895 Election
- Gladstone, and the Liberals after his final retirement in 1894, were never likely to succeed in passing Home Rule given the permanent Conservative majority in the Lords.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- at the beginning of the period (1885) Gladstone was losing popularity for other reasons including his foreign policy
- concessions to the Irish were unpopular given the violence, associated particularly with the Land League
- the policy of Home Rule was opposed because success of nationalism in Ireland could lead to the break-up of the British Empire
- the Conservatives and Unionists gave support to the Ulster Protestants and opposed the notion of Ireland dominated by the Catholic Church, both popular causes in Britain
- Parnell's divorce led to many Liberals and particularly Nonconformists turning away from support for Irish nationalism
- Liberals were divided over other issues such as imperialism and the Boer War
- Conservative dominance was helped significantly by improved Party organisation and increased support from the middle classes
- Conservatism was more closely associated with imperialism, so popular during most of this period
- Conservative popularity during the Boer War and in the Khaki Election of 1900
- the Conservative period of dominance ended in 1905–1906 because of other factors, not over Home Rule.

Furthermore, candidates may:

- note that the Irish policies of Balfour in Salisbury's 2nd government, coercion and agrarian reform (Land Purchase Acts in 1888 and 1891) appeared gradually to get results in quietening unrest

- refer to other Unionist Government reforms to improve agriculture, fishing and small scale industry as well as Wyndham's Land Purchase Act in 1903.

In conclusion, candidates may:

- argue that Gladstone's policies were the most important factor accounting for Conservative dominance but that there were other significant issues which also played a part.

Question 2

- 02** How successfully did Liberal governments deal with the Constitutional Crisis of 1909 to 1911? (45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Candidates will need to assess and evaluate the degree of success of the Liberal governments in dealing with the Constitutional Crisis and balance this against issues which limited that success. They may also comment on whether the Crisis was of the Liberals' own making.

Candidates may refer to some of the following material in support of success, relating to the Crisis, achieved by the governments:

- determination to ensure adoption of the 1909 People's Budget despite its rejection by the Conservative dominated House of Lords ('Balfour's poodle') in November 1909
- the January 1909 ('Peers versus People') Election on the issue of the Budget saw the Liberals remaining in power, albeit dependent on the Irish Nationalists and Labour for a parliamentary majority in the Commons
- the Lords then (reluctantly) passed the Budget
- determination of the Liberal government to pass their Parliament Bill despite the failure of the constitutional conference over the prospect of Irish Home Rule
- support of the new King, George V, to create sufficient new Liberal peers to dominate the Lords, after the December 1910 Election
- the passing of the Parliament Act by the Lords, albeit only by 141 votes to 131, with many abstentions.

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- the Liberals lost their overall majority in the January 1910 Election and did not regain it in December, which meant dependence on minority parties in the Commons
- the Lords managed to retain a delaying power over legislation
- the country was divided firstly over proposals for taxation in the People's Budget and then over the proposals for constitutional reform especially during the months of the constitutional conference in 1910.

Furthermore, candidates may:

- note the dependence of the Liberal governments on the Irish Nationalists; and then the Parliament Act, making Home Rule a distinct possibility, created another crisis potentially more serious than the Constitutional Crisis
- see that the Lords could no longer reject Liberal legislation completely, or maul bills as they had done before 1909.

In conclusion, candidates may:

- argue that the Liberals had concluded the Constitutional Crisis essentially in their favour by the end of 1911
- understand that the British political system had become more democratic with the elected chamber now clearly more powerful than the unelected chamber
- note that opposition by the Conservatives to constitutional reform might have been overcome, but not their and Ulster unionists' opposition to Home Rule which became a key problem from 1910.

Question 3

- 03** To what extent was British foreign policy dominated by concern for the Empire in the years 1868 to 1914? (45 marks)

Target: AO1(a), AO1(b), AO2(b)

Generic Mark Scheme for essays at A2

- Nothing written worthy of credit. **0**
- L1:** Answers will display a limited understanding of the demands of the question. They may **either** contain some descriptive material which is only loosely linked to the focus of the question **or** they may address only a part of the question. Alternatively, they may contain some explicit comment but will make few, if any, synoptic links and will have limited accurate and relevant historical support. There will be little, if any, awareness of differing historical interpretations. The response will be limited in development and skills of written communication will be weak. **1-6**
- L2:** Answers will show some understanding of the demands of the question. They will **either** be primarily descriptive with few explicit links to the question **or** they may contain explicit comment but show limited relevant factual support. They will display limited understanding of differing historical interpretations. Historical debate may be described rather than used to illustrate an argument and any synoptic links will be undeveloped. Answers will be coherent but weakly expressed and/or poorly structured. **7-15**
- L3:** Answers will show an understanding of the demands of the question. They will provide some assessment, backed by relevant and appropriately selected evidence, which may, however, lack depth. There will be some synoptic links made between the ideas, arguments and information included although these may not be highly developed. There will be some understanding of varying historical interpretations. Answers will be clearly expressed and show reasonable organisation in the presentation of material. **16-25**
- L4:** Answers will show a good understanding of the demands of the question. They will be mostly analytical in approach and will show some ability to link ideas/arguments and information and offer some judgement. Answers will show an understanding of different ways of interpreting material and may refer to historical debate. Answers will be well-organised and display good skills of written communication. **26-37**
- L5:** Answers will show a very good understanding of the demands of the question. The ideas, arguments and information included will be wide-ranging, carefully chosen and closely interwoven to produce a sustained and convincing answer with a high level of synopticity. Conceptual depth, independent judgement and a mature historical understanding, informed by a well-developed understanding of historical interpretations and debate, will be displayed. Answers will be well-structured and fluently written. **38-45**

Indicative content

Note: This content is not prescriptive and candidates are not obliged to refer to the material contained in this mark scheme. Any legitimate answer will be assessed on its merits according to the generic levels scheme.

Candidates will need to assess the extent to which concern for the Empire dominated British foreign policy throughout the period and balance this against the importance of other concerns. They may also argue that the dominant concern of foreign policy varied in the period, e.g. that concern for the Empire was not consistently the main aim, e.g. in the 20th century that it was combating the perceived threat from Germany.

Candidates may refer to some of the following material in support of the case that the Empire was the dominant concern of policy:

- Disraeli's government's involvement in the Eastern crisis, Egypt (Suez Canal), Afghanistan and South Africa
- Gladstone's government's foreign policy in the 1880s concerning Egypt, Afghanistan and South Africa
- expansion of the Empire in the late 19th century
- support of Unionists, e.g. Salisbury and Chamberlain, and Liberal imperialists for 'imperialism' and the Empire
- the Boer War
- enlarging and strengthening the navy to combat the German threat to the Empire
- Lloyd George's 1911 Mansion House speech
- declaring war in 1914 to protect the Empire (as well as Britain itself).

Nevertheless, there are a number of other factors to consider:

- Gladstone's 1st Ministry had different foreign policy concerns as illustrated over the Franco-Prussian War, the 'Alabama' dispute and especially allowing Russia to break the 'Black Sea clauses'
- Gladstone's later governments were conciliatory over imperial issues in Afghanistan and particularly in South Africa and the Sudan where policy overall was (some) withdrawal rather than concern for dominance or expansion
- lack of enthusiasm for imperialism by some, mainly 'New' Liberals, e.g. in opposition to the Boer War and from 1906 preferring expenditure on welfare reforms rather than the navy.

Furthermore, candidates may:

- argue that concern for the Empire, as the dominant factor of foreign policy, was largely confined to the years of expansion from c1875 to c1900
- argue that the Empire was not consistently the main concern
- argue that, at least at various times, other concerns were more important, e.g. during Gladstone's 1st Ministry (avoidance of war and conciliation), or combating 'aggression' by Russia and France, e.g. in the Near and Far East, and at Fashoda
- emphasise that preserving the balance of power, given the perceived threat from German policy after c1900, was then the main concern
- see the declaration of war in 1914, given the German invasion of Belgium, as ultimately protection of Britain itself rather than the whole Empire.

In conclusion, candidates may:

- argue that over the whole period the dominant concern of foreign policy was the Empire, both in terms of protection and enlargement, if not consistently so
- see that other concerns were more important at times especially at the beginning and end of the period.

Converting marks into UMS marks

Convert raw marks into marks on the Uniform Mark Scale (UMS) by using the link below.

UMS conversion calculator: www.aqa.org.uk/umsconversion