

GCE 2004
June Series



Mark Scheme

Government and Politics *A2 Unit 6 - The Politics of Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales (GOV6)*

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available from:

Publications Department, Aldon House, 39, Heald Grove, Rusholme, Manchester, M14 4NA
Tel: 0161 953 1170

or

download from the AQA website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2004 AQA and its licensors

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

The Assessment and Qualifications Alliance (AQA) is a company limited by guarantee registered in England and Wales 3644723 and a registered charity number 1073334. Registered address AQA, Devas Street, Manchester. M15 6EX.

Dr Michael Cresswell Director General

CRITERIA FOR MARKING AS/A2 GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS

Introduction

The AQA's revised Government and Politics specification has been designed to be objectives-led in that questions are set which address the assessment objectives published in the specification. The assessment objectives for A Level and AS are the same, but the weightings are different at AS and A2. Details of the weightings are given in paragraphs 7.2 and 8.4 of the specification.

The schemes of marking reflect these objectives. The mark scheme which follows is of the *levels of response* type showing that candidates are expected to demonstrate their mastery of the skills required in the context of their knowledge and understanding of Government and Politics. Mark schemes provide the necessary framework for examiners but they cannot cover all eventualities. Candidates should be given credit for partially complete answers. Where appropriate, candidates should be given credit for referring to recent and contemporary developments in Government and Politics.

Consistency of marking is of the essence in all public examinations. It is therefore of vital importance that assistant examiners apply the marking scheme as directed by the Principal Examiner in order to facilitate comparability with the marking of other options.

Before scrutinising and applying the detail of the specific mark scheme which follows, assistant examiners are required to familiarise themselves with the general principles of the mark scheme as contained in the Assessment Matrix.

Using a levels of response mark scheme

Good examining is about the **consistent** application of judgement. Mark schemes provide a framework within which examiners exercise their judgement. This is especially so in subjects like Government and Politics which in part rely upon analysis, evaluation, argument and explanation. With this in mind, examiners should use the Assessment Matrix alongside the detailed mark scheme for each question. The Assessment Matrix provides a framework ensuring a consistent, generic source from which the detailed mark schemes are derived. This supporting framework ensures a consistent approach within which candidates' responses are marked according to the level of demand and context of each question.

Examiners should initially make a decision about which Level any given response should be placed in. Having determined the appropriate Level the examiners must then choose the precise mark to be given within that Level. In making a decision about a specific mark to award, it is vitally important to think first of the mid-range within the Level, where that Level covers more than two marks. Comparison with other candidates' responses to the same question might then suggest whether the middle mark is unduly generous or severe.

In making decisions away from the middle of the Level, examiners should ask themselves questions relating to candidate attainment, including the quality of language. The more positive the answers, the higher should be the mark awarded. We want to avoid "bunching" of marks. Levels mark schemes can produce regression to the mean, which should be avoided. A candidate's script should be considered by asking "Is it:-

- precise in its use of factual information?
- appropriately detailed?
- factually accurate?
- appropriately balanced or markedly better in some areas than others?
- generally coherent in expression and cogent in development (as appropriate to the level awarded)?
- well presented as to general quality of language?"

The overall aim is to mark positively, giving credit for what candidates know, understand and can do.

**A2 GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS, EXCLUDING SYNOPTIC UNIT (GOV4,
GOV5, GOV6, GOV7)**

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (a) (Total: 8 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Levels 3 - 4 (2 marks) The candidate demonstrates a good to excellent knowledge and understanding of political data, concept(s) or term(s). Where appropriate, the candidate produces accurate and/or relevant examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 3 - 4 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate applies a good to excellent range of developed concepts and uses appropriate political theory to construct a clear and cogent explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 3 - 4 (2 marks) The candidate communicates clearly and effectively using appropriate political vocabulary. The answer has a clear sense of direction, is focused on the question and, where appropriate, has a conclusion which flows from the discussion.</p>
	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 mark) The candidate demonstrates limited knowledge and understanding of political data, concept(s) or term(s). The candidate produces few or inaccurate examples and/or limited evidence to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 - 2 marks) The candidate applies a limited range of concepts and makes little or limited use of political theory or ideas in developing an explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 mark) The candidate communicates explanations or arguments with limited clarity and effectiveness using limited political vocabulary. The answer may lack either a clear focus on the question or a sense of direction. A conclusion, where appropriate, may be offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion is modest or implicit.</p>

**A2 GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS, EXCLUDING SYNOPTIC UNIT (GOV4,
GOV5, GOV6, GOV7)**

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (b) (Total: 12 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (5 - 6 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate fully addresses the requirements of the question and provides developed and effective to comprehensive interpretation. The answer also provides clear, accurate evidence and, where appropriate, good to excellent examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 3 - 4 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate applies a good to excellent range of developed concepts and uses appropriate political theory to construct a clear and cogent explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 3 - 4 (2 marks) The candidate communicates clearly and effectively using appropriate political vocabulary. The answer has a clear sense of direction, is focused on the question and, where appropriate, has a conclusion which flows from the discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate clearly addresses the requirements of the question and provides sound interpretation and contextual awareness. The answer includes good examples to illustrate points made.</p>		

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (b) (continued)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 - 2 marks) The candidate demonstrates slight to basic knowledge and understanding of political concepts, institutions and processes. The candidate makes a very limited attempt to address the requirements of the question and provides little to partial but reasonably effective interpretation. Answers offer limited or little evidence and few or inaccurate examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 - 2 marks) The candidate applies a limited range of concepts and makes little or limited use of political theory or ideas in developing an explanation or argument.</p>	<p>Levels 1 - 2 (1 mark) The candidate communicates explanations or arguments with limited clarity and effectiveness using limited political vocabulary. The answer may lack either a clear focus on the question or a sense of direction. A conclusion, where appropriate, may be offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion is modest or implicit.</p>

A2 GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS, EXCLUDING SYNOPTIC UNIT (GOV4, GOV5, GOV6, GOV7)

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (c) (Total: 20 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (7 - 8 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The candidate fully addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates excellent contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes excellent examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 4 (7 - 8 marks) The candidate displays excellent awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is an excellent focus on the specific question asked. There is a clear evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a sophisticated awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>Appropriate parallels and connections are clearly identified together with comparisons. A wide range of concepts is used.</p>	<p>Level 4 (4 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions with clarity. Excellent use is made of political vocabulary to construct cogent and coherent arguments. The answer has a clear sense of direction, culminating in a conclusion that flows from the preceding discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (5 - 6 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer clearly addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates sound contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes good examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 3 (5 - 6 marks) The candidate displays sound awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is a clear focus on the question. There is a sound evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays good awareness of viewpoints and issues. There is good recognition of parallels and comparisons. Appropriate concepts are used.</p>	<p>Level 3 (3 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions well. Good use is made of political vocabulary to construct clear arguments and explanations.</p> <p>The candidate produces an answer with a conclusion linked to the preceding discussion.</p>

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Question 1 part (c) (continued)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 2 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate demonstrates outline knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and some awareness of the relationships between them. The candidate makes a limited attempt to address the question and demonstrates contextual awareness covering part of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes simple examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 2 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate displays limited awareness of the implications and demands of the question, resulting in a restricted focus. There is a limited evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays partial awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is some recognition of basic parallels and comparisons with limited use of concepts.</p>	<p>Level 2 (2 marks) The candidate communicates arguments and conclusions adequately with limited use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion is offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion may be modest or implicit.</p>
	<p>Level 1 (1 - 2 marks) The candidate demonstrates a slight and incomplete knowledge and understanding of political institutions and processes and limited awareness of the relationships between them. There is little attempt to address the requirements of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes few, if any, examples which may be inaccurately reported or inappropriately used.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1 - 2 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question and focus is lacking. Evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour is superficial, with little awareness of viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is little, if any, recognition of parallels and comparisons. The use of concepts is superficial and naïve.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1 mark) The answer relies upon narrative, which is not fully coherent. There is little or no use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion, if present, is not adequately related to the preceding discussion.</p>

**A2 GOVERNMENT AND POLITICS, EXCLUDING SYNOPTIC UNIT (GOV4,
GOV5, GOV6, GOV7)**

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Questions 2, 3 and 4 (Maximum 40 marks)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 4 (13 - 16 marks) The candidate demonstrates a comprehensive knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The candidate fully addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates excellent contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes excellent examples to illustrate points made. The answer includes detailed and comprehensive interpretations or explanations as well as accurate evidence and relevant examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 4 (13 - 16 marks) The candidate displays excellent awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is an excellent and sustained focus on the specific question asked. There is a clear and full evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a sophisticated awareness of differing viewpoints and recognition of issues.</p> <p>Appropriate parallels and connections are clearly identified together with well-developed comparisons. A wide range of concepts are used and developed.</p>	<p>Level 4 (7 - 8 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions with clarity. Excellent use is made of political vocabulary to construct cogent and coherent arguments and explanations. The answer has a clear sense of direction, culminating in a conclusion that flows from the preceding discussion.</p>
	<p>Level 3 (9 - 12 marks) The candidate demonstrates sound knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and the relationships between them. The answer clearly addresses the requirements of the question and demonstrates sound contextual awareness.</p> <p>The answer includes developed and effective interpretations or explanations and also clear evidence and good examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 3 (9 - 12 marks) The candidate displays sound awareness of the implications and demands of the question. There is a clear focus on the question. There is a sound evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays good awareness of differing viewpoints and recognition of issues. There is good recognition of parallels and comparisons. Appropriate concepts are used and developed.</p>	<p>Level 3 (5 - 6 marks) The candidate communicates arguments, explanations and conclusions well. Good use is made of political vocabulary to construct clear arguments and explanations.</p> <p>The candidate produces an answer with a conclusion linked to the preceding discussion.</p>

GENERIC MARK SCHEME for Questions 2, 3 and 4 (continued)

	Knowledge and Understanding: Recall, Select & Deploy	Skills: Analysis & Evaluation	Communication
	AO1	AO2	AO3
	<p>Level 2 (5 - 8 marks) The candidate demonstrates outline knowledge and understanding of political concepts/theories/institutions and processes and some awareness of the relationships between them. The candidate makes a limited attempt to address the question and demonstrates contextual awareness covering part of the question.</p> <p>The answer includes a partial and reasonably effective attempt at interpretation or explanation with some examples to illustrate points made.</p>	<p>Level 2 (5 - 8 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question, resulting in a restricted focus. There is a limited evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour which displays a partial awareness of differing viewpoints and issues.</p> <p>There is some recognition of basic parallels and comparisons. Arguments and explanations are undeveloped with limited use of concepts.</p>	<p>Level 2 (3 - 4 marks) The candidate communicates arguments and conclusions adequately with limited use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion is offered but its relationship to the preceding discussion may be modest or implicit.</p>
	<p>Level 1 (1 - 4 marks) The candidate demonstrates a slight and incomplete knowledge and understanding of political institutions and processes and limited awareness of the relationships between them. There is little attempt to address the requirements of the question. There is only superficial awareness, if any, of the context of the question, with little interpretation and few, if any, examples often inaccurately reported or inappropriately used.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1 - 4 marks) The candidate displays little awareness of the implications and demands of the question and focus is lacking. Evaluation of political institutions, processes and behaviour is superficial.</p> <p>Analysis shows little awareness of differing viewpoints and issues. There is little, if any, recognition of parallels and comparisons. Arguments, explanations and use of concepts are superficial and naive.</p>	<p>Level 1 (1 - 2 marks) The answer relies upon narrative, which is not fully coherent. There is little or no use of political vocabulary.</p> <p>A conclusion, if present, is not adequately related to the preceding discussion.</p>

June 2004

Unit GOV6 – The Politics of Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales

1

Total for this question: 40 marks

- | | | |
|-----|---|------------------|
| (a) | Explain the term <i>devolution</i> used in the extract. | <i>(8 marks)</i> |
|-----|---|------------------|

Accept process of transferring power from a central government to a lower one, or similar. For higher marks, some additional information, e.g. sovereignty remains at centre, different from independence/federalism, etc. Examples, such as Scotland, Northern Ireland, and Wales devolved institutions.

- | | | |
|-----|--|-------------------|
| (b) | Using the extract and your own knowledge, explain the significance of the Welsh Assembly having “only secondary legislative powers” delegated to it. | <i>(12 marks)</i> |
|-----|--|-------------------|

From the extract, the Welsh Assembly can only fill in details of legislation passed by Westminster. Discriminator is ‘significance’, of which various approaches, e.g. reflects very narrow support at referendum for Welsh devolution; fewer powers than Scottish Parliament (which may arguably lead to future discontent in Wales); ‘England’ still largely controls Welsh legislation (which could raise questions of legitimacy, particularly if in future there is a Conservative dominated ‘Commons’); reduces Welsh Assembly to a ‘talking shop’, etc.

- | | | |
|-----|--|-------------------|
| (c) | “Effective devolution of power has occurred in Scotland.” Discuss. | <i>(20 marks)</i> |
|-----|--|-------------------|

Discussion should include: political processes, institutions and governmental structures relevant to Scotland; political context and background of devolution in Scotland, including 1979 and 1997 referendums and record of Conservative governments since 1979; nationalism in Scotland; the government of Scotland and (changed?) relations with Westminster/Whitehall post-devolution; elections to the Scottish Parliament and subsequent developments.

Answers should then address ‘has occurred’ and ‘effective’. This should include analysis of changes in governmental arrangements, including implications for Westminster and Whitehall (e.g. reduced role of Scotland Office) as well as Scotland; changed legislative/tax powers; policy divergences and political changes; retained power of Whitehall/Westminster (e.g. sovereignty, reserved powers, limited taxation powers, etc.); parallels, connections, similarities and differences between political institutions and structures before and after the creation of Scottish Parliament, and between the Scottish Parliament, Northern Ireland and Welsh assemblies; use of relevant concepts (e.g. sovereignty, nationalism, devolution, accountability, independence, etc.).

The question refers to devolution ‘in Scotland’ which invites discussion beyond the Scottish Parliament itself (e.g. effectiveness of coalition government, impact of electoral system for Scottish Parliament). It also allows discussion of ‘effectiveness’ from different viewpoints (e.g. Blair government, SNP, People of Scotland, etc.).

2**Total for this question: 40 marks**

“A compromise between the competing demands of the different traditions in Northern Ireland.”
Discuss this view of the 1998 Good Friday Peace Agreement. (40 marks)

Discussion should include: context of, and issues underlying, Northern Ireland conflict; aspirations of Unionist and Nationalist traditions and London and Dublin perspectives; main proposals in Good Friday Agreement and subsequent developments; composition and functions of the Northern Ireland Assembly, Executive (and North/South Council and Council of Isles); continuing role of Whitehall and Westminster.

Having explained the above, candidates should address the Good Friday Agreement’s relevance to aspirations of different traditions (e.g. Unionist gain South’s constitutional amendment/dominance in Assembly/Council of Isles; Nationalists gain power sharing/North-South Council); ‘compromise’ (e.g. something for everyone) and ‘competing’ (e.g. continuing significance of Unionist, i.e. maintenance of Union, and Nationalist, i.e. reunification aspirations of traditions and their relevance to the GFA) should be specifically addressed. Post GFA developments (e.g. referendum, experience with power sharing, decommissioning, Patten, suspension of NI Assembly); and parallels, connections, similarities and differences in (and within) Unionist and Nationalist positions where relevant. Concepts (e.g. nationalism, Unionism, sovereignty, power sharing) should be used as appropriate.

Possible to argue from a variety of positions, e.g. that compromise, made easier with emergence of cross-tradition support for peace, has flowed from GFA; that specific obstacles, e.g. decommissioning, Patten, power sharing arrangements – have exacerbated conflict; that GFA does/does not represent compromise; that divisions within, rather than between, traditions prevent compromise, etc.

3**Total for this question: 40 marks**

Discuss the view that multi-party systems now exist in Scotland and Wales.

(40 marks)

Discussion should include: recent trends in electoral support for Plaid Cymru, SNP and other main parties in Scotland and Wales, and of factors influencing these trends; voting patterns in Scotland and Wales, and reasons underlying them; results of recent elections (including elections to devolved assemblies) in Scotland and Wales; devolution and the policies of the main political parties.

Having explained the above answers, candidates should address ‘multi-party systems exist’. This should include discussion of party systems and implications of recent election results in Scotland and Wales; the impact of devolution (and electoral systems used for devolved assemblies) on the party system in Scotland and Wales (including party strength and performance in Westminster and devolved assemblies); the significance of values (e.g. nationalism, Labourism); ideologies (e.g. conservatism, socialism); beliefs (e.g. independence, the Union) and policies (e.g. devolution) upon party strength and the party system in Scotland and Wales. ‘Now’ invites analysis of changes over time. Appropriate concepts are devolution, nationalism, and representation.

4

Total for this question: 40 marks

“Although it takes different forms, nationalism remains a powerful force in the politics of Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales.” Discuss. *(40 marks)*

Discussion should include: nationalism as a concept; the nature of nationalism in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales (aspiration, goals, causes/roots, development, strength, etc.); the cultural, social, economic, historical and political context of nationalism in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales; the constitutional and political status of Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales and associated nationalist perspectives.

‘Different forms’ should address differences, parallels, connections and similarities between nationalism in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales (e.g. violence in Northern Ireland, emphasis on language/culture in Wales and desire to regain lost statehood in Scotland), and ‘powerful force’ the influence of nationalism on political debate, policies and constitutional change in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales; political and electoral significance of Plaid Cymru and SNP, and the influence of nationalism upon the Northern Ireland conflict and the peace process. (Note: parties, elections and voting in Northern Ireland are not explicit within the specification.) ‘Remains’ invites analysis of changes over time. Reward answers which evaluate relative significance of nationalism in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales, and which make use of the relevant concepts, such as nationalism, devolution and independence.