



# ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE CRITICAL THINKING

Unit 1: Credibility of Evidence

# F491

Candidates answer on the question paper

**OCR Supplied Materials:**

- Resource Booklet F491/RB

**Other Materials Required:**

None

**Monday 18 May 2009  
Afternoon**

**Duration: 1 hour 15 minutes**



Candidate  
Forename

Candidate  
Surname

Centre Number

Candidate Number

## INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name clearly in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read each question carefully and make sure that you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided, however additional paper may be used if necessary.
- Additional answer space is available on the lined pages at the back of this book. Answers on these pages must be clearly numbered.

## INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [ ] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **80**.
- You will be awarded up to 5 marks overall for the quality of your written communication.
- This document consists of **12** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

For Examiner's Use	
Section A	
Section B	
Section C	
QWC/5	
Total	

OCR is an exempt Charity



Read the documents and then answer the questions that follow.

The 5 documents in the Resource Booklet contain reports relating to the dispute as to whether giving financial rights to couples who have been living together is likely to undermine the institution of marriage.

### Section A: Assessing the credibility of documents

- 1 There may be weaknesses in the credibility of the reporting of proposed changes to legal rights (other than the financial rights of couples who have been living together).

Explain **three** possible weaknesses in the credibility of such reporting.

1 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [2]

2 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [2]

3 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [2]

- 2 *Fig. 1 in Document 2 shows a change in the percentage of people getting married.*

Suggest **two** possible explanations for this change.

1 .....  
 ..... [1]

2 .....  
 ..... [1]

- identify a relevant credibility criterion
- use this to assess the credibility of the document
- make reference to the text to support your assessment.

1 ..... [3]

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

[3]

3 .....

3 .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... [3]

© OCR 2009

## Section B: Assessing the credibility of evidence

- 4 *Consider the bishops' claim in Document 5, "It would inevitably lead to the question, 'Why marry at all?'"*

They seem to assume that the main reason for marriage is for financial benefit.

Suggest **two** ways in which this assumption might be challenged.

1 .....  
 ..... [1]

2 .....  
 ..... [1]

- 5 *Consider the claims made by the Law Commissioner in Document 1 and the Archbishop of Canterbury in Document 3.*

Assess the credibility of their claims. For each of these sources make **two** points of assessment, each of which should:

- identify a claim made (you can use the same claim twice.)
- assess how this claim is strengthened or weakened by any relevant credibility criterion
- state what you must suppose to be true in order to reach your assessment.

### The Law Commissioner

1 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [5]

2 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [5]

## The Archbishop of Canterbury

1 .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... [5]

2 .....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... [5]

- 6 Use **one** credibility criterion to compare the credibility of the Law Commissioner with that of the Archbishop of Canterbury.

.....

.....

.....

..... [2]

**Total Marks for Section B [24]**

**Section C: Coming to a reasoned judgement**

- 7** Come to a reasoned judgement as to whether or not giving financial rights to unmarried couples who have been living together would undermine the institution of marriage.

In your answers you should refer to the individual sources **within** the documents.

- (a)** State **two** precise claims that are corroborated.

Support each of these with two references from the text.

1 .....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
..... [3]

2 .....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
.....  
..... [3]

(b) State **two** precise claims where conflict arises.

Support each of these with two references from the text.

1 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [3]

2 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [3]

(c) Identify **all** the individual sources within the documents on each side of the above dispute.

Identify any source that does not fit easily onto either side.

.....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 .....  
 ..... [4]



- (d)** State which side, if any, has the greater weight of evidence, supporting this with numbers of sources.

..... [2]

- (e) Using **three** different credibility criteria, assess the quality of evidence on each side of the above dispute.

..... [6]

- (f) State the judgement that results from your assessment as to whether or not giving financial rights to unmarried couples who have been living together would undermine the institution of marriage.

..... [1]

**Total Marks for Section C [25]**

**Five marks are available for the quality of written communication** **[5]**

**PAPER TOTAL 80 Marks**

If you use the following lined pages to complete the answer to any question, the question number **must** be clearly shown.

[illegible]



**PLEASE DO NOT WRITE ON THIS PAGE**



**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations, is given to all schools that receive assessment material and is freely available to download from our public website ([www.ocr.org.uk](http://www.ocr.org.uk)) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PB.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.