

General Certificate of Education June 2011

Classical Civilisation 1021
Women in Athens and Rome
AS Unit 1D

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the candidates' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of candidates' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of candidates' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright @ 2011 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered centres for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to centres to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the centre.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

The Assessment and Qualifications Alliance (AQA) is a company limited by guarantee registered in England and Wales (company number 3644723) and a registered charity (registered charity number 1073334). Registered address: AQA, Devas Street, Manchester M15 6EX

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the candidate uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- · read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of candidates after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Candidates are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the candidate's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	 Demonstrates accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question clear understanding of central aspects of the question ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	9-10
Level 3	 Demonstrates a range of accurate and relevant knowledge some understanding of some aspects of the question some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or • some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either • some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge or • an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen, accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- · ability to sustain an argument which
- has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus,
- responds to the precise terms of the question,

19-20

14-18

9-13

5-8

1-4

- · effectively links comment to detail,
- · has a clear structure
- reaches a reasoned conclusion
- is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and
- · makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate, accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the question
- ability to develop an argument which

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail and has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question

 some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar

• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them

• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge
- or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it
- and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5 Demonstrates

- well chosen, accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question
- coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question
- · ability to sustain an argument which

has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail.

27-30

has a clear structure

reaches a reasoned conclusion

is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and

makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 4 Demonstrates

- generally adequate, accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question
- understanding of many of the central aspects of the question
- ability to develop an argument which

appropriate.

has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when

20-26

Level 3 Demonstrates

- a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- some understanding of some aspects of the question
- some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question

13-19

- some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar
- some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

Level 2 Demonstrates

- either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge
- or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them

7-12

 and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.

Level 1 Demonstrates

- either some patchy, accurate and relevant knowledge
- **or** an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it

 and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 1-6



Mark Scheme

Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section One

Option A

01 What is the name of the 'woman' (Passage A, line 1)?

Clodia / Claudia [1]

(1 mark)

02 Where in Rome is Cicero making the speech from which the passages come?

(law) court / forum [1]

(1 mark)

O3 Cicero is pretending to be Appius in Passage A and Clodius in Passage B. Give one piece of information about each of these men.

Appius: Caecus / blind / ancestor / made peace (with Pyrrhus) / built aqueduct / built road etc.

Clodius: brother / with whom Clodia alleged to have had sex / Cicero's enemy etc. [1]

(2 marks)

O4 Give one reason why it was appropriate for Cicero to entertain his listeners by playing these parts.

holiday / on which plays performed / to distract attention away from defendant's (Caelius') guilt / to condemn Clodia more vividly etc. [1]

(1 mark)

05 How sharp a contrast does Cicero make between Appius and Clodius in their attitudes towards the woman's alleged behaviour? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the passages and elsewhere in Cicero's speech.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Appius: repetitively described by Cicero before passage as severe, solemn, old-style, austere, heavily bearded and again in similar terms before introduces Clodius; curt, abrupt, blunt ('woman'); sarcastic ('with a youth'); obsessed with family ancestry and honour (5 generations + eulogies of husband and Vestal); scathing tone (e.g. short abrupt questions); criticism of Clodius; rhetorical climax of own noble achievements which claims Clodia has abused for her own sexual gratification etc.
- Clodius: before passage, explicit contrast between gruff, rustic, aged Appius and dapper, urbane Clodius, a timid boy frightened of the dark finding comfort in Clodia's bed; not at all outraged by Clodia's amorous desires, which he implies are perfectly normal (just as Cicero is trying to show Caelius' behaviour as normal) but by the fuss she has caused; argument has appearance of reason (no need to pester Caelius as you have a garden where you can spy on and have all the young bathers' bodies you want) but in this admission of Clodia's obsession with young flesh as damning as Appius etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

66 For Roman wives in the period to the end of the 1st century BC, how important a quality was 'domestic virtue' (Passage A, line 10) and how important were other qualities? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the sources you have studied.

You might include discussion of

- what Romulus said to the Sabine women
- Lucretia
- the speeches of Cato and Valerius in the debate about the repeal of the Oppian Law
- Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi
- Sempronia
- Turia
- Murdia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Sabine women: emphasis on their submission to husbands, in return for which would be treated with respect, and their child-bearing function etc.
- Lucretia: wins contest because of her nocturnal domestic industry; capitulates to
 Tarquinius only in order to avoid greater dishonour which she will be unable to contest
 and commits suicide to become exemplum to future generations of women; in defence of
 her chastity and her and family's honour shows courage, independence, good sense and
 political insight etc.
- Cato believes women's place is firmly in the home under the tutelage of a guardian and views their interference in the forum as a threat to Roman society; Valerius too believes women should be subservient to men but treated with respect rather than as minions, allowed to excel in their own sphere of honour, the display of fine clothes, with public interventions justified where women have an interest as in case of Oppian Law or where their actions benefit community etc.
- Cornelia's statue above all records her maternal role alleged to have called her children
 her 'jewels' and Tiberius sacrificed his life so that she could survive to bring up children –
 but also remembered for her fortitude in grief, her upholding of family values, her political
 insights in advising son, her culture and education, her rejection of marriage to Ptolemy
 etc.
- Turia's eulogy makes passing reference to her domestic virtues characteristic of all
 women who value their good name but these virtually taken for granted and far more
 emphasis placed on her exceptional, traditionally more masculine qualities shown
 appropriately in exceptional circumstances to defend the interests of husband and family
 e.g. courage, independence, intelligence, self-sacrifice etc.
- similarly Murdia's eulogy, despite its fragmentary state, emphasising in what survives her judiciousness in assigning her inheritance etc.
- Sempronia and Clodia excoriated for showing neither domestic nor any other virtue, though Sallust allows Sempronia some potentially promising qualities which are not, however, strictly domestic etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

07 What was the occupation of Eppia's lover?

gladiator [1]

(1 mark)

08 'What was it she saw in him?' (line 10) Give one detail of his appearance.

shaved neck / wounded arm / deformed face / mark where helmet rubbed / wart between nostrils / smelly discharge from eye / had sword / looked to Eppia as beautiful as Apollo's friend (Hyacinth) [1]

(1 mark)

09 According to Pliny's letter to Nepos, in what circumstances did Arria (the Elder) go to sea? Give three details.

THREE of **e.g.** husband involved in revolt (of Scribonianus in Illyria) [1] taken as prisoner to Rome [1] to be put on trial [1] Arria begged to accompany him (on ship as slave) [1] but forbidden [1] so followed in (tiny fishing) boat [1] to show her loyalty (etc.) to him [1]

(3 marks)

10 To what extent does Juvenal play on men's fears of women's infidelity and to what extent does he play on other male anxieties? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from all you have read of Satire 6.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- a gallimaufry of female iniquity with repeating lumps of sexual deviance to take away Postumus' appetite for marriage
- first examples in extract give graphic descriptions of Eppia's and Messalina's extreme infidelities and of wife, schooled by her mother, with lover in hiding etc.
- moves away to examples of women who have abandoned traditional female roles to pursue male activities e.g. litigation and athletics, but reverts to fear of licentiousness caused by luxury since Punic Wars etc.
- back to women's attempts to usurp male supremacy in the fields of literature and philosophy, particularly humiliating men at dinner, and then finally again arousing fears of women's ability to procure abortions and of illegitimacy ('you might end up being the father of an Ethiopian')
- a refrain is that poverty ensures virtue, while wealth brings decadence and even, in the case of Cornelia, snobbery etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

11 To what extent is Pliny's attitude towards women similar to Juvenal's and to what extent is it different? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from both authors' work.

You might include discussion of

- the purposes of Pliny's and Juvenal's writing
- their underlying assumptions about women
- what Juvenal says about Eppia, Messalina, Cornelia and other women
- what Pliny writes about
 his wife Calpurnia
 the young girl Minicia Marcella
 the Helvidiae sisters
 Arria
 Fannia, Arria's granddaughter.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Juvenal writing satire, one aim of which was to entertain as well as perhaps making a
 moral point; Pliny writing letters which he revised for publication, even when original
 might have been private; each letter has a clear theme in effect is a mini-essay and
 often a moral point which Pliny makes explicit to recipient / reader etc.
- both tend to see women in terms of types, whether for emulation or criticism, rather than as individuals; both tend to see women in their relationship with men, how far they serve male interests or undermine them etc.
- Calpurnia: some anxiety (rather obliquely expressed) that she may be led astray by pleasures of Campania, i.e. some fear of female moral and sexual weakness without male guidance; otherwise stresses her chastity, devotion and respect, the same qualities that Juvenal values by highlighting women who lack them etc.; Pliny's concern for heir who will have illustrious future matched by Juvenal's dig at the woman whose child will turn out to be Ethiopian etc.; Pliny's praise for Calpurnia's discreet interest in his legal career and literary efforts matched by Juvenal's pillorying of women who use literature / law to usurp men's position etc.
- Minicia Marcella portrayed as having all the qualities of a matrona despite her youth, all of
 which she uses to support her family's interests; letter designed to reflect and strengthen
 Pliny's relationship with her father and functions as a kind of funeral eulogy etc.
- both Calpurnia and Minicia young and rather passive, so despite their class more in line with Juvenal's ideal Venusian girl; Arria and Fannia more independent, dynamic women, more on a par with those Juvenal focuses on and, in contrast to Pliny's praise for the steadfast way in which they uphold their family's tradition of Stoic opposition to the emperor, perhaps liable to the criticisms Juvenal makes of Cornelia's snobbery; however, whereas Juvenal vividly portrays the sleaziness of Messalina's betrayal of Claudius, Pliny praises the heroic opposition of Arria to Claudius because it demonstrates her total devotion to husband Paetus etc.
- whereas Juvenal focuses on female perversity, Pliny views the traditionally masculine qualities of Arria and Fannia in a praiseworthy light because they serve interests of husband and family, even if in opposition to emperor etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Section Two

Option C

12 'Athenian marriages were based on usefulness rather than affection.' How far do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the Athenian sources you have studied.

You might include discussion of

- Ischomachus' conversation with Socrates
- Apollodorus' speech about Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano
- Euphiletus' defence speech
- the speech about the marriage of Ciron's daughter
- the poisoning trial.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- Ischomachus explaining to Socrates how he has trained his young wife to be useful to him in running his oikos so that he can enjoy the leisure outside the house to increase his reputation; in explaining managerial role to wife, Ischomachus is patronising and paternalistic rather than affectionate / tender, though seeks to secure her understanding / agreement; relationship portrayed as being for their mutual benefit but mainly designed to suit his; outright prohibition on wearing of make-up reflects his concerns about unwanted male gaze and shows no interest in her feelings etc.
- as Ischomachus' wife had no say about whom she married, so it was Stephanus who
 married off Phano for his own social / political advancement; Phrastor married, then
 divorced Phano purely for reasons of legitimate inheritance, further emphasised when
 he tried to accept her son; Theogenes similarly motivated by self-interest, needing a
 wife to fulfil role of Archon Basileus, until revealed to be illegitimate; Apollodorus'
 categorisation of women so that wives associated only with function (childbirth and oikos
 management), hetairai and pallakai with male pleasure (even here, no mention of
 feelings); wives' interest in case also portrayed as stemming from their interest in their
 status, not any feeling of affection for husband etc.
- Euphiletus does claim to have shown affection for his wife, but only after he had guarded her closely and she had proved her usefulness by producing an heir; affection demonstrated by handing over to her responsibility for the *oikos* and allowing her to use ground floor as *gynaikeion*, apparently allowing him greater freedom to take liberties with the maid upstairs when at home and at other times to leave house in wife's care while he travelled around; once adultery revealed, shows no concern for feelings but only desire for revenge and to re-establish honour by killing Eratosthenes *in flagrante*; his comments on laws concerning adultery show male fear of wife transferring affection to seducer etc.
- speech about Ciron's daughter entirely about demonstrable evidence that marriage legal and therefore heir legitimate (though of course this is what case demands)
- prosecutor in poisoning trial implies wife thought her husband's alleged ill-treatment of her was justification for his murder, but does not expect jury to agree; Philoneus' apparent intention to consign concubine to bordello might suggest affection ephemeral even outside marriage etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

'Athenian women would have found little to laugh at in Women at the Thesmophoria.'
How far do you agree with this statement? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the play.

You might include discussion of

- the ways in which women and the Thesmophoria are portrayed
- what the women say about themselves and about men
- the way Aristophanes portrays different types of men
- the parodies of tragedy
- other sources of humour.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- starting point of plot is women's desire for vengeance on Euripides for his vilification of
 them, paralleling notorious female monsters of myth; anger stems from reaction of
 husbands to plays, not what they themselves have seen; therefore shown as silly when
 Critylla takes parody of *Helen* literally; much of portrayal depends on stereotypes and
 stock male jokes e.g. Mnesilochus' speech emphasising women's duplicity and
 mendacity; Mica's prurient fascination with Mnesilochus' phallus and distress at
 'sacrifice' of her baby (parody of *Telephus*) emphasise their stock caricaturing as sexcrazed drunkards etc.
- Thesmophoria imagined to be parody of Assembly in which women attempt to mimic men and, rather than being the respectable devotees the rituals required, the women are shown to be focused on deceiving men in the areas of greatest significance for males e.g. chastity and childbirth etc.
- Mica's speech which does not declare women's innocence but condemns Euripides for making it more difficult for them to get away with their misdemeanours which subvert the oikos; Chorus-Leader's defence of women accusing men of voyeurism and comparing women favourably with some men (lampooning of contemporaries stock feature of Aristophanic comedy) etc.
- Aristophanes also ridicules other 'outsiders' e.g. foreign slave the Scythian (mentally and verbally defective and sexually excitable), effeminate men e.g. Cleisthenes and Agathon, who appear as / take on roles of women, as does Mnesilochus etc.
- Aristophanes parodies two plays by Euripides in which Helen and Andromeda portrayed as victims, not villains, thus emphasising absurdity of plot and his more misogynistic depiction of women etc.
- other examples of humour which might or might not be thought to appeal to Athenian women e.g. clowning around of dressing up and stripping etc.
- relevant references to other sources which might shed light on women's attitudes and their understanding of male public life e.g. at Assembly and in theatre etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Either Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	1	-	1
02	1	-	1
03	2	-	2
04	1	-	1
05	5	5	10
06	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or Option B

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
07	1	-	1
08	1	-	1
09	3	-	3
10	5	5	10
11	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section Two

Either Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
12	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or Option D

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
13	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%

UMS conversion calculator www.org.uk/umsconversion